Revue d’Etudes Tibétaines
numéro quarante-huit — Avril 2019

ISSN 1768-2959

Directeur : Jean-Luc Achard.

Comité de rédaction : Alice Travers, Charles Ramble, Jean-Luc Achard.

Comité de lecture : Ester Bianchi (Università degli Studi di Perugia), Fabienne Jagou (EFEO), Rob Mayer (Oriental Institute, University of Oxford), Fernand Meyer (CNRS-EPHE), Françoise Pommaré (CNRS), Ramon Prats (Universitat Pompeu Fabra, Barcelona), Charles Ramble (EPHE, CNRS), Françoise Robin (INALCO), Alice Travers (CNRS), Jean-Luc Achard (CNRS).

Périodicité

Participation
La participation est ouverte aux membres statutaires des équipes CNRS, à leurs membres associés, aux doctorants et aux chercheurs non-affiliés. Les articles et autres contributions sont proposés aux membres du comité de lecture et sont soumis à l’approbation des membres du comité de rédaction. Les articles et autres contributions doivent être inédits ou leur réédition doit être justifiée et soumise à l’approbation des membres du comité de lecture. Les documents doivent parvenir sous la forme de fichiers Word, envoyés à l’adresse du directeur (jeanluc.achard@sfr.fr).

Comptes-rendus
Contacter le directeur de publication, à l’adresse électronique suivante : jeanluc.achard@sfr.fr

Langues
Les langues acceptées dans la revue sont le français, l’anglais, l’allemand, l’italien, l’espagnol, le tibétain et le chinois.

La Revue d’Etudes Tibétaines est publiée par l’UMR 8155 du CNRS (CRCAO), Paris, dirigée par Sylvie Hureau.

Hébergement : http://www.digitalhimalaya.com/collections/journals/ret/
Nathan W. Hill
Tibetan zero nominalization pp. 5-9

Paul K. Nietupski
Amdo politics and religion—Tuken Losang Choki Nyima (Thu’u bkwan Blo bzang chos kyi nyi ma, 1737-1802) pp. 10-35

Veronika Hein
A collection of Spiti songs sung at village festivals and private gatherings pp. 36-49

Lama Jabb
The Mingled Melody: Remembering the Tibetan March 10th Uprising pp. 50-98

Hiroyuki Suzuki & Sonam Wangmo
An outline of the sound structure of Lhagang Choyu: A newly recognised highly endangered language in Khams Minyag pp. 99-151

Sarah H. Jacoby
Tibetan Studies and the Art of Dialogue pp. 152-169

Nakza Drolma
Pilgrimage Guide of the Tibetan Buddhist Holy Mountain Brag dkar sprel rdzong pp. 170-183

Maheshwar P. Joshi
Material culture as proxy for language: the Himalayan evidence pp. 184-232

Compte-rendu

Jean-Luc Achard
Several researchers draw attention to the ability of Tibeto-Burman languages to use nominalized verb forms in finite contexts (Matisoff 1972, Coupe, ed. 2008, DeLancey 2011), but the reverse pattern—morphologically finite forms occurring in nominal contexts—has received less attention. Here I collect a few examples from Classical Tibetan and Old Tibetan texts of affixless verb forms occurring in syntactically nominal contexts.

In example (1) the nominalized present verb stem ḡdzin-pa 'taker' is coordinated with gzuṅ, the finite future stem of the same verb. The meaning of gzuṅ in this passage is unequivocally 'that which is taken', as if the form were gzuṅ-pa or gzuṅ-bya. The choice of -daṅ as coordination marker guarantees the interpretation of gzuṅ as a nominal form, since -daṅ occurs only after nouns and never after verbs (Schwieger 2008: 161, 274-276). The expected phrase gzuṅ-pa-daṅ ḡdzin-pa is attested, as seen in example (2).

(1) gzuṅ-daṅ ḡdzin-paḥi sgrīb gņis bral
   'free from the two obscurations of 'taken' and 'taker'.
   (Marpa 67a)
(2) de ltar yoṅs-su sbyaṅs-nas gzuṅ-pa-daṅ ḡdzin-pa-las rnam-par srol-ziṅ
   'being thus completely purified, one is liberated from 'taken' and 'taker' (Tenjur, vol. 13, p. 229)

One might suppose that in example (1), although the form in question looks verbal, in fact it is a noun derived from a verb just as 'a run' derives from 'to run' in English or gnas 'place' form gnaṅ 'to stay' in Tibetan. Although 'zero nominalization' is a fine term for this type of derivation of nouns from verbs, it is a derivational rather than an inflectional process and may not be synchronically productive. Nonetheless, there are other examples in which the zero-nominalized form functions verbally to the left and nominally to the right, just as in the case of productive inflectional nominalization such as -pa suffixation.

The noun phrase rtse-la ḡdgaṅ daṅ sduṅ-pa 'amorous play and
beauty' of example (3) consists of two component phrases *rtse-la dgaĥ 'amorous play' and *sdug-pa 'beauty', coordinated by the associative case -daṅ. The first constituent of the coordination, *rtse-la dgaĥ 'play and love', itself clearly consists of two finite verbs coordinated by the converb -la. Thus, dgaĥ functions as a verb to the left (taking the verbal coordinator la) and a noun to the right (taking the nominal coordinator daṅ).

The threats of illness are thus quite unbearable. The wise man, having seen this circumstance, how will he engender the notion of amorous play and beauty? (D. 96, vol. 46, p. 94a)

To my taste the passage should have read rtse-la dgaĥ-ziṅ sdug-paḥi, with the verbal coordinator-ziṅ in place of the nominal coordinator case -daṅ. Tshogs drug raṅ grol (1781-1851) shares this preference, as seen in his quotation of the passage in example (4).

The threats of illness are thus quite unbearable; the wise man, if he sees this circumstance, how will the notion of amorous play and beauty arise? (Tshogs drug raṅ grol 2002, vol 4, p. 413)

In example (5) the phrase ma rig looks like a finite 'didn't know', but functions as an attribute 'ignorant' as if the text had gsuṅ ma-rig-pa. The presence of the negation marker ma ensures that rig is acting verbally to the left.

(5) *bla-mahi gsuṅ // ma-rig min-pa dbyiṅs-su dag /
The words of the guru, which are not ignorant, are as pure as space. (Marpa 67a)

The expected phrase *ma-rig-pa min-pa appears not to be attested. The ninth Karmapa Dbaṅ phyug rdo rje (1556- c. 1603) employs the finite equivalent ma-rig-pa min (example 6). The non-occurrence of *ma-rig-pa min-pa, together with the use of gzuṅ-dan Ḫdzin-pa (example 1) in place of gzuṅ-pa-dan Ḫdzin-pa (example 2), suggest that the Tibetans do not like a construction to contain too many pa’s and omit the first
when two appear in quick succession.

(6) gal-te bu ńan-pa-la bu ma-yin zer-ba bźin-du śes-rabs ńan-pa
ni ma rig-pa ho ze-na / śes-rab ńan-pa ni ma rig-pa min-te/ ńon-
moṅs-can-du gyur-pahi lta-ba yin-pahi phyir
If one says 'evil knowledge' is ignorance, like one says to
an evil son 'he is not (my) son', evil knowledge is not
ignorance because it is a view that gives rise to kleśas.
(Đbaṅ phyug rdo rje 2001)

Analogous to the ma-rig 'ignorance' of example (5) is ma-dad 'lack of
faith' in example (7); the negation of the verb stem suggests it must be
understood verbally to the left, but the use of the noun coordinator -
daṅ requires it to be understood nominally to the right.

(7) ńa-rgyal-daṅ ni ma-dad-daṅ // don-du gñer-ba-med-ńid-daṅ //
phyi-rol-rnam-g.yen-naṅ-bsdus-daṅ // skyo-ba-ńan-pahi dri-ma
yin //
Pride and lack of faith, lack of interest and being
distracted outward, being withdrawn inward and
dejection, (these) are flaws of listening. (Bu ston 22b)

Example (7) offers a second more interesting case of zero
nominalization, viz. don-du gñer-ba-med-ńid. The clitic -ńid typically
follows a noun phrase; a phrase don-du gñer-ba med-pa-ńid 'non-
extistence of searching after meaning' would pose no problem. This
example is in meter, but a causa metri explanation for the lack of -pa is
unsatisfying, since one could have swapped the -ńid with a -pa and
thereby improved the syntax without substantially changing the
meaning.

In example (8) bźugs looks like a finite verb 'sits', but in context it
means 'those who sit', as if the form were bźugs-pa. Because bźugs 'sit'
governs the ḡdir 'here' to its left, it cannot be analyzed as a noun.
Example (9) is exactly analogous, but with the verb tshogs 'assemble'.
The expected phrases ḡdir bźugs-pa (10) and ḡdir tshogs-pa (11) also
occur. In these cases, the explanation for the zero-nominalized forms
is certainly that the passages in examples (8) and (9) are verse
whereas examples (10) and (11) are prose.

(8) ḡdir bźugs gsan-cig !
'listen, O you who sit here!' (Marpa 50a)
(9) ḡdir tshogs grwa-pa bu-slob kun //
'O all you monks and disciplines gathered here!' (Marpa
83a)
There is no need to examine whether or not those sitting at this great maṇḍala are suitable for taking prātimokṣa vows. (Tenjur, vol. 29, p. 300)

We siblings assembled here, having blessed in this way these victuals which we offer (D 846, vol. 99, p. 192a)

In example (12) the verb lta 'watch' acts verbally to the left, governing gar 'dance' in the allative case, and it acts nominally to the right, as an argument of mtshuṅs 'be similar'. A nominalized form lta-ba, as seen in example (13), would have been expected.

The birth and death of creatures is like watching a dance. (D.96, vol. 46, page 88a)

Like parents looking at their only child (D.120, vol. 53, page 130b)

Zero-nominalization is also attested in Old Tibetan, although the smaller size of the corpus limits one's abilities to find closely parallel passages with and without the zero-nominalization. In example (14) the word dnö-grub 'siddhi' is modified by the verb phrase srid-pa gsum-la dbaṅ byed 'rule over the three worlds'.

The three siddhis (which) rule over the three worlds (Rama C l. 12).

One would usually expect a nominalized clause to modify its head to the right, i.e. dnö-grub gsum  srid-pa gsum-la dbaṅ byed-pa, or, if the modifier is to the left of its head, one expects both nominalization and the genitive case, i.e. srid-pa gsum-la dbaṅ byed-paḥi dnö-grub gsum.

The examples given above suffice to demonstrate the existence of zero-nominalization in Classical and Old Tibetan.
Primary sources


D = Derge Kanjur


Rama = de Jong 1989


References


Amdo politics and religion—Tuken Losang Choki Nyima (Thu’u bkwan Blo bzang chos kyi nyi ma, 1737-1802)¹

Paul K. Nietupski

Introduction

Chinese and Tibetan deities are believed to be able to influence human affairs, and bestow blessings and rewards on many levels. Qualified or at least well guided humans are in turn able to invoke and control deities. Given this, deity invocation, control, and place-identification were parts of a religious, social, and political process asserted by Chinese and Tibetan emperors, local elites, and common Chinese and Tibetans. Gods were subject to rituals performed by qualified individuals, who invoked and controlled deities for religious merit (punya), victory in battle, expressions of political fealty, economic prosperity, and cure of disease.

One of the most famous Chinese deities was Guan Yun Chang (關雲長, ca. 162-220), also known as Guandi (關帝), Guanyu (關羽, 关羽), in Tibetan Kwan Lo Ye, Kwan Yun Chang, and Kwan Sprin Ring, or by one of his very many other names and titles, to this day still well

known in China. He is believed to have been a general in the Eastern Han Dynasty who went on to develop an illustrious career, or careers in China’s military, political, and religious institutions. Over time, Guan Yun Chang, in a redefinition or “superscription” process played different roles in history. Prasenjit Duara showed how Guandi in different times and places in China served as a validating source for victory in war, for Buddhist benefit, and for the acquisition of wealth and power. Here, the argument is that when invoked and controlled by Tibetans, Guandi/Guan Yun Chang would reward Tibetans with territorial definition and protection, political autonomy, religious authority, and rewards of any description.

Over time—like many other Chinese and Tibetan (Gesar, for example) mythic heroes, Guandi became deified and venerated in temples in Chinese communities around the world. There are today books, plays, movies, and video games about Guandi. Besides being associated with warfare, he represents loyalty (zhong, 忠) to the community and country, righteousness (yi, 義), and other traditionally Chinese, and “Confucian” values. To this day, he is an important figure in Chinese folk religion, in Confucianism, Daoism, Chinese Buddhism, and in modern Chinese national sensibilities, noted in detail by Duara. But Guandi was not the only iconic deity in the Tibetan and Chinese worlds. For the Chinese, the Southern Song general Yue Fei (岳飛, 1103-1142), the goddess Mazu (媽祖, 媽祖), perhaps the modern Lei Feng (雷锋, 1940-1962), or even Chairman Mao Zedong, became deified and venerated in Chinese communities around the world.

This malleability however allows for continuity of identity, resulting in a situation where myths are both continuous and discontinuous. This is relevant to our present project in several Amdo Tibetan communities, which have maintained their own interpretations of the status, roles, and capabilities of deities, and at the same time, in a number of places engaged foreign powers, in this case, Guandi. This is what Duara, drawing on Malinowski and others, argues is the adoption of a foreign myth: in the process losing some of the original details, but where “... extant versions are not totally wiped out... but by adding

---

2 For a detailed outline of Guandi, his many names, related legends, etc., see [http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Guan_Yu](http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Guan_Yu) (accessed 26 December 2014). This source is however not very useful for the present project.

or ‘rediscovering’ new elements or by giving existing elements a particular slant, the new interpretation is lodged in place.”

Thus, imperial Guandi is the Chinese—and Tibetan—god of war, the god of Confucian loyalty to state and family, a Buddhist door guardian, a Daoist protector, a god of wealth, a Han loyalist, and more. But acceptance and worship of Guandi and at the same time redefinition and control of the deity, is arguably the situation with the Tibetan adoption of this Chinese “God of War.” Here, however, in the hands of Tuken and others cited below, our protagonist Guandi is drawn into the service of Amdo Tibetans by a translation of his story, and especially by a ceremony and liturgy that bind the deity to the service of the Tibetans.

This is how we can understand the Tibetan adoption of the Chinese deity Guandi, who appears in a number of Tibetan contexts. In Duara’s words, “[s]uperscription thus implies the presence of a lively arena where rival versions jostle, negotiate, and compete for position. . . . to establish its own dominance over the others.” Guandi lives in Tibet, and is absorbed into the already massive Tibetan divine realms, and superscripted or interpreted or accepted, on Tibetan terms.

Adopting foreign deities was a symbolic process, but it had concrete results. The Tibetan adoption of Guandi constituted recognition and acceptance, but we hasten to add that it did not mean full acceptance of Chinese authority. Again, in Duara’s rendering, “historical groups are able to expand old frontiers of meaning to accommodate their changing needs . . . [but] the legitimacy of the old is drawn upon.” Writing of the Qing Dynasty, and here very resonant with seventeenth century and centuries following in Amdo, Duara argues that

The struggle to survive within this arena may be desperate, and so also to dominate, as with the Qing. But although the Qing was able to reorder the interpretive arena of the myth, its hegemony was never

---

4 Duara 780.
5 For example against the Manchus, Duara 787.
6 Duara 783-4.
8 Duara 780.
9 Duara 791.
Amdo politics and religion

absolute. . . . In the end it had to be satisfied with a nominal acceptance of the official version by particularly defiant subaltern groups.\(^\text{10}\)

In this essay our focus is on Tibetans and Chinese in the eighteenth century, the Qing Dynasty period, in which Duara suggests that for the Chinese Guandi, “Emperor Guan,” was prominent. For some the implication might be that the peoples of Tibet were under the actual rule of the Manchu emperors. Our primary Tibetan source texts, however, present a scenario in which Guandi, the Chinese “God of War,” is appropriated and used by Tibetans.

The very short Tibetan text translated below has two main parts; first, an historical sketch of the mythological “emperor” of China Guandi/Guan Yun Chang, in Tibetan, Kwan Phrin Rings, and several other names, and second, a liturgy for invoking and controlling him. The text was composed by Tuken Losang Chokyi Nyima (1737-1802), a scholar from Amdo who was well connected in the Qing court, well connected in Lhasa at Gomang College of Drepung Monastery, and not the least, well connected in a network of prominent scholars and religious leaders in Amdo.

The inclusion of China and a well-known Chinese deity who exemplifies loyalty to the Chinese state government in these Tibetan liturgies and art objects attests to the close involvement and self-assertion of the Tibetans in the Qing court. The liturgies are thus remarkable for the Tibetan assertions of local Tibetan sovereignty and at the same time their acknowledgement of the outside authority of the Qing emperors and their armies.

