The Bulletin of Tibetology seeks to serve the specialist as well as the general reader with an interest in this field of study. The motif portraying the Stupa on the mountains suggests the dimensions of the field.

EDITORS
JAMPAL K. RECHUNG
KUNGA YONTEN HOC'OTSANG
BHAJACOVINDA GHOSH
Price per copy Rs. 10/-
CONTENTS

EARLY TIBETAN LAW CONCERNING DOG-BITE
- Hage Richardson  5

REBIRTH IN BUDDHIST LOGIC
- J.K. Rechung  11

STUPAS OF PREVIOUS BUDDHAS
- B. Ghosh  17

NOTES & TOPICS
- J.K. Rechung  25
CONTRIBUTORS IN THIS ISSUE:

RICH EDWARD RICHARDSON leading authority on Tibet past and present; epigraphist and historian; reads, writes and speaks Tibetan like one born in Tibet; lived more than two decades in Asia: India, Tibet and China; held diplomatic assignments in Lhasa (1936-40 and 1946-49) and Chungking (1942-44): for several terms professor in Tibetan language and History at University of Washington, Seattle, U.S.A.; recipient of the Gold Medal of the Royal Central Asian Society, U.K.; Fellow, King's College, Oxford; Fellow British Academy.

JAMPAL KUNZANG RECHUNG comes of the Yabshi Phuenshang House, Lhasa; had higher studies in Drigung Monastic University of Leling Datsang and was conferred the title of Geshe Lharampa; had studied modern subjects in India, Holland and England collaborating with Tibetologists; currently Director, Sikkim Research Institute of Tibetology; Author of Tibetan Medicine.

BHARADWAJA GHOSH had lessons in Brahminic and Buddhist literature; was sometime in Asiatic Society, Calcutta. Curator of Museum and manuscript section, currently Librarian, Sikkim Research Institute of Tibetology.

Views expressed in the Bulletin of Tibetology are those of the contributors and not of the Sikkim Research Institute of Tibetology. An article represents the private individual views of the author and does not reflect those of any office or institution with which the author may be associated. The editors are the publishers of the article(s); copyright of an article belongs to the author, unless otherwise indicated.
EARLY TIBETAN LAW
CONCERNING DOG-BITE

- HUGH RICHARDSON

The Tibetan Chronicle from Tunhuang shows that by the eighth or ninth century Srong-btsern sgam-po was regarded as having established "a great code of supreme law"—gtug-lag bka’-grims ched-po (p.118); and the Annals record that six years after Srong-btsern’s death the Chief Minister Mgar Ston-gtshan Yul-zung wrote the text of the laws—bka’-grims-gyi yl-ga bris (p 13 (6). There is no contemporary evidence about their content but in later tradition the sixteen laws attributed to Srong-btsern sgam-po are no more than a series of moral precepts. However, documents from Tunhuang reveal the existence of several specific legal codes and regulations. One long document in the India Office Archive collection of the Stein mass (10 no. 740) gives details of the proper decision, according to a new set of regulations, in cases concerning such matters as loans, taxation, marital disputes and so on. Many other Tunhuang documents refer to the law regarding contracts, sales, taxes, land-holding etc. and often mention the judge, zhul co-pa who decides the cases. Another document in the Stein collection (10 no.753) deals with the law of theft, and Pelliot Tibetain (Pell T.) 1075 is a fragmentary copy of part of a similar mass. Other matters regarded as criminal, are the subject of Pell T. 1071 which records at length the penalties, graded according to the status of the victim and the offender, for causing death or injury in the hunting field by an arrow aimed at a wild animal; and also in cases where someone fails to rescue another who has fallen under a yak or 'bri. Although in such accidents there is no suggestion of the deliberate causing of death, they are dealt with under the law of homicide and in several cases the death penalty is imposed. It may even be inflected on the highest ranking ministers if they falsely deny responsibility for an accident or fail to pay blood money imposed on them. Death is the penalty also in some instances of failure to rescue the victim of a yak, and a further— and peculiarly Tibetan— punishment may be imposed by hanging a fox's
tail, signifying cowardice, on to the offender. This is described in the Tang Annals where it is said that it was deemed so shameful that death was held to be preferable; and that bystanders would kill the wretched coward. I have prepared an edition of that document as a contribution to a memorial volume for the late Tsipon Sharabpa but it is unlikely to be published for some time. Meanwhile, I have studied another document (Pell T. 1073) setting out the law where someone sets a dog on to another and death or injury results from the attack. Here too the death penalty may be imposed, which is not surprising any more than it is for major thefts— it continued for even quite small thefts in Great Britain into the 19th century; but for those offences in the hunting field it illustrates the very stern demands of honour and discipline in a rugged, warlike society.

PELLIOT TIBETAIN 1073

is a fragment of 28 lines in rather crude calligraphy: the punctuation is occasionally by double tsegs instead of the usual single; there are a few instances of the da-drag. These are possibly but not necessarily signs of a comparatively early date. As in Pell. T. 1071 there are many obscure words and phrases and it is probable that some readings are suspect. Below, I have attempted a translation and notes, the number and length of the latter indicate how many difficulties I have been unable to solve; and it is hoped that others may provide more satisfactory answers.

