SHORT REVIEWS

*Books*

A BRIEF HISTORICAL ACCOUNT OF NAGALAND. By M. Alemchiba Ao. 22½ x 14½ cm. 11+261 pp., 16 ht. plates, 2 maps, index. Published by the Naga Institute of Culture, Kohima, Nagaland, India, 1970. Price: Rs 18/-

It is a pleasure to note the recent appearance of several historical accounts of peoples of North-Eastern India. These works have been written by historians who have spent much of their lives among the people about whom they write. Our knowledge of the history of the North-East is generally based on two categories of sources. First, the accounts by British administrators and semi-scholars who could gather a prodigious amount of material over relatively short periods of time, and second Bengali scholars who hardly moved out of Calcutta, but who contributed a new and valuable perspective by extensive use of Sanskrit and Bengali or Assamese records.

Both the above sources, as well as the occasional missionary, have contributed significantly to our knowledge of the people of the North-East, but we are still in great need of the perspective of the people themselves through their own historians and writers. Thus, the writings of people like Hamlet Barth of the Khasis, Iman Singh Chemjong of the “Kirats”, Alemchiba Ao of the Nagas, etc., are very valuable.

Dr. Alemchiba Ao’s account of the historical development of the Nagas is the only easily available chronological account of Naga history, a good half of the book being devoted to the Twentieth Century. While the author may have relied too much on J.H. Hutton and secondary sources such as Mackenzie, W.C. Smith, B.C. Chakravarty, etc., he has managed to present an intelligent review of Naga history up to the present time. It is conceivable, however, that Mackenzie’s accounts of the British occupation of the Naga Hills would not stand a close scrutiny even from a detailed study of available official records, not to mention Naga accounts in whatever forms still available. It is hard to believe that so few historical facts can be traced through the rich Naga folklore, legends, etc., and that one needs to rely so heavily on secondary sources such as Mackenzie. (This is not to suggest, however, that Mackenzie was so unreliable and misleading in his reports as, for example, Sir Ashley Eden was regarding his Mission to Bhutan or Claude White in his dealings with Sikkim). Perhaps a good deal of original research can still be done. All in all, however, the book is well researched and documented. It includes a comparative vocabulary of the seven Naga dialects and English compiled by Shri P. K. Bhattacharya of the Naga Institute, and an index which is somewhat limited. A detailed bibliography would have been much appreciated. We are looking forward to further publications by Dr. Alemchiba and the Naga Institute.

H.K.K.
TRIBAL FOLK-TALES OF ASSAM (HILLS).
Compiled by Satyendra Nath Barkataki. 16½ x 25 cm. xvi + 237pp.
21 h. t. palates. Published by the Publications Board, Assam,
Gauhati, Assam, India, 1970. Price: Rs. 15/—

Shri S.N. Barkataki, I.A.S., is well qualified to write on Assam. As a native of
the state, a civil servant of repute and a lover of travels and fun, he has served in many
parts of Assam, throughout India, and for some time in Laos with the International Com-
mission for Supervision and Control. His two books on his life as a civil servant, “The
Escapades of a Magistrate” (Gauhati, 1961) and “Post Magisterial”, (1968) are intended
“to warn entrants to the civil services against pitfalls which, depending of their tem-
perament, they might not like to fall into”. And although Shri Barkataki seems to
have fallen into a lot of pitfalls during his at times stormy career as a civil servant, to
judge from these two books, he is none the worse for it and is cheerfully writing on.
He has had two books published by the National Book Trust, “Assam” and “Hill
Tribes of Assam”. In addition to a locally published volume of light-hearted short-
stories (“The Grand Panjandrum”) and two books in Assamese, “Fulbibi” and
“Hakimor Tighilghiloni”.