Communities of the Faithful

Drawing on central Tibetan religious heritage and social models, Amdo Tibetan monastic estate owners in this period amassed much of their often enormous wealth and political authority from local nomad and farming communities. Internal sovereignty and regional economic control were often validated by Lhasa religious pedigrees and endorsed by powerful outside forces, in this period, and in the case of Tuken, especially the Mongols and Manchus. These internal monastery-centered networks and effective engagement with external powers were crucial to the well-being of the Amdo “monastic” consortium.

\(^{10}\) Duara 791.
Like the Chinese deities, including Guandi, the Tibetans have their own pantheons of deities, including Buddhist, Bon, local Tibetan deities, important Indian deities, and Guandi, altogether in an arguably even more complex pantheon than the Chinese. These include many historical figures transformed, or apotheosed, and widely recognized Tibetan adepts in lineages of reborn scholars and practitioners. Common Tibetan deities include very many local inhabitants, and, noted in the texts under study here, many well-known bodhisattvas and tantric deities, including Vajrapāṇi, Avalokiteśvara, Vajra Bhairava, and Mahākāla.

These deities and their followers, the human communities of believers, were not isolated from one another. This is very much the case in advanced meditations for individuals and their primary objects of meditation (iṣṭadevatā). Katia Buffetrille has noted that deities, in this respect like humans, have relationships with each other, as spouses or lovers, offspring, or competitors, often in close physical proximity to one another.

Briefly, in Buddhist technical language, Tibetan and Chinese deities engaged in human-like, mundane laukika religious (mi chos) matters, and in transcendent lokottara, often tantric concerns (lha chos). The former worldly matters were important in establishing local political sovereignty, less concerned with matters of religious insight and Buddhist enlightenment. However, knowledgeable lay Tibetan and Chinese people and even well-educated lamas did not strictly differentiate between the categories of the religions of gods and humans. Epstein & Peng noted that Tibetan, and might add, Chinese lay faithful did not hesitate to ask the Buddhist tantric deities for mundane favors:

... as Samuel and others have pointed out, the Tibetan folk and more formal religious traditions have interpenetrated each other to the extent that it is difficult to disentangle them. Monks, for example, often perform readings of religious texts for laymen, which, in the eyes of the latter, accomplish the same this-worldly ends as do, say, folk rituals of purification. They also confer some degree of otherworldly

merit on them. Similarly, Buddhist or Bon rituals and texts are often employed in folk rituals.\(^\text{13}\)

The point here is that even if formally separated there is a conflation of the categories of religions of gods and humans into what might be a third category, a fusion of religious deities (tantric and non-tantric, *lokottara* and *laukika*) and religious goals (apotropaic and transcendent).\(^\text{14}\) Religious and political, temporal motives and goals are not separate in these communities. The religious vision of the unity of human and divine realms in Amdo, and the applications of divine power to the physical realities of Amdo economics, weather, territorial sovereignty and warfare were, as above, arguably very real. Evidence of these visions and concerns are in Tuken’s text under study here, and in the texts of his Amdo contemporaries noted below.

Competition between communities and their respective deities are expressions of territoriality, even on national levels. Deity invocation and place-identification are a political process asserted by local lay chieftains and Buddhist leaders, who derive their authority not only from the central Tibetan or other governments, but also from more local resident deities.\(^\text{15}\) These deities are subject to rituals performed by qualified individuals, like Tuken, who can invoke and control deities like Guandi. This process was an invisible political agency located in living communities that defined ownership of land, boundaries, and the community’s territorial and political autonomy.

These scholars demonstrate a strong sense of history, perhaps better described as Brown’s “intervisibility,” or even better, an intersubjectivity by which Tibetan and Chinese peoples and histories were mutually cognizant of one another. Again, considering Waugh, the importations of Guan Yun Chang into Tibetan communities were instances of

“... movement, resettlement, and interactions across ill-defined borders
... also the story of artistic exchange and the spread and mixing of religions, all set against the background of the rise and fall of polities which encompassed a wide range of cultures and peoples ...”\(^\text{16}\)

---

13 Epstein and Peng 1998, 121.
14 See R.A. Stein, 37-49. The material in these paragraphs is taken in part from Paul K. Nietupski, “Understanding Sovereignty in Amdo.” In *Trails of the Tibetan Tradition: Papers for Elliot Sperling*. Edited by Roberto Vitali, with assistance from Gedun Rabsal and Nicole Willock, 217-232.
And similarly, echoing Brown, the engagement of Guan Yun Chang by these Tibetans was “. . . juxtaposition of the known and the exotic,” a kind of “archaic globalization.”

Liturgy as Literature

The short text translated below has two parts: first an historical sketch of the mythological “God of ar,” and “emperor” of China Guandi, aka Guan Yun Chang, and second, a liturgy for invoking and controlling him. The text was composed by Tuken Losang Chokyi Nyima (1737-1802), again an Amdo Mongguor scholar educated in Lhasa, well connected in the Qing court, and highly regarded in Amdo. In addition to this text by Tuken, this project references altogether six works by five major figures in Tuken’s network, all with similar religious and academic pedigrees, with similar political orientations and assumptions of sovereignty. The five authors are (1) Tuken himself, (2) Chahar Géshé (Cha har dge bshes Blo bzang tshul khrims, aka Cha phring ’jang gsar bstan ’dzin, 1740-1810), author of two liturgies to Guandi, (3) the Second Jamyang Zhepa (’Jam dbyangs bzhad pa Dkon mchog ’jigs med dbang po, 1728-1791), (4) the Third Jangkya, Rolpé Dorje (Lcang skya Rol pa’i rdo rje, 1717-1786), and (5) the Sixth Panchen Lama, Losang Pelden Yeshé (Slob bzang dpal ldan ye shes, 1738-1780). The six liturgies are remarkable for the assertions of local sovereignty and at the same time for their diplomatic acknowledgement of the outside authority of the Qing emperor and his armies.

Tibetan liturgical (gsol mchod) literature is very scripted, and more like screenplays or dramatic programs than prose narratives. The texts here signal religious and community events. They typically involve the exercise of procedures and processes and are often preceded by prayers, invocations of deities, and acknowledgements of teachers and teachings.

All texts include breaks for ritual processes and explanatory asides: offerings of herbs, fragrant plants, foods, recitation of spells, music, and so on. The texts give the impression of being notes taken at, or in preparation for an actual ritual, in the example translated here likely with Tuken officiating, contributing the central texts and prayers, but not writing out everything in the actual sequence, leaving this to assis-

---

tants in the community. Tuken includes prayers and mantras from canonical texts, quoted passages, and some references to historical documents, evidencing a broad literary education.

The style and genre of Tuken’s selection here is also reflected in the works of other Tibetan writers, perhaps in this respect part of the necessary repertoire for Tibetan writers. Tuken’s text colophon tells us that our present piece was given in the presence of the Mongol Khalka Jinong Beisi, at Jis bu, in the country of Kwachu. It was requested (bskul) by one Darhan Choje Yeshe Dragpa Sangpo (Chos rje ye shes grags pa bzang po), assembled, or edited (sbyar) by Ku swa yi [UNCLEAR] Dharmavajra, and the writer (yi ge pa) was Ngag dbang phun tshogs. The performance was likely attended by many local monks and laypersons. These details speak to the process of “writing” or “composition” of Tibetan texts and are similar to those found in all of the texts under study here, and in much of Tibetan literature in general.

In terms of literary structure and content, two of the five authors under study here, Tuken and Chahar Géshé, began their liturgies with brief historical or better mythological accounts of Guan Yun Chang. The histories here are mixed with myth. Descriptive titles of kings, generals, and lamas are defined in their own respective terms, and assumptions of sovereignty asserted by each writer. But for all of the mixing and vision, the liturgies were grounded in very real persons and places. The network of scholars is marked by Chahar Géshé in his colophon, where he notes that the first of his two compositions to Guandi/Guan Yun Chang is “based on Tuken’s oral composition (zhal snga), and a little expanded according to models in other propitiation rituals.”

Interaction, or networking, is clearly evident in the historical sections of Tuken’s and Chahar Géshé’s liturgies. In a comment that signals some historical blending, or perhaps Brown’s “juxtaposition” or a signal of “archaic globalization,” Tuken notes that the deity Guandi/Guan Yun Chang is “of the same mind” (thugs rgyud gcig pa yin te) as Begtsé Jamsing (beg tse lcam sring). Tuken explains further that in ancient texts (sngon gyi yig rnying rnams su . . .) it is said of Begtsé that “he was a Chinese demon (dam sri).” He goes on to say that Lālitavajra (Rolpé Dorjé) orally translated this into modern Indian language. Chahar Géshé makes no mention of Beg Tsé’s supposed Chinese origins or Rolpé Dorjé’s use of ancient texts, but both authors state

---

18 Zhal snga nas thu’u bkwan rin po ches mdzad pa bzhin byas kyi steng du bskang gso’i cho ga gzhin la rigs ’gres kyi seng zad rgyas su bzang nas . . ., 10b2). Chahar Géshé has two liturgies to Guan Lo Ye/Yun Chang, full details noted in the bibliography. Here, the first is abbreviated “Gsol mchod” and the second “’Dod rgu ’gugs pa’i lcags kyu.”

19 Gsol mchod, (fol. 2b3-4).
that Beg Tsé Jamsing/Guan Yun Chang is the “owner” (bdag po) of all of China, and that he has many donors of food and drink in Tibet, and in particular, that “... a great venerable being (bla chen sku gres po) in Tsang, ... [is] the chief of our donors.”

Chahar Géshé concurs with two quotations similar in content, but not literal renderings of Rolpé Dorjé’s text, alluding to “the great being of Tsang, who, it is said, is in the lineage of the Panchen Rinpoche [and] ... relied on Beg Tsé. ... And, it says in the biography of the designated Prince Don grub (gsungs pa'i rgyal bu kyi rtogs brjod der ...) that when the omniscient [6th/3rd] Panchen Lobzang Yéshé (1738-1780) was young,

a red man came and said ‘I am called Beg Tsé.’ In the future I vow to be your protector, and so on. It is clear that this is the deity, [and] it is certain that this very one is identical to Beg Tsé (beg tse dang ngo bo gcig yin par nges so). Furthermore, the minister Dorjé Dudul also said that they are identical. ... (fol. 3a2-4)

Chahar Géshé continues that since the time of Sróngtsan Gampo and Princess Wencheng, Tibet sent ministers to China and that previous Tibetan kings paid their respects to Guandi/Guan Yun Chang, naming him in Chinese and in Tibetan “The great emperor who defeats the demons of the three realms (khams gsum bdud 'dul rgyal po chen po).” He mentions that when Wencheng went to Tibet she was followed by Guandi/Guan Yun Chang, who was installed in a fortress in the Grib region of Lhasa, in the Crystal Cave in Yarlung, today known as Btsan bshan, and subsequently in many other places.

Chahar Géshé closes his historical account by crediting the Yig Tshang, presumably the Rgya Bod Yig Tshang Chen Mo of the 15th century writer Dpal 'byor bzang po,21 citing “the testimony of many erudite people (tshad ma'i skyes bu), and the writings of many previous meditators (sngon gyi hwa shang).” These two historical accounts, by Tuken and Chahar Géshé again attest to the interaction between Tibetan and Chinese deities, their visions, and their roles in Tibetan culture.

---

20 I understand that this passage refers to the 6th (3rd in the Bkra shis lhun po system) Panchen Lama Losang Palden Yéshé, 1738-1780, author of a Collected Works that contains a liturgy to Guan Yun Chang, and not the 5th Panchen Lama, Losang Yéshé (1663-1737). The text reads Blo bzang ye shes (3a2), the 5th, but the 6th (3rd) wrote the liturgy. The 5th Panchen received novice vows from the 5th Dalai Lama (1617-1682), and went on to give novice vows to the 6th Dalai Lama. Both Panchens were in contact with the Qing court.

21 Gsol mchod, (fol. 3a6-3b4).
Of the six Tibetan liturgies to Guandi, these two, our present text by Tuken and the other by Chahar Géshé, contain historical introductions, as above. Three of the six compositions are quite different, very short, and include mostly verses of invocation to Guandi. These three short pieces are, with colophons, (1) the very brief verses by Rolpé Dorjé, (2) a brief composition by the 6th [3rd] Panchen Lama Losang Palden Yéshé, and (3) the second liturgy by Chahar Géshé, the ‘dod rgu ‘gugs pa’i lcags kyu,” very different from his long liturgy appended to his history, which he credits in part to Tuken.

In addition to these three short writings, three others (of the six) liturgies are more detailed, longer compositions. These include visualization instructions, use of ritual materials, and notes of sequences of the rituals. These three are (4) Tuken’s liturgy, translated here below, (5) Chahar Géshé’s piece appended to his history (again, credited in part to Tuken), and (6) the Second Jamyang Zhepa’s composition. Altogether these make six liturgical works, including two with attached historical sketches.

Religious Contexts

These detailed writings contain much description of religious ritual and mention of philosophical contexts (ston pa nyid tu ’gyur . . . ), deity families and hierarchies, historical persons (Tsong kha pa, etc.), and not the least, the idea of the Tibetan “unity of religion and worldly matters.” Outside of the fact that he intends to invoke and control invisible deities, the Sixth Panchen Losang Pelden Yéshé has little to say about religious or metaphysical contexts. In his similarly brief writing Rolpé Dorjé, however, instructs one to begin the liturgy after emerging from meditation on the “superior deities (lhag pa’i lha) Guhyasamāja, Cakrasaṃvara, or Vajrabhairava,” and continue to recite the six mantras, the six mūdras,22 and the three seed syllables (om ah hum).

Tuken gives more detailed information taken from tantric ritual contexts about how to approach Guandi/Guan Yun Chang. At the opening of his historical section he invokes Hayagrīva, and in the actual liturgy he begins with a mention of the necessary material offerings--refined alcohol, medicinal substances--and, like others of the liturgies, notes when musical instruments are to be sounded. Tuken goes

---

on to describe how one is to visualize a gold and silver vessel appearing from the letter hūṃ, on top of which are three vajras from which one offers an oblation of nectar. One recites Oṃ aḥ huṃ three times and proceeds with the oblation. The other authors are even more explicit; in his eloquent work the Second Jamyang Zhepa clearly uses ritual processes from the tantric traditions as preliminaries to his invocation of Guandi/Guan Yun Chang, including a fire offering fueled by precious substances, all absorbed and answered by hosts of deities, where appearance and emptiness are not mutually obstructive (snang stong ma ’gag). This type of language and ritual process is elaborated in even more detail in Chahar Gēshé’s liturgy.

These brief compositions are one very small example of a dynamic and rich religious culture, an important part of the broad expanse of Tibetan religious practices. The liturgies display the Tibetan religious worldview, densely populated by invisible spirits of broad description. Guandi/Guan Yun Chang is variously described as a regional deity (gzhi bdag), an enemy deity (dgra lha), and a Dharma protector (bstan bsrung). In all cases, Guandi/Guan Yun Chang represents forces to pay attention to, to control, and at best, manipulate to one’s own advantage. In this regard Guandi/Guan Yun Chang and similar spirits are very involved in human affairs, both for better and for worse, and are accessible to religious experts, who through various means, including liturgy recitation and ritual, can bridge the normally impenetrable barrier between gods and humans.23

The Network

With so many liturgies and so many deities, one might suppose that such studies and performances become repetitive and boring. The tedious generic qualities are, however, quickly lost in the specific contexts, which in our case include a group of five prominent religious and political leaders, specific places in Amdo, and local constituents. Liturgies have an important role as a dynamic contact point between high level religious figures, political leaders, their own extended communities, and outside forces, which here include especially the Manchus and Mongols, all with their own vested interests.

The five authors are remarkable for their Amdo roots (except for the Sixth Panchen Lama Losang Pelden Yeshé, 1738-1780, from central Tibet, but who had extensive contacts with Amdo lamas, and wrote liturgies to deities from Kokonor/Mtsho sngon po/Qinghai, etc.), their Lhasa-derived religious education, their proximate Mongol neighbors, their engagement with the Qing court and Qing authorities, and their compositions focused on Guandi/Guan Yun Chang. One particular point noted in the works by Tuken and Chahar Géshé that seems revealing is the episode of the mysterious “red man” who appeared in a dream, and is identified as Begtsé/Guandi, and fully described, but not as clearly identified, in the Second Jamyang Zhepa’s liturgy. The deity advises Rolpé Dorjé to go to Tsang, where he has many loyal followers and supporters. This seems to indicate the importance of Tsang, home of the Panchen Lamas, to Guandi/Guan Yun Chang, who describes himself as the “owner” of all of China. The identification of Tsang as a support base for the Chinese deity Guandi/Guan Yun Chang seems to be a telling episode, given that our writers are mostly from Amdo, but perhaps signaling a close connection to central Tibet.