PELLIOT TIBETAIN 1073

..... if the g-yar, or whatever, he is riding ailes and he is thrown whether he is killed or not, on account of the wounds, if there is someone who set on the dog he will be punished by banishment for a term (ring res gcig) and as penalty a good 'og-rta' and dressings for the wounds according to their number shall be imposed. If the offender is a woman, the fine is a quantity of good foodstuffs and dressings in proportion, to be given to the complainant. If a rgu-l-phug yi-te-ma phra-men gyi yi-te-ma (holder of a copper letter) down to a rgu-l-phug yi-te-ma (holder of a silver letter) himself or his equal for the purpose of compensation sets a dog on to a zangs-gyi-yi-te-ma (a minister who holds a silver-gilt letter) or his equal and he is bitten and dies; or if by setting on a dog, the
g-yar he is riding shies and he is thrown and dies whatever excuse the man who set on the dog may give, if the victim is killed and if someone set on the dog he himself shall suffer the 'bka skib death penalty, his family shall be banished and whatever treasure and cattle they have shall be given as compensation for the killing; as for the landed property (khol-yul), if there is a son living in a separate family it shall be given to him, if there is no such son it shall be given to the father; if there is no father, even if there is a close clan relation (phu nu bo drung) it shall not be given to him but shall be shared among those who are the subjects and bondsmen ('bang and brun) of the person executed. If there is no separate household and the one who set on the dog has been executed, whatever treasure and cattle the father and sons (spad srum) possess that has not been divided up, shall be divided and the whole share of the treasure and cattle that would have gone to the one who has been executed shall be given as compensation for the killing. If a married woman sets on a dog and causes death, whatever was given as dowry 20 by the original paternal family of that woman shall be given as compensation for the killing. If an unmarried sister sets on a dog and causes death her bondsmen and cattle and spum yarn (kud for skud?) shall be given as compensation for the killing. If by setting on a dog the g-yar he is riding shies and he is thrown, whether he is killed or not the one who set on the dog shall be banished and a quarter of his treasure and cattle shall be given as penalty for the wounded. If it is a woman, in addition to banishment for her, half of the treasure and cattle whatever she has shall be given as penalty for the wounded. If someone from gtsang-chen to damga atm-sa sets a dog on to a zhang-lon phra mya men gyi yi-sgo-pa upwards, himself or an equal, and if by setting on the dog the person is bitten and dies, or if the g-yar he is riding shies and he is thrown and killed, whatever excuse the one who set on the dog may make, if the person is killed, for the offence of setting a dog on to a zhang-lon or dgo-ba the offender and the sons who live with him downwards, shall be put to death: if there are no sons living with him his womenfolk (zmad) shall be banished and his treasure and cattle shall all be given as compensation for the dead zhang-lon. If someone in an undivided household has been executed for setting on a dog all the treasure and cattle that has not been divided between father and sons shall be divided......
NOTES

1-3. g-yar: also in PELL T. 1071 f1. 322,406,401. Dictionaries give no specific help towards its meaning. Yar-ma is Das and Deyab, referring to some sort of cow is inapposite. Gyari-ba, "Borrow, hire" also seems inappropriate because persons concerned in 11,7,17 and 24 are high-ranking ministers who would be presumed to own their riding animals. Thomas TILD. 118. 275, an incomplete passage reading... "thul ba'i g-yar'og rta... ma byor ma may introduce the idea of a comparison between g-yar and 'og -the better quality and the less good quality horse: 'og rta appears frequently in PELL T. 1071 as well as in 1.2. here. In view of the uncertainty I leave both words untranslated.

4. dakod. For god, "punishment"?
5. 'og-rta. See note 1. See PELL T. where it appears in several contexts.
6. ya-btags. something attached on top; bandage?
7. 'yi or go za ma the reading is not clear? "seful?"
8. Official ranks were distinguished by insignia of different precious substances- turquoise gold, phra-sen (silver-gilt), silver, copper and brass. The Chinese Tang Annals describe them as strings of beads hanging from the shoulder. Perhaps the letter, yi-go, was a diploma on a metal plate entitled the holder to wear the appropriate decoration.

9. zhang-lon. The general body of ministers: to be distinguished from zhang-blon, blon-zhang; see "Names and Titles in Early Tibetan History" H. E. Rechardson, Namgyal Institute of Tibetology Bulletin No. IV 1967.

10. stong mnyam-pa of equal status in matters of compensation, penalties and so on. I have abbreviated it to "equal".

11. lan 'don gyin chu. lan-lon. I take this "to give a reply" rather than to making retribution.

12. lha shig blum, of which the etymology is uncertain, is seen from PELL T. 1071 to be a death penalty in which unlike the harsher dag or rabs gsad the offender's sons did not also suffer execution.

13. bu rnam. In its appearance in PELL T. 1071 this seems to mean "family", "children" (Jaeschke, and Das) rather than "mother and daughter" (Deyab, and Goldstein)
14. bang za dang nor phyugs, "treasure store and cattle wealth" are the personal property of the offender and his family.

15. khol-yul. Land with its complement of bondsmen and subjects (bran and 'bangs granted by the btsan-pa to a family. It was heritable but could be resumed for disloyalty or misdemeanour.

16. adum-pa bub-pa of khyim-phub of a son who has set up a separate household.