Out of the 129 folk tales in this book, only about 40 or so are reprinted from
well-known classics, such as Dewansingh Shangma Rongmuthu’s “Folktales of the
Garos”, Stack’s “The Mikirs”, Sandy’s “Legends of Old Lushai”, etc. Hence we
are left with a substantial body of newly published folktales covering the following:
Lushai (Mizo), Lakher, Pawi, Mikir, Khasi & Janintia, Dimasa Kachari, Thado-
Kuki and Zemi-Naga. (All the Garo tales have been reproduced from D. S. Rong-
muthu’s book). The stories are arranged tribewise, and there seems to be no further
systematic breakdown of types, etc. It would have been interesting if variants could
have been indentified, and also some analysis made of possible relationships between
the different tribes’ tales. The preface lists works from which some folk-tales have
been reproduced, but there is no detailed list of which tales have been reproduced
from old lources and which are newly collected or published.

Mr. Barkataki is well qualified to compile a bibliography of the hill tribes of Assam,
and we hope this could be added to the book when it goes for a second printing. Despite
the above points, however, this is a solid piece of work and a valuable addition
the few studies available on this area. We also hope it will be followed by other studies,
for the hills are still rich and generous.

The Assam publications Board is well known for the quality of its publications,
and this book is no exception. It is nicely printed on good paper, solidly bound, and
has relatively clear halftone blocks.

The book was finished in September 1965, and unfortunately did not appear until
late 1970. H.K.K.
VAISNAVA ICONOLOGY IN NEPAL.

By Pratapaditya Pal. 186 +xxxi pp., 110 b/w plates.
Published by the Asiatic Society, Calcutta, n. d. Price: Rs. 50/—

Vaiśṇavism has had an important place in the religious life of Nepal from at least the fourth century A. D., but its exact importance, its decline in medieval times and subsequent re-emergence in a strong Kṛṣṇa cult, and its present state of relative decline, have never been clear to even closest students of Nepali religion. In a country where Śiva and the Buddha have been dominant from the medieval period, Viṣṇu’s position has been ambiguous, alternating between what Pal refers to as “bias and fusion” (p. 127), with Viṣṇu at times supreme, and at times fused completely with Śiva. Today, Śiva remains the supreme deity for a Hindu in Nepal, yet Viṣṇu’s presence cannot be denied. The shrines dedicated to him, particularly those of Buḍha Nilkanṭha and Caṅgu Nārāyaṇa, have preserved their sanctity and bear witness to the power he once had by their antiquity and the quality of the art which they possess.

What has been lacking until now has been systematic discussion of the physical products of Nepali Vaiśṇavism—the icons, shrines, and painting—in conjunction with epigraphical sources and Vaiśṇava literature. This is what Pal has done in this monograph. And his book is not only a specialized discussion of Vaiśṇava iconography as it is found in Nepal but an attempt as well at an historical reconstruction of the religion there through the investigation of its art.

Following a general discussion of Nepali Vaiśṇavism in the first chapter, Pal discusses the vibhava images of the god, his para and vyūha aspects, the cult of Kṛṣṇa, Vaiśṇava tantric icons, temple forms, and finally composite icons. The detailed iconographic discussions are illuminated by reference to appropriate literary sources. His discussion of the famous Caṅgu Nārāyaṇ sculpture of the Viśvarūpa Viṣṇu as a representation to the Viśvarūpadārśanam in the Bhagavad Gita is the most remarkable example of how effectively he uses the traditional literature. Pal points out outside influences where they exist, discusses the differences in the Indian conceptions of the same iconic forms, and demonstrates the striking originality of certain of the Nepali images even while they are based on traditional Hindu themes.

