Social Change and Status Emulation Among the Nisyangte of Manang

M.T. Cooke
Department of Anthropology
University of California, Berkeley

Introduction

In a recent article, Messerschmidt has tackled head-on basic issues of social change in Nepal. This effort is timely in two respects: (1) it draws attention to the fact that the paradigm of social change which has guided anthropological thinking since the work of Leach and Barth "(has not) yet been fully applied to the study of change in Himalayan societies" (Messerschmidt 1982:267) and (2), as a particular demonstration of this assertion, it attempts to right the balance of the heavily documented literature on social change among the Thakali, previously weighted to emphasize discontinuous aspects of change at the expense of the continuous. This article proposes to follow the implications of this line of argument in two directions. First, it attempts to extend the ethnographic basis of evidence for continuity of social change in the region through data drawn from an immediately neighbouring and equally entrepreneurial group, the people of Nyishang. Second, through comparison of the different courses of social change followed by the Thakali and Nyishang people, it tries to highlight the complexity of one particular element in the study of social change in Nepal, the somewhat vexed issue of status emulation.

Change and Continuity in Nyishang Trade

Since a stance on the shoulders of Messerschmidt's argument is the point of departure for this article, and since the original form of that argument may not be widely available to readers in Nepal, a brief summary is not out of place. To evade responsibility for the loss in substance which is unavoidable in any summary, I will borrow the abstract of the argument from that article:

The Thakali of north-central Nepal have long captured anthropological interests as a people who have readily adapted to changes in their social, religious, economic and political environments. Recent ethnographic research, however, casts new light on the question of how discontinuous contemporary Thakali culture is vis-à-vis the past. This study traces changes in Thakali religion from shamanic Dhom, through Boh and Buddhism, to modern Hinduism and
scientific atheism, and simultaneous political changes from the 7th century A.D. to the present. Quite apart from the usual interpretation of radical cultural change, this study demonstrates a basic underlying adaptive continuity, with obvious ramifications on scholarly interpretations of change in Nepalese Himalayan society (Messerschmidt, 1982).

In the case of the Thakali, the evidence for discontinuity with the past comes from the anthropological literature where recent changes in the group's religious practice and political orientation feature prominently (ibid, pp. 269-71); the evidence for underlying continuity of change is found in a historical pattern of adaptation to an environment of cultural pluralism, the vagaries of which occasioned such changes. In the absence of a comparable literature on the people of Nyishang3, it is principally through stereotype that the group's present circumstances have come to be seen as departing radically from their past. This idea, part of a sharply defined public image of the group, has developed space with the group's rise to wealth - a rise at once more recent, more rapid, more extensive, and more subject to scrutiny than that of the Thakali4. Due in part to these factors, opinion tends to be uniform on the subject of the group's abrupt social metamorphosis where it is otherwise divided on questions such as the group's origin and status. A common expression of this image is in terms of the contrast between the unkempt traders who used to paddle bits of root in the streets of Kathmandu and those same traders who are now setting standards of fashion while trading in Walkmans and video cameras. The Nyishang people themselves also contribute to an image of the group's break with their past. The division of the community into urban and rural segments has, for reasons which will be touched on, tended to dichotomize modern and traditional values, resulting in an appreciable sense of dislocation with the past.

More exacting specification of the degree of discontinuity in the entrepreneurial history of the Nyishang people can only be grasped, of course, in forms less slippery than stereotype and group image. The principle sources for a surer hold on the history of Nyishang trade are: (1) a series of government documents (N: lal mohar) addressed to the leaders of the Nyishang community over almost a two hundred year period (V.S. 1844-2021) and (2) oral history5. While the documentary evidence can not be considered in detail here, it can be summarized to provide context for the oral history of Nyishang trade.

These documents indicate that, for at least a two hundred year period, the Nyishang locality had effective local autonomy as well as insulation from the continual shifts of power common to the region (see Messerschmidt 1928:272 for the effects of these shifts of power on the Thakali). The major limitation of this autonomy involved traditions of tributary tax payments to more powerful neighbors including -- but initially not limited to -- the Gorkha authorities in Kathmandu. Apparently, the central authorities in Kathmandu granted the people of Nyishang trading concessions (principally, a customs tax exemption on trade goods) in return for recognition of the government's sovereignty
as expressed through payment of an annual tribute (sirto land taxes fixed at a nominal level and an annual tribute of local goods including boots (khyoo), a musk deer (laou), and a musk pod (laou phiinyii). Although such accommodations varied in terms of specific provisions, they were not uncommon in other peripheral areas of the newly formed nation (see Regmi 1978:74-6). What is unusual, though by no means unique, in the case of Nyishang is that these concessions were retained through administrative reorganizations during subsequent periods of political consolidation.