A Community of Scholars

Guandi/Guan Yun Chang, a Chinese-originated deity and his mythic stories, was a “God of War,” appropriated and manipulated by Amdo Tibetans. Such deity invocation and manipulation was widespread across Amdo and all of Tibet, at all levels of society. This example is especially interesting for its cross-border movement between Tibet and China. In addition to Tuken, the invocation and manipulation of Guandi/Guan Yun Chang appears in the writings of several of his colleagues, several mentioned above. These well-known and prolific

---

scholars in part made up a network of scholars in teacher-student relationships, and often in tantric guru-disciple relationships. All were in the Gelukpa order, and were celibate Tibetan Buddhist monks; in this they were very different from their famous pupil and supporter, the Qianlong emperor. 25 Outside of literary compositions, other evidence of Tibetan appropriation of Guandi/Guan Yun Chang in central Tibet include the Guandi statue, with Gesar in the ca. 1793 temple near Chakpori in Lhasa. This temple is credited to the Reting Regent, Losang Yeshe Tenpa Rabgye (1759–1815). The list of associations goes on, and signals an important component of Tibetan religious and political sensibilities, far beyond the scope of this short essay.

Finally, a word about our Monguor Amdo scholar-politician-enlightened bodhisattva, the Third Tuken (1737-1802). Briefly, his religious biography begins with his studies with the Third Jangkya, ROLPHÉ DORJÉ and the Second Jamyang Zhepa. He was educated at Gonlung Monastery and at Gomang in Lhasa. He was identified as the rebirth of the Second Tuken by ROLPHÉ DORJÉ, by the Second Jamyang Zhepa, and by other prominent Tibetan teachers. He was ordained (dge tshul) by ROLPHÉ DORJÉ. After the passing of the Second Jamyang Zhepa, one of his primary teachers in Lhasa, the Third Tuken went on to validate the rebirth of the Third Jamyang Zhepa (Blo bzang thub bstan ‘jigs med rgya mtsho, 1792-1855), and later granted him renunciate (rab byung).

Amdo politics and religion

vows. The Third Tuken went on to serve as executive administrator of Zhalu Serkang, Gonlung Jampa Ling, and Kumbum monasteries.

In addition to his Amdo roots, his education in Lhasa, and his prominence in his home institutions, Tuken and his network of Amdo teachers and scholars also shared strong involvement with the Qing and Mongol courts. The Third Tuken spent a good deal of time traveling between Beijing, Mongolia, and Lhasa. He made three trips to Beijing, the first for five years, and the others much shorter. He spent much time with the Qianlong Emperor, serving as one of his closest Buddhist teachers. He was honored by the Lhasa government, the Chinese Emperor, and was highly regarded by Mongol, and not the least, Tibetan nobility. The similarities in homeland, education in Amdo and in central Tibet, and involvement in the Chinese imperial court are evidence of political and religious institution building.

Conclusion

The discussion of Guandi/Guan Yun Chang and the Tibetan lamas and deities becomes more relevant when one considers that social and political authority were very often understood as integrated with religious ideologies and institutions. Ideologies, including interactions


with deities, were the groundworks of ethical, legal, political, and religious behavior. Put simply, Amdo monastic authorities, in the name of divine beings, exercised authority over farm and pasture land, received tax revenues, corvée, and profits from livestock, and received a wide range of donations. They were recognized and respected by their neighbors. In return, deities were believed to be capable of “eliminating outer and inner obstacles, fulfilling the community’s wishes, providing for their long and prosperous lives, healthy livestock, not too much or too little rain, and bountiful crops.” They were thought to expedite Buddhist practice and merit-making activities, and here most importantly could, in the eyes of local Tibetan communities, provide grounds for political sovereignty in their designated fields of control.

Translation

“Thunder that calls down a deluge of good deeds: The history of the great king Guan Yun Chang, who overcomes the demons of the three realms and the way to invoke him”

Tuken Losang Chokyi Nyima (1737-1802)

Homage to the teacher Hayagrīva,
Who binds all beings tightly with the noose of compassion,
Who pulverizes legions of demons with his wrathful dance,
And is the great wrathful king who terrifies with all fearsome things.
I bow with respect to the feet of Great Lotus [Hayagrīva]
Who by merely raising the banner of his inexhaustible power Destroys [even] the name of evil.

---

28 There are many different kinds of local deities in Amdo, including yul lha, gzhi bdag, gnyan, gdon, bgegs, rbad ’dre, rbo dgon, klu, and others.


30 The text is unclear here; I read provisionally “thal mar rlog,” to smash, crush, pulverize.

31 Khro rgyal chen po bzhi, four wrathful kings, protectors of the four directions: Vijaya, Yamāntaka, Hayagrīva, Amṛtakundali.

32 Padma dbang chen is an epithet of Hayagrīva.
Let us gently proclaim with a storm of praise
To invoke a deluge of the great king’s wish fulfilling goodness.

Here is the method for offering tormas of praise to the one known as
King Yun Chang, who controls the demons of the three realms. In this
there are two parts, the history of the great king and the actual expla-
nation of the method for offering tormas of praise.

First,
Long ago, in the great country of China, there was a Han (han gur) em-
peror named Xuande 玄德 (also known as Liu Bei 劉備,刘备, 161-223).
His minister, named [Guan]Yu (yu‘u; 羽) (ca. 160-220),33 was of noble
birth and courageous [in battle]. [Guan Yu’s] power was great; he was
appointed military commander. He conquered different hostile enemy
countries, and brought innumerable regional emperors (sa steng gi
rgyal po) and lesser kings under his control. And, when arrogant per-
sons, proud of their bravery gathered around him they became like
garudas and little birds. Everywhere, just by hearing his name there
was not even one among them who did not bow. Moreover, it is said
that he was one of unwavering righteousness in any circumstance,
peaceful or violent, without the ferocity that does not discriminate be-
tween those to be protected and those to be subdued. He was like
Aśoka, king of the Buddhist teachings (dharmarāja), a wheel turning
king (cakravartirāja) who protects a great country in accordance with
the Buddhist teachings. Further, as it is said, he quickly bypassed men-
tal delusions (thugs mug pa’i rnam pas) and then assumed a birth as a
great dragon (nya mid chen po).34 At the end of his life, when there were
battles with others, he appeared as if angry, and afterwards, there was
[only] a light rain [remaining]. (…) ‘og rol tu zi khrong gyi sa’i char).

At Yuquan Mountain35 there is a high peak today called Zhang
Ling. There, [Guan Yu] became Shu po che, a spirit of the nāga class.
He is extremely disruptive. Mere travel by others in sight of that
mountain was difficult.36

---

33 These identifications are tentative. The text is Sya na dhl…yu’u, the king and
minister. This could be Xiandi 献帝 (181-234), but Xuande is connected to Guan
Yu/Guandi.
34 Unclear text; nya mid chen po’i skye bslangs par…, 2a1.
35 See note 13.
36 The text here is unclear. I tentatively read: 2a2: klu’i rigs kyi mi ma yin shu po che zhig
tu gyur pa shin tu tsub drag pas…
Then, after about four hundred years passed, the great master Zhiyi (智顗),\textsuperscript{37} who upheld the lineage of Protector Nāgārjuna [and Āryadeva], the father and son, came to that place for retreat (sgrub pa la).\textsuperscript{38} It is said that even though the local people were extremely hostile, he didn’t go back [home], and meditated on that mountain. Then, by the machinations of local spirits a giant snake appeared and wrapped itself around that mountain three times, leading (drang) many tens of millions of armies of gods and nagas. The great mountain shook (brdegs). The sun and moon crashed (brdeb) together. A deluge of weapons fell. A blizzard raged above. [However,] whatever kinds of terrifying apparitions and so on appeared were not able to distract him from his concentration (ting nge ’dzin).

At that moment, the great general [Guan Yu], decorated with armor and ornaments appeared with eight military battalions (sde). He prostrated to the master, apologized for trying to inflict harm, and said “In the past I was a great general. Because I was able to get over my anger I changed into this type (rnam pa can) of snake. Doing good deeds gave rise to this great power and apparition.” [Then,] the master lectured extensively on the teachings of karma and its effects.

[Guan Yu] vowed that “Now, I will be a protector of the Buddha’s teachings. Wherever there is an image of the Buddha, I will install my image in whatever kind of entry gate or left and right antechamber, and I will protect the monastic community and the Buddhist teachings (chos ’khor).” From that time on he became a protector of the Buddhist teachings.\textsuperscript{39}

\textsuperscript{37} Thanks to Zhang Linghui 张凌晖, who provides us with a reference to Ti ce da shi, and his identification as Zhiyi (538–597): “rGya nag hwa shang gi byung tshul grub mtha ’i phyogs snga bcas sa bon tsam smos pa yid kyi dri ma dag byed dge ba ’i chu rgyun,” by Kah-thog-Rig’dzin Tshe-dbang-nor-bu (1698–1755), In Kah-thog rdo rje gdan gyi rig ’dzin chen po tshe dbang nor bu ’i zhabs kyi gsung ’bum (6 vols). Dalhousie, H.P.: Damchoe sangpo, 1976–1977, vol. 5, pp. 419–450. See p. 439, “ṭi ce dā shì’a thwa wan,” a transliteration of the Chinese 智者大师德安, a biographical description of Zhiyi 智顗. He is called Ti ce da shi; Zhiyi is also called Zhizhe dashi 智者大师.

\textsuperscript{38} Text unclear, 2a3.

\textsuperscript{39} This speaks to Guandi/Guan Yu/Guan Yun Chang’s wide range of roles in China. From the internet, with a similar story of Guan Yu, but with very different contexts; compare with Duara’s version, and the present Tibetan version. “In Chinese Buddhism, Guan Yu is revered by most practising Buddhists as Sangharama Bodhisattva (simplified Chinese: 伽蓝菩萨; traditional Chinese: 伽藍菩薩;; pinyin: Qíelán Púsà) a heavenly protector of the Buddhist dharma. . . . The term Sangharama also refer to the dharmapala class of devas and spirits assigned to guard the Buddhist monastery, the dharma, and the faith itself. Over time and as an act of syncreticism, Guan Yu was seen as the representative guardian of the temple and the garden in which it stands. His statue traditionally is situated in the far left of the main altar, opposite his counterpart Skanda. According to Buddhist legends, in 592, Guan Yu manifested himself one night before the Zen master Zhiyi, the founder of the
In that way (de lta bu’i) this very great emperor (rgyal po chen po) is of the same mind (thugs rgyud) as Begtse Chamsing (beg tse lcam sring). In ancient (sngon gyi yig rnying rnam su) accounts it is said that “he was a Chinese demon (dam sri),” and that Begtse is red colored. His weapons include a scorpion-shaped lance (ral gri’i yu pa) and others as in the ancient histories. These are the spoken words of Lālitavajra, our excellent leader, the Lord protector of the teaching (’khor lo’i mgon po), who translated it ‘into modern Indian language’.

Then, on the way to U and Tsang in Tibet, he stayed at the approach to that place [mentioned] above. One day (zhag mdzad pa’i tše), in a dream, a huge red man appeared. He said “The peak of this mountain is my home. I will lead you there.” Taking one step he arrived at that mountain peak. He saw a beautiful house in the middle of many unbelievable ones (chog mi shes). He was offered all different kinds of food and drink. He said [introduced] “This is my daughter and son,” and many came to meet and greet him. From here on down is the country of China. “I am the owner of all of this, from the center to the borders. I also have lots of donors of food and drink in Tibet. In particular, there is a great old being (bla chen) in Tsang who continuously offers food. He will come here to meet you and will be your guide. Briefly, he is the chief of our donors. He will protect and shelter you from any unexpected harm. Your longevity, merit, prosperity, and possessions (yegs tshogs) will increase. Your old friends and good deeds will not decline over time.”

Give praise and increase your good deeds in this way.
You, Conqueror, with your retinue, who controls the demons of the three realms
Today, go [return] to wherever you live.

Tiantai school of Buddhism, along with a retinue of spiritual beings. Zhiyi was then in deep meditation on Yuquan Hill (玉泉山) when he was distracted by Guan Yu’s presence. Guan Yu then requested the master to teach him about the dharma. After receiving Buddhist teachings from the master, Guan Yu took refuge in the triple gems and also requested the Five Precepts. Henceforth, it is said that Guan Yu made a vow to become a guardian of temples and the dharma. Legends also claim that Guan Yu assisted Zhiyi in the construction of the Yuquan Temple (玉泉寺), which still stands today. [http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Guan_Yu](http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Guan_Yu) (accessed 26 December 2014).

For a brief mention, and extended analysis of the phenomenon of deities like and including Beg tse lcam sring as non-Buddhist deities, see José I. Cabezón (ed.), “Introduction,” in *Tibetan Ritual*, (Oxford University Press, 2009), 10, 1-34, passim. Beg tse lcam sring has a Mongolian connection, but perhaps Indian origins. As above, it is related to Hayagrīva, and to the Dge lugs pa order. From the many sources see for example [http://huntingtonarchive.osu.edu/Exhibitions/sama/ Essays/C95.013Begtse.html](http://huntingtonarchive.osu.edu/Exhibitions/sama/ Essays/C95.013Begtse.html) (accessed 27 December 2014).
Then, whenever I call you forth as guests, come quickly without delay and
Carry out good deeds.

Saying that, praise their departure and ornament the ending with these good luck verses. Recite:

The leader of all atmospheric demons, divinities, spirits, aggressive demons
The divinity diligent in practice, like protecting a child.
[Is like] a butcher who cuts to the heart of enemies of the teachings

This liturgy for generating the happiness of Guan Yun Chang is based on valid (tshad ma) oral instructions, and on histories. And, there is no contradiction with the techniques for invoking divinities and guardians by excellent ancient ones (sngon). I think that there are no mistakes. However, these days there are some extremists (dpang gyur skye bo zad) who disagree. There are incorrect practices of Buddhism everywhere. Therefore, it is like scolding a blind person (dmus long mig ldan ’phya ba bzhiṅ). Let those who delight in senseless banter do what makes them happy.

“Ethical behavior [like] tens of thousands of sun rays
The Buddhist teachings spread into a garden of white lotuses.
Happiness is an unceasing honey[-sweet] festival
Embodied beings, bees and others; come and play!”

This great protector of the teachings who rules in this powerful country is known as Emperor Long Cloud, who conquers the demons in the three realms. This method for invoking and worshipping him is titled “Thunder that calls down a deluge of good deeds.” These days, the engagement between most people and the wisdom deities, who protect the teachings, has deteriorated. From this, at this time, for every (re la? Unclear text, 6b1) spirit (mi ma yin) and malevolent being (gdug pa can), lamas, places of refuge more precious than jewels, have increased [works] like this. This is to be avoided (dgag bya che na’ang), but because it was requested by some interested persons, and for some other reasons, the one called [Thu’u bkwan] Blo bzang chos kyi nyi ma, composed [this]. [He] is the one who was titled by order of his excellency, the authentic, wise [Qianlong Emperor] as “Tuken: Pure, Wise

The titles given to the Jamyang Zhepas and others by the Manchus were rather indiscriminate. See for some of the many examples Erdeni nominhan (Dharma king) to the first, Jamyang hu tuk tu (Emanantion Body), nominhan (dharmarāja) and jasagh to the second, Samati pakṣi (a Sanskrit term) to the third, see Ngag
Master of Meditation” (rnam dag bslab ldan bsam gtan gyi slob dpon, 靜修禪師 jing xiu chan shi Thu’u bkwan Hu thog thu),” an honorable figure who has travelled far. He composed this in the Garden of Solitude [at] Dechen Rabgye Ling (dben pa’i dga’ tshal bde chen rab rgyas gling).

Best wishes to all.

The Way to Invoke [Guan Yun Chang]

I bow to all teachers.

When one is worshipping and offering to Emperor Long Cloud and wants to offer a libation, put powder of precious medical seeds into alcoholic spirits (chang rgod kyi nying khu). Pour it into an offering cup and put it in front of you. From BHRUM there are large vessels of gold, silver, and so on. A person with the five qualities (yon tan) for offering a libation of nectar conferred (byin brlabs) with three vajras becomes capable of satisfying guest [deities].

OM AH HUM (Recite three times)

Then, taking the cup in your hand [recite]:

KYAI!

Once, long ago, there was an imperial general. Because of karma and conditions he became a powerful spirit. At that time he realized the ultimate (chos nyid mngon gyur pa) and in front of the Hwa shang master Master Zhiyi he promised to protect the teachings. His name is Emperor Long Cloud, a warrior deity (dgra lha) of the local protectors (sa dbang thub bstan rgya mtsho.’jam dbyangs bzhad pa gsum pa’i rnam thar, 270-271.


Rnam dag bslab ldan bsam gtan gyi slob dpon, 靜修禪師 jing xiu chan shi, 6b2-3. The quotation: gnam bskos ’jam dbyangs gong ma chen po’i bka’i lung gis jing zi’u Chan shi Thu’u bkwan Hu thog thu zhes rnam dag bslab ldan bsam gtan gyi slob dpon du bsngags pas mthar ’khyans pa’i btsun gzugs. Huthuk tu means sprul sku, nirmanakaya but is here used for slob dpon.