17. In this document and in 1071 stsa'id is not preceded by a particle such as la or tu.

18. phu na bo drung A. Kors Tas in "Social Terms..., in the Tun-huang Chronicle", Acta Orientalia Hungarica, 1955, concludes that this term covers a clan, specifically the progenies of the male line. The meaning of drung here is uncertain. In Pell T. 1071 it is contrasted with gang 'dur-pa (bdur-pa sdro-ba) which applies to persons who may receive the property in default of closer relatives of the deceased.

19. I have hesitated for a long time before accepting that this passage means that the bondsmen and subjects may share the khol-yul. If my interpretation is correct here and in Pell T. 1071 it represents a surprising departure from what appears to be the principle that khol yul to which the bondsmen and subjects are attached is held by persons of rank; but I can see no easy interpretation to indicate that the khol yul and bran and 'bangs in this case should be assigned to anyone else. It may be noted that in the early days of the kingdom persons of high rank who had been cornered by some rivals could become bran (Tibetan Chronicle p. 103. 1 20-24) but that would not appear to apply to later centuries.

20. btsangs. For btsangs.

21. The text is probably corrupt and bran should be bang za as in other cases; it may also be that mention of banishment, as in 1. 21. has been omitted.

22. I am doubtful about the reading kud-pa, gud-pa "what she has privately" might be an alternative.

23. gtsang-chen, an official of lower rank than those who held letters of various degree.

24. dmangs mtha-ma. "the lower commoners". It is not clear who might be covered by this description. From Pell
T. 1371 it is seen that the jamgön, who ranked below the sōnum-chen and above the soldiery (rgod), could hold whol-yul and so had a recognized place in the social hierarchy, perhaps as minor officials attending on those of higher rank.

25. dge-ba appears to have no religious connotation. It is contrasted in Pell T. 1071 I 260 with sngan-pa- "the good and the bad". In a Tunhuang ms. I.O. no. 506 quoted by R.A. Stein in Tibetica Antiqua II p. 268 sngan-pa is equated with r kun-ma, "thief". From its occurrence several times in Pell T. 1071 dge-ba seems to be an honorific epithet of very high-ranking officials, perhaps similar to ya-rabs.

26. bu-smongs : an obscure word perhaps for srong as in thun srong "together, jointly".

27. In the reading dguu/smo/smongs/smo/buung ma I take the construction as dguu smo/smongs rather than dguu/smo smongs etc.

28. smad here seems to mean "wife, womenfolk" as the song have been accounted for in the previous sentence.

ABBREVIATIONS

Dagyab. I.S. Dagyab, Tibetan Dictionary, 1966
Das. Sarat Chandra Das, Tibetan-English Dictionary, 1902
REBIRTH IN
BUDDHIST LOGIC

- J.K. RECHUNG

Of all the ways, the most excellent for attaining happiness and eradicating suffering is the infallible doctrine of the Buddha. Influenced by His true path, the virtuous person will reach the desired goal of emancipation. Because of the absolute certainty of attaining the desired goal in His teachings, the Buddha is adored as the Great Being, who is Authority personified (Skt. Pramāṇa puruṣa, Tib. Tsad-ma-kyi-skyes-brug), that is, He attained Bliss and shed all suffering. The epithet of 'omniscient being' as referring to the Buddha is also mentioned by Slob-dpon-phyo-rgyas-ling (Achārya Bījnāga) in his Tsad-ma-kun-btum (Pramāṇa sammu-cchaya). The Buddha as omniscient being could be found in more detail in the commentary works of Chos-kyi-grags-pa (Dharmakirti) in the second chapter of Tsad-ma-rnam-grel (Pramanavartika).

Buddhist logic accepts only two sources of valid knowledge: revelation of the Buddhist scripture (Skt. Agama-nirdesa, Tib. Lung-gi-bstan-pa) and the mystic intuition of the saint (Skt. Adhīṣṭhāna-nirdesa, Tib. Rtsogs-pal-bstan-pa). The validity of these two truths is also mentioned in the works of Slob-dpon-dbyig-gnyen (Achārya Vasubandhu) as contained in Abhidharma.

Revelation of scripture is the three pitakas (Skt. snod-gsum): Vinaya pitaka ('dul-bai-sde-sno), Sutrapitaka (Mdo-sde-sde-sno) and Abhidharma pitaka (sngon-pal-sde-sno). Mystic intuition can be cultivated through the three trainings of the mind.

This note on rebirth is from believer's point of view and is based mainly on Dharmakirti, the master of logic. Buddhist logic takes cognition of mind as the lord of five senses. Consciousness is thus leading point in the concept of this life and the life beyond. Modern scientists find great interest in Buddhist theories of life and death. This note is a mere introduction in the believer's language.

Why is the Buddha called the 'perfect being'? Because his profound teachings have the innate value to lead the virtuous person to the path of emancipation. That is to say, he will never let them down in their expectations and desires. The two truths of revealed scripture (Lung-gi-bstan-pa) and mystic intuition as taught by the Buddha are infallible. Therefore, from whom the two sources of valid knowledge come, is a 'perfect one'. Dignaga in the beginning of Prasangika Samuccaya praised the Buddha for having transformed into the 'perfect being'. By studying the infallible doctrine of Buddha such as the four Noble Truths, the disciples will attain the higher realms of gods and human beings and will also be able to penetrate deep into his sublime teachings.