In 1883, as a document of that year reveals, traders were engaged in the barter of locally procured commodities in trade centers of north India reached via Nautana. The impetus for the southern orientation of trade was the geographical disadvantage which limited Nyishang involvement in the local salt-grain trade. The principle route in the vicinity of Nyishang passed through Thak Khola and Mustang in the neighboring Kali Gandaki valley to the west. A secondary route followed the lower Marsyangdi as far as Thonje and then branched off to the northeast, reaching Tibet via Larkya. Any possible route through Nyishang involved contending with an additional 17.500' plus pass at Thorong and consequently the valley was customarily by-passed. Moreover, the fact that these trade routes were controlled by neighbors of the Nyishang people, the Thakali subba lineage of Tukuche and the Gurung subba lineage of Gham-pokhara respectively, further limited the possibilities for involvement by the Nyishang people (see Messerschmidt and Gurung 1974).

Within the recall of oral history is the past half century of itinerant trade. For summary purposes, the development of trade in this period may be considered in decade-long periods. In the 1940's, Shillong (Assam) was the major trading base for the entire trading community. Household members electing not to remain in Nyishang year-round would travel overland to the border crossing at Birgunj, continue by train from the railhead at Raxaul to Gauhati, finally reaching Shillong by bus. From Shillong, trading groups (tshong roo) of adult males would make short trading forays into nearby areas such as the Naga Hills. In villages and bazaars of the area, they would trade a variety of commodities, most of which had been brought by traders from Nyishang. These included local roots and herbs (e.g. - N: nirmanai, pakhanbet, silajit, ban lasun), animal parts and products (e.g. musk pods, yak tails, wool products) and miscellaneous items such as the bark of birch trees used as a platter at caste feasts and for insulating the lids of rice pots. While the adult men traded, women and children remained in Shillong; adolescent boys could find work there on a daily basis gathering wood or pine cones for fuel or pounding stones into pebbles for road construction. In all but a few cases, traders and their family members would return to Nyishang slightly before the planting season in late May and would remain there until after harvest in October. Profits were slight and it appears that trading ventures were as important for the fact that they reduced pressure on limited supplies of household grain in Nyishang as for the fact that they returned cash profits to the household.

In the 1950's, the importance of Shillong as a trading base declined as traders scattered to more distant locales. Shillong still retained
some importance as a reliable source for procuring documentation necessary for international travel, as a starting point for several overland routes to Burma, and as a locale for familiar trade. Increasingly, however, Calcutta came to supplant Shillong as a trading base. A tradition of residence was established in one of the neighbourhood bazaars, travel documentation was procured from a nearby government office, and steamship connections to Rangoon, Penang, and Singapore were available through Calcutta port. As Calcutta's importance increased, so did the importance of goods from the city's bazaars in the inventories of Nyishang traders. To the traditional items of trade, items of exotic jewellery such as tiger claws and more ordinary items such as bangles and inexpensive gemstones were added. Traders travelled by steamship with these goods to Burma and the British colony of Malaya. A less travelled and more far-flung route connected Singapore and Kuching (Sarawak). In all of these locations, the practice of itinerant trade through villages and bazaars was followed. Profits of 2-3,000 rupees, earned through six months of continuous hawking -- seven day weeks of eighteen hour working days were common -- and returned to Nepal through a system of bank deposits and drafts were considered large.

In the 1960's, Nyishang trade continued to expand in scope and profitability. After Thai Airways established a direct connection between Kathmandu and Bangkok in 1968, Nyishang trade became firmly established in Thailand where it catered to both tourists and military personnel. The trading base in Thailand, where several traders leased houses, also put Hong Kong in easy reach by air. Commodities of trade varied somewhat during this period, as more emphasis was placed on ritual curios from Kathmandu and on gems and rings from Udayapur and Calcutta; however, like the successive adaptations to railway, steamship and air travel, such changes in inventory represented a basic continuity with past practice. The most radical change during this period was in the profits realized through thoroughly traditional items of trade. As Chinese pharmacies in Hong Kong and Singapore came to replace the village bazaars of north India as the principal market for items such as musk, profits increased by as much as one hundred fold over the levels of the previous decade. These increases in profits allowed some members of the community to establish the first permanent residences in Kathmandu during the early years of the decade.