Five qualities for offering, in one rendering: Buddhafields, celestial palaces, pure rays of light, thrones, enjoyment.
skyong). His powerful emanations are all pervasive; he controls the entire country of China. His many emanations, Rdo rje bdud ’dul chen po, Srog bdag zangs kyi Beg tse can, Rdzong btsan bshan, and so on, protect Tibet and guard the Buddhist teachings. His religious (dharma, chos) activities are magnificent; he engages in virtuous activities (’phrin las sgrub). He subdues harmful enemies of the teachings and government (bstan srid). He is the Lord, he gives refuge for honor and praise.

KYAI!

“Oh deity, to generate your (khyod) happiness, with a faithful attitude I offer this most pure libation, with reverence, and with pleasant, melodious sounds.”

This wonderful, excellent libation actuates (phabs sbyar) the medical potency in the essence of good fruit. It extracts jewels and gold and releases their potency. The physical strength and luminosity of whoever drinks this will increase. It brings a contented happiness to the heart (snying la dga’ bde’i sim pa ster). Drinking this wondrous nectar satisfies Kwan Yun Chang, the emperor of the warrior deities, his queen and children, the clan (tshang) of Kwan Phing gro’u, and so on. [It also satisfies] the officials, the messengers, the servants, and the divisions of armored and weapons-bearing [soldiers]. This fearsome group of military heroes completely fills the earth and sky.

We offer! We praise! Be content and pleased!

May those who offer this excellent libation, who spread the teachings, and uphold the teachings have stable lives and expand good works. May the leaders of the country guide us to the dharma. In particular, when I and our community hope and are confident, please don’t turn your good works away from whatever undeceiving friends think of, according to their wishes.

Saying that, pour the libation and play music.

Further, this narrative (zhes pa), was given in the presence of the faithful Khalka Jinong Beisi, at Jis bu, in the country (yul) of Kwachu. It was requested by Dar han Chos rje Ye shes grags pa bzang po and written

down by Ku swa yi [UNCLEAR] Dharmavajra. The scribe was Ngag dbang phun tshogs.

References


Blo bzang tshul khrims. “Bkwan lo ye la gser skyems ’bul tshul ’dod rgu ’gugs pa’i lcags dkyu (na phyi ma).” [“Dbang phyogs tsi na’i yul gyi dgra lha’i rgyal chen bkwan lo ye la gser skyems ’bul tshul ’dod rgu ’gugs pa’i lcags dkyu’”]. In Gsung ’bum, Blo bzang tshul khrims. TBRC W23726. 6: 239-244. SKU ‘bum byams pa gling, 2002.


Rawski, Evelyn S. The Last Emperors: A Social History of Qing Imperial Institutions.


A collection of Spiti songs sung at village festivals and private gatherings

Veronika Hein
(Solothurn)

The following five songs have been recorded on various occasions in different villages of central and lower Spiti, Himachal Pradesh (India) and transcribed with the help of the local singers on the one hand and my long-term assistant and interpreter Sonam Tsering from Tabo on the other hand.

The five songs presented here are all very well known in the villages of Spiti and are therefore often sung at dances (the two shabro, čabrō, WT zhabš bró) or at informal gatherings in private houses (the sitting songs, dečlu, WT bsdad glu). What links them is the theme of material wealth which is either collected as symbols of the religious path or offered to the lama or god in order to follow the dharma. The natural beauty of the Himalayan environment is also seen as wealth that makes all the sentient being happy.

1. Shabro: Dzambulingna

Recorded at Tabo (April 2002) and Po (October 2009)

The first shabro presented here might well be the most popular shabro song in the villages of lower Spiti. It is a simple counting song that enumerates a precious substance in each of its four stanzas. It is set in the human world and is about material wealth on a concrete level.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>dzambülĩnna te̤i panydz̄ot j̠</th>
<th>dzambülĩnna séri panydz̄ot j̠</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>In the human world what is there a store-room of?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In the world there is a store of gold.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

1 In this article the text given in IPA renders the spoken Tibetan dialect of central and lower Spiti, some special terms or names are also given in their Written Tibetan form (WT).
2 All the recordings have been put into the Phonogramme Archive of the Austrian Academy of Sciences in Vienna.

The first precious substance mentioned is of course gold. Gold is very rare in Spiti. It is used in some women’s necklaces (in the form of beads) together with coral and turquoise. Otherwise gold is mainly worn in small jewelry such as finger rings.

Gold is so precious that people are warned in the song not to mix it up with brass, which is much more common and cheaper. It is used for plates, vases and jugs.

The second precious substance is silver. Silver is very common in Spiti for head and breast jewelry of the women. But also the men wore amulet boxes made of silver in the old days. Although silver is more affordable than gold, there is also a warning, not to mistake aluminium for more expensive silver. Aluminium is commonly used for cooking pots, ladles and spoons.

The third precious substance is turquoise. This mineral is first of all used in the head ornaments of the women (perāk, WT be rag?), but also in necklaces and rings of both men and women. The false turquoise which the text warns of is probably just a cheap quality of turquoise sometimes used in jewelry.

The fourth precious substance is conch shell. This substance was

---

4 In Tabo norsō is used instead.
also used for ornaments in the old days as it can still be found as part of the costumes of the Buchen (puṭeṇ, WT bu chen), the religious performers of Pin Valley / Spiti. What is interesting in this stanza is the fact that the substance mentioned as an alternative that should not be mixed up with conch shell is ivory. In western materialistic understanding ivory is more valuable than conch shell. That is why the symbolic meaning of conch must be taken into account. And then, in the Tibetan Buddhist context, conch is the really precious substance, because the conch is one of the eight auspicious symbols. As a wind instrument it is blown at the monastery to call the people or as a signal to the gods at certain moments of a ritual performed by the monks.

The last stanza shows most clearly the fusion of material and symbolic significance of the substances mentioned in the song. Looking at the song as a whole, it starts with the most valuable substance in terms of material value and it ends with the most precious substance in terms of spiritual or religious importance.

2. Sitting song 1: Hangpa Dela

This song was recorded and worked on several times:
— in Tabo with Ane Thimet and Ane Phuntsok Dolma (2002),
— in Dhankar in 2003 with a comment by the local singers,
— in Po in 2009 and in Solothurn with Sonam Tsering in February 2011.

The song of Hangpa Dela is a sitting song (deṭlū, WT bsdad glu). Hangpa Dela is a local young man from Hango, a village in the Hangrang Valley of upper Kinnaur, on the western side of the Spiti River near Liu.

The young man in the song has been given everything he needs for a good life of a family man, but he is more inclined towards a religious life and wants to leave all the worldly wealth and pleasures in order to follow the dharma.

There are a number of parallels between this local sitting song and a similar song about the girl Naksa Oebum.

The beginnings are different, though. In Hangpa Dela the situation and beauty of Hango village is praised. It is situated high up in the mountains, well protected by the local deity and rich in sunlight, clear water and young people.

In this place full of natural beauty, the boy Dela sees a white cer-

5 Cf. Christiane Kalantari’s work on the materials used for the costumes of the Buchen of Pin Valley.

6 The Naksa Oebum song is another Spiti song sung by the Buchen, who also perform a play of the same title.
A Collection of Spiti songs

In my night’s sleeping dream, I saw a white ceremonial scarf (kʰātāk, WT kha btags) in his dream. He reads this as an auspicious sign that he should not settle down as a householder but follow the dharma. And he is well equipped for a life away from home, the strong boy with 35 arrows, putting the rope around his waist, getting ready to leave.

The song then enumerates all the gifts the parents give to their boy: a bride, lots of dowry, white conch ornaments, a rich house full of barley, a strong and healthy white horse. But Dela puts all the presents aside and only wishes that the horse may carry him away to the place where his heart wants to go, to the dharma.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>jiŋma cernai cāra</th>
<th>The sun, which rises from the east</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ērī tondzām jiŋma</td>
<td>The pleasant sun</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>jiŋma oṣer lāmō</td>
<td>The beautiful light of the sun</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>jiŋma oṣer lāmō</td>
<td>It rises on the top of the village</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>hāṅkār tsēla cērdzun</td>
<td>The beautiful light of the sun</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>It rises on the top of Hango.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>jyli pʰūru zuːwa</th>
<th>The one who lives at the top of the village</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>jyli jylsā pēnpo</td>
<td>Is our very happy protector</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>hāṅkār pʰūru zuːwa</td>
<td>Is our very happy protector</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>jyli jylsā pēnpo</td>
<td>The strong youths of the village</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>jyl dzun tākēr dzepā</td>
<td>They may get the protection of the deity.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>lāi dzungčōy zat teik</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>jyli dyncu muva</th>
<th>What is flowing in front of the village</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>tsoʰūmō jērtcʰā tan kānteʰā</td>
<td>Is the water of summer and snow mountain</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>hāṅkār dyncu muva</td>
<td>What is flowing in front of Hango</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>tsoʰūmō jērtcʰā tan kānteʰā</td>
<td>Is the water of summer and snow mountain</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>jyli tākēr dzepā</td>
<td>The youth of the village –</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>sānī sīnteʰā jin</td>
<td>Is completely purified water</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>jyli tākēr dzepā</td>
<td>The youth of the village –</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>cēmi cēnteʰā jin</td>
<td>It is like offering water.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>tsʰān sum nāli mīklām</th>
<th>In my night’s sleeping dream</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>kʰātak kārwō mī:jon</td>
<td>I saw a white ceremonial scarf</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>pūsā tsoʰā la dqvi</td>
<td>For the boy going to the dharma</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>zaŋji zaŋtā jinḍo</td>
<td>It might be an auspicious sign</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>dela tsoʰā la dqvi</td>
<td>For Dela going to the dharma</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>zaŋji zaŋtā jinḍo</td>
<td>It might be an auspicious sign.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sanskrit</td>
<td>English</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------</td>
<td>---------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>puṭṣā teṅaktu nāma daṅtui sūmtcā sōṅā cēṭla sāṭak nāmkēn</td>
<td>The boy holding in his hand Thirty-five arrows</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>puṭṣā nā ṇात</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The one putting the rope around his waist</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I am a strong boy</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The one putting the rope around his waist Dela, I am strong.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>pʰāṃā pa: sāla tsʰrōk maṭte dzaṃo dzaṃo jēru eaktce</td>
<td>What the parents, the two, offered The beautiful life partner</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>puṭṣā nāni teʰ:la ḍo dzaṃo jōndu eaktce delā nāni teʰ:la ḍo</td>
<td>Putting the beautiful one to the right side I, the boy, am going to the dharma</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>pʰāṃā pa: sāla pʰrnte ḍaṛ:ṛŋ tōṛp:ṛŋ tōṛp:ṛŋ jēru eaktce puṭṣā nāni teʰ:la ḍo ḍaṛ:ṛŋ jōndu eaktce delā nāni teʰ:la ḍo</td>
<td>Putting the beautiful one to the left side I, Dela, am going to the dharma.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>puṭṣi teṅaktu nāma tuːjɪ tēplun kārteṇu tēplun jēru eaktce puṭṣa nāni teʰ:la ḍo tēplun jōndu eaktce delā nāni teʰ:la ḍo</td>
<td>What the two parents offered Hundreds and thousands of pieces of dowry</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Keeping the thousands to the right I, the boy, am going to the dharma</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Keeping the hundreds to the left I, Dela, am going to the dharma.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>mākāṃ cīpā: dweepo ṇu: tēk goblëm tispens jēntsāk sermō nesi tēnṭīm loyeṭ teʰ:ṇa teːc:ṇu sıṃpā ḍuːla māndūk</td>
<td>Inside the great house Please, let the light stay inside!</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The doorstep where we climb up from the right</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>It is full of golden barley (Even if) you offer a lot of local beer The grain will not finish.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>puṭṣi jāpteːn sāla tāwōi wuːcā tīkār puṭṣā sěmpā kāːsāntu lyːwō cāːlō nāntān delā sěmpā kāːsāntu</td>
<td>What the boy’s father offered A strong and healthy white horse</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wherever the boy’s heart goes Please, take the body as well Wherever Dela’s, my heart goes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
A Collection of Spiti songs

The song of Hangpa Dela is like a local equivalent to the story of Naksa Öebum, which is well known all over the Tibetan-speaking area. A daughter or a son of devoted parents, who want to give everything to their children to provide for a good future. But the child shows to the world/ the religious community that the most important aim in life is to devote oneself to the religious path and not get distracted by wealth and gifts and not even by well-meaning parents.

3. Sitting song 2: Lari Palkyit Lu

This version of the text was first collected in 2003 at Gyu Village (by Dechen Lundup of Tabo). In 2011 the text was dictated to me and checked in Khar, Pin, by Meme Puchen.

The Lari Palkyit song is about a girl called Palkyit from the village of Lari in lower Spiti. Palkyit's village is praised in the same way as Hango in Hangpa Dela's song above. There is also a connection between the mountains above the village and the local deity residing there.

Then the people in the village are described as having a lot of wealth. And finally, Palkyit herself prays for wealth for the village of her parents and for herself as she has left Lari and moved to Mane (a village higher up in central Spiti) and got married there. But her prayer is for both villages and the people's prosperity and happiness.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Tibetan</th>
<th>English</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>laři tākčär dzonpāla kamen goŋčon dzoł</td>
<td>Please, give the deity’s protection</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>mátsi tsikpāru tṣidzun tṣṣkpo mi cildēn tṣidzun</td>
<td>To the young people of Lari</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>guŋkā tönpo tṣṣučin wɔ</td>
<td>Please, give Kamen’s protection.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>memē təktək guŋkā tönpo tṣṣučin memē noŋō təktək</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>jyldzun jatstyn maːtāŋ sēr ReactiveFormsModule</td>
<td>We put up a wall</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>nṛdzin jūi tṣębūm wɔ</td>
<td>We put up the foundation wall</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>jyldzun jūi tṣębūm wɔ</td>
<td>The (tall grown) tree of the high sky</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>tcaŋdēn təkt</td>
<td>You, only one old man</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What we see as a turquoise vase</td>
<td>The tall tree of the high sky</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>That is our one Umdzet⁷</td>
<td>Old man, the king, one only (I am)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>All the monks of the small village</td>
<td>All the young people of the small village</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>They are the golden wealth</td>
<td>Are the arrows of the pure snow mountain water</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What we see as a turquoise vase</td>
<td>Arrow Serla Yödrön</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>That is our one and only Changden.</td>
<td>The two of us, Tsewang and Dimdrül</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>All the young people of the small village</td>
<td>The small village’s gathered married women (are like)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Are the arrows of the pure snow mountain water</td>
<td>Plentiful tea, beer and milk</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arrow Serla Yödrön</td>
<td>The gathered married women of Lari like</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The two of us, Tsewang and Dimdrül</td>
<td>Plentiful tea, beer and milk</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The small village’s gathered married women (are like)</td>
<td>The plenty should not decrease</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Plentiful tea, beer and milk</td>
<td>This is my, the girl’s prayer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The gathered married women of Lari like</td>
<td>The plenty should not decrease</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Plentiful tea, beer and milk</td>
<td>This is my, Palkyit’s prayer.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The plenty should not decrease</td>
<td>Palkyit, who is enjoying (her life)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>This is my, the girl’s prayer</td>
<td>She went to Mane Village</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The plenty should not decrease</td>
<td>The girl, I go to a village of other people</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>This is my, Palkyit’s prayer.</td>
<td>Don’t feel bad!</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Palkyit, who is enjoying (her life)</td>
<td>You don’t feel bad either!</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>She went to Mane Village</td>
<td>Sing in your heart</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The girl, I go to a village of other people</td>
<td>The girl, I am going to a village of other people</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Don’t feel bad!</td>
<td>Please, give the wealth of plenty of sons</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>You don’t feel bad either!</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sing in your heart</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The girl, I am going to a village of other people</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

⁷ Umdzet (WT dbu mdzad) is the monk who leads the recitation of prayers.
In the first stanza the rays of the morning sun light up the mountain above Lari, which is also the dwelling place of Kamen Gyalmo, the local deity of Lari Village. The sun rises on the rock which is her castle. The singer of the song then prays for Kamen Gyalmo’s protection of the young people of the village.

The second stanza turns to the village, where the people have put up their houses. The link between the high sky (of the first stanza, the realm of the gods) is formed by the tall tree. The tree represents the old man, the local king. He praises the golden wealth of the village, the most precious element symbolizing the monks. And another precious substance is used to describe the first one of them, the Umdzet. He is compared to one of the eight symbols of fortune, the turquoise vase.

In stanza three all the young people of the village are described as arrows, fast like another wealth of the village, the pure water coming from the snow mountains.

Now Palkyt prays for plentiful tea, beer and milk, substances which are meant to represent the wealth of married women.

The final stanza reveals some facts about Palkyt’s own life. She tells herself to be happy and keep singing, although she has left Lari, her parents’ village, and now lives at Mane with strangers, her husband’s family. And beautiful Palkyt finally prays for herself and for the wealth of plenty of sons to make her in-laws happy.

