Bulletin of Tibetology

VOL. XIII  No. 1

21st February 1974.

NAMGYAL INSTITUTE OF TIBETOLOGY
GANGTOK, SIKKIM.
The Bulletin of Theology seeks to serve the reader with an interest in this field of study. The motive portraying the Stupa on the mountains suggests the dimensions of the field.
11th February 1976,
NAMGYAL INSTITUTE OF TIBETOLOGY
GANGTOK, SIKKIM.
CONTENTS

PAGE

1. The Temptation of the Buddha 5
   Dr Valentine Stache-R Zoe

2. The Story of Rupamanda from Bamiyan, Afghanistan 10
   Dr J. Benevse

3. Note i: A translation of the Biography of the Mehaniddha Indrabhuti 15
   Nathan Katz

4. Note ii: Namgyal Institute of Theology 30
   Dr A.M. D'Rosario

Views expressed in the Bulletin of Theology are those of the contributors and not of the Namgyal Institute of Theology.
CONTRIBUTORS IN THIS ISSUE

DR (Mrs) VALENTINA STACHE-ROSEN comes from the family of diplomats several of whom were orientalists. After studying Sanskrit, Chinese and archaeology at Goettingen University, she came to India on a postgraduate research scholarship. She specialises in Buddhist studies and has to her credit two Sanskrit texts from Central Asia. She now lives in Bangalore with her husband Dr Wilfried Stache, who heads the Max Mueller Bhavan there.

Dr P. BANERJEE, Assistant Director, National Museum, New Delhi is a well known scholar and writer.

NATHAN KATZ a scholar working on Tibetan Buddhism at Temple University, Philadelphia, USA. Much interested in Asia, its philosophy and religion. Visited the Institute of Tibetology in 1973 and spent a useful fortnight consulting literature and making contact with research workers.

DR A.M.D’ROZARO: The Director of the Nangyul Institute of Tibetology.
THE TEMPTATION OF THE BUDDHA

A Preliminary Comparison of some Chinese versions of an episode in the life of the Buddha

Valentina Stache-Rosen

Almost all the biographies of the Buddha relate that Mara, the Evil-one, attempted in vain to disturb the Buddha, either before or after he obtained enlightenment. The accounts, however, vary in many respects. Mara, regarded as the personification of death is in some of the texts 1) the same as the god of love, Kama, in Acūghosha's Buddhacarita. 2) The ways in which Mara tries to influence the Bodhisattva are manifold. He fights him with his army of demons or sends his daughters to seduce him. He offers him his kingdom and his rank, or tells him that he could prevent a horrible war by becoming king and ruling wisely and justly. He brings bad news from Kapilavastu and asks the Bodhisattva to return to his hometown and set matters right, or he tells him to enjoy life and its pleasures. 3)

The attitude of the gods also differs. They are generally neutral and offer flowers to the Bodhisattva after he has emerged victorious from the struggle. In the account given in the Pali Nidānakathā 4), Sakka (Indra) and Brahma take sides with the Bodhisattva. Sakka blowing a conch and Brahma holding a white umbrella, while a Naga praised the Bodhisattva. When, however, Mara's army advanced, they all ran away. Sakka stood at the end of the world, Brahma returned to the Brahma-loka and the Naga lay down in his palace, covering his face with his hands. According to the T'ang Pe-pen-shang-ch'ing, Indra, riding on his elephant Airavata and Varuna, the god of the water, are generals in Mara's army, and the god An-hsiang (peaceful Shiva), the chief of the evil spirits is the first to turn round and flee. 5) This is all the more surprising, as the same text relates that all the gods came to protect and venerate the Bodhisattva when he was born. 6) The four-headed god An-hsiang for instance, was riding on a bull and took an umbrella to protect the newly born child, and Yama came to venerate him after having dismissed his prisoners from hell.

In some instances Mara's weapons are bows and arrows, swords and spears, in others he throws hot coals, ashes, sand and soot at his adversary or hurls rocks and trees at him, or he fights with a number of bad qualities such as passion, delusion and the like, which the Bodhisattva overcomes with their opposites.

5
In Rockhill's 'Life of the Buddha', which is based on the 'Talasen Dam', the account of the temptation is as follows: "Then Mara, the Evil-one, went to him and said: 'Dharmatilaka has retrieved Kapileshvar; he has seized the palace and has crushed the talasen. Why stay you here? He caused apparitions of Yasodhara, of Mridula, and of Coppa, of Dharmatilaka and of the Sakya who had creeped to appear before him, but the Bodhisattva remained unmoved. Then Mara reasoned with him, saying that it was impossible to find enlightenment, but all to no purpose. After that he called his three daughters, De ire, Pleasure and Delight, and they tried all their allurements, but in vain; the Bodhisattva changed them into old hags. All the Evil-one's devices were unable to affect the Bodhisattva, and, seeing this, the deca of the pure abode and all the gods showered down flowers on the conqueror (Dyana), and sang songs of victory.'"

Some of the versions of this episode from Pali and Sanskrit sources have already been compared with each other by E. Windisch in his book 'Buddh and Buddha'. A few Chinese texts will be analysed below. These texts may be grouped together into five groups.

The first group comprises T 59 'Ta-a-hun', the complete 'Sangydajjage-mo and T 100 'Pao-yi Ta-a-hun', in the complete 'Sangydakagome. The temptation of the Buddha of these two texts may be compared with the Pali 'Samyana Nikaya' version, with which they agree in 'ana (sense) with only a few discrepancies in 'yanna (wording). As will be seen below, parts of a version from the Pali 'Samyana', the 'Pahawatana', are incorporated in these texts.

The second group consists of T 1457 'Ko-ga-shou-i-ch' 'shaga-pa-pi-chou-a-yeh, the 'Tinga' of the 'Mla-xa-saradom and T 191 'Fe-shou-chung-hoa-mo-a-ching, 'Sama-adonnikôngapinana. The latter text begins with the appearance of the world at the commencement of kala, and ends with the Buddha's visit to Kapilavastu. This text agrees on the whole with the account given in Rockhill's 'Life of the Buddha'. Apart from the fact that in T 191 the three women who attempt to seduce the Bodhisattva are created by Mara, whereas they are his daughters in T 1457 and that the latter text is more detailed at the end, the two texts agree.