Those who desire happiness should find the means to attain such in the teachings of Buddha. There is much knowledge which does serve the ultimate purpose of attaining the higher path. But to find the ultimate truth, one has to resort to Buddha's teachings. Therefore the Buddha must be taken as the perfect teacher because he had observed the true nature of the transmigratory existence.

Another reason why the Buddha is known as perfect being is that he excelled in the cultivation of great compassion (basab-pa-phun-sun-tshogs-pa-nying-rje-chen-po) and acquired realization through eliminating the wrong conception of self (byor-ba-phun-sum-tshogs-pa-bdag-med-tog-na-pat-shen-rab). The practice of compassion and destruction of self-consciousness (ego) are the most excellent methods for delivering beings from the world of suffering and to attain the realm of all-knowing (Thar-pa-dzog-thams-choe-khyen-pa'-go-phang). The universal compassion (nying-rje-chen-po) in Buddha does not arise without a cause. This great compassion is the sum total of the long period of practice carried through innumerable past lives. He disposed his mind towards the deliverance of innumerable beings from suffering. The omniscient one therefore chose the best method: cultivation of universal compassion (Nying-rje-chen-po).

12
The theoretical school of Chârvâkas however discounted the belief in the efficiency of the practice of compassion for many lives, because there is no previous birth and rebirth, and hence no Karmic formation. They argued that the mind is based upon physical body and when the body dissolves the mind also perishes with it. The body is made up of four elements and five senses and when body dissolves, they also disintegrate and disappear like a rainbow. Hence one's mind cannot go for the next rebirth. When the Charvakas disown the next birth, they also discount the virtuous or wise deeds and their results. For Chârvâkas, there is no attainment of the higher path through the accumulation of virtuous deeds.

They supported their views with the following examples: 'like an essence of the liquor, the mind is the essence of the body'; 'like an illumination of the light, the mind is the illumination of the body'; and 'like a fresco on the wall the mind is a projection of the body'. Thus when there is no liquor there is no essence of it, when there is no light there is no illumination, when there is no wall there is no fresco or there is no mind when there is no body.

How the Buddhist refute them? If only the body is the cause of the mind, then the dead body should also have the mind. Therefore, physical causative body also warrants the existence of mind even when the body is out of function.

The mind, however, is not dependent on the body. The mind is a separate entity because its development and degeneration does not depend upon the body's development and degeneration. If the mind is of same nature as that of body, then the senses which perceive the objects should also perceive the mind. But this is not so.

Most of the beings appear in physical form. However in some realms there exists only mind (Skt. Manas, Tib. Yid). Both the mind and body have their own original causes (Nyer-len). The formative stage of the body comes from the semen and blood of the father and mother. Likewise the formative stage of the mind is the Karmic force that flows from the semen and blood of the two opposite sexes. The original cause of the mind is already in development before the present mind is born. That is to say, the origi-
nal cause of the mind has already proceeded before the present mind is formed, because the external elements like flesh and blood cannot generate mind. Therefore, the original cause of mind must necessarily be the mind that has proceeded it.

Mind must have the substantial cause of its production. The substantial cause is the one that was already there before it enters the semen and blood of father and mother. This very mind is the mind of the previous birth and not of the present birth. That is how Chos-kyi-grags-pa (Dharma-kirti) says in the second chapter of Pāramāvatīka (Ta-had-na-ram- ‘grel):

Skt. Prāṇāṇaṃśvedrīdāhīṣāṃ delādene na kevalāt/
Sajñātiinrapakṣāṇaṃ janma jñānapariṇāhe//37
Pāramāvatīka, Ch. I

Tib. dkye-la-yongs-su-len-pa-na/
’byung-dub-'dbang-po’i-blo-dag-md/
Rang-gi-lus-la-ltse-med-phylr/
Lus-nyid-’bah-shig-las- skyes-min//

The verses signify the existence of previous birth. For example, the consciousness of an old man is brought about by the previous consciousness, because without the previous consciousness there cannot be the consciousness that he has now. Similarly a dying man’s consciousness will join with the future consciousness. There is always an unbroken chain of the development of consciousness. Out of this chain of consciousness comes the cycle of birth and rebirth. That is why acts in this life bear fruits for the future life through consciousness.

In many lives the ‘omniscent one’ has cultivated to perfection all the virtuous acts and thus he has become the ‘perfect one’. Because he has devoted so much of his time to the cultivation of compassion in the previous lives, even without practising it now, the compassion nevertheless remains in abundance within him. This is one aspect of the wisdom that is inherent in him because of his previous consciousness. As a result he was filled with much compassion, which is comparable to an uncontrollable fire.

Now in order to utilize his universal compassion Buddha chose the best method that can expedite the removal of sufferings. That is, he contemplated on the four Noble Truths and the sixteen characteristics of voidness.