This rapid expansion in capital resources also made possible trade developments which have characterized trade since 1970. In the simplest terms, these developments are: (1) increased investment in high-value, low-bulk merchandise such as electronic goods (purchased in duty-free markets and transported back for resale in the restricted domestic market) and, in some cases, gold (see newspapers of Jan 20, 1982); (2) a more general sharing of the dramatically expanded profit margins realized by some traders in the 1960's; and (3) marked increase in the number of year-long absences from Nyishang for trading purposes. While some trading groups (tshong roo) were able to profit substantially from these trends, many others had neither the capital resources nor other advantages necessary for such success.
This thumbnail sketch of the development of Nyishang trade makes possible consideration of at least its most prominent elements of continuity and discontinuity. Most strikingly, the traditional character of Nyishang trade as a highly mobile and adaptive system of barter is evident in all of its phases. Continuities are apparent generally in rapid adaptation to a variety of forms of transportation, in the organization of trading groups, and in choice of trade items which have long included both luxury and proscribed goods. Continuity is also apparent in a number of highly specific practices. The sidewalk displays of merchandise which traders now set up in the bazaars of Singapore are no different, except in the commodities displayed, than those which traders in the 1950's set up in Burma and Malaya (photos of these latter displays can still be seen in many village houses, customarily mounted near the entrance to the hearth room (thin) or in the shrine room (chee khang)). Similarly, the Archery Festival (mi-thaa prenba, 'arrow-target shooting') first organized on a village basis for Nyishangte Kathmandu residents in the early 1980's has, as precedent, an identical form of celebration practiced among residents of Shillong forty years earlier.

The elements of discontinuity over this period can mostly be reduced to variations in the routes followed and commodities traded, increases in profits and capital resources available, and changes in the annual duration of trading activities. None of these represent fundamental alterations of the nature of entrepreneurial activity or its organization; instead, as responses to changing circumstances, they represent the reflexes of on-going entrepreneurial adaptation. The most significant discontinuity over this period is the recent reversal in the established flow and counterflow of goods and cash across Nepal's borders.

To avoid distorting the understanding of change during this period, it is important to draw attention to one element of change in particular -- the dramatic increase in profits. Most obviously, the impact of this change can be seen in the increasingly capital-intensive nature of trade commodities and in the greater prevalence of year-round trade activity during recent years. A less apparent consequence of this change has been the emergence of class-based difference between those households no longer dependent upon agriculture and herding in the Nyishang valley and those still reliant to some degree on those pursuits. The emergence of such distinctions in a community where egalitarianism is deeply rooted in institutional organization as well as in traditional attitudes has been acutely divisive. In its most common expression, these distinctions are formulated as an opposition between village traditions and modern urban life; in fact, it is as symbols of a more basic crisis of egalitarian values that they loom large. As typified by the history of their trading activity, the crucial element of recent adaptation for urban and village residents alike, is its continuaities with past traditions.

Status Emulation and Its Vicissitudes

If patterns of economic adaptation among the Thakali and Nyishang people both reveal basic elements of continuity, the course of recent religious change in the two communities reveals great contrasts. Yet
consideration of recent religious change as it relates to the Thakali experience is inviting for a number of reasons. For one thing, there is a basis for meaningful comparison in that the groups are local to the same general area; are of comparably small scale; and share a variety of cultural traditions in common. The Nyishang valley is separated from the Thakali homeland in the Thak Khola by only a one-day strenuous walk over the Thorong La. In population, neither group ranks among the larger ethnic populations of Nepal: while the Thakali probably number less than 12,000 (Messerschmidt 1982:265), the Nyishang community is roughly half of this size. In matters of cultural traditions, the clearest evidence of affinity is language, mutually intelligible varieties of which are native to the two groups'. Other evidence of shared traditions includes a common stratum of pre-Buddhist belief revealed, for instance, in a three-year cycle of festival sacrifice, called Paten in Nyishang, which was formerly celebrated in Nyishang, Nar-Phu, and the Thak Khola in the course of each cycle.