Two Chinese texts make up the third group. T 184 'Ha-sho-hang-pen-ching' and T 185 'Fa-dun' at the 'shou-ting-pen-ching', two biographies of the Buddha translated in 197 A.D. and between 372 and 380 respectively. T 184 is said to have been brought from Kapilavastu by the monk 'Pah-wo-yeh. The more elaborate versions of the episode in question have been grouped together in group four and five. Group four comprises
In Group five we find the longest and most detailed accounts of the temptation. The texts belonging to this group are the Bodhisattva T. 120 in p. 19; the Chº-cheng T. 121 in p. 19; and the Pu-hsin-chºng T. 122. All three have been translated by B. Rhys in his book "The Buddhist Texts of Central Asia." They relate the story of MÁM, who was tempted to become a Bodhisattva, and the other texts relate the story of the Buddha himself.

According to E. Windich, who compared several Pali and Sanskrit versions of the incident, the Bodhisattva T. 121 describes the incident as told by MÁM, the Bodhisattva, while he was being tempted by Mara, the king of the demons. The account describes how Mara tried to tempt the Buddha into falling into temptation. Mara promised the Buddha immortality and wealth if he would accept Mara's realm. The Buddha rejected these offers and Mara was forced to leave. The story is told in detail and is a classic example of the Buddha's resistance to temptation.

A more concise version of this episode is found in the Avadāna-paññatā of the Satisānti-sūtra, where the Buddha recounts the incident to his disciples. According to this account, the Buddha was tempted by Mara, who offered him wealth and power if he would accept Mara's realm. The Buddha rejected these offers and Mara was forced to leave. The story is told in detail and is a classic example of the Buddha's resistance to temptation.

Another account of the episode is found in the Mahāyāna-sūtra, where the Buddha describes the temptation to his disciples. According to this account, the Buddha was tempted by Mara, who offered him wealth and power if he would accept Mara's realm. The Buddha rejected these offers and Mara was forced to leave. The story is told in detail and is a classic example of the Buddha's resistance to temptation.

In the Chinese Tradition, the Sanyō-jōken T. 199 and T. 200 agree with the Pali. According to these two texts, Mara approached the Buddha and offered him wealth and power if he would accept Mara's realm. The Buddha rejected these offers and Mara was forced to leave. The story is told in detail and is a classic example of the Buddha's resistance to temptation.

Another account of the episode is found in the Chinese Tradition, where the Buddha describes the temptation to his disciples. According to this account, the Buddha was tempted by Mara, who offered him wealth and power if he would accept Mara's realm. The Buddha rejected these offers and Mara was forced to leave. The story is told in detail and is a classic example of the Buddha's resistance to temptation.
find something soft, Is it something sweet?" Having obtained nothing sweet there, the crow went away from that spot. Just like the crow approaching the rock, being disgusted, we shall go away from Gotama." 15) The Chinese verses say: "A white stone looked like hard fat. A bird who did not realise this wanted to eat this fat. He did not get anything to eat and hurt its beak. As he returned without getting anything to eat, thus do I return without having obtained my aim." 16

In all the three texts it is said that Mara’s three daughters approached their father and offered to seduce the Buddha. Mara doubted whether this would be possible. The three daughters Rat, Arati and Tasha went to the Buddha, but he paid no attention to them. Thereupon they each took the form of a hundred women of different ages, but to no avail. Each of the three daughters in turn approached the Buddha. Tasha asked him why he stayed alone and did not make friends with people in the village. The Buddha answered him that he had found peace after the vanquishing Mara’s host. Arati then enquired how the Buddha made it possible to cross not only five streams, but also the sea, thus reaching the other shore of desire.16) The Buddha’s answer was that his body as well as his mind were at peace. Finally Raga stated that many people would be released by the Tathagata’s doctrine, and the Buddha confirmed this.

The three daughters then joined their father who told them that it was foolish to attempt to split a rock with stalks of flowers, to dig up a mountain with the fingernails or to eat iron. The Chinese verses add that it was as if they had wanted to catch the wind in a net or push down the moon or empty the ocean with their hands or blow down the Himalayas.

Group II is made up of T 1451 the Vinaya of the Mahasanghika and T 151. These two texts tell us that the Bodhisattva was seated under the Bodhitree. Mara had two banners, one which moved when a happy event was to take place, and the other when some misfortune was at hand. The latter flag moving violently, Mara took the shape of a messenger and approached the Bodhisattva with news from Kapilavastu, saying that Devadatta had entered his palace, violated the women and killed the Sakya.17) The Bodhisattva was affected by these tidings, and three evil thoughts of desire, ill-will and violence arose in him. He realised that these thoughts were due to Mara and he caused thoughts of renunciation, good will and non-violence to arise in him. These two versions are the only ones discussed here in which Mara’s attempts to sway the Bodhisattva from his path have any effect, albeit a temporary one.

Mara then enquired why the Bodhisattva was sitting under the Bodhitree. The Bodhisattva answered that he wanted to obtain enlighten-
mer. He told Mara that he had sacrificed his possessions, life and limbs through countless kalpas, whereas he, Mara, had obtained his rank because of some good deeds done by him, but that nobody would testify to the Bodhisattva's countless sacrifices. The Bodhisattva then touched the earth, and the spirit of the earth appeared as witness for the Bodhisattva.