14
In his numerous lives, the omniscient one attempted to penetrate into the real nature of the four Truths (Tib. Bden-pa 'Bshil; Skt. Catvāri satyānd) and as a result, Buddha cultivated an unmistakable knowledge on them. Through this knowledge, he contemplated on their nature and generated immense compassion. Overwhelmed by compassion, the Buddha directed his thoughts toward the deliverance of entire beings from sufferings. In this endeavour Buddha, however, found that egoism (Tib. Bde-gzen; Skt. Atma-graha) is the root cause of all sufferings. The Buddha then investigated the meaning of worldly existence which is bound with egoism. In order to remove such misapprehension of self, Buddha concentrated on the methods during his previous lives and, therefore, he could unmistakably discern the correct and faulty means to eliminate the grasping self. By his discriminatory wisdom, the inclination towards ignorance is also removed. He now became an ‘accomplished one’ in fulfilling the wishes of others with his perfect means.

BIBLIOGRAPHY


1. KADAM BUCHO VOLUME KA (PART I)

It deals with twenty previous birth stories (Jatakas) of 'Brom-ston-rgyal-ba'i-byung-gnas narrated by Atisa Dipan- kara-srijana and which are known as rNgog-chos-nyi-shu. The original xylograph reproduced by photo-mechanic process with introduction in English.

2. KADAM BUCHO VOLUME KHA (PART II)

This volume contains the instructions, prophecy, short previous life stories of 'Brom-ston-pa-rgyal-ba'i-byung- gnas, hymns and a supplementary chapter by Lotsawa and chief disciples. Reproduction by photo-mechanic process with introduction in English.

FORTHCOMING PUBLICATIONS OF SRIT

1. SAKYA KABUM CATALOGUE (Sakyapa Catalogue Series Vol. I)

This is the first comprehensive catalogue of Sakya Kabum (collected works of five founder lamas of Sakya Order); Tibetan title and its romanization with subject index and introduction in English. This forthcoming publication is expected to be immensely useful and serve the purpose of the libraries and individual scholars for carrying their research in the field.

2. DAM NGA ZOD CATALOGUE (Kagyudpa Catalogue Series Vol. I)

It is the first comprehensive catalogue of gDams-ngag-mdzo (collected works of Jamgon Kongtrul); Tibetan title and its romanization with subject index and introduction in English.

The publication programme of Catalogue Series of all the Buddhist works preserved in the SRIT will be a landmark contribution in the field of documentation and library science. The institute intends to bring out more issues in the coming years.
STŪPAS OF
PREVIOUS BUDDHAS

- B. GHOSH

The fact of some of the preceding Buddhas has been substantiated by the Archaeological findings like Asokan inscription cited in the concluding part of this article, as well as the account of Chinese pilgrims, who visited the stupas of last three Buddhas, prior to Sakyamuni.

"Display of miraculous power of Sakyamuni shown in the appearance of stupa, being opened by him, discloses to sight the frame of the expired Tathāgatas Prabhutaratna, who is desirous of hearing the exposition of the Lotus of the True Law (Saddharma-Pundarika/ Damcho Pema Karpo). How the Sakyamuni in a former birth strove to acquire the Lotus. His great obligations to Devadatta. Episode of the wise daughter of the oceans and her change of sex" (Saddharma-Pundarika, trans. H. Kern, SBE, Vol. XXI Ed. F. Max Muller, Int. P.XXX). In the above text there is an edifying chapter "Apparition of Stupa"/Shūpa-darśana-Parivarta (Ch.XI). The chapter begins thus: "Then there arose a Stupa consisting of seven precious substances from the place of the earth opposite the Lord, the assembly being in the middle" (Ibid p.227). One may see the same legendary account of the apparition also from the edition of Saddharma-Pundarika by N. Dutt with N.D. Mironov's text: Central Asian Manuscripts of Asian Society (Calcutta 1953) on the Apparition Max Muller cites remarks of Senari. "Between the Lord (i.e. the sun) and the Stupa of Seven Ratnas, i.e. here it would seem the rainbow of seven colours, we shall see that stupa has also another function that of symbolising the celestial dhāraṇya in which sun and moon are standing." (Ibid p. 227)

Buddha Sakyamuni, it is relevant to note in his parable often referred to Buddhas of the past, who trod the path Sakyamuni had discovered. In Dīgha Nikāya Buddha disclosed the clan, family life span and Enlightenment of Six Buddhas preceded him thus:

17
Practice of erecting stupas over corporal relics was older than the time of Buddha Sakya牟牟. In reply to Annada's query about the rites to be performed after the demise of the master, Buddha remarked that his mortal remains left after cremation, should receive the honour of a universal monarch by creation of stupas over such remains the crossing of four highways, a carin should be erected to the Tathavatas, a Pratyeka Buddha (individual Buddha), a disciple of the Tathagata and Chakravartti Raja (universal monarch) (Dīgh Nik. Pall, VI 50).