More important than the more possibility of comparison are the ends it serves. The significance of comparing recent religious change among the Thakali and Nyishangte is that it provides perhaps the best instance currently available for understanding processes of status emulation in Nepal. Both groups have experienced the effects of unprecedented profits on traditionally subsistence-level economics and both groups have experienced social changes related to that influx of cash. As Führer-Haimendorf phrased it in particular reference to the Thakali, it is not unnatural under these conditions that groups should strive "to attain a social status commensurate with their prominent economic position" (1967:197-8).

What distinguishes the two cases, and makes for interesting comparison, is the fact that these processes of change occurred at different times and under fundamentally different conditions. The period during which large amounts of wealth were first accumulated within elite sections of the Thakali community extends from 1862 to 1928 (Furer-Haimendorf 1975: 143-6). During this period, the Rana court in Kathmandu strictly upheld Hindu traditions, enforcing a system of law, the Muluki Ain, which subordinated the rights on non-Hindu groups in a legal hierarchy of group-specific rights and privileges (Höfer 1979; Sharma 1982/3). By way of contrast, the rapid rise in economic fortunes of the Nyishang people occurred after 1960. A decade prior to this, the Shah Kings had regained power from the Ranas. While maintaining Nepal’s constitutional status as a Hindu Kingdom, the Shah Kings have brought about fundamental changes in governmental policy toward non-Hindu groups (Rose & Scholz 1980:83,85). One indication of this is the fact that the Rana Muluki Ain was replaced in 1962 with a new system of law which makes no reference to caste or tribe (N: jat) as a criterion of legal rights.

The similarity of Thakali and Nyishangte economic fortunes taken together with the dissimilarity of the social environments in which their wealth was realized throws light on the ways in which groups attempt to raise their social status in Nepal. Thakali religious change from Buddhism to Hinduism and scientific atheism has generally been interpreted in terms of attempts "to accommodate to the dominant status hierarchy of the Hindu population" (Messerschmidt 1982:270). Among the Thakali,
status emulation of this type had been frequently described as 'Sanskritization' or 'Hinduization' (Iijima 1963:48; Bista 1966:59; also see Manzardo 1978:173), though the terms are clearly inapposite in reference to scientific atheism. These descriptions are based on Srinivas' definition of Sanskritization as "the process by which a 'low' Hindu caste, or tribal or other group, changes its customs, ritual ideology and way of life in the direction of a high, and frequently, 'twice-born' caste" (Srinivas 1966:6).

Before turning to consideration of recent religious change among the Nyishangte for the light it throws on these issues, it is necessary to dispose of an obfuscating point. The claim of the Nyishangte people to Gurung identity is widely known through the use of the surname 'Gurung' within the group. In the lowlands of Nepal, this claim is generally rejected out of hand on the basis of obvious cultural similarities between Nyishangte and groups of Tibetan culture (N: bhotiya). It is less widely known, however, that the Nyishang language is a dialect of Gurung (Glover 1980:73-4). If identity is to be decided on the basis of culture, how is one to weigh between linguistic affinities linking the Nyishang people with Gurungs and affinities of cultural lifestyle linking them with Bhotiyas? The question itself brings us back to a point raised earlier: the paradigm of social and I would add here 'ethnic' change which has guided anthropological thinking since the work of Leach and Barth has not yet been fully applied to the study of change in Himalayan societies. From the perspective of this paradigm, the question just posed is simply not relevant. Identity is not determined by degree of cultural affinity but by processes of social interaction and boundary maintenance (Barth 1969). From an interactional perspective, the people of Nyishang are an integral ethnic group, socially-bounded from both Gurungs and Bhotiya populations. In this light, the claim of Gurung status should be seen as relevant in only a restricted number of categorical contexts. In these limited contexts, the claim of Gurung identity has as much validity as the counter-claim of Bhotiya identity.