T 1431 continues by referring to Mara's three daughters, whereas according to T 1397 Mara created three beautiful, bashful young women. These three women, Mara's daughters and his creations, attempted to disturb the Bodhisattva and were turned into old women. Mara then attacked the Bodhisattva with his 36 divisions of troops of demons and wild animals. The Bodhisattva entered into the meditation of compassion. The account of T 1431 is somewhat shorter than that of T 1450. According to the former text, a god of the pure abode created an umbrella and protected the Bodhisattva from all the missiles hurled at him and turned them into all kinds of flowers. The Bodhisattva then performed miracles, sitting, standing and walking in the air and issuing water and fire from his body. T 1450 tells us that Mara's weapons were turned into flowers. The earth Mara raised onto his opponent was turned into fragrant substances. A god of the pure abode then created a canopy of flowers and the venomous insects Mara sent forth could not reach the Bodhisattva. Mara then thought of turning the leaves of the Bodhitree into instruments and causing the wind to blow and produce a horrible sound. The Bodhisattva's meditation was not disturbed. The gods of the pure abodes came down to help, each one took hold of one leaf so that they could not move in the wind. As Mara's army was not yet willing to disperse, the gods united and threw Mara onto a mountain. The Bodhisattva then performed miracles. This last feature is found only in these two versions.

T 181 and 185, Hsiu-hung-pen-ch'ih-t'ing and fu-shou t'o-tsu-shui-pen-ch'ih-t'ing form the third group. Both versions agree with each other literally. The Bodhisattva was sitting under the Bodhitree and a light from the spot between his eyebrows entered Mara's palace and frightened him. Mara's son Suvatt warred his father not to fight the Bodhisattva, whose conduct was pure, but Mara did not listen. His daughters offered to seduce the Bodhisattva. Together with 500 attendants they went to the Bodhitree, playing the lute and singing and offered their services to the Bodhisattva. He told them: You are like beautifully painted vases full of filth. You do not pay heed to the fact that everything is impermanent and that you will be reborn in the three evil existences. Since innumerable ages I was free from desire and regarded women either as mothers or as elder or younger sisters. Return to your palace and do not again disturb people.
these words he turned them into old women, Maha grew furious and smashed the jewels on his head in anger, but they were not able to go near him. The Bodhisattva then spoke some verses in which he said that he had served the Buddha, had seen the past, and that he himself would become the Buddha Sakayamun. Mara's boots will be occupied and his son will beg forgiveness.

The three texts of group IV are the prakrti-circa, T 189 kosala- 
chintitajyajamah, and T 194 karma-sahajangam. The latter text is a tantric biography in verse. The katti-pañcītratā, T 2064, a catalogue of Buddhist scriptures written in 950 C.E., says of this work on p. 89:

"Some say this work, has been composed by A. Kingsuki.

This remark is also found in T 189's letter from landed property grant. 39 p., whereas Nalaka says the author of this work is unknown. 39 t. This must be the case, as it is highly搅拌 (i.e., that Aangalika should have written two books)." 39 p. has 93 s., the Kalachāra and T 194 have, however, many verses in common.

In T 189 two sisters of Mara appear, Myagka and Kāli, who are also mentioned in gāthā (thrice, 93 p.):

khamu, paramānā kale chamān

buddhāram ba tayānagam na pagau

culamuttu buddhāvagamam

The translation of this verse by I.S. Johnson is as follows: "But a woman, black as a cloud, with a skunk in her hands, wandered about there, unceasingly, and did not remain still, with the intention of detaining the great sir's heart, and resembling the intelligence of a man of inconstant mind, wandering uncertainly among the various sacred traditions." In a footnote Johnson refers to the Chinese text, in which Myagkali is taken as a proper name. As Myagkali is female, two women must be meant. In T 191 Mara turns a woman black as a cloud, who wandered about aimlessly. 39 t.

T 193 has a feature not found in any of the other texts: Indra, Varuṇa, Śiva, and other gods fight in Mara's army. The Bodhisattva's and Mara's weapons are good but bad qualities respectively. The gāthā against the other hand is the only text which mentions these two sons of Mara, Vihāra, Harsha and Daśa. It also states very clearly that Mara is the same as the god of love, Kamā:

pam kumārdena pravajñata bhe ca vajra-dhāna pāramānāra
luttāntaṃ tattvādham na kumāra

Him, whom in the world they call the god of love, him of the bright weapon and also the flower arrowed, that same one as the mother

10
activities of the passions and the story of liberation they unfold."  
24) This character of Mara's is also applied to in T.49, where the five flower arrows of Mara are mentioned.

According to the Buddhavamsa and T.49, the Buddhasweta was meditating under the Buddhabrut. Mara was depressed, and three sons in Buddhasweta were not called into existence by their father why this was so. Mara told them the reason. Shatru advised his father not to fight the Buddhasweta. In both texts, Mara remained the Buddhasweta of the three sons to the Buddhabrut. It was not true that he should become a meditator. As he Buddhasweta will not have to deal with Mara, Shatru charged an arrow, but both his companions this trio had no effect. In the Buddhavamsa, Mara's three daughters are also briefly mentioned, whereas T.49 says they failed to the Buddhasweta and were turned into old women. Mara himself left his palace and his rank to the Buddhasweta. The Buddhasweta was not interested in this offer and called Mara as a friend for his merits. The spirit of the earth testified for the Buddhasweta, sided with Mara, and the spirits were angry with Mara. T.49 says blood oozed from their pores. The gods of the pure air, according to T.49, assisted the Buddhasweta, whereas the Buddhavamsa says, "The gods of the pure air always developed compassion in their minds, but were angered by anger because they were from from all passion." 25) The pious conclusion alike in both texts; an invisible spirit in the sky administered Mara to designate, and Mara finally turned away vanished.