4. Shabro 2: E mola ri (Sipki Angmo)

This song was recorded in October 2009 at Po Village, Spiti.
The first stanza sets the girl under the high, blue sky lit by sun and moon. Like this the setting is shown with its cosmic dimension. The second stanza shows the snow mountains as the background for the snowlion to be happy. The snowlion can be seen as the animal that lives in the highest mountains and also represents Tibet. The third stanza mentions the high rocks, where the great vulture lives. The tečarjāl gṭψpö is understood to be the king of birds, the eagle, who dominates the air and the high mountains. In stanza four, the setting is a mountain pasture, where a deer family is grazing happily. In this context the deer might also symbolize the spreading of the dharma. After the general mountain scenery, the last two stanza focus on the human realm. In stanza five, it is the monastery with its assembled monks and in the last stanza it is the festival ground, where the young people of the village gather for dances. Like this the six parts of the song move from the high sky past the mountains with their animal life to the places of human habitation and set the scene for the girl to be happy and enjoy the dance. So she appears to be well settled in her environment and protected by cosmic and natural forces.

| eː mola sì gyan’en tönpo ziːtāŋ āmila nomö | He!, you, mother’s girl At the high blue sky Please, you, mother’s girl, have a look. |
| eː mola sì gyan’en tönpo ziːtāŋ sîpki āŋmō gyan’en tönpöna ınıdā niːwō tönwöi tönjana dukpa | He!, you, mother’s girl In the high blue sky Have a look, Princess Angmo. In the high blue sky The sun and moon, the two They are where we can see them. In the high blue sky The sun and moon, the two, happily Enjoying, they are there. |
| niːdā niːwō cîtpöi cîteāmna dukpa | |

---

9 The version known at Tabo says sërki āŋmō.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Spiti Song Title</th>
<th>Translation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Kaytöt t'ënpōna tarsāṅ kārmō t'ënhōdi t'ënsana dukpa</td>
<td>On the high snow mountain The white snow lion He is where we can see him.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kaytöt t'ënpōna tarsāṅ kārmō cītpōi cīteāṅna dukpa</td>
<td>On the high snow mountain The snow lion is where He can enjoy happily.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ē: mōla ŭi ŭaktōt t'ënpō zi:tāŋ āmīla nomō</td>
<td>He!, you, mother’s girl On the high rock Please, you, mother’s girl, have a look.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ŭaktōt t'ënpō zi:tāŋ gīpki āñmō</td>
<td>He!, you, mother’s girl On the high rock Have a look, Shipki Angmo.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ŭaktōt t'ënpōna tēarjāl gātpō t'ënhōdi t'ënsana dukpa ŭaktōt t'ënpōna tēarjāl gātpō cītpōi cīteāṅna dukpa</td>
<td>On the high rock The great vulture He is where we can see him.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ūaktōt t'ënpō na gōndzēn te'ēnmō</td>
<td>On the high rock The great vulture Is where he can enjoy happily.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

Variation at Tabo:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Spiti Song Title</th>
<th>Variation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ē: mōla ŭi pāntōt t'ënpō zi:tāŋ āmīla nomō</td>
<td>He!, you, mother’s girl On the high mountain pasture Please, you, mother’s girl, have a look.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>pāntōt t'ënpō zi:tāŋ gīpki āñmō pāntōt t'ënpōna cāvā meṃēt-t'ënhōdi t'ënsana dukpa pāntōt t'ënpōna cāvā meṃēt cītpōi cīteāṅna dukpa</td>
<td>He!, you, mother’s girl On the high mountain pasture Have a look, Shipki Angmo. On the high mountain pasture The deer family Is where we can see them.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>gōndzēn te'ēnmō</td>
<td>On the high mountain pasture The deer family are Where they can enjoy happily.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

Variation at Tabo: *jumō* ‘female’.
At the great monastery
The assembled monks
Are where we can see them.

At the great monastery
The assembled monks are
Where they can enjoy happily.

He! you, mother’s girl
The great performance ground
Please, you, mother’s girl, have a look.

He!, you, mother’s girl
The great performance ground
Have a look, Shipki Angmo.

At the great performance ground
The assembled youngsters
Are where we can see them.

At the great performance ground
The assembled youngsters are
Where they can enjoy happily.

Chart 4: Shábro 2.

5. Sitting song 3: Chhukpo Poloi Lu/ Dhangkar Panma

The third sitting song was also worked on with Meme Puchen of Khar Village in October 2011. Another version of this sitting song was recorded in Po in 2009 and its text transcribed in Tabo with Sonam Tsering and Ane Phuntsok Dolma.

As the title indicates, this sitting song focuses on Dhangkar Village in central Spiti. The former capital of Spiti is situated on a white rock which is compared to a white lotus flower at the beginning. The song is about different parts of Dhangkar. First, at the top, there is the monastery with the lama who guides the people and lights up their path.

In the second stanza there is another well-built house. This is the castle\textsuperscript{11} of the local king, who leads the people.

Then there is the house where the brothers and sisters were born. In the second half the song focuses on the eldest sister and her husband, who appears to be like a Bodhisattva leading a religious life and helping people on their way.

\textsuperscript{11} The name Dhangkar can be understood as White Rock (WT brag dkar po) or Rock Fort (WT brag mkhar).
The song concludes by linking the two, the eldest sister Dawa Putit and her husband with the sun and moon, who never stay in the same place but go round the world and give light to the human beings. And like sun and moon, we should also go around and on our way spread the *dharmā*.

The last stanza, which calls upon people to be like the sun and the moon and go around the world, is a very unusual ending of a song. There are a great number of songs that begin with the sun and the moon circling the earth in the high blue sky. From there the songs normally proceed downward towards the realm of the humans as illustrated in this paper with the first sitting song (Hangpa Dela) and the second *shabro* (*Emola ri*).

By ending the song with the sun the moon circling the world and the appeal to the people to follow their example the whole place (Dhangkar) is set into the well-established cosmic order and the people put under its laws.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Takār pānmī tājna gōndzīṅ d:e:kār pānḍā naṅna lāmākun zu: jēt dōwā dēn̄ī lāmā lāmā lōbzan̄kun zu: jēt miṃpā sīlī lāmā</th>
<th>On the top of the lotus flower of the white rock There is a small monastery like a heap of white rice Inside the Lama lives The Lama of all the sentient beings Lama Lobzang lives there The Lama who lights up the darkness.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Kʰāte cārla zi:wa rapsāl go ndikpī naṅnai zimkʰāṁ cārla zi:wa rapsāl go ndikpī naṅnai naṅna pōṅpōkun zu: jēt Ṇṅṅāk cōṃwōi pōṅpō mākʰāṁ cīldu cē:wa nōzāk pūnla zīpō cārī laiśī tājmā wōj ātē įe:ktēık cārī laiśī tājmā ātē dawā puṅīt</td>
<td>Facing east From well-fitted windows and doors His holy bedroom facing east From well-fitted windows and doors Inside the king lives The king who leads all the people. The ones who were born in the central room We, the four brothers and sisters The one who was born first Is our only elder sister The one who was born first Is our elder sister Dawa Putit.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sēṃkār kʰē:wa duṅwā golteāk ḋ̄īlki diṃik</td>
<td>The very skillful blacksmith, what did he make?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| gołtęak naŋi zemā | The key to the magic lock  
The inside bar of the lock  
Is sister Dawa Putit  
To the very true dharma  
There are very few followers. |
|---|---|
| mi tā jumī norsela  
đenken maŋtsām dükpa  
cawō teuytɕuŋ sēmpā  
nōmō nōi mākpa  
cawō teuytɕuŋ sēmpā  
dawō nōi mākpa | The very precious wealth of the people  
There are many who follow  
The layman Bodhisattva  
Is my, the girl’s husband  
The layman Bodhisattva  
Is my, Dawa’s husband. |
| guŋnām tōŋla zuˈwa  
pīmā dawā mìwo  
kāt teik tśaŋlna mazuˈwa  
ndzamlin kōrtu cót teik | The ones who live in the empty sky  
Are the sun and the moon  
Do not stay in one place as a word\(^{12}\)  
Please, come to look after the world! |

Chart 5: Sitting song 3.

5. Conclusion

The five texts presented here are all light-hearted songs for happy occasions like dances or family celebrations. They are all in a cheerful mood and encourage the people to celebrate and enjoy the event. But they also create an atmosphere of a well organized order, in which the people can feel protected and safe in their natural and social environment. An additional dimension comes in with the the Hangpa Dela and the Chhukpo Polo songs. They not only describe the setting of human life in the Himalayan environment, but also remind the people of the metaphysical dimension of life and show examples of how the people integrate spiritual values in their lives.

References

University of Berne. Preprint.


\(^{12}\) People should really go round and spread the dharma like the sun and the moon, which circle the world and give light to us. (Sonam, oral communication, 9/2/2012).
A Collection of Spiti songs


The Mingled Melody: 
Remembering the Tibetan March 10th Uprising

Lama Jabb

Suffering ages, but can never be forgotten
Tibetan Proverb

decade of fierce resistance and rebellion on the Tibetan plateau against the Chinese Communist forces, personnel and ideology culminated in a huge uprising on 10 March 1959 in the Tibetan capital Lhasa. Seasoned Chinese soldiers brought the uprising to a swift end leaving carnage and destruction in its wake. Avoiding death and capture the Dalai Lama managed to escape to India along with around 80,000 Tibetans, thus giving rise to the now global Tibetan exilic presence. This bloody suppression consolidated Chinese power and sealed the fate of Tibet under “the red flag” (dar dmar) of the Chinese Communist Party. More than any other date the 10th of March has come to define the modern Tibetan nation. It marks the complete occupation of Tibet and has come to symbolise a national tragedy, but it also stands for national unity, resistance and survival. Since 1960, March 10th has been unfailingly observed as the Tibetan National Uprising Day in Tibetan exile commu-

1 This essay is dedicated to my late beloved friend and colleague Tsering Dhundup Gonkatsang (1951-2018), a passionate lover and teacher of Tibetan language and poetry.
2 I would like to acknowledge a huge debt to the Leverhulme Trust for awarding me a Leverhulme Early Career Fellowship in 2016 at the Faculty of Oriental Studies, the University of Oxford. This support has enabled me to undertake extensive research concerning the themes of the essay and discuss them with many colleagues in conferences and workshops held in Asia, Europe and the United States.
3 sdu nying rgyu yod ra brjed rgyu med.
4 For a detailed account of the Tibetan national uprising of March 10th 1959 visit the March 10th Memorial website launched by Jamyang Norbu: http://m10memorial.org.

nities around the world. State security measures and the threat of serious reprisals from the Chinese authorities make such commemorations impossible inside Tibet, but March 10th looms large in both political action and poetic language. Even though Tibetans are forbidden to undertake open public commemorations of this date inside Tibet, many observe it both privately and collectively. Groups of people, both large and small, actively remember it by carrying out audacious protests coinciding with the month of March. The large-scale protests of the 1980s and 2008 are obvious illustrations of such commemorative acts. Privately, Tibetans observe the anniversary through a variety of acts, such as lighting butter-lamps, making bsang offerings (the popular Tibetan ritual of purification involving fire, incense and foodstuff), visiting holy mountains, sponsoring special prayers and rituals in monasteries or at sacred sites, reciting what could be called their national mantra - Om maṇi padme hūṃ, composing and performing songs, and writing poetry.

Obvious references to this highly sensitive date are mostly confined to underground politico-poetic literature. However, more and more there are bold mentions of it in contemporary Tibetan poetry published online and on social media. In this paper, I will present a critically acclaimed and widely circulated commemorative poem by Sangdhor (Seng rdor), a celebrated contemporary Tibetan poet. The poem is known by two titles. When it first appeared on Sangdhor’s private literary website, now closed down, it was entitled “The Anniversary and the Melody” (dus dran dang rol dbyangs). As it began to circulate via social media it has acquired the more forthright title “March 10th and the Melody” (gsum pa’i tshes bcu dang rol dbyangs). Composed in 2010 to mark the 51st anniversary of the Lhasa Uprising, the poem stands out not only because of its daring subject matter but also its style, cadence, image construction, technical excellence and layers of allusion. Through an analysis of these qualities I will show how traditional metric forms, recurrent motifs in classical Tibetan literature and oral traditions, formulaic figurative expressions and religious concepts are used in novel ways in order to convey contemporary political ideas and aspirations. The paper will also offer a brief reflection on the popular reception of the poem in the age of social media. The attraction power of the emotive content embedded within the fine arrangement of words is circulated through both conventional and modern communication technologies, the extent of its reach owing to the rise of the Tibetan language social media. Such internet enabled computer mediated means of communication helps to undermine political authoritarianism as well as orthodox literary views.

---

5 On these protests see Schwartz, Ronald D. 1994 and Smith, Warren W. 2010.
The Melody of March 10th

“The Anniversary and the Melody” is a long poem. In order for it to speak to the reader directly, without being diluted by interpretation and contextualisation, I present it here in its entirety at the outset. Having said this, the very medium of translation entails interpretation and inevitably alters the aesthetic and semantic qualities of the text. Shelley goes as far to speak of “the vanity of translation” when he posits: “It were as wise to cast a violet into a crucible that you might discover the formal principle of its colour and odour, as seek to transfuse from one language into another the creations of a poet. The plant must spring again from its seed, or it will bear no fruit—and this is the burthen of the curse of Babel.” While taking heed of this notion of the untranslatability of poetry, it is also a simple fact that without the labour of translation there cannot be much poetic communication across cultures divided by languages—let alone any possibility of overcoming the perennial linguistic confusion captured by the Tower of Babel story. Indeed, Tibetan scholars acknowledge the illuminating role of translation in opening one’s eyes to a foreign world when they (following Indian classical scholars) reverentially address the accomplished translator as Lotsāwa (lo tsaA ba), “the eyes of the world” (’jig rten mig). It might be impossible to transport “a certain uniform and harmonious recurrence of sound”7 within a specific poem in a specific language over into another language. However, it is still possible to communicate some of its sense, tone, imagery, subtleties and general meaning. With this in mind, I suggest that the reader first appreciates the poem on its own, albeit mediated through my translation. The Tibetan text is provided in Appendix One for those who read Tibetan—even with only a rudimentary level one should be able to get a sense of the poem’s sheer lyrical beauty, plaintive yet assertive cadence and unique Tibetan sound patterns.

The Anniversary and the Melody*

Tonight is the Tenth of March,
Right now, Wednesday past midnight.
This year how many living things will die?
How many living things of this mountainside will die?

---

7 Ibid: 107.
8 The poem is subtitled: “My first representative poem of the Iron Tiger Year”. For the Tibetan original see Appendix One. This specific version was downloaded from a highly popular Tibetan WeChat literary forum on 29 April 2015. The name of this forum is left anonymous so as to avoid unwelcome attention.
The story of that time, that place and that month;  
The cause of that day, that family and that year.  
Roll them into a song of stringed peas scattering,  
Roll them into a dance of pulsing minds boiling.

“All the people who come are people who must go;  
This perishable world has many a high and a low.”  
Sing the tune of Khache Phalu far into the distance,  
From the horizon something bounces back as an echo.

Each and every single goose that solitary flies,  
Each and every lone grouse that solitary cries.  
Let them be heard in the inner space of our minds,  
Let them permeate the utter depth of our minds.

If snow and blizzards swirl and rage, let it be;  
If seasonal winds blow and blast, let it be.  
Let’s meditate upon the boulder of conquering peace,  
Upon the thunderbolt boulder of conquering peace.

A band of mist breaks away and journeys to the south,  
A band of cloud breaks away and journeys to the north.  
That is the offensive attack by the south,  
That is the violent suppression by the north.

Something of the mind convulses to the innermost core,  
Something of the psyche shakes with myriad motions.  
To be beaten in the east and driven to the west is our karma,  
To be beaten in the west and driven to the east is our fate.

On the other side of this mountain of a distant land  
And on this side of this mountain of a great wilderness,  
There is a sacred vow kept with fervent holy tears;  
There is a solemn promise kept within choked throats.

“All from here over towards the regions where the sun sets,”  
Thus is it written in a passage of an early dharmic text.  
Despair is the circling of vultures with wings flapping,  
Defeat is the spreading of muthak with tassels flipping.⁹

---

⁹ *Muthak (rmu thag)* is a long cord of loosely spun predominantly white wool with tassels running along the entire length of it. *Muthak* has great mythic and symbolic significance and it is believed that it bridges death and afterlife as well as the earth
From somewhere a song surges out with gentle pace,
Gradually it demolishes cells of silence and isolation.
That is the ideal that we can behold;
That is our own great renaissance.

Beneath a thousand layered sheath of flesh and skin
Laughs an innate, natural tune with deep resonance.
Deep within a hundred thousand encased bones and veins
Sobs and sobs a masterful, primordial melody.

What is to be done with these cheekbone tears?
What is to be done with these heated liquids?
Let’s reveal them by turning them into sounds!
Let’s sing them by changing them into a melody!

That melody is the way that sand flows;
It is the way that sand and dust flow.
The year when the wisdom wings of mountain peaks beat
The torrential flow of sand is the command.