In contrast to the Thakali experience, the rise to wealth of the Nyishang people has been associated with a strengthening of Buddhist practice, at least in its outward and material manifestations. The clearest evidence of this is seen in individual religious patronage, in community religious projects, and in attendance at institutions of Buddhist learning. Increase in the scale of Buddhist patronage by individuals is indicated most dramatically by a series of 'offering rites' (tsok puja and tongjee) sponsored by village households in the summer of 1981 and 1982, respectively. For the performance of the first series of these rites, a prominent Karmapa Rinpoche from India, accompanied by two lamas, was flown to Jomson and then brought by horse-back to Nyishang. For the second series, one of the four 'jewels' (Tulku, 'incarnations') of the Karmapa Kantshang (see Thinley 1980:24) was flown to the valley with a larger retinue. Transportation expenses were pooled among the sponsoring households; expenses for a single household, including a share of transportation expenses and the cost of sponsorship of a rite, were as high as Rs 40,000. The observance of these rites was unprecedented, in terms of both the ritual rank of the officiants and of cost, in Nyishang.
Another instance of religious patronage, though undertaken by the community as a whole rather than by individuals, is afforded by a series of Buddhist construction projects in Swayambhu, Kathmandu. These include an entrance gate (kho) to the temple complex and an adjacent bank of prayer wheels (mantang); there is also a nearby crematorium complex (tore) and, to the southwest, the 'Manangi gompa' (pashongri kompa). The last of these projects alone cost 13 lakh (approx. US$ 70,000) excluding the cost of land which was donated. Funds for its construction, undertaken from 1983 through 1984, were raised entirely by community subscription with a few individual donations as high as 1.25 lakh. Although this is the largest single religious project undertaken by the community to date, similar projects have been undertaken in Pokhara and elsewhere in recent years.

In institutes of Buddhist learning Nyishang enrollment has increased sharply in the past two decades. While direct affiliation with Buddhist institutes outside the Nyishang valley was virtually non-existent twenty years ago, enrollment is now high numerically and widespread geographically. The dispersion of these institutes as far afield as Dehra Dun and Darjeeling makes precise enumeration of Nyishangte enrollment difficult but there are at least one hundred young novices (Taha) aged between 6 and 12 studying at Buddhist establishments in Kathmandu and Pokhara alone. In addition to these younger students, there are also a small number of advanced students (aged 15-25) at the Shri Karma Nalanda Institute of Higher Studies in Bumtek (Sikkim).

While these changes indicate an overall increase in the scale of Buddhist observance in recent years, the changes have not been uniform in rural and urban locales. While there is evidence that the scale of patronage, both individual and community, has increased in both locales, rising enrollment in institutes of Buddhist learning has occurred at the expense of traditional forms of religious organization in the Nyishang valley. By traditional village custom, the second of three sons born in a single household was expected to join his village gompa as a novice. This association only rarely entailed formal instruction; it was primarily a system of 'labor recruitment' for gompa activities. The recent practice of enrolling novices in institutes of Buddhist learning outside the valley coupled with the opportunities for trade which induce some novices to relinquish formally their status has led to a decline in this system. In the summer of 1985, less than fifteen of the seventy-five individuals who still retain formal status as novices in the villages of Manang and Braga were resident in the valley. The related system of nunnerly (jomo, jomo srol) in the Nyishang valley, which involves significantly fewer numbers of initiants, has been less adversely affected.

Although the religious changes associated with the Thakali's rise to wealth could very plausibly be described as an instance of Sanskritization, this is clearly not the case for recent religious change among the people of Nyishang. To be sure, differences in the historical context within which Thakali and Nyishangte social change occurred account in some part for the different courses of religious change. The replacement of a constitution which defined rights and duties according to the norms
of the Hindu caste system, adoption by the Shah Kings of humane policies of cultural and religious pluralism, and many other related changes have all tended to reduce pressure towards Hindu conformity. Likewise, differences in the organizational basis of change in the two cases -- mediated by a single dominant family with the Thakali (Furer-Haimendorf 1975:145) and channeled more diffusely by traditions of group egalitarianism, leadership rotation, and redistribution of wealth among the Nyishang people -- helps explain some of the difference in terms of the key role of elites in Sanskritization (Srinivas 1966:46-88). Yet the compelling question of the comparison remains unanswered. Since the dominant status hierarchy of Nepal remains strongly Hindu, shouldn't some accommodation with Hindu norms be expected to accompany a dramatic rise in economic status? If, in fact, religious change indicates a contrary trend, shouldn't other models of social change be added to the theoretical repertoire of social change in Nepal?