The summary of T.49 is as follows: When the Buddhasweta meditated under the Buddhabrut, the earth shook, and Mara asked his minister what the meaning of the earthquakes was. The minister informed him that the destruction of this Buddhabrut was about to obtain enlightenment. Mara's daughters asked their father why he was depressed, and he told them the reason and asked them to hinder the saint. They attempted to influence the Buddhasweta and were turned into old women. Mara then called the army and mounted a splendid chariot. He went to the Buddhasweta and asked him to enjoy life and rule as a king. The Buddhasweta remained calm, even when an arrow was shot at him. Mara then decided to fight, heard, who carried a thunderbolt and had a thousand eyes on his body named it elephant. Ativasa. He was followed by silver chariots drawn by white horses and white eagles. The god of the waters, Varuna, rose a golden chariots drawn by a thousand noble lions. Valmikana led a host of sabhas, gods and demons on various mounts. Lions, peacocks, tigers, donkeys, camel and horses worshiped. Some rode on eagles and spit fire, others hid animal heads and horrid shapes, they all were armed with various weapons and making horrible noises,
they attacked the Bodhisattva, who remained calm and caused flowers to fall. Mara then created a woman like a black cloud to confuse the Bodhisattva. A god asked Mara to desist, wherupon Mara grew more furious and hurled the fire of desire against the Bodhisattva, who created rain clouds to put out the fire. The god An-hsiang, the greatest of the spirits, (Shiva), withdrew. Mara brought earth anger and hatred and the whole world was full of venomous snakes. By meditating on compassion, the snakes were destroyed by the Bodhisattva. Mara brought forth delusion, but the Bodhisattva whitened. Mara shot the arrow of illusory form and created a nag. The Bodhisattva shot the arrow "compassion" and created a garuda, which destroyed the naga. Mara shot with the weapon "pride" and created an elephant. The Bodhisattva shot with the ten powers (25) and created a lion which chased the elephant. Mara shot with the weapon "lies" and created wind. The Bodhisattva shot with truth and created a mountain. Mara shot with avance and created fog. The Bodhisattva shot with liberality and created a rainbow so that the fog disappeared. Mara shot downwind and created a cloud, the Bodhisattva shot the five purities (36) and created a breeze which dispersed the cloud. Mara shot wrong views and created darkness which enveloped the world. The Bodhisattva shot right views and created a sun which illuminated the world. The Bodhisattva denied the armor of patience and put the foot of discipline firm onto the earth, he adorned himself with the jewels of energy and meditation and took the bow "compassion" and the arrow "brahmanic state" from the quiver "noble" and he obtained victory. The gods of the pure abodes advised Mara to desist. It might be possible, they said, to deprive all beings of their own nature, but not to hinder the Bodhisattva's course. The account ends with the ceiling of the earth as witness to the Bodhisattva's good deeds and the final defeat of Mara.

The last group consists of the Lokavistara (EV) Chapter XXI, T 196 Fu-pen-hsing-hi-chang, which has been translated by S. Beal under the title The Romancic History of Sakya Bodhis. T 185 Pu-yao-ching. Beal began to translate the latter text too, but he found the text so corrupt and imperfect and the style of the composition so inflated that he gave up the task.\(^2\) The episode of the Buddha's temptation according to these three texts is as follows: T 186, LV and T 193 say that the Bodhisattva went a ray into Mara's palace and that Mara had 32 dreams foreboding evil. He called his adherents together and told them of his dreams, and of a voice he had heard telling him of the Bodhisattva who would obtain enlightenment. A son called Shresthi in T 190 and Sathvaca in LV and T 186 required why his father looked so pale and worried and he advised him not to fight. T 190 relates that the Bodhisattva approached an Anura tree. The gods, wishing to indicate the proper Bodhi-tree, hung garlands on it. A Yaksha deputed another Yaksha, Red-eyes, to warn Mara. Mara ordered the Yakshas to hinder the Bodhi-
attva going to the right tree. The Yakshas and the guardian spirit of the wood praised the Bodhisattva. Mara approached the Bodhi-tree and asked the Bodhisattva to go to some other place, which the Bodhisattva refused to do. Mara took the shape of a messenger-bringing letters from Kapilavastu, informing the Bodhisattva that Devadatta had usurped the government and invited Mara to Suddhodana. The Bodhisattva remained firm and the tree spirits protected him. LV, T 186 and T 190 continue by relating the conversation between Mara, his minister and his son, ten of whom took sides with the Bodhisattva, dissuading their father from attacking, while 500 others urged him on. In the following passage, the three accounts again diverge. T 186 says that Mara sent his four daughters to seduce the Bodhisattva, while T 190 mentions Mara's female attendants, who were deputed by Mara to this end, and later he sent his three daughters. LV mentions daughters of Mara without giving their number. On their father's instigation, they attempted to seduce the Bodhisattva, and their father scolded them for being unable to do so. According to T 190, when the women saw that the Bodhisattva was not to be moved, they went away wishing him success, while according to T 186 they are turned into old women. The account continues by Mara asking the Bodhisattva once more to leave the Bodhi-tree and enjoy life and when Mara saw this did not impress the Bodhisattva, he told him he would be able to present a terrible war by righteous government. Mara then rushed at the Bodhisattva with his army of demons. The weapons that were thrown turned into flowers. Mara's son Shrihari begged his father to desist, and so did a god of the pure abodes. The gods assisted the Bodhisattva, who emerged victorious from the battle and gained supreme enlightenment. LV too has a long—description of Mara's army followed by discussions between Mara's sons and finally Mara's attack. Mara fought with ten different means, wind, rain, stones, weapons, coal, ash, sand, mud and darkness. Mara, sitting on his elephant Shrinkhala, fled, returned again and hurled his disc at the Bodhisattva but he was finally defeated, all his weapons having turned into flowers.

LV then mentions eight rice spirit, while T 186 refers to the spirits without giving their number. They uttered sixteen benedictions, and the gods of the pure abodes uttered sixteen curses against Mara in LV, eighteen in T 186. The spirits of the Bodhi-tree also cursed Mara in sixteen manners. In both accounts, LV and T 186 a conversation between the Bodhisattva and Mara follows. A number of these verses agree literally. T 186 ends with verses already found in T 184 and T 185.