II

"Führer located the ruins of Krakuchchhanda's Natal town in mounds near Lār-kli-Kundan (Kodan) 11/2 mile south west of Taulihawa (U.P.) and nearly 1 1/2 mile north-east of Gothawa. According to him the four mounds at this place represent the three *stupas* and monasteries mentioned by Fa-hsien and Huoem Tsang. Mukherji (*A Report on a Tour of Exploration of the Antiquities In the Tarai, Nepal*, Archaeological Survey of India, Imperial Series XXVI Pt. I, Calcutta 1901) also held the mounds representing stupas and monasteries. General His Highness Prince Khadga Sumsher Jung Rana Bahadur while regarding the mounds as *stupas* and monasteries felt that "it must have been the place where Buddha held athletic sports: if not, the place belongs to his Goutiltes, i.e. relatives". W. Vost took Kodan as suburb of Kapilavastu and identified (i) the northermost with the stupa adjoining to the spot where the elephant (thrown by Gautama Buddha) falling on the ground caused a deep and wide ditch", (ii) the next mound (which is the largest of all) with the remains of two temples (one with the representation of Gautama and the other with the likeness of Yasodharī and Rāhula) which Huoem Tsang saw by the side of hasti-garta, (iii)
the third mound with the site of the school room of Gautama and (iv) the fourth mound with the remains of the temple which lay without the southgate (of Kapilavastu) and contained a representation of sick man. The tanks on the banks of which these mounds are located has been identified by him with the haasti-garta (pit caused by the fall of the elephant)"

According to Mr. Mitra "All these presumptions have been proved baseless by our excavations at the mounds at Kodan which can neither be regarded as the natal town of Krakuchchhanda nor a part (or suburbs) of Kapilavastu for want of vestiges of Buddhist character. Of the four mounds, one is reduced to the last stage of decay. The excavations at the remaining three mounds yielded the remains of three bricks Brahmanical temples which were originally decorated with various motifs carved on the facing brickwork. None of these temples is earlier than the eighth century A.D. The tank was the offshoot of the constructions of the temples which desolated a huge quantity of earth not only for the mortar and bricks, but for the extensive filling material in the foundation of the temples". Devala Mitra: Buddhist monuments, Sahitya Samad (Calcuttâ 1906) pp. 250-251. Dr. Mitra further remarks that Smith's (V.A. Smith): The Birthplace of Gautama Buddha (JRSA of Great Britian and Ireland for 1867, pp. 615-21) 'tentative identification of Gotihawa with the site of Nyagrodharama, which lay 3 or 4 li south of Kapilavastu town, does not seem justified. Huen Tsang did not notice any Asokan pillar at Nyagrodharama. Gotihawa with the lower portion of Asokan pillar and stupa, certainly represents the supposed site of Nirvana of either Kanaka Hue (Konâkamâna, Asokan edict, Kangâmama the 23rd Buddha of the Buddhavastra-Pali) or Krakuchchhanda. It is very likely that the two fragments (one with Asoka's inscription recording the enlargement of the stupa of Kanakamuni and erection of the pillar) of the upper portion of an Asokan pillar at present lying at Nigali-sagar (as already noted by P.C. Mukherji the pillar fragments of Nigali-sagar are not in situ. Traces of any ancient vestiges, not to speak of the stupa of Kanaka Hue mentioned in the inscription on the pillar, are not sight within the immediate neighbourhood. The fragments, evidently were brought from some other site formed the upper parts of the pillar in situ at Gotihawa. As is well-known, the upper portion of the gotihawa pillar is missing, but a major fragment of the bell-shaped capital was found here (moved to the Taullhawa
The corresponding lower part of Nigali-sagar pillar and also the capital is missing. The fragments of the Nigali-sagar pillar are smaller than the Gothawala pillar in diameter, so that the former can easily be the upper parts of the latter, all these fragments being tapering and of identical stone. If this presumption is correct, the stupa (which by the size of the bricks looks Asoka) in front of the pillar at Gothawala is the one of the Kanakamuni which Asoka claims to have enlarged in the inscription on the lower of the two pillar-fragments at Nigali-sagar. In this connection it may be noted that Gothawala, which is east of Sravasti, does not fit in with Fa-hien’s heresay (south-east) of Krakuchchchanda’s place in relation to Sravasti’ (Ibid p. 252)

One of the reasons for the difference between Fa-hien and Huen Tsang on the location of Kapilavastu with reference to Lumbini and the natal town Krakuchchchanda and Kanakamuni, two of the Mausshi-Buddhas who preceeded Gautama Buddha. According to Fa-hien Kapilavastu is somewhat less than a Yojana east of Kanakamuni’s town, the latter situated less than a Yojana north of Na-pl-ka, Krakuchchchanda’s town, which is 12 Yojanas south-east of Sravasti. Huen Tsang places Kapilavastu 50 11 (600 11 according to the Huen Tsang’s life) south east of the town of Kanyakapura near Sravasti and 50 11 north of Krakuchchchanda’s town, the latter being 30 11 south-west of town of Kanakamuni. Though the two pilgrims agree tolerably on the distance between the native towns of these three Buddhas, they differ materially regarding the directions. Thus Kapilavastu according to Fa-hien was to the east of Kanakamuni’s town and north east of Na-pl-ka, and according to Huen Tsang, to the north west of Kanakamuni’s town and north of Na-pl-ka. Fa-Hien places Lumbini 50 11 eastward of Kapilavastu while Huen Tsang took bearings from Sarā-kūpa (Arrowwell), 30 (or 32) 11 south east of Kapilavastu to Lumbini, the latter being 80 to 60 11 north of Sara Kupa’ (Ibid 248).