That melody is how one breaks into a gallop;
It is how one leaps and breaks into a gallop.
The year when the tummo of mountain peaks burns
Breaking into a wild gallop is the sacred helmet.

That melody is the crunching sound of smashing stones;
It is the crunching sound of smashing plastic and stones.
The year when the manes of mountain peaks stand on end
The crunching smashing of the stones is the strategy.

Now let’s practise within the melody,
Let’s practise within the measure of the melody.
Let’s strike every string of the mind with great force
And strum each note of the psyche with great power.

Now let’s train the mind within the melody,
Let’s train the mind within the cadence of the melody.
Let’s press every spring of the senses with great strength

and the sky. Indeed, old Tibetan historical texts often state that some of the earliest Tibetan kings used muthak to travel to the heavens after their death thus leaving no corporeal remains. To this day such ropes are stretched out on the ground when performing sky burials for the dead.
And turn each screw of the intellect with great might.

Now let’s seek respite within the melody,  
Let’s seek respite within the harmony of the melody.  
Let’s wipe clean all the parts and joints of the soul  
And wash well each component of the life force.

Now let’s write \textit{repa} within the melody,  
Let’s write thought-provoking \textit{repa}.  
Each \textit{repa} is a billion interrogations,  
Please strum the guitar and play the flute!

Now let’s draw dreams within the melody,  
Let’s draw dreams swarming with illusions.  
Each dream is a billion pistols,  
Please strum the guitar and play the flute!

Now let’s draw steeds within the melody,  
Let’s draw cantering steeds with beating hooves.  
Each steed is a billion prisoners,  
Please strum the guitar and play the flute!

Now let’s be immersed within the stream of the melody;  
Let’s reflect upon each fusion of tunes  
Like the process of water flowing into water,  
Please strum the guitar and play the flute!

Sometimes bend the upper string and release,  
Sometimes loosen the lower string and tighten.  
Each and every musical note is anguish,  
Each and every vocal tone is sadness.

Recognise every pause of the melody within the mind,  
Reveal each activity of the mind through the melody.  
Let’s call out “mum and dad” from the back of the throat,  
Let’s weep “kith and kin” from the depths of the vocal cords.

Place your ear against the mat of the melody,  
Place it with precision and without wavering.  
Ever so gently close the eyelids and slow down,  
The seal of our tribe will appear from the flank of the liver.

Rest your head against the ground of the melody,  
Rest it with precision and without dreading.
Place your hands on the chest and slow down,
The sword of our tribe will emerge from the side of the bowels.

Seat your body within the depths of the melody,
Seat it with precision and without fretting.
Breathe out at a measured pace and slow down,
The edict of our tribe will come rolling off the lungs.

Thus, having realised the deep imprints of the melody
And having dissolved all obscurations of the tune,
The mango of the bones has gradually ripened.¹⁰
So, let’s sing the distance of fifty years with voice!

Thus, having perfected the liberation paths of the melody
And having extinguished all illusions of the tune,
The knotted rope of the throat has gradually unravelled.
So, let’s measure the stretch of fifty years with sound!

Thus, having roamed through the bardo of the melody
And having been conceived through the union of the tune,
The joints of the mind have gradually dovetailed,
So, let’s utter the reach of fifty years through speech!

A Tibetan proverb tells us that “suffering ages, but can never be forgotten”. This gives distilled utterance to the lasting suffering inflicted by the loss of life. It is specifically referring to grief that changes over time in its sense of immediacy and felt intensity but never goes away. When suffering is collective, within the durability of suffering encapsulated by the Tibetan proverb lies a potent cohesive force. In his influential lecture What is a Nation?, Ernest Renan is acutely aware of this force and states that “suffering in common unifies more than joy does.” He goes on to stress: “Where national memories are concerned,

¹⁰ In Tibetan dialectics mango (A mra) is used as an image for representing four contrasting conditions of a thing or four logical possibilities known as mu bzhi. In Sangdhor’s poem the gradually ripened mango stands for a state of perfect maturation. For instance, (1) a mango could be ripe in the inside but unripe on the outside, or (2) unripe on the inside but ripe on the outside, or (3) unripe both inside and outside, or (4) ripe both inside and outside. Here the case is the fourth. Bone (rus) is highly significant for the formation of Tibetan identity in that one’s descent is traced to the bone of an ancestor or ancestors. As such Tibetan terms for family or tribal lineage often feature the word rus as in bone: For instance, rus (family lineage, clan) rus pa (family lineage) rus rgyud (ancestry, lineage), bod kyi rus chen bzhi (The Four Great Tribes of Tibet). Bone is also a main tester of the strength of a person’s character as in mi ru pa can—“one who has the bones”—meaning someone who possesses backbone, courage, integrity and loyalty.
griefs are of more value than triumphs, for they impose duties, and require a common effort.” The present poem is informed by this unifying potency of collective pain and defeat. It captures, amongst other things, that aspect of nationalism Isaiah Berlin calls the “bent twig” phenomenon, a reaction to wounds or a strong sense of collective humiliation brought on by forms of injustice, oppression and military conquest. The poem bears out this observation, but it also shows that such unifying collective emotions and their remembrance are redoubled and mediated by other cohesive dynamics such as age-old cultural and historical memories, established forms of poetic expression and the present socio-political situation.

**The Goose and the Grouse in Mourning**

In the famous 1800 preface to the second edition of *Lyrical Ballads* Wordsworth declares: “For all good poetry is the spontaneous overflow of powerful feelings: and though this be true, Poems to which any value can be attached were never produced on any variety of subjects but by a man who, being possessed of more than usual organic sensibility, had also thought long and deeply.” For Wordsworth the writing of poetry entails both an extempore dimension and a prolonged conscious meditation. Later on, in the same preface he describes this creative process as “emotion recollected in tranquillity.” The fluidity, directness and raw emotive energy of “The Anniversary and the Melody” make it come across as a product of spontaneous inspiration. At the outset, the poem declares: “Tonight is the Tenth of March/ Right now, Wednesday past midnight”. During one of our many conversations on Tibetan literature, Sangdhor confirmed that: he had indeed written the poem in one sitting in the small hours of Wednesday morning, 10 March 2010. Such extemporaneity underscores the poet’s natural flair and exceptional “organic sensibility”.

However, the poem’s technical brilliance, verbal intensity, nuanced historical consciousness and heightened political awareness also indicate deliberate contemplation. The poet “thought long and deeply” while processing the initial feelings aroused by the long memory of March 10th for the finished poem. This date of defeat and suffering

---

5 Skype conversation, 17 April 2015.
6 One of the numerous constituents of this long memory is the annual March 10 Statements delivered by the Dalai Lama between 1961 and 2011. These statements and the speeches that accompanied them on the day were staple material for the
lodged deep within the Tibetan psyche had haunted the poet over a long period of time—leading right up to the midnight moment when it triggered the actual composition of the poem. Although the physical act of writing was spontaneous the powerful feelings, memories and thoughts that fuelled the poetic outburst had long, deep roots in the past. The use of vivid language, imagery, rhythm, cadence and overall musicality add to the pull of patriotism inherent within the poem and widens its appeal to the contemporary Tibetan reader. In spite of this popular appeal and seeming accessibility it is not an easy poem. As it is a poem wrought of passion and reflection one needs to read it several times in order to appreciate its emotional depth, niceties of imagery and its many oral and textual allusions. Each reading seems to peel away one layer of meaning to reveal yet another. There are too many layers and nuances to explore in a single essay but allow me to focus on at least three principal features of the poem.

First and foremost, as I have already pointed out, “The Anniversary and the Melody” is a poem that commemorates a particular historic day of the Lhasa Uprising. The 10th of March has come to be regarded as a singular historic moment, but it is important to be aware of the long-term forces and complex events that gave rise to it. Moreover, history did not stand still but has continued to complicate the Tibetan life ever since that momentous occurrence. This popular revolt was the culmination of armed insurgencies that had greeted the Chinese communist forces and personnel as soon as they set foot on Tibetan soil in the eastern Tibetan regions of Kham and Amdo. The Lhasa uprising met the same brutal fate as the eastern Tibetan rebellions against what Tibetans call “the gun-toting uninvited guests” (me mda’ thogs pa’i ma bos mgon po) and their sweeping communist reforms that sought to upend traditional Tibetan society and long-established worldviews. For many Tibetans, the military suppression of the Lhasa Uprising marks the complete establishment of Chinese rule over Tibet and thus March 10th symbolises the unprecedented social trauma and political persecution that had preceded it as well as that which followed in its long wake stretching to the present day. Sangdhor is tapping into this historical significance and the distilled symbolism of the day when he begins the poem announcing the specific time of writing:

politically conscious Tibetans both inside and outside Tibet. For English translations of these statements see The Dalai Lama 2016. For instance, the Dalai Lama (i.e. unpublished speeches delivered on 24 December 2002, 7 March 2014) often traces the root of the current Tibetan plight to the arrival of uninvited new guests (gdan zhu gang yang med pa’i sku mgon gsar pa zhig) wielding guns (me mda’ khyer nas yong). Also see Jangbu’s subtle poem on this gun-wielding uninvited guest (Ljang bu 2001: 32-33). Heather Stoddard’s English translation of this poem can be found in Jangbu 2010: 18.
Tonight is the Tenth of March,
Right now, Wednesday past midnight.
This year how many living things will die?
How many living things of this mountainside will die?

No attempt is made to conceal such a politically sensitive date in the coded language or metaphorical garb that many Tibetan writers usually employ to fend off Chinese state censorship and serious reprisals. The pregnant significance of the date and precarious moribund existence of the present link the recent past and the here and now in an instant of recollection and contemplation. Conscious observation of the historic date and reflection upon the current situation of Tibet present the Tibetan collective experience under the Chinese rule as a continuum of repression, death and tragedy. From the present moment of the small hours of Wednesday 10 March 2010 the poem jumps back over five decades to recall: “The story of that time, that place and that month; / The cause of that day, that family and that year.” These are obvious references to the tragedy that befell the “family” of Tibet on 10 March 1959. Tibetans inside Tibet and China are forbidden to mention this source of many sufferings, including their ongoing plight, let alone relate its story and reflect upon its causes. While many dare not even hint at it, the poet resolves to sing it, and celebrate it. Thus, at the very outset the poem seethes with death, destruction, angst, an active remembrance, and paints a modern Tibetan nation in unending pain.

What also becomes apparent right from the start is that the poem is not merely preoccupied with remembering a single significant date—10 March 1959—and its unaccounted and unmourned casualties. It is a subtle yet fluid narrative poem that channels accounts of historical happenings and the current political situation into its overall torrential flow whilst also communicating the awakening of a new political consciousness. It comingles and simultaneously commemorates the sufferings inflicted upon the Tibetan people over fifty years of colonial rule. The poem was composed two years after the suppression of the 2008 pan-Tibetan uprising that resulted in arrests, political re-education, increased militarisation and heightened surveillance across the Tibetan plateau. For many Tibetans, this nationwide Tibetan rebellion was reminiscent of the 1950s resistance to CCP rule in terms of its

---

18 For reports on the crackdown of the 2008 protests see the International Campaign for Tibet (ICT) 2009; Human Rights Watch 2009, 2010; Smith 2010. For audacious contemporary Tibetan accounts of the 2008 protests and their suppression see Shokdung 2016 and the banned 2008 issue of Shar dung ri (The Eastern Snow Mountain), an acclaimed Tibetan language journal of social and literary criticism (sGrol
sheer intensity, geographical reach and participant diversity, as well as violent reprisals, which included thousands of arrests, and the detention and political re-education and relocation of thousands of monks. Accordingly, Sangdhor’s poem records this uprising with allusions to the raw “stone-smashing” protest scenes, interrogations, imprisonments, deaths and the ongoing repercussions in the form of acts of self-immolation.

One historical event segues into another forming a seemingly unbroken chain of tragic happenings. With the referencing of the fiery self-immolations through the appropriation of a profound spiritual practice as a metaphor the poem brings the reader face to face with the grim present. While recalling a past historical event it brings to prominence the living legacy of this particular event by directly linking it to the here and now. As a consequence, for the poet, recent Tibetan history is characterised by unceasing suffering and incessant deaths. This realisation is uttered by a note of anxious foresight in the first stanza of the poem in which the evocative date of March 10th conflates the past and the present and points to a dark future. Macabre historical patterns assure the poet-singer of one thing—that there will be more deaths and destruction to come. It is this certitude born of actual experience and a feeling of resignation to suffering that we can hear in the questions: “This year how many living things will die? / How many living things of this mountainside will die?” “Living things” is the English rendering of the Tibetan term skye dngos in its broader sense. It literally means things that grow or regenerate and in its common usage it covers both animals and plants. Here the term carries a broader connotation to subsume under it all things graced with regenerative vigour and life force, including human beings, that grow on or inhabit “this mountainside”, that is Tibet. The questions are rooted within the tacit understanding shared by the poet and the reader that many animals, plants and humans have died every single year since 10 March 1959 as a direct outcome of what befell Tibet on that specific day. The emphatic identification of the date is immediately followed by a sombre reflection upon how many “living things” will once again disappear this very year as history repeats itself.

This elegiac poem thus recalls a date of immense historical significance and symbolic power and laments the loss of Tibetan lives and the sufferings inflicted since the 1950s. It does this by taking advantage of Tibet’s literary and oral traditions. For instance, it borrows the memorable metre, cadence and wisdom of a famous 18th century text formally entitled Khache Phalu’s Advice on the Observance of Secular Karmic
Remembering the Tibetan March 10th Uprising

Laws (kha che pha lu’ ‘jig rtan las’ bras rtsi lugs kyi bslab bya). Although little is known concerning its authorship, this text is attributed to a certain Khache Phalu. Hence, among both the literati and the general public the work is simply known as Khache Phalu.\(^{19}\) It belongs to the highly popular category of Tibetan literature called bslab bya, advice. The advice genre is generally characterised by an astute observation of life in its spiritual and temporal complexities and communication of wise words and counsel with clarity, concision and persuasive poetic force.\(^{20}\) Apart from the short opening remarks in prose, Khache Phalu is written in verse using a very accessible vernacular idiom. It is a lyrical and captivating aphoristic work addressed to the young and old alike. In arresting sound patterns of rhyme and rhythm, it dispenses practical advice on leading a fair, just, contented and thoughtful life without ever having the need to fear the vicissitudes of fortune and impermanence of life. For the Tibetan reader, this borrowing endows “The Anniversary and the Melody” with a familiar lyricism and rhythmic feel and a tone of intimate concern. Sangdhor acknowledges his debt to Khache Phalu by citing lines from it verbatim very early on:

“All the people who come are people who must go;  
This perishable world has many a high and a low.”
Sing the tune of Khache Phalu far into the distance,  
From the horizon something bounces back as an echo.

The two lines in quotation marks are extracted from separate sections of Khache Phalu. The first line comes out of the ruminations about the impermanent nature of life. Indifferent to social stratification, death the great leveller makes everyone who ventures into this world depart it:

\(^{19}\) Mig dmar (ed.) 1992: Kha che pha lu. A very useful edition that takes into account variations between three different versions of the text can be found in Thub bstan sbyin pa AND Blo bzang rdo rje rab gling (eds.) 2006: 371-386; 440-450. In the 1980s the text was further popularised in Eastern Tibet by the famed bard Kalsang Dekpa’s (skal bzang grags pa) recitation of it on radio and cassette tapes. The authorship of the text is not known for sure. Some scholars attribute it to a great Islamic scholar. For instance, following the accounts given by some Tibetan Muslims, Dawa Norbu speculates that the author’s second name corresponds to a certain Farzur-alla in the preface to his English translation of Kha che pha lu (1987: xii). On the other hand, Horkhang Sonam Palbar attributes it to ‘Brong rtse mkhas pa chen po, a famed teacher of the Seventh Panchen Lama (Hor khang bsod nams dpal ’bar 1999: 503-505). For an English translation of the entire text see Dawa Norbu 1987.