As can be seen from the above summary of some sections of the temptation of the Buddha, there are many different accounts of the same episode. The versions differ from each other in important ways, like
1. a) the temptation takes place in front the enlightenment:
   T 184, 185, 186, 190, LV, 191, 193, Ec, T 1429
   b) after the enlightenment
   SN, MS, T 99, 100

2. a) The idolatries challenge Moses
   T 184, 185, 190, LV, T 186
   b) Moses is warned by two brasses
   T 191, 1950
   c) not men tred
   Be, Sn, HS
   d) Moses is warned by an earthquake
   T 186, 193
   e) Men in his 53 dreams foreboding evil
   T 186, LV, T 193

3. Moses's family
   a) not mentioned
   Sn
   b) three daughters
   MS, T 99, 100, 184, 186 (compared by 100 attendants)
   189, 190 (collect attendants) 193, Be, T 1418
   LV (three daughters are mentioned in a second consumption
   after the enlightenment)
   c) four daughters
   T 186
   d) one son
   T 184, 185, 189
   e) three sons
   Be
   f) thousand sons
   T 190, LV, T 186
   g) two sisters
   Be, T 189

4. a) Moses's daughters go to the idolatries on their own accord
   MS, T 99, 100, 185, 186
   b) they are seen by their father
   T 186, LV, Be of V.c. go with him : T 189, Be, T 193
   c) they are turned into old women
   T 184, 185, 186, 189, 191, 193, 1429

14
Men's proposals

a) He should enjoy life.
   T 192, 196
b) He should perform sacrifices.
   T 193, 194

c) He should live like a kshatriya.
   Bv, T 185, 191, 190
d) He should return to Kapilavastu.
   T 191, 1439

e) He should rule in Men's world.
   T 189

f) He should prevent a terrible war.
   T 190

g) He should join men, but should not preach.
   T 99, 100, 101

6. The earth contributes to the Buddha's miracle.
   T 189, 193, LV

NOTES

2. See below, p. 11.
3. See below, p. 18 for a detailed list.
5. T 192, p. 77 b.
8. Windisch, F., Mara and Buddha, Leipzig 1895.
12. Stoebe, p. 76.
14. This title is also found in Majjima Nikaya, I, 234.
16. F. Jelgerton, E., *Buddhist Hybrid Sanskrit Dictionary*, New Haven, 1933 s.v. *oghā* referring to the *Suttapañna 159*; it is not clear what is meant by the five and six streams. From the Chinese it might seem that the five streams are connected with the five scent, the sixth with wind.

17. According to T 131 he brought letters from Buddhodana, according to T 1450 he came running with a verbal message.


19. The *tattvaratna*, Chapter XXII, ed. P. L. Vaidya, *Dhūlīnaya 1928* p. 253 (501; 2445) states that the Buddha rose in the air to the height of seven palm trees, as the gods expected him to make a sign after the enlightenment. No reason is given in our texts.


22. In *Majjhima Nikāya* I, 331 a Mara of a previous age, who is Meghālāha in this age is mentioned. He had a sister, Kali, whose son is the Mara of the present age.

23. *Buddhacarita*, XIII, 2

24. *Buddhacarita*, XIII, 11


26. It is not clear what these five parties are.

27. Sacred Books of the East, Vol. XIX, p. IX.

28. In *Lattituturā*, Chapter XXIV, three daughters of Murašaṇa are mentioned who approached the Buddha after the enlightenment.

29. An elephant *Girimukha* is mentioned in the *Nadakāśa*, p. 73
Abbreviations
(Please refer to bibliography)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Acronym</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Bc</td>
<td>Buddhacarita</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LV</td>
<td>Lalitavistara</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MS</td>
<td>Mahasanghika</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SBE</td>
<td>Sacred Books of the East</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sn</td>
<td>Suttapiṭaka</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SN</td>
<td>Satsuyutta Nikaya</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>T</td>
<td>Tanbo Dainyo, Tokyo 1927–33</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Books Consulted:

**Pali and Sanskrit Texts**

*Maravijayata, Sujata Niyaya, ed. PTS*
*Pudhanayata, Suttanipata, PTS*
*Nidanakatha, Jatake Vol. 1*
*Mayhama Niyaya*

The Buddha-sutra, ed. E.S. Johnston, Delhi 1977
*Lalitavistara, ed. P.B. Vaidya, Buddhist Sanskrit Texts No.1*
*Darbhanga 1958*

**Chinese Texts**

| T 99 | Ts'a-hun, the complete Sanyakagama |
| T 100 | Pi-ye Ts'a-hun, an incomplete Sanyakagama |
| T 124 | Hui-hsiang-pao-ch'ih-ching translated 1537 A.D. by Chou Ta-li and Kung Meng-hsin |
| T 185 | Fu-shou-chu-tzu-shui p'ing pao-ch'ih-ching translated by Ch'ien between 122 and 280 A.D. |
| T 186 | Fu-pao-ching translated 308 A.D. by Dharmaraksa |
| T 189 | Kuan-ch'iu-tzu-mai-yin-huo-ching (Arithmopagansurenstra) translated by Gunicshin 470 and 479 A.D. |
| T 190 | Fu-pao-ching-ki-ching (Akshinakramastu) translated by Jinan Gupta - Romantic History of Sakyamuni Buddha, translated by S. Beal |
| T 191 | Fu-shou-chang-hsun-ma-ti-chung translated by Fu-hsien in the 10th century |
| T 193 | Tsao-pao-ching (Buddhapavacanatara) translated by Po-yun 437-449 A.D. |
| T 1450 | Ken-shou-i-ch'ih-yung's tai-yeh Vimala of the Mulasarvastivadins |
| T 2034 | Li Tai an pao chi by Fei Chang-feng-feng 397 A.D. |


Real, S., The Buddhist History of Salwa Buddha from the Chinese-Sanskrit, London 1875

Charpentier, J., Das Mahayana Yana in Mahavarta, Wiener Zeitschrift für die Kunde des Morgenlandes, XXIII, 1909

Edgerton, F., Buddhist Hybrid Sanskrit Grammar and Dictionary, William Dwight Whitney Linguistc Series, New Haven '959


The Buddhist Conception of Mara in: Buddhistic Studies, ed. B.C. Law, Calcutta 1932

Malabareza, G.P., A Dictionary of Pali Proper Names, London 1960

Nanjio, H., A Catalogue of the Chinese Translations of the Buddhist Tripitaka, Oxford 1883

Olenberg, H., Der Satan des Buddhismus, Deutsche Rundschau, LXXXVIII, 1896

Fryer, J., La place de Mara dans la mythologie bouddhique, Journal Asiatique, CXX, 1927


Ein zweites Danisbambau, Mitteilungen des Institutes für Orientforschung, VI, 1,1938

Windsich, E., Mara und Buddha, Leipzig 1895
THE STORY OF RUPANANDA FROM BAMIYAN, AFGHANISTAN

As is well known, Afghanistan was an important centre of Buddhism and Buddhist art during the early centuries of the Christian era. Begun, Hadda, Bamiyan and several other sites have provided abundant material for the study of Buddhist religion and art from the Kushan times to C. seventh-eighth century. Of all the sites, Bamiyan offers the highest attraction. While the other Buddhist remains have very much crumbled and fallen into ruins, the rock-cut caves of Bamiyan have still remained in spite of long neglect, vicissitudes and human vandalism much of its old grandeur in the form of many interesting paintings and sculptures.