Several important conclusions result from this study. First, the obvious point is made that no understanding of religion in Nepal can be reached without a thorough examination of Vaiśṇavism and its relations with Śaivism and Buddhism; second, that Vaiśnavism was influenced by tantrism to a much greater extent in Nepal than in India; and third, that while religious art in Nepal has owed in India a source of inspiration, it has never merely imitated it. More that any recent author Pal, I think, makes clear the kind of syncretism which makes Nepali art and religion unique:
“Although both for their religion and their art the Nepalis were always dependent on India, it would it be a mistake to presume that they were mere imitators. Rather the study of Nepali art is important to the art-historian preceisely because it demonstrates the remarkable capacity of the artists for assimilation. Exposed constantly to influences from India, the Nepali artist has displayed his truly artistic aptitude and inventive genius in absorbing what was essential and then giving form to his ideas following his own aesthetic intent. We have time and again seen how a Vaiṣṇava icon or a particular motif was modified by him according to his needs and norms. That is why despite the origin of the style in India we cannot cite any example for India where forms such as those seen in the Varāha image (Fig. 5) or the stupendous sculpture of Kāliyadāman (Fig. 51) could have originated. Isolated though they were in their mountain-girt valley, the artists of Nepal must have realised fully that artistic creativity is an experience where complete isolation leads to the inevitable stagnation of art. Their southern windows were therefore always open.”

This is certainly one of the most important books on Nepali art and religion to appear in recent years. It is clearly written and logically argued. It is, in addition, well produced and the plates are clear. There are several misprints and typographical errors in addition to those listed in the errata, but nothing bothersome enough to mention here. This reviewer finds it surprising, however, that the Asiatic Society has not included anywhere the publication date of such an important book. From the author’s preface we learn that the book was written in 1966. The preface itself is dated March, 1970.”

T. R.


Nepali is as yet but little taught in foreign universities (in Paris it has been taught regularly since 1965) although much practical knowledge of the language has been acquired by past and present members of such organisations as the Peace Corps. The death of T. W. Clark was a great loss to Nepali studies in the Anglo-Saxon world; but it is to be hoped that the impetus given by the Summer Institute of Linguistics at Tribhuvan University to linguistic studies in Nepal will eventually provoke more regular teaching of Nepali in Europe, America and perhaps even Japan. The present work contains the romanized text (p.49-113) of a Nepali translation of Kṣemendra’s Sanskrit Vētālapāncaviṃśati, as it subsists in a bilingual (Sanskrit and Nepali) manuscript purchased in Benares by Professor W. Norman Brown, and at present in the University of Pennsylvania Collection under No. 764. Mr. Riccardi also gives us an
annotated English translation of this version with a short but useful introduction and a grammatical sketch of the language of the manuscript. The author claims (p. ix) that this is "the first study of a Nepali work and its connection with the Sanskrit tradition". It is certainly the first study of its kind in English, and as such marks an important date in Himalayan Studies.

In his introduction, the author lists the known Nepalese versions of the Vetāla, discusses the date of the manuscript he is editing (early nineteenth century) and then furnishes some notes on Kṣemendra and the date of his Vetāla (c. 1037 A. D.). He suggests that the translator and/or scribes of the Pennsylvania manuscript were perhaps Newars (p. 9, n. 36). He remarks that "the Nepali is an attempt at an almost literal rendering into prose of Kṣemandra's slokas. It is almost twice as long as the Sanskrit. Little is omitted and much is added; the scene in the burning ground in the frame-story, in particular, contains many comparisions and images which are not in the Sanskrit, but nothing substantive has been added or changed. The language is good literary Nepali." It is interesting to read that "many of the forms in the manuscript can still be heard in some of the dialects spoken in the hills of Nepal" (p. 11). This seems to be particularly so with regard to Western Nepali. Again one is struck by the absence of the honorific Second Person pronoun tapāiṁ, which, interestingly enough, does not occur once in the entire manuscript." Mr. Riccardi concludes his introduction by some observations on the Sanskrit of the Pennsylvania manuscript and the possible connections and relationships between this and other manuscripts. The 'Nepali' translator, faced with an example of Kṣemendra's early style, sometimes translated, sometimes commented "by adding metaphors and similes which explain very little" (p. 13). However, "the stories are clearly, if not always elegantly, told and are not lacking in drama and humour."