III

The nineteenth century discovery of two fragments of an inscribed pillar by the side of Tank called Nigali-sagar, the lower portion of Asokan pillar in Situ and a stupa of Gothawala, a pillar in situ with the record of Asoka at Lumbini and a conspicuous stupa with exceptionally precious deposits and reliquaries at Piprahwa (U.P.), one
of the reliquaries from Piprahwa, as is well known bears an inscription in Maurya Brahmi character recording the deposits of Buddha relics. The discoveries promoted further researches in the field, scholars turned their attention toward the Nepalese Tarai for the sites of the towns of Buddha, Krakuchchhanda and Kanakamuni.

In the older books of Pitaka six Buddhas are mention-
ed as proceeding Buddha Sakyamuni namely Vipassi, Sihk, Vessanath, Kusumanda, Konagama and Kassapa (Dig. Nik. Pali, 14 Mahânañanasutta, Therag 499 Sañjútta Nīkāyā, Pali XII, 4-10).

According to Sir Charles Elliot: Hindutam and Buddhism, vol. I p. 342 "the last three at best may have some historical character. The Chinese pilgrims Fa-Hien, who visited India from 405 to 411 A.D. saw their reputed birth places and says that there still existed followers of Devadatta (apparently in Kosala) who recognised these three Buddhas, but not Sakyamuni. Asoka erected a monument in honour of Konagama in Nepal with dedicatory inscription which has been preserved."

In the Majjhima Nikaya, 50, Maratărjanlyasuttam, we find a story about Kakusandha and his disciple and Gotama Sakyamuni once gave (Dig. Nīk. 14) an extensive account of Vipassi, whose teaching and career are represented as almost identical of his own.

In Māratajñiya Sutta (Maj. Nīk. vol. I 50 Kassap. Int. p XVII), the legend of former Buddha is narrated thus: "The venerable Mahanogallâna was walking up and down in the open. Then, Mâra, the Evil one entered his stomach and produced a girbling sound. Mogallâna knew it. He chided the māra for making a mischief, narrating his previous life- "O Mâra, long ago I was born in the mara-realms, my name was Dûmi, I had a sister called 'Kûli' whose son was none but you. Thus, you are a dear nephew of mine. Then there flourished the Buddha called Kakusanda. I, as the 'Dûsimara', took possession of the people called and gave a hard opposition to the Lord Kakusanda and his order. Due to evil result of it, I was born in the hell and had to undergo a long torture burning in its fire".

Yuan Chwang in his travel account states that "There is Asoka stone pillar not far from the stairs was a tope
where the Four past Buddhas had sat and walked up and down" (on Yuan Chwang's Travel in India Thomas Watters, vol. I 1961 p 334). From Ayudha the pilgrim travelled east above 300 li and crossing the Ganges to the north, arrived in the A-ye-muk'ta and close to the Ganges, were an Asoka tope at the place where the Buddha had preached for three months, traces of sitting and walking place of the four past Buddhas and a dark blue stone tope with Buddha-relics" (Ibid vol. I p 359).

Yuan Chwang found in Samatata Tan-no-ilb-ti (Tamralipti) its capital above ten li in circuit, besides the capital was an Asoka tope and near this were vestiges of the four past Buddha's sitting and exercise ground (Ibid vol. II p. 190).

In Karma suvarmā- near the monastery were several topes built by Asoka at spots where the Buddha had preached and also a shrine (ching-shé) where the four past Buddhas had sat and walked for exercise. (vol. II p.191)

In Maharashtra- within and outside the capital were five Asoka topes where the four past Buddhhas had sat and walked for exercise (vol. II:239).

In Kapilavastu- outside the capital to the south of the city, he tells us and at distance of above 50 li (about 10 miles) from it, was old city with a tope. This was birth place of the past Buddhas Ka-lo-ka-tsun-te (that is Krakuchunda or Krakuchchhanda the Kakusandha of Pali scriptures, not far to the south from this city was tope to mark the spot at which Krakuchunda having attained to Perfect Enlightenment (that is, having become Buddha) met his father. Another tope, which was to the south-east of the city marked the place in which bodily relics of this were deposited. In front of this tope was a stone pillar erected by Asoka, above 30 feet high with a carved lion on the top and an account of (Krakuchunda's) decease (Parinirvana) on the sides. Above 30 li (six miles) north east from this old city was another "old large city" which also had a tope. Here the past Buddha ka-no-ka-Mau-nl (kanakamuni) was born. Near this city, on the north east, was the tope which marked the spot where this Buddha, after attaining Bodhi, admitted other into his religion, and north of this was a tope with bodily relics of Kanakamuni Buddha, Here too was a stone pillar above twenty
feet high, with a lion on the top and as record of the circumstances of this Buddha's decease on the sides, this pillar also had set up by Asoka (vol. II p.5-6).

Fa-hien places the old city of Krakuchundas (called by him Ku-lo-chun Buddha) twelve Yojanas (about 36 miles to the north).

Hereunder we quote the Asoka's edict on stupa of former Buddha with its translation:

"The beloved of the gods, king Priyadarshini (when; crowned fourteen years, enlarged the stupa of Buddha Kanakamuni to double (its former size) and (when) crowned (twenty) years himself came (here), worshipped (and a stone-pillar) was erected."