Bamiyan, being on the old silk route, was a meeting place of many peoples and cultures, and as such Bamiyan art shows a cosmogony of traditions, Indian, Sassanian and Chinese with the native or local styles.

The object of this paper is to offer a new interpretation or identification of a wall painting (pl. 1) from Bamiyan, (occurring on the niche of the 5 cm. Buddha) which has been described by Benjamin Rowland as Bodhisattva Maitreya and his Sakti:

The main or central figure is seated on an elaborate throne inside a shrine with a domed top. His legs are crossed at the ankles (and not shown interlocked in yoga), while the hands are in vishvamudra (the gesture of discussion or teaching). Except for a narrow scarf, he is nude from the waist, though for his lower garment he has an elaborate dhoti reaching his ankles. He seems, however, to be endowed with a necklace, and bracelets.

Beside this main figure, stands a female figure beneath a tree, with these figures show great charm and grace, typical of the classical Gupta style. In describing the beauty of the female figure, Rowland says, "...she vouchs for provocative charms, beside the throne of the great soft-bellied Bodhisattva; entirely nude she bends graciously forward, stretching forth her flower-like hand from beneath a tree that twists and writhes in a curiously twisting way, the contours of the trunk and the finger like branches suggesting the insinuating curves of the lady in its shade."

20
Rowland identifies the main figure as Bodhisattva Maitreya on the basis of the similarity of the sitting posture and hand gesture of the present figure with those of the countless Bodhisattvas (specially labelled as Bodhisattva Maitreya) in the cave-temple at Lungmen in China. Further, Rowland seems to have been led to this belief by his supposition that over the throne, there is a sopha, an attribute associated with the future Buddha (Maitreya) and not employed for the Bodhisattvas. Regarding the female figure Rowland does not explain his reasons for describing her as the 'Sakti of Maitreya.

Rowland's identification, which he calls, however, of a probable nature does not seem to be supported by facts. The main figure here is seated on a throne inside a shrine with a domed top. There is no sopha over the throne, as supposed by him. Further, this figure does not hold any other known attribute of Maitreya, such as a nectar vase or a Nagakeara flower. The gandharas or Kushan sculptures of Maitreya are found to hold a nectar jug, one of his distinguishing characteristics, which is missing in the present case.

As is being explained below, the present painting seems to illustrate the story of Buddha's teaching to Rupananda or Janapadakalyani on the impermanence of form of beauty; at Jetavana, the grove which was presented by prince Jeta in Bravasti for the use of Buddha and his community.

The story which occurs in the Dharmapada-antakrsha 4 tells us that Janapadakalyani possessed great charm and she was very much conscious of it. Feeling that her brother (Buddha himself), her husband (Nanda) and other kinsfolk have become monks and her mother has also become a nun, she joined the Buddhist community as a nun. This was, however, not out of her faith in the doctrine but of her love of the kinsfolk. Because she possessed great beauty, she came to be called Rupananda.

One day Buddha said, "Beauty of form is impermanent, involved in suffering, unreal, so likewise are sensation, perception, the aggregate of mental states, consciousness, impermanence, involved in suffering." 5 This put Rupananda to think that if she met Buddha face to face, he would find fault with her beauty. Therefore, she avoided seeing the Master face to face.

Once having heard the nuns praise her brother, i.e. the Buddha, in extravagant phrases, she (Rupananda) made up her mind to go with the other nuns to listen to his instructions without letting herself being seen by Buddha.

22
Buddha, however, came to know through his spiritual vision that Rupamanda would come to pay respects to him and thought that it would be good to her if he could curb her pride in her beauty.

When Rupamanda came and sat behind the nuns, Buddha created a phantom of a young woman as beautiful as the full moon. Seeing this, Rupamanda considered her own beauty as of no consequence. Buddha then transformed the woman into a middle-aged person and through vagrages ultimately to an old, decrepit woman who has enough sufferings and died in misery. Rupamanda’s heart became filled with disgust and she could re-live the impermanence of her own beauty and her mind sprang forth to meditation.

Buddha said to her, ‘Nanda, think not, there is reality in this body. It is a city of bones, plastered with flesh and blood, where lodge old age and death and pride and deceit.

The present painting does not depict all the details of the story. We do not feel in the picture the phantom of any beautiful woman Buddha created to curb the pride of Rupamanda, nor do we find here the nuns behind whom, Rupamanda took her seat in the congregation. Art is suggestive and it is an accepted fact that the artist need not follow in his work all the details of a story. In conformity to this, the artist of Banraksha seems to have been selective. To make the point clear the Je. Vani in Sravasti, where the Buddha preached the law of impermanence of beauty to Rupamanda is suggested by a tree beneath which Rupamanda (whom Rowland describes as Bodhisatta Maitreya’s Sakti) stands. That this female figure probably represents Rupamanda is, can be inferred also from the exquisite beauty invested in it by the artist.

Further, the story that Rupamanda, who was conscious of her beauty and avoided the Master seeing face to face has been very skillfully depicted, by the artist as he has shown her not in front of Buddha but by his side beneath a tree.

Again, there is hardly any doubt that the main figure is of Buddha, with elongated ear and short hair characteristic of Buddha figures. The only deviations seem to be the ornament on his body. But it is well known that the concept of ornament and bejeweled Buddha, many examples of which we find in the early medieval period, were perhaps taking shape from now, i.e., in seventh century to which the present painting can be attributed on stylistic grounds.