\(^{20}\) See Thub bstan sbyin pa AND Blo bzang rdo rje rab gling (eds.) 2006 for an anthology of such advice texts and an informative introduction to the genre.
The beggar might be sad but scrapes through life,
The king might be happy but must die in the end.
One cannot tell how many have gone already,
And who can surmise how many are yet to go?
People come and go, and come and go.
In essence, all the people who come are people who must go,
Of this samsāric world not a single thing is permanent.\textsuperscript{21}

The second quotation is taken from a passage reflecting upon inequality, karmic destiny and contentment. Suffering and happiness are impermanent and unpredictable in nature and diverse in form. They come in incalculable shapes and sizes. Each individual experiences joy and woe differently in terms of their intensity and endurance. It is advised that one should brace oneself for what life throws at one with the means of contentment:

This perishable world has many a high and a low,
Joy and woe incalculable in their range and depth.
As can clearly be seen no single person is like another,
It’s far better for oneself to be contented with this.\textsuperscript{22}

These quotations appear to have at least two overall significances. Firstly, they indicate that the poet accepts and underlines Khache Phalu’s conclusion that death and suffering are part and parcel of this world and one must embrace them with stoicism. However, the stanzas that immediately precede and follow the quotes make it abundantly clear that we are not dealing with ordinary loss of life and anguish. Nor are they the consequences of inevitable natural causes. When one ponders over the cause and nature of Tibetan suffering it brings something echoing back from the horizon. Deep consideration and recall make one realise that the tragic experience of Tibetans cannot be accepted with the usual wise resignation or be consigned to oblivion. Secondly, the quoted lines draw attention to the stylistic features of the poem itself. They emphatically confirm the conscious absorbance of Khache Phalu’s nine syllabic metric pattern, high propen-

\textsuperscript{21} Mig dmar (ed.) 1992: 6. \texttt{sprang po sdup kyang mi tshe ‘khyol ‘gro lo/ rgyal po sbyid kyang thu ma shi ‘gro lo/ de snga song pa’i grang ka mi shes ‘dug/ da dung ‘gro rgyu/i gdeng tshod su yis shes/ yong gin yong gin ‘gro gin ‘gro gin ‘dug/ don du yong mi tshang ma ‘gro mi red/ khor ba ‘di la rtag pa geig kyang med/.}

\textsuperscript{22} Ibid: 16. \texttt{’jig rten ‘di ru sgang gshong mang zhig ‘dug/ sbyid sdu g ring thung sbom phra grang med red/ ‘dra ‘dra geig kyang med pa mthong gsal red/ ‘di la chog shes rang gis byas pa dga’/.}
Remembering the Tibetan March 10th Uprising

Gradual Maturation and Political Awakening

This constant remembrance brings to the fore a second prominent feature of the poem: A seemingly inevitable new political awakening. For the poet-singer the Tibetan colonial experience that followed from the 10 March Uprising is characterised by an accumulation of suffering...
and misrule over half a century (calculated from the date of composition). The shock and pain engendered by the bloody takeover of Tibet in the 1950s were made even worse by the socio-cultural trauma of the 1960s and the 1970s that was brought about by the destructive policies of the Cultural Revolution. The period of relative cultural freedom in the early 1980s was short-lived. Since the late 1980s, many aspects of Tibetan cultural revival and reassertion of national identity have yet again been subjected to draconian political restrictions. Relentless state control, surveillance and persecution—encapsulated in the poem by the images of “pistols”, “interrogations” and “prisoners”—afflict today’s Tibet. The absence of basic civil and political rights and the fact that Tibetans have little or no say in the day to day running of their homeland aggravate an already deplorable situation.

“The Anniversary and the Melody” intimates that this colonial experience has an awakening impact upon the Tibetan psyche that leads to political action and realisation. This idea is something very similar to that put forward by the highly acclaimed Tibetan intellectual Shokdung in his vociferous book on the 2008 Tibetan uprising entitled *Separating the Sky and the Earth: On the Peaceful Revolution of the Earth-Mouse Year* (*gnam sa go ‘byed/ sa byi zhi ba’i gsar brje la bris pa*). In this renowned volume published in 2009—that put him in detention and earned him many admirers including our poet Sangdhor—Shokdung asserts that years of repression and terror finally gave way to the 2008 Tibet-wide peaceful rebellion. He construes this rebellion itself as the manifestation of a revolutionary political awakening that harkens back to the heroic courage and national consciousness of the Tibetan Empire, as well as feeding on current Tibetan aspirations for freedom, human rights and democracy. In Sangdhor’s poem, we learn that although decades of Chinese communist rule, disinformation and indoctrination have made inroads into the Tibetan consciousness, these state endeavours have not managed to produce the desired effect. Despite the material resources and coercive apparatuses at its disposal, the Chinese state has failed to instil total submission, historical amnesia and unthinking conformism among Tibetans. As a

---


24 For Sangdhor’s show of admiration see his effusive verse review of Shokdung’s book and his poem celebrating Shokdung’s prison lease. Both of these poems were first published online on Sangdhor’s now closed down literary website on 5 February 2010 and 15 October 2010 respectively. They can be found in printed form in Seng rdor 2011: 103-112, 117-126.


26 Many contemporary Tibetan poetic statements similarly touch on the inability of the Chinese state to bend Tibetans to its will. For example, a very famous Tibetan
result, out of the long colonial subjugation a song surges out, a song
propelled by a profound melody:

From somewhere a song surges out with gentle pace,
Gradually it demolishes cells of silence and isolation.
That is the ideal that we can behold;
That is our own great renaissance.

Beneath a thousand layered sheath of flesh and skin
Laughs an innate, natural tune with deep resonance.
Deep within a hundred thousand encased bones and veins
Sobs and sobs a masterful, primordial melody.

I believe this song is a reference to the protests that rippled across the
Tibetan plateau in 2008 calling for justice, freedom, independence, hu-
mankind rights and the return of the Dalai Lama.\textsuperscript{27} Hundreds of monks
carried out two separate protests on 10 March 2008 in Lhasa to com-
memorate the 49th anniversary of the 10 March 1959 Uprising and to
express dissent against the Chinese rule. Suppression of these and
other protests on subsequent days unleashed a wave of large-scale
public demonstrations all over Tibet, the likes of which had not been
seen since the armed resistances of the 1950s. The uprising met a vio-
lent end resulting in mass deaths, torture, imprisonments, displace-
ments and various repressive campaigns. Its magnitude and intensity
were only matched by the sheer violence of the Chinese state and the
multitude of its draconian measures. Nevertheless, with its audacious
expression of deep discontent and its show of resurgent political
awareness and agency the 2008 uprising leaves an enduring and un-
fathomable legacy. It functions like an awakened and awakening song
that breaks the state enforced silence and ends the isolation induced
both by state repression and citizens’ political inaction.

\textsuperscript{27} For an account and analysis of the 2008 Tibetan uprising and its repercussions see

\footnotesize{hip hop song resists the power of Chinese state and repels the light of its “civilising
mission” as follows when they speak for a new generation of Tibetans who came
of age under its colonial rule:

We’re the sharp intellect
Not content with your advice and edicts
We’re the soft darkness
Not repelled by your light and power
We’re the uproar and retaliation to embitter you
We’re the terror and plague of your life

See Lama Jabb (2018: 101-105) for a commentary on and a translation of the lyrics
in its entirety.}
In the poem under review, a profound primordial melody informs and carries this new song and then absorbs it into its long and seemingly infinite sequence. After incorporating the song into its perpetual flow the melody surges on and beyond gathering other distinct notes into its currents on a permeating and enlightening course through the hearts and minds of contemporary Tibetans. Through the employment of specific terms, concepts and images the poem indicates that this suffusive melody is born of Tibetan territory and history, and that it is deepened by Tibetan spiritual traditions, artistic heritage and current socio-political experiences. Suggestive phrases like “living things of this mountainside” (ri sul ’di yi skye dngos), “this mountain of a great wilderness” (bas mtha’i la mo ’di), and “the mane of mountain peaks” (ri rtse’i rngog ma) portray the mountain-enshrined existence of Tibet. “The sacred vow”, “command”, “sacred helmet” and “the royal seal”, “sword”, and “edict”, (dbu mna’, bka’ bda’, dbu rmog, rang sde’i rtags tham, dpa’ dam, bka’ gtsigs) recall a glorious period of Tibetan history. These are some of the evocative terms associated with the Tibetan imperial power, which extended from India to China and spread across Central Asia during the Eighth and Ninth Centuries.\(^{28}\) Through the appropriation of such loaded terms the poem is underlining the unifying resonance and the inspirational energy of some of the forces that enabled the Tibetan imperial expansion, i.e., Tibetan solidarity and allegiance (sacred vow or covenant), administrative power (royal seal and edicts) and military might on horseback (“Breaking into a wild gallop is the sacred helmet”).\(^{29}\)

Complex concepts and practices such as karma, unceasing conceptual activities of the mind, primordial mastery, meditation, tummo, bardo and the perfection of liberation paths and stages (las dbang, sems kyi ’phro ’du, gnyug ma rtsad grub, sgom, gtum mo, bar do, sa lam rdzogs

---


pa) deepen the melody with their allusions to Tibetan religious traditions. These terms, although spiritual in their origin, are consciously invested with secular significance to reference contemporary ideological change and actual political developments on the ground. As already observed, Tibetan artistic heritage courses through and channels the flow of the melody, as exemplified by, *inter alia*, the tune of *Khache Phalu* and the composition of the sublime Tibetan performing art *repa*. Indeed, it is guitar and flute (*pi Wang, gling bu*), ubiquitous traditional instruments, that Tibetans are beseeched to play in order to sing out their contemporary existence. This contemporary existence, which also feeds the melody, is characterised by interrogations, pistols and prisoners (*tsha ‘dri, dkrum mda’, bison pa*) as well as ideological awakening and political agency. It is within such a complex melody the contemporary Tibetan people find wisdom against and escape from Chinese imperialist power and indoctrination:

> Now let’s practise within the melody,  
> Let’s practise within the measure of the melody.  
> Let’s strike every string of the mind with great force  
> And strum each note of the psyche with great power.

> Now let’s train the mind within the melody,  
> Let’s train the mind within the cadence of the melody.  
> Let’s press every spring of the senses with great strength  
> And turn each screw of the intellect with great might.

> Now let’s seek respite within the melody,  
> Let’s seek respite within the harmony of the melody.  
> Let’s wipe clean all the parts and joints of the soul  
> And wash well each component of the life force.

Such spring-cleaning stands for a necessary deprogramming process that rids Tibetans of the imprints of Chinese state indoctrination effected through the medium of state-run education, mass media and political campaigns. The act of deprogramming is combined with meditative absorption within the melody, thereby deepening the political awakening announced by the song of the 2008 uprising. This new political consciousness is made known through the novel use of

---

30 *Repa* (*ras pa*) is a type of Tibetan performing arts that features song, dance, storytelling, gymnastic display and recitation of poetry. Its origins are traced back to Milarepa (1052-1135) and is usually performed by a single itinerant artist or a troupe of artists, who are also known as *repa*. A variant spelling of it is *ralpa* (*ral pa*). For an introduction to this once ubiquitous but now declining art see Mgon po rgyal mtshan 1998.
Buddhist concepts and meditation practices. Familiar theological terms are secularised - thus defamiliarising them—for the purpose of conveying the awakening of a revolutionary consciousness. The poem brings into relief its extended metaphor of meditation cum enlightenment as it makes emphatic references to “spiritual practice”, “mind training”, “the perfection of liberation paths and stages”, “the dissolution of all obscurations”, and “the extinguishing of all illusions” (nyams len, blo sbyong, sa lam rdzogs, sgrib ba ma lus byang, 'khrul ba thams cad zad). In Tibetan Buddhism, these are conventional technical terms for specific meditation practices and the resultant spiritual experiences that pave the way to the final enlightenment. Great Tibetan meditation treatises such as Stages of Meditation (sgom pa’i rim pa) tell us how one needs to constantly immerse oneself in deep contemplation enabled by diligence, patience, discipline and a compassionate mind embracing all sentient beings.  

It is stressed again and again that one must incessantly engage in rigorous meditation and overcome uncritical conventional thinking obscured by ignorance (ma rig pas sgrib ba) and worldly illusions. It is believed that this in turn will help the practitioner cultivate the awakening mind of bodhichitta (byang sms) rooted in universal compassion that will eventually secure the ultimate goal: the omniscient state of enlightenment. Sangdhor applies this religious idiom for communicating an entirely different experience — an experience that is considered to be equally novel and transformational. Buddhist enlightenment serves as a metaphor for political emancipation. The highly taxing and time-consuming process of deep meditation that results in the attainment of Buddhahood (more often than not requiring the endeavour of many a lifetime) is likened to the long, arduous and reflective journey that ends with an awakened mind thirsting for political freedom. Although this realisation may not entail the actual materialisation of political freedom, it at least gives rise to a galvanising awareness that Tibet has been under occupation, which in turn generates an impulse for emancipatory action. The poem instructs the reader to take a particular meditation posture, and be seated and immersed within the melody. It advocates supreme calm by encouraging us to slow down our physical activities and breathing to a measured pace. The long reflection on Tibetan history and Tibet’s current situation—assisted by composure, precision and patience (prerequi-

31 Stages of Meditation (sgom pa’i rim pa) is said to have been composed by the great ninth century Indian scholar Kamalaśīla in Tibet. The Dalai Lama teaches this text frequently, and see his Stages of Meditation (2001) for an authoritative commentary on this illuminating text in English. Another lucid exposition of Tibetan meditation practices can be found in Treasury of Knowledge by Jamgön Kongtrul Lodrö Tayé 2008.
sites for single-pointed concentration, *ting nge ’dzin*)—leads to the visceral rediscovery of “the seal”, “the sword” and “the edict of our tribe”. Here the intimate term “our tribe” (*rang sde*) denotes Tibet.\(^{32}\) It recalls Gedun Choepel’s stirring verse that brings to an abrupt end his unfinished yet highly influential history of Tibet called *White Annals* (*theb ther dkar po*).\(^{33}\) This was the first Tibetan history book that made use of the ancient Dunhuang manuscripts for shedding light upon the workings and the legacy of the Tibetan empire.\(^{34}\) Gedun Choepel describes his incomplete historical project with patriotic sentiment:

> With the white brilliance of love for the people of our tribe
> That resides within the centre of my natural born heart,
> To the king and country of our land of snowy Tibet
> I have offered a little service to the best of my ability.\(^{35}\)

“The seal”, “the sword” and “the edict” of Sangdhor’s poem belong to that very tribe with an impressive imperial history celebrated with such passion and poetic eloquence in *White Annals*. As they meditate within the melody, these great symbols of the Tibetan imperial power issue forth from the vital organs of living Tibetans who are experiencing the Chinese colonial rule here and now. This sequence of graphic images is the heightening of a powerful bodily imagery that permeates the poem, which even locates the original source of the great melody itself within the “layered sheath of flesh and skin” and “encased bones and veins.” The salient embodied imagery underscores that intricate connection between the bodily senses and human understanding specifically lauded by William Hazlitt and emulated by his prose style.

---

\(^{32}\) Depending on the context *rang sde* can be translated as my tribe (community, village and settlement) or one’s tribe or our tribe. Reflecting the tone, mood and overall patriotic feel of the poem I have chosen the last of these three options.


\(^{34}\) Dunhuang manuscripts are a large cache of ancient documents discovered at a cave complex in Dunhuang, the Chinese province of Gansu in the early 20th century. They are predominantly in Chinese and Tibetan and are an invaluable source for studying early Tibetan history, religion and society. The International Dunhuang Project provides digital images and catalogues of these manuscripts on its website: http://idp.bl.uk

\(^{35}\) dGe ‘dun chos ‘phel 1994 Vol III: 299. rang sde’i rigs la zhen pa dkar po’i mdangs// rang byung snying gi dbus na gnas pa ’dis// rang yul kha pa can gyi rje ’bangs la// rang gis nus pa’i sri zhu cung zad sgrub//.
Hazlitt prizes writers whose style displayed “strong, vivid, bodily perception” and whose “body thought.”

Tom Paulin explains that the presence of the body is prominent in Hazlitt’s writing because “he wishes to unite sense experience and, importantly, expressive physical movement with imagination and understanding.”

In a similar way, Sangdhor’s poem observes and expresses the connection between bodily experience and human understanding. After rigorous meditation-like absorption within the melody, the items that emerge from the liver, lungs and bowels—organs associated with love, life, happiness and deep inward feelings—link the imperial past with the present Tibetan body experiencing the pangs of colonial rule and an awakening political mind.

The past and the present mingle within the mind and the body of contemporary Tibetans culminating in a patriotic consciousness for guiding individual and collective action. “The Anniversary and the Melody” thus displays an element of what D. H. Lawrence calls “the poetry of the present” that incorporates both the past and the future while being neither. For Lawrence, it is in the immediate present that the “living plasm vibrates unspeakably, it inhales the future, it exhaled the past, it is the quick of both, and yet it is neither.”

Within this fluid and dynamic poem under review, the immediate present moment of Tibet breathes in and out both the past and the future. As we have already seen the poem is mostly preoccupied with the present and recent Tibetan history, yet in terms of both form and content it is woven of Tibet’s rich literary and oral traditions and the distant past. This quality furnishes the poem and its imagery with intellectual and emotional depth while always ensuring that it is deeply rooted within the living, evolving and vibrating present. The political awakening that the poem detects and celebrates is the part of a living present felt by the contemporary Tibetan body or by what Lawrence would call the “pulsating, carnal self.”

Thus Sangdhor’s poem teems with poetic images that are visual representations of bodily senses and intellectual experiences.

---


  her pure, and eloquent blood
  Spoke in her cheekes, and so distinctly wrought,
  That one might almost say, her body thought;


38 Sangdhor’s “Those Heroes Might’ve Thought Thus (dpa’ rgod de tshos ‘di ittar dgongs yod nges) is another poem that employs graphic bodily imagery and senses for portraying contemporary Tibetan political protests and patriotism see Seng rdor 2011b: 107-109.