The Grammatical Sketch occupies pages 15-48 and is divided into three main parts: Phonology, Morphology and Notes on Syntax. The material has been organised grosso modo on the lines of Clark's Introduction to Nepali so as to be more easily coordinated with the modern language. The section on verbs is particularly important.

The English translation (p. 120-188) is precise and is followed by notes to the text and to the translation, a glossary, a bibliography and an index. The book is very well produced with remarkably few misprints. I only regret that in this solid piece of work, it was not deemed possible to print the English translation opposite or alongside the Nepali text. The constant turning back and forth of the pages, imposed on the serious student by the layout of the book, will not only try his patience but will also sorely try the binding. Perhaps some oral indigenous versions of these stories may yet turn up in the Nepalese hills.

A.W.M.

The number of books written in Hindi about Nepal is very small. This one relies perhaps a bit too heavily on traditional puranic accounts and a very limited number of secondary sources for its discussion, but it does present a useful popular account of the country and its culture for the Hindi speaker. There are some errors: in chapter eleven the alternative name of Bhaktapur is given as bhatgāvm and the twelfth chapter is entitled Pāṭan athavā Devpattan. An interesting but unsupported statement appears on p.67: "Pāṭan kā śilalekh bhi aṣok ke nepāl āne kā pramāṇa detā hai" (‘A stone inscription of Pāṭan also gives proof of Aśoka’s coming to Nepal’). It would be interesting to know to which inscription the author is referring.

The book has a pleasant appearance and is well printed.

* Reprinted books

AN INTRODUCTION TO THE GRAMMAR OF THE TIBETAN LANGUAGE. By S.C. Das 2,2, xxvii, 62, 50 vi, 88,5,2,27,2,35 pages. Delhi, Motilal Banarsidass, 1972, Rs. 40,—

Messrs. Motilal Banarsidass, the well-known orientalist booksellers of Delhi, Varanasi, and Patna, are to be congratulated for reprinting the Tibetan grammar of Sarat Chandra Das (1849—1917), one of the significant Tibetological classics. The quality of this work, which first appeared in 1915, and its reproduction is several cuts above the average for the reprints which now flood the market in India.

The same publishers have also brought out the author’s monumental A Tibetan English dictionary, with Sanskrit synonyms (1902; repr. 1970). In 1965 Firma K. L. Mukhopadhyay reissued his Indian Pandits in the Land of Snow. Indian Studies: Past and Present has published the author’s articles which were originally published in the Modern Review in 1908 and 1909 under the title Autobiography; narratives of the incidents of my early life (1969). Maṇjuśri Publishing House have recently done the Journey to Lhasa and Central Tibet (1902; repr. 1970) and Contributions on the religion and history of Tibet, a collection of the author’s articles which appeared in the Journal of the Royal Asiatic Society of Bengal in 1881 and 1882.

Sarat Chandra’s An Introduction to the grammar of the Tibetan language is a book whose value has diminished little in the almost six decades that have passed since its appearance. It is a work intended for somewhat advanced and highly motivated students of Tibetan. The student who patiently goes through this collection of miscellaneous texts will be well prepared for reading the more difficult genres of Tibetan literature.
The appendices to the first book, a presentation in English of the principles of classical grammar, contain a varied selection of Tibetan documents: patents of recognition, marriage deeds, road letters (lam-yig), letters, etc. Of special interest are Sarat Chandra's own account of his journey of 1882 to Lhasa rendered in Tibetan, an account of the previous incarnations of the Dalai Lama, the so-called Love-songs of the 6th Dalai Lama, and the "Song of the precious reed", a Sikkimese drinking song. These appendices are followed by a detailed analysis. Following the analysis of the appendices one finds an account of Ekai Kawaguchi's pilgrimage to the great religious sanctuaries of Tibet rendered into Tibetan.