From the preceding, it is clear that there is no plausibility in Rowland’s suggested identification of the present scene as one of Maitreya and
his fakir on the other hand, when one considers the details of this painting against the background of the Rupananda story, one feels inclined to hold that the scene depicts Buddha's instructions to Rupananda on the impermanence of the beauty of form.

Though Mahayana Buddhism with Tantrik elements including the worship of female principles developed in different parts of India and Afghanistan, since Asanga's time, i.e., 2nd-3rd century A.D., still Hinayana Buddhism held its sway for a considerable time. The art of Ajanta Bamiyan and of Central Asia till the seventh-eighth century was predominantly of Hinayana inspiration. Hence, there is nothing surprising in finding Hinayana scenes depicted in Bamiyan as late as the sixteenth-seventeenth century. That Bamiyan was an important stronghold of Hinayana Buddhism during the period in question is evident also from the account of the Chinese pilgrim Huen Tsang.

Before we conclude, it may be mentioned that not many representations of the Rupananda story are found. In addition to the present one, there is a fragmentary Amaravati sculpture showing this story as identified by Sivaramamurti.

---

**FOOT NOTES**


3. *Ibid*.


5. *Ibid*.


A TRANSLATION OF THE BIOGRAPHY OF THE MAHASIDDHA INDRABHUTI
WITH NOTES.

Nathan Katz

THE LIFE OF GURU I. NDRA. BHULTI

1. As for the account of Guru Indrabhuti:
2. In the country of U.γγακ., there were five hundred thousand cities.
3. Two kings ruled them.
4. Indrabhuti ruled the two hundred fifty thousand cities of Sam.βφλα.
5. At the same time, King La.γα.δρα. ruled the two hundred fifty thousand cities of La.γγαγαβαεν.
6. To the king of Sam.βφλα, Indrabhuti, there was a sister, La.κασμεν. Νας, so-called, who was seven years old.
7. (La.κασμεν. Νας) was given to the son of the king of Langkaburti,
Jalandra, because of the asking (for her hand).
8. King Indrabhuti gathered all of his ministers, and while they were advising (him) (they said):
9. "Jalandra does not practice Dharma. Except for that, all other things are equal," and, so saying, it was promised to give (La.κασμεν. Νας).
10. To a messenger they said: "There is a difference between one who practices Dharma and one who does not practice Dharma.
(Nevertheless) we will join families." And they sent him back.
11. After that, in the following year, the son (of Jalandra) came to Sam.βφλα.
12. He met with La.κασμεν. Νας, and then departed to his own country.
13. Indrabhuti bestowed and sent many presents of gold, silver, horses, cows, and the like.
14. He (the prince) set out towards his own country, and his father said: "Where is your wife?"
15. Because the daughter was young, they wouldn't let her go," he said.
16. (The father) said: "That's proper!"
17. At that time, Indrabhuti had many wives.
18. Because they all had nothing but fringes in the Dharma, the nobility, together with the queens, after requesting from Lama Va.βα.βα.aa.
initiation and spiritual instruction, were striving for attainment.

19. When the lady had attained the age of sixteen years, Jalandra sent a message about the method of giving the lady into marriage.

20. Since the lady's mind was depressed towards the world, (she) did her siddhi.

21. While attaining the siddhi of 'earth-discovering', (she) welcomed sweepers and the like.

22. Those who had gone to heaven are made clear in the lady's own biography.

23. After that, King Jalandra gave a message to King Indrabhuti with news about the way the lady was doing: "The 'earth-discovering' which has brought about the generation of the lady is proper. (But) making oneself peaceful and blissful is not proper," he said.

24. After that, Indrabhuti thought: "The unfairness of my sister's being born is piling up. To the fact that I am of little benefit to the kingdom, there is great retribution. It is necessary that I give it up and practice Dharma," he thought.

25. He entrusted the kingdom to his own son and made him attain a good house.

26. After twelve years, he attained to Mahamudra.

27. Since the retinue didn't know (about this), the son and the retinue of subjects set out to see (him).

28. They commenced to open the door of that one (house). From the sky, (they heard):

29. "Do not open the door. I am here," he (Indrabhuti) said.

30. Hearing this, (they) looked to the sky and they saw that he was dwelling there.

31. Then there was born the joy of having attained as much as the first bhumi.

32. Saluting according to their faith, they sat down to one side.

33. Having stayed in the sky for seven days, the royal father, to the son and the retinue of subjects, said:

34. "Thought cannot penetrate the depth and excellence of the Dharma."

35. Together with the retinue of seven hundred people, he went to heaven with this very body.

36. The account of Guru Indrabhuti is complete.
NOTES ON THE TRANSLATION

2. Učgamt. Skt. Uddāya. Presently Swat State in the Paki-
tast Himalayas; also the home of Gious Rinpoche.

6. Sambhoda. Spelling resembles Sambhūla., a mythic Tibetan
paradise-realm. Although Sambhūla. is usually said to be in the
north, Sambhoda. is to the west.

9. "does not practice Dharma": is not a Buddhist.

13. Indrabhuti sends gifts as dowry. It is customary in many Eastern
countries to have a two-stage marriage: a betrothal, at which time
dowries are paid and the union is often consummated; and a
wedding held some time later.

18. "nothing but faith in the Dharma": This implies faith as opposed
to experience and direct knowledge. Because of this lack, the
wives are seeking the teachings.

18. Lhama We-ba-pa.: Literally, the one with a goitre.

19. We assume that the wedding took place at this time. This would
account for Lhokshumka's depressed state as described in line
twenty.

20. "mind was depressed toward the world": Tib. yid ybyud.
This may also be translated as "to renounce".

21. "earth-discovering" siddhi. We do not know just what this
siddhi is. However the image of getting in touch with the basic
facts of the world is carried through in her acquaintance with the
sweepers, who occupy a very low caste position.

22. This topic is discussed in the biography of Lhokshumka, who is
also one of the 84 Mahārṣikhas. This story now returns to
Indrabhuti.

23. Probably lalanda is upset with Lhokshumka's unorthodox behavior,
although he does respect her spiritual accomplishments. In his
Hindu kingdom, the idea of a princess (of kṣatriya caste) associating
with sweepers is quite outrageous.