Recent religious change among the people of Nyishang suggests that a dynamic of ethnic mobility within the relatively fluid status hierarchy of Nepal is in certain instances a more appropriate model than the process of Sanskritization with its conceptual links to the more rigid caste system of India. The Sanskritization model involves a fixed hierarchy of birth-ascribed status in which, under certain conditions, a group is able to raise its position. The status hierarchy of Nepal, though at one time tied to a legislated version of a somewhat similar fixed hierarchy, can operate more fluidly according to cultural criteria. One area of relevance for this distinction is in the interpretation of status claims of the type widely reported in Nepalese ethnography (Furer-Haimendorf 1975:152, 204; Furer-Haimendorf (ed) 1981:17,22; Fisher (ed) 1978:11,50 -- to cite only three standard works). To take an example a case previously introduced, the claim of the Nyishang people to Gurung status is at least as much a manipulation of ambiguity in culturally-defined identity as it is sleight-of-hand raising of status between fixed and separate birth ascribed groups.

The relative fluidity of status claims in Nepal is also indicated by another instance involving the people of Nyishang. In its ethnic sense, the Nepali term 'Manangi' is used to designate the socially-bounded population of the Nyishang valley. However, the term also has a more comprehensive geographic sense which comprises the district (N: jilla) of Manang, an administrative unit in which the people of Nyishang are only one of several population groups. As the economic position of the Nyishangte has improved, it has become increasingly common for individuals who are 'Manangi' in only a geographic sense to exploit the ambiguity in the term to create, in certain interactional contexts, the impression of ethnic membership within the Nyishangte. Like the Nyishang people's own claim to Gurung membership, this is simply a manipulation of cultural definitions of identity, a process related to but distinct from the movement of caste groups within a fixed hierarchy.

NOTES

1. I follow Messerschmidt's usage in using the term 'Thakali' to
2. The people of Nyishang, more commonly 'Manangi', inhabit the Nyishang valley of Manang District (Gandaki Zone). Use of the terms 'Manangi' and 'Nyeshangba' has been discarded in favour of the more ethnically neutral and ethnographically accurate term 'the people of Nyishang' (Nyishangte). The transliteration 'Nyishang' is based on the phonetics of the Nyishang language as currently spoken rather than on conventions of Tibetan orthography (Nyeshang).

3. While over 130 works on the Thakali have been published in Nepali and Western languages (see Vinding and Bhattachan 1985), there is little in print which makes more than a passing reference to the people of Nyishang. The most notable works dealing with Nyishangte society are an unpublished M.A. dissertation by Nareshwar Jang Gurung (1975), and a published article by the same author (N. Gurung 1976).

4. As discussed later in the article, the period during which wealth was rapidly amassed within some sections of the Thakali community dates from 1862 to 1928 while the rapid increases in wealth within the Nyishang community came after 1960. The extensivity of wealth is taken here to include both the total wealth of individual households and the distribution of wealth throughout the community; the comparative judgement as to the extensivity of Nyishang and Thakali wealth is based on casual comparison of land-holdings and fixed property in Kathmandu and on household income in the village locales.

5. A full treatment of these historical documents is contained in Chapter 6 of the author's Ph.D. dissertation The People Nyishang: Tradition and Change Along the Nepal-Tibet Border. A monograph on the subject of the history of Nyishang international trade is currently under preparation.

6. Export of anatomical parts of the musk deer was prohibited by the 1956 Export and Import (Control) Act and by the 1958 Wild Life Protection Act. Musk deer were removed from the schedule of protected species on April 9, 1962 and returned to the schedule on October 13, 1969.

7. There is some reason to speculate that the term by which the Nyishang people designate their own language, sar kee, may be etymologically related to the Tibetan term for the group of languages which includes both the Thakali and Nyishang languages (Tib - se skad, pronounced 'se kee'; also see Messerschmidt 1982: 277 and an as yet unpublished Ph.D. dissertation by Charles Ramble (1985)).

8. Recent ethnographic research suggests both some degree of oversimplification in previous descriptions of social change among the Thakali and some contemporary resurgence of Buddhism (Messerschmidt...
1982:266 and especially Vinding 1982). These issues are analytically distinct — the first an etic question of ethnographic accuracy and the second an emic question of social reactions to a perceived past — and, because they are not yet fully sorted out, I have not included them in the present discussion.

REFERENCES