The second, third, and fourth books reproduce three important Tibetan works on grammar and orthography. The first text is the famed Si tu'i sum rtags, a detailed presentation of Tibetan grammar by Si-tu Pan-chen Chos-kyi-'byung-gnas (1699/1700-1774), with an index by Ekai Kawaguchi. The third book contains the Dag byed gsal ba'i me long, a verse orthographic dictionary. The last book contains Dngul-chu Dharmabhadra's (1782-1851) commentary on the Si tu'i sum rtags, the Si tu'i zhal lung.

Jamyang Namgyal


These two early accounts were unobtainable for a long time and Bibliotheca Himalayica is to be commended for reprinting them faithfully and attractively. Much of what they contain is out of date, but they are still of great value to the scholar (1) because it is almost impossible to read intelligently the work of later historians (e. g. Lévi) without constant reference to their predecessors, and (2) because they contain information which still has not been fully exploited by modern scholars.

William Kirkpatrick first went to "Nepaul", or as he puts it characteristically (p. 169), "more correctly Nypaul", in 1793 as an emissary of the East India Company. He spent only seven weeks in the country, but this was sufficient time for him to gather extensive information on the 'Napaulians', including brief accounts of land tenure, revenue systems, agriculture, weights and measures, and detailed descriptions of routes and distances in the Himalayas. He also includes an historical account of the valley and samples of the Nepali and Newari languages. His orthographic system, despite its peculiar appearance, is fairly consistent and one easily recognizes after a little practice.
the Bhagmutty, the shrines of Sumboo-nat and Pusspatnat, the heights of the Himma Leh, the kings Bhoomy Gupt, Jye Ekshah Mull, Roy Mull, and the great Purthi Nerain.

Hamilton's work stands out as the best of the early accounts. Written in a pleasing and lucid style, it is the only work which discusses the entire country of Nepal and does not limit its discussion to the Kathmandu Valley. As Mr. Gaborieau remarks in his introduction: "It would perhaps be no exaggeration to say that his is still the only book which treats Nepal as a whole." Even Lévi, the value of whose work no one can deny, concentrated almost entirely on the Kathmandu Valley.

Hamilton visited Nepal only once in 1802-3. He remained there for almost a year, gathering information from travellers and people who had played a part in the events which led to the formation of the new Gorkha empire. He visited the territories to the south of Nepal, although he was unfortunately never able to enter the western parts of the kingdom itself.

With reference to the history of the valley and to the ethnology of the country, Hamilton's work is now out of date. Yet his chapters on the hills, in Mr. Gaborieau's words, "are still unsurpassed".

Calcutta: Sanskrit Pustak Bhandar. 1971 (reprint). Rs. 40

In this reprint, the original work has been re-set, but the publisher's note indicates that some attempt has been made to improve on Rajendralal's spelling: "Transliteration of Sanskrit proper names were extremely ill-assorted in the original edition. Though we had tried to square them all, some slips, we are aware, are still there. For these and other errors, the publisher craves the indulgence of the erudite readers." Many errors are still present and it is not clear which occured in the original. The book is printed on a variety of different papers and the cover has no writing on it, either on the spine or the front.

Dr. Ray's introduction rambles a bit ("His synoptic approach did not help him achieve a viable synthesis in his multifarious inquiries which were rooted in inter-related disciplines", p. viii) but nonetheless it does give information about Rajendralas's family, his education, and his scholarly interests.

Rajendralal's own preface is included. It describes the career of Brian Hodgson and how he collected Sanskrit manuscripts in Nepal. With the aid of several Calcutta pandits Rajendralal summarized the contents of eighty-five of these manuscripts and produced the present work. Many of his remarks are out of date, e.g. on p. 27 his discussion of the poet Kṣemendra attributes the Bohdhisattvāvadānakalpalatā to the fifth century A. D., six hundred years too early. A general weakness is his preoccupation with proving that the Mahāyāna works were older than the Pāli canon.

Despite these criticisms, however, the reprint is to be welcomed for the book is still useful to the scholar of Buddhism and related subjects.