24. This is the turning-point of Indrabhuti's life, and is a common
motive in the lives of the Mahārṣikhas. We find similar inspira-
ations in the lives of Tilopa., Naropa., and others.

25. "attain a good house": Probably an idiom referring to
Indrabhuti's getting the affiIy of state in order for the
transference of power to his son.

27
31. "the first bhumi": Tib. sa.dung.po.
32. "sat down to one side": A way of showing respect to an exalted person.
35. "went to heaven in this very body": This refers either to immortality or, more likely, to the siddhi of 'skywalking', which is spontaneously attained in many of these biographies. (Mircea Eliade, in his studies on Shamanism, concludes that references to flying are a way of speaking about ecstasy).
THE NAMGYAL INSTITUTE OF TIBETOLOGY

A short note on the Namgyal Institute of Tibetology has appeared in the Bulletin of Tibetology, Vol X, No. 1. In this note attempts is made to complete or update the information.

The Namgyal Institute of Tibetology is a unique contribution to the cause of learning. The work of Tibetology means the study of the Chhos (Dharma) and the culture and culture and sciences associated with Chhos. Chhos has been the energising force in the spiritual, social and cultural life of the people living in the vast mass of land form the southern slopes of the Himalaya to the northern slopes of the Altai Karakoram and even beyond.

The Foundation Stone of the Institute was laid by His Holiness the Dalai Lama on the 10th February 1957 and the Institute was declared open by the late Prime Minister of India Mr Jawaharlal Nehru on the 1st October, 1958. According to the Charter of Incorporation dated 28th October, 1931 granted by the Chogyal XI, the Institute enjoys the status of an autonomous body with a Governing Council to administer it. It is financed by the Government of Sikkim and the Government of India on a matching basis. The present Chogyal has been the President of the Governing Council from its inception and as a result of his leadership and interest the Institute has grown to its present stage. It has now been listed in the International publication like the "World of Learning" the "International Universities Bureau", etc. the "Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development". The building of the Institute is one of the most imposing Monuments in Sikkim. It is a splendid example of Sikkimese architecture by virtue of its pagoda-like tin roofs, painted turquoise. The building was incomplete in so far as the two rear towers consisting of six rooms had yet to be completed. The work of completion of the two rear towers was undertaken in 1971 and completed in the latter half of 1972 and thus has provided much needed space. Further, more staff quarters have been constructed during 1974 on the premises especially for the lower paid staff.

Security arrangements have also been installed in the building to prevent fire and theft.

The Chogyal has empowered the Institute to cover the study of the doctrines of all associated Sects and Schools of Mahayana Buddhism. Consequently under the powers of the Charter the Institute has been
collecting books of all the Sects and has a representative collection of over 30,000 books and treatises in Nyingmapa, Kargyupa, Sakya and Gelugpa works. Further some rare Lepcha manuscripts have been added to the collection. During 1971-73 the Institute acquired manuscripts and xylographs totaling 354 from Mr. G. Tharchin, who also established a programme of lectures. In 1974 the Institute purchased a total of 157 Tibetan books consisting of 36 xylographs, 41 manuscripts and 80 printed books apart from 109 books for the General library. Thus this Institute is a unique public establishment in the province of Nyingpo anywhere in the Tibetan-speaking countries where books of different Sects are being stored and preserved in one repository. As such this Institute may be destined to serve the interests of Choix in a more lasting manner than perhaps any establishment anywhere in the Malaya world.

Over the years the technical and administrative full-time staff of the Institute has grown from 3 in 1959 to 17 in 1972 and 19 at present. Furthermore, the present technical strength is 18 as against 4 in 1971 and 7 in 1973. In addition three learned Lamas, Dodrup Chen Rimpoché, Lhodö Zangpo and Ngyawang Rimpoché are attached to the Institute to advice and act as consultants.

Apart from providing research facilities to scholars interested in the study of Chos, the learned Lamas and scholars are engaged in research activities, imparting instruction in the Holy Dharma and the teaching of Tibetan language.

The Institute brings out regular publications of its Bulletin of Tibetology. Articles from learned scholars on religion and philosophy figure particularly in the issues of the Bulletin. So also there are contributions on linguistics and philology, history and social institutions of Tibet and epigraphy and geography. In addition to the Bulletin of Tibetology, some of the other important publications are:

(i) Vimsatika Vijnaptimatratra-Siddhi
(ii) Socha Gyalo Korzeü
(iii) Melong gel-chen-yan-can-rreg-gi-tsel-tsho Nying-po
(iv) Pug-nag-Drung Mchog-Gnyis (reprinted 1979)

The Institute has a programme of initiating study along a few lines viz (a) Tibetan Medicine, (b) Translation of Tibetan works, (c) Collection of Tibetan works and (d) Tibetan Art.

Apart from these important developments, the Institute awards scholarships to young scholars for full-time research work, has initiated a project for the establishment of a Museum and introduced a guide-
system. The Museum Project is nearing completion and during the year the Institute undertook a programme to reproduce xylograph books of important works from blocks preserved at the Institute and from individuals. These are sold at the counter almost at cost price for the benefit of devotees and others interested.

To help facilitate study, there is a Hostel attached to the Institute where genuine scholars can stay at a small charge.

A. M. D'ROZARIO.
Price Rupees Six

The Institute is an autonomous organisation administered by a
Governing Body.

President of the Governing Body—The Chegyal of Sikkim
Director—A.M.D’Rosario, Ph.D. (Cantab), Dip. Ed (Cantab)
Assistant Director—Mr Tashi Denspa, M.A. (USA)—on leave
Acting Assistant Director—Rechung Rinpoche—Called for
Geshi Lharampa (Tibet)

Ven Dorjrup Chen Rinpoche—Learned Lama
Khenpo Lhoko Zango—Learned Lama
Ngawang Rinpoche—Learned Lama
Kunga Yonten Hochotsang—Research Officer
Tsuring T. Bhutia—Microfilm Assistant
Junpeyshi Lama—Research Assistant
Kalang Lama—Tibetan Librarian
Sherab Ralshi—Assistant
Karma Lhendup—Assistant.