Text of Migalisaagar (Migal stag) pillar inscription:
Devnavam priyena pilyadesa teijnas ca-davaisabhisista Buddha sa Kanakamana thabe dutiya vaghite, sabhistaena ca ataena sagoa sahyete-papite.

Text sanskritised:

Devnavam priyena priyadarsinena rajah catudaesa vargaabhisiktena Buddhassyena Kanakamunan stupaas dutiyaam vardhitaam, (vimatit-var-...) abhisiktena ca atamaa sagoa sahye, (sattaa-tamhaca) ut-...) sarpatam.

Date: Regal year 20 (?) c 249 B.C.
Subject Asoka's visit to the stupa of Kanakamuni, (Asoka's Edict: Amulya Chandra Sen (Calcutta 1956 pp. 124-125)

GLOSSARY OF PLACE NAMES

A-ye-mukha: Ayamukha (Hayamukha 'Horsemouth' Daudia-khara on the northern bank of Ganges (U. Mitra)


Gotihawa: (Gutiva) 2½ miles of Taulihawa (Mitra)
Karna-Suvarna : (Kaωsona) now called Rangamati in the
district of Murshidabad, on the right
bank of Bhagirathi, six miles south of
Berhampur in Bengal (Dey).

Kosala : Oudh, Ayodhya divided into two, Uttra
Kosala (Northern) and Dakshina Kosala
(Southern). During Buddha, the kingdom
of Kosala under Prasenjit's father Mahako-
sala extended from the Himalayas to the
Ganges and from the Ramganga to the Gandak
(Dey).

Lari-kl-Kurda : (Kodan)

Na-pla : Natal town of Krakuchchnanda, 12 Yojanas
south-east of Sravasti (Mitra)

Nigali-sagar : 4½ miles north-east of Taulihawa in Nepalese
Tarai (Mitra)

Nyagrodharma : 'Banyan grove' lies half a mile to the
south of Kapilavasu

Piprahwa : District Basti, Uttar Pradesh

Sravasti : Sahet-Mahet on the bank of Akravati or
Achitravati (modern river Tapti) in the
district of Gonda in Oudh (Dey).

T(n)-mo-li(h)-ti ; Tamralipti, Tammalipit (litt) perhaps
modern Tamulk (Thomas watters: on Yuan
Chwang's Travel in India (London 1961)

Taulihawa : In Nepalese Tarai

24
NOTES & TOPICS

REBIRTH IN BUDDHIST LOGIC

Earlier, Āchārya Dignāga had written about hundred minor treatises on the Buddhist logic. He however found that those treatises did not contain the complete substance of the entire Buddhist logic. Therefore, he felt it necessary to write a compendium of the Buddhist logic which could give a comprehensive description of all the treatises he had written so far. He wrote 'Pramāṇasamuccaya (Tsad-ma-Kun-bus) by eulogizing the Buddha for having transformed into a 'perfect being' who could lead others along the correct path. This salutation, in one and half verses, mentions the Buddha as having understood Pramāṇa by virtue of his discerning the correct reasoning (Skt. Samyakhetu, Tib. Rig-pa-yang-skṣī) of the four original causes and the four effects of the reversal process of the dependent origination. The same subject is further elaborated in the commentary work, 'Pramāṇavārtika' (Tsad-ma-rnam-'grel) of Dharma-kīrti which contains four chapters. The first sloka of the second chapter mentions the non-deceiving nature of the Buddhist logic by not contradicting the perceiving senses with the object perceived.

Similarly, before his enlightenment, the Buddha had steadfastly undertaken, till completion, the contemplation on the great compassion and the cultivation of the wisdom of selflessness. As a result, he assumed spiritual (Skt. Dharma-kāya), Tib. Chos-skru and physical forms (Skt. Rūpākāya, Tib. Gzugs-sku) and could penetrate deep into the profound meanings of the four noble truths to liberate beings from the false path. Hence, from the point of view of the non-contradicting 'perfect being' this second chapter of the Pramāṇa is compiled.

J.K. RECHUNG

25
OUR TWO MAJOR PUBLICATIONS
DURING 1988 & 1989

1. SANGS RGYAS STOMG: Subtitled An Introduction to Mahayana Iconography. This book of 75 pages (11 ½ half inches x 8 inches) contains 4 colour plates and more than 80 line drawings (sketches): thick paper back witt Jacket depicting 33 Buddhas. Intended for the lay reader, this introductory account is based on original sources in Pali, Sanskrit and Tibetan. The basic concept of thousand Buddhas is explained at length, while all the important symbols and images in their variant forms are presented from believers' point of view. Art critic or academician will find the book worthy of perusal. (English text), Folio 75 pub. 1988, and priced at Rs.150/-

2. TALES THE THANKAS TELL: Subtitled An Introduction to Tibetan Scroll Portraits. The book has 64 pages (11 ½ half inches x 8 inches) and contains well produced eleven colour plates, with Jacket depicting Buddha Sakyamuni and his two disciples. The book tells much about Mahayana Pantheon and particularly about the legends and myths around Buddhism as depicted through numerous Scroll Portrait forms. These colourful portraits speak about the contacts with the traditions of Tartary, China, India, Iran and Byzantium.

Published by Sikkim Research Institute of Tibetology, Gangtok, India 1989 and priced at Rs.200/-