T. R.

Despite its age, this book is reviewed here because of what it represents. It too purports to be a reprint, but is really a member of an ever increasing class of works which might charitably be called “edited reprints.” Here the original work is re-set in very small type with illustrations omitted and printed on very cheap paper. Another step is then taken to destroy further the dignity of the original. Editors appear mysteriously—they may be the printers or publishers or somebody else, we are not told—who set about changing the text in order “to bring it up to date”. This deliberate re-wording is not indicated in any way either in footnotes or in the text itself. The reader, therefore, has no way of knowing what portions belong to the original and which parts have been added by the editors, unless he happens to have beside him a copy of the original which is usually unavailable; the reason the book was supposedly reprinted in the first place. The most delightful example of this process in the present work occurs on the first page where Wright, writing during the latter part of the last century, states that Nepal shares the subcontinent with India and Pakistan.

In the unlikely event that the few original copies of Wright’s work were to disappear and the many copies of this reprint were to remain in circulation, scholars of the future would be faced with a problem similar to that of the Sanskrit specialist when dealing with Indian manuscripts: the re-creation of the original text from a set of emended and distorted versions made later by anonymous authors. Reprints such as these merely confuse the studies they were meant to illuminate.

T. R.

* * *

* Journals, anthologies, etc.

PINES—Academic and Cultural Quarterly, vol 1. part 1, March 1970. Edited by B. Shastri. 16x 25 1/2 cm. 106 pp. 5 h. t. plates, vignettes. published by the Literary and Cultural Cooperative Society, Laitumkhrah, (Cottage of Dr. I. B. Roy). Shillong-3, Meghalaya. Price: per copy Rs. 2; Per year Rs. 8/—

This journal is one of the welcome happenings in the area of North-East Indian studies in 1971. While we have not seen any further numbers, we hope that the journal will continue for a long time. The former Garo Hills, and United Khasi and Jainta Hills districts of Assam now form a separate state, Meghalaya, and this journal attempts not only to cover social and cultural aspects of life in Meghalaya, but includes short articles on the Mizoram or Lushai Hills (the former Mizo District of Assam), Aruna-
chal Pradesh (formerly North East Frontier Agency) and the Assam and Bengal foothills. Particularly fascinating is C.C. Sanyal’s article on the Totos, a tribe of some 371 members (1960), Milton Sangmai’s note on Garo inheritance, J. B. Thanga’s note on an episode from the history of the Mojos and J.B. Rajkwar’s article “Traces of early history of North Eastern India in Kachari Dimacha and Tipra Languages”. It is rather interesting to note that while K. Zadeng in “Customs and Cultural life of the Mizos” maintains that Christianity has wrecked the old Mizo social order and caused a deterioration in the quality Mizo life, E. M. R. Syiem in the article “The Social Organization of the Khasi” claims Christianity has brought little social change among the Khasi and that the missionaries “established the new faith on the foundation of the Khasi society itself”.

A. K. Das has written a delightful eulogy to the *gamocha*, the multipurpose headgear of Assam, and Nilmoni Barooah a thoughtful essay on the *pocha* system, or indigenous cooperative system of Assam. He concludes that “had the (modern) cooperative been grafted on this ancient stem (the *pocha* system) it is sure it would have thrived much better than the sophisticated modern institution imported from outside and imposed from above.” There are many more articles and stories—most of them too short, but still worthwhile.

We hope that readers will encourage and support the PINES journal, as it represents a good initiative to encourage understanding and study of these relatively little known areas.

H.K.K.

**STUDIES IN INDO-ASIAN ART AND CULTURE, VOLUME I.**
Edited by Peralal Ratnam. 22 x 28½ cm. 270 pp. 16 h. t. plates, 32 line drawings, Published by the International Academy of Indian Culture, J—22 Haus Khas Enclave, New Delhi-16, 1972. Price: Rs. 40/—

This anthology on Indo-Asian culture forms Volume 95 of the Sata-Pitaka series and is sponsored by the Acharya Raghu Vira Memorial Committee. It is a Commemoration Volume on the 96th birthday of the late Dr. Raghu Vira, the founder of the International Academy of Indian Culture as well as the well-known Sata-Pitaka series of scholarly publications.

This brief note cannot hope to do justice to the publication. It contains some twenty-five articles by leading scholars of the world, ranging from Y. Rinchin of Mongolia and Pentti Aalto of Finland to Juan Francisco of the Philippines and Professor J. W. de Jong of the Australian National University. Dr. Lokesh Chandra, Dr. Raghu Vira’s son and present director of the International Academy, has written a fascinating article of Gaṇeśa in Japan, illustrated with line drawings. He traces the worship of Gaṇeśa in Japan back to 806 A. D. and analyses the Gaṇeśa manifestation in the Vajradhātu maṇḍala as well as other manifestations of Gaṇeśa.

This review must also mention Hugo Munsterberg's contribution on the dragon in Chinese art, and Dr. Sarkar's interesting note on the fictitious and historical treatment of the port of Tamralipti on the Bay of Bengal.

The book is extremely well printed on excellent paper, and the binding, except for weak stitching, is far above average for Indian books. Unfortunately, pages 148 and 149 have been printed upside down. Still it is an excellent effort and a good beginning for what promises to be an interesting series.

H. K. K.

* * *

*Phonographic recordings*


This recording contains a lively and imaginative collection of mostly secular music of the Himalayas. The recording includes seven Naga ballads and dances, two Khampti tunes from Arunachal Pradesh (formerly NEFA), two Tibetan dance-dramas and one Tibetan prayer with instrumental musi, one folk song from Jammu, two dances and one lone song from Bussahir in Himachal Pradesh Last, but not least, a vigorous chholia dance from Pithoragarh in the Uttar Pradesh hills. The recordings are of even quality, although sometimes the stereo separation is too marked. It would have been helpful if the notes, particularly the description of the various instruments, had been more detailed.

**TIBETAN FOLK AND MINSTREL MUSIC. Recordings and notes by Peter Crossley Holland. Lyriehord stero LIST 7197 (Mono LL 196). 33 1/3 rpm. 12'' Lyriehord Discs Inc., 141 Perry Street, New York 14, USA (1967).**

Little research has been done on the secular music of Tibet proper until quite recently, but some significant work in his field has been by Peter Crossley-Holland. The present recording presents folk music from Kham and Eastern Tibet, Central Tibet (Gyantze) and Sakya in West Tibet as well as a fascinating selection of Tibetan minstrels or semi-professional musicians recorded in Ladak. The folk-music was recorded among Tibetan refugees in Sikkim, Darjeeling and Kalimpong in 1961, and this recording represents an interesting cross-section of Tibetan folk-music. The notes accompanying the record are very thorough and comprehensive, and the quality of all the recordings is very good.


Both these recordings contain Tibetan religious ritual music, and technically they are both of high standard. While Mr. Desjardin’s recordings cover the major Tibetan Buddhist sects (Gelugpa, Nyingmapa, Kargyudpa) at various places in Sikkim and in India, Dr. Smith’s recordings were all done at Dalhousie (Chamba district, Himachal Pradesh) at the tantric Gelugpa Monasteries (or Colleges) Gyuto and Gyume.

The Anthology recording contains some verses from the Guhyasamaja and some songs to Mahakala Lha-mo, and it is accompanied by extensive explanatory notes on the religious meaning of the chants (by Professor Huston Smith), on the acoustics of the chanting (by profesor Kenneth Stevens) and on the historical background (by Ngawang Lekden, former Abbot of Gyume, and Mr. Brian Cutillo). The most detailed and enlightening documentation is provided by Dr. Crossley-Holland in a commentary titled “The Music of the tantric rituals of Gyume and Gyuto”.

Mr. Desjardin’s recording is well produced and edited, but the lack of precise explanatory notes detracts somewhat from its usefulness.