40 Ibid: 49. Italic original.
that possess a force of sudden revelation concerning today’s Tibet born of the past and the present.

The Power of the Visible

In another fresh and pregnant metaphor Sangdhor secularises a famous spiritual practice to give expression to a tragic yet powerful contemporary Tibetan political action, which might be seen as yet another aspect of the new political awakening the poem records. The torrential flow of the melody gathers its momentum in the “year when tummo of mountain peaks burns”:

That melody is how one breaks into a gallop;  
It is how one leaps and breaks into a gallop.  
The year when the tummo of mountain peaks burns  
Breaking into a wild gallop is the sacred helmet.

Tummo (gtum mo, inner heat or inner fire)—the great yogic practice of internal heat generation—is converted into a new poetic image to capture a state forbidden aspect of contemporary Tibet. This is the act of self-immolation carried out by Tapey, a young monk from Kirti Monastery in Eastern Tibet, in protest against Chinese rule in 2009, which set off a chain reaction of similar acts in the years that followed calling for Tibetan freedom, the return of the Dalai Lama, and language equality and protection.\(^{41}\) The secular appropriation of tummo gives vivid presence to something that is either silenced or (when mentioned) distorted to the point of invisibility in the official narrative of the Chinese state concerning contemporary Tibet. In this innovative poetic image, we can observe, to borrow from Marianne Moore, that the “power of the visible is the invisible”. In a poem on the ostrich called “He Digesteth Hard Yron”, Moore opines:

---

\(^{41}\) Since Tapey’s self-immolation on 27 February 2009, a further 154 Tibetans have carried out acts of self-immolation inside Tibet to date (14 December 2018). There have been at least three self-immolation protests in 2018 alone. Out of the 155 recorded self-immolators 123 are known to have passed away. Little is known about the wellbeing and whereabouts of the survivors. Summary details of Tibetan self-immolations and an informative 2012 report (Storm in the Grasslands: Self-immolations in Tibet and Chinese policy) on the lives and last testaments of some of the self-immolators can be found on the website of International Campaign for Tibet: https://www.savetibet.org/resources/fact-sheets/self-immolations-by-tibetans/. For further information on and media coverage of Tibetan Self-immolations see Buchung D. Sonam (ed.) 2013. For scholarly interpretations of self-immolations see Tsering Topgyal 2016b: 166-187; McGranahan and Litzinger (eds.) 2012, and Buffetrille and Robin (eds.) 2012.
The power of the visible
is the invisible; as even where
no tree of freedom grows,
so-called brute courage knows.
Heroism is exhausting, yet
it contradicts a greed that did not wisely spare
the harmless solitaire.\footnote{Moore, Marianne 1968: 100.}

In her poem, Moore celebrates the obstinate survival of the ostrich while many similar exotic birds became extinct. She might also be referring to the power of the image, the known and the living that enables it to shine light upon the unimaged, the unknown and the dead. The invisible or the unknown has an uncanny ability to reveal itself through the visible. In her ostrich poem Moore is specifically noting the power of the visible presence of the living—that is the ostrich—to reveal those erstwhile living things first deprived of their freedom and then driven to extinction by sheer human rapacity and power lust. If one extrapolates this notion to Sangdhor’s employment of \textit{tummo} as a poetic image one might be able to perceive that it makes something unspeakable visible to the “inward eye” of the Tibetan reader. It sears a vivid image of the acts of self-immolation on the Tibetan mind—acts made unmentionable and not objectively discussed by the Chinese state and its media.

The spiritual and historical dimensions of the term \textit{tummo} and its enduring popularity deepen its symbolic significance and make it more profound and accessible as a poetic image. \textit{Tummo}, inner fire meditation, is an ancient yogic practice that constitutes a vital part of the famous Six Yogas of Naropa (\textit{nā ro chos drug}).\footnote{For an insightful book on the Six Yogas of Naropa revolving around \textit{tummo} see Glenn H. Mullin’s (2005) translation of and introduction to Tsongkhapa’s famous commentary on these yogic practices called \textit{The Three Convictions (yid ches gsun ldan)}. According to the current Dalai Lama this “work is regarded by Tibetans as tummo gyi gyalpo [\textit{gtum mo gi rgyal po}, the king of treatments on the inner heat yoga” (Quoted in Mullin 2005: 44).} Tibetans have been practising it since at least the 11th Century when the great translator and master Marpa Lotsāwa (1012-1097) imported it from India and popularised it in Tibet. Through diligent and disciplined meditation practices the \textit{tummo} practitioner harnesses inner heat and channels it for generating the subtlest level of consciousness so as to attain the highest form of wisdom. That is to say that the blissful heat of \textit{tummo} (\textit{gtum mo’i bde drod}) is utilized for gaining enlightenment. Therefore, \textit{tummo} is highly sought after for its liberating “fire-heat” (\textit{gtum mo me drod}). The most famous practitioner and teacher of \textit{tummo} is the great
remembering the tibetan march 10th uprising

yogi-poet Milarepa (1052-1135), a principal disciple of Marpa Lotsāwa. The thin cotton clad Milarepa is admired, amongst other things, for his courage and sheer obstinacy to bear many hardships in order to perfect tummo amidst the snowy mountains of Tibet (gangs ri'i khrod). To this day, many a Tibetan practitioner has followed in his footsteps. In short, tummo is the product of centuries of Tibetan Buddhist teaching and practice shaping bodily and mental experiences. Sangdhor appropriates this consciousness forging yogic practice and makes it burn on the mountain peaks of contemporary Tibet, just as the heat of tummo burnt inside Milarepa so many years ago on so many summits. The inner heat that has blazed inside the bodies of great yogis and numerous lesser practitioners on the Tibetan mountaintops, sharpening their senses for spiritual emancipation, is transformed into the sacrificial fire of self-immolations uttering political discontent, aspiration and agency in such ineffable ways and with such tragic consequences. Thus, within the poetic image of tummo—visible in the mind’s eye—rages the invisible fire of the self-immolations for political liberation, invisible in the Chinese state-controlled media and state censored Tibetan communications. Tummo is also part of the salient bodily imagery of Sangdhor’s poem that captures what is experienced and expressed by the contemporary Tibetan body. Thus, matters of the mind and body are employed as poetic images for communicating new political awakening and actions of the contemporary Tibetan nation.

Tibet within the Fabric of the Poetic Text

The third prominent feature of “The Anniversary and the Melody”, indissolubly interwoven with the other two highlighted aspects, concerns the presence of the Tibetan nation within the very fabric of the poetic text itself. As the poem weaves itself into the written form out of the warp and weft of Tibetan oral and literary sources it beseeches the Tibetan reader to use the newly gained consciousness or political Buddhahood for narrating the recent history of Tibet. Like many who

---

44 On Milarepa, his relationship with his master Marpa Lotsawa and diligent spiritual practice see Andrew Quintman’s fine translation of The Life of Milarepa by Tsangnyön Heruka 2010. For Milarepa’s vital role in the transmission of the Six Yogas of Naropa see Mullin 2005.

45 See Seng rdor (2006: 125-128; 2008: 33-36) for two contrasting yet equally brilliant poems on Milarepa. Sangdhor’s free verse poem “To Mourn” (mya ngan zhu ba) that first appeared on his now closed down literary website on 11 October 2011 is a more explicit reflection on Tibetan self-immolations (Seng rdor 2011c).
fought against Western imperialism in the 20th century, many Tibetans see “an unbroken continuity” of resistance\textsuperscript{46} that can be traced back to the first native fighters’ insurrection against foreign intrusion. Just as there is an unbroken line of active Tibetan opposition that leads, to borrow Basil Davidson’s words, to a period of “primary resistance,”\textsuperscript{47} so there is an uninterrupted chain of repression that stretches from the initial encounter between Tibet and Communist China to the present day. It is this history that Sangdhor’s poem narrates with frequent allusions to Tibet’s past imperial grandeur and by taking full advantage of the communicative efficacy, cultural embeddedness, arresting cadence and unique sound patterns of the Tibetan language. It is this history that the poem urges Tibetans to sing “with voice”, measure “with sound” and utter “through speech”. This vocal narration of Tibetan history forms part of that long-running resistance because it struggles against imposed historical amnesia.\textsuperscript{48} Remembering forbidden historical events generates counter-memory that helps to offset the Chinese state’s efforts to erase and rewrite Tibetan history.

As alluded in the first section of the essay, by providing an alternative Tibetan historical narrative, this poem is itself a form of national remembrance on a grand scale encompassing Tibetan territory, history, art and culture. It not only explicitly recalls the highly significant historical date of the March 10th, but also evokes the rich Tibetan artistic heritage in its textual body. As we have seen, it is woven of historical allusions, religious references, poetic language and imagery derived from Tibet’s oral and literary traditions. As I have demonstrated, it employs the captivating tune and wisdom of \textit{Khache Phalu} to tease out and carry on the great melody that bursts forth. This immensely popular traditional text that reflects upon the unpredictable, suffering and death-ridden nature of the human condition is itself informed by Tibetan oral poetry. As the poem closely associates the new Tibetan awakening with images of galloping horses, “the sacred helmet”, “the seal”, “the sword” and “the edict” memories of the Tibetan imperial power begin to course through it. The poem also calls to mind Tibetan

\footnotesize
\textsuperscript{46} Edward W. Said 1997: 238–239 notes the tendency of many anti-imperial movements to locate their legitimacy and cultural primacy in this “unbroken continuity” of resistance, which is usually played down by the European imperial powers in their historical accounts.
\textsuperscript{48} This is not to claim that the poet sets out consciously to undertake political resistance. In a way he is simply exercising an inherent human faculty, be it mediated by one’s socio-cultural experience. Memory is an essential part of an individual’s existence and identity and a Tibetan’s free use of it happens to clash with the Chinese imperial power.
avian folklore as it makes use of it to express immense human suffering and instil eternal loyalty in Tibetans. The secular application of Tibetan religious practice and thought permeates the poem and it culminates in the “birth” of a new political consciousness that evokes the Buddhist enlightenment. At the core of all these recalls lie the resourceful expressiveness and elasticity of the Tibetan language. Moreover, they show Sangdhor’s innovative use of the Tibetan language which enables him to “sing” the Tibetan nation without being silenced by the Chinese colonial power.

“The Anniversary and the Melody” helps to demonstrate how some contemporary Tibetan poems are able to counter the distorting and dominant language of the imperial power by consciously exploring the full potential of the marginalised Tibetan language. Around the same time when the tragic event commemorated in Sangdhor’s poem was unfolding on the Tibetan plateau, George Steiner, echoing George Orwell, exposed the terrifying relationship between language and political lying entailing political inhumanity. In his famed essays “The Hollow Miracle” and “A Note on Günter Grass”, Steiner argues that the language of the Nazi regime “polluted” and “poisoned” the German language beyond recognition. He believes that this pollution was so intense that it turned the post-WWII German tongue into an effective tool for causing oblivion concerning the recent horrors of the Holocaust. Likewise, the vocabulary of the Chinese Communist Party (CCP) and the Chinese state has a polluting impact upon Tibetan language that either glosses over or totally erases the bloody encounter between Communist China and Tibet in the 1950s and its ongoing repercussions. The perversing effects of the imperial idiom of the CCP run deep in the contemporary use of the Tibetan language and they are blatantly obvious in frequently repeated official statements that paint traditional Tibetan society as “dark” and “medieval” and cast colonial intrusion as “peaceful liberation”. Official Chinese state publications tell Tibetans and the world that “the peaceful liberation of Tibet” is “a milestone marking the commencement of Tibet’s progress from a dark and backward society to a bright and advanced future.”

---

49 Intermeshed with the extended meditation cum enlightenment metaphor is the image of the conception, gestation and birth of a new Tibetan consciousness. As can be discerned in the concluding stanza of the poem this very much resembles the rebirth of a being after a long journey through the realm of Bardo. Here it is the Bardo of the Tibetan colonial experience.


They endlessly reiterate: “The Society of old Tibet under feudal serfdom was even more dark and backward than Europe in the Middle Ages.” Due to both official pressure and unthinking conformism, many Tibetans embrace this imperial idiom and portray Tibet of yesteryears as being “extremely cruel, extremely backward and extremely dark”, and continue to believe that their society and culture are still lagging behind advanced peoples and are in need of progress.

The political vocabulary of the CCP as an effective carrier of an imperial hegemony has seriously infected Tibetan language to the extent that it continues to affect the narration of Tibetan history as well as the perception and expression of Tibetan identity. Reflecting upon the enduring power of injurious words, Emily Dickinson once noted that “the infection in the sentence breeds”. Such an infection goes on breeding in the Tibetan sentence, but as shown by the likes of Sangdhor’s poem all is not lost. The deep oral and literary roots of such contemporary poetry prevent the infection reaching to the marrow of the Tibetan language. “The Anniversary and the Melody” is effective in fighting the infection and avoiding historical forgetfulness because it plumbs what Sangdhor terms “the depths of the Tibetan language” for poetic communication. This specific poem belongs to what Sangdhor and others classify as “the new verse poetry” that has given a renewed energy and creative impetus to the neglected formal Tibetan verse poetry. Since the flourishing of free verse form in the 1980s, triggered by the pioneering poems of Dhondup Gyal, many Tibetan writers have attacked metrical composition for its perceived inflexible, archaic and inadaptable form and uniformity of content. This prevalent anti-verse sentiment led to a sharp decline in the practice of versification especially in the 1980s. As a result, the fate of the formal Tibetan verse poetry became a source of

---

52 Information Office of the State Council of the People’s Republic of China 2001: 3.
53 For instance, a recent Tibetan news report (Snying lcags 2017) on “the 58th Anniversary of Serfs’ Emancipation Day” typifies the imposition as well as adoption of the Chinese imperial idiom when it states that Tibetans “sang songs of praise to the wise and glorious deeds of the Communist Party with deep love while remembering the extremely cruel, the extremely backward and the extremely dark history of the Old Tibet”.
54 The renaming of Tibetan places, rivers and mountains in Chinese for official record and administrative purposes is a typical colonial practice of erasing the presence of the colonised. Deliberate sinicisation of Tibetan proper names erases historical, cultural and psychological identities embedded within them.
55 Dickinson, Emily [1947]: 553. “A Word dropped carelessly on a Page”.
56 Commentaries on this new type of Tibetan verse see Seng rdor 2014; 2010: 56-66. Also see Sgo yon 2011.
great anxiety for an older generation of Tibetan scholars during the 1980s and the early 1990s.\(^{57}\) “The new verse” (\textit{bcad gsar}) is the product of a conscious collective endeavour to revitalise the Tibetan verse poetry by exploring “the depths of the Tibetan language” that can only be fully appreciated by a true Tibetan ear or a Tibetan language forged sensibility.\(^{58}\)

According to Sangdhor’s exposition, “the new verse” approximates to what Gedun Choepel calls “the ancestral diction” (\textit{pha mes lugs kyi tshig sbyor}) or “the diction according to the natural freedom of the Tibetan language” (\textit{bod skad rang dbang ba’i sgrig tshul}), which advances a notion of the flexible Tibetan poetic diction naturally inherent within the Tibetan language (\textit{bod skad rang gi gshis la yod pa}) that is unrestricted by the artificial style of the Indian \textit{kāvya} influenced Tibetan literature.\(^{59}\) Thus, “the new verse” creatively exploits different types of Tibetan metrical composition found in both oral and written literatures, whilst always prioritising terminology, diction, grammatical rules and rhetoric devices considered distinctively Tibetan.\(^{60}\) “The new verse”—as a new poetical voice of the present—observes rules concerning grammar, syntax and spelling but avoids the strict dictates of literary Tibetan and adopts the freedom and flexibility of the spoken word when it comes to such conventions. Sangdhor distinguishes “the new verse” from the regular verses of Tibetan \textit{kāvya} and oral poetry but stresses that these and other categories of Tibetan versification are indispensable for its birth and development.\(^{61}\) In fact, when he calls it “the flow of a literary form” he is emphatically recognising “the new verse” as the perpetuation of an ancient Tibetan literary practice.\(^{62}\) For Sangdhor the flow of “the new verse” is fed by, amongst other artistic tributaries, “the ritual recitals of the Bon tradition, poem-songs (\textit{mgur}), elegant sayings (\textit{legs bshad}), advice, and the poetry of \textit{Kāvyādarśa (me long}}

\(^{57}\) For instance, some of the most passionate and reasoned writings of the Lama scholar poet Alak Dorshi bear this anxiety. See his 1980s critical as well as pedagogic essays on Tibetan literature especially focusing on regular verse poetry, Dor zhi gdong drug snyems blo 2004a: 179-191, 192-220, 221-256, 281-310 and 2004b: 12-118, 206-230.

\(^{58}\) Seng rdor 2014.

\(^{59}\) Ibid. Here Sangdhor is drawing on a fine essay by Gedun Choepel called “On the Grammar of the Written Tibetan Language” (\textit{Bod yig gi sgra sbyor skor}), Dge ’dun chos ’phel 1994 Vol1: 281-283. An English translation of this essay by Thupten Jinpa and Donald S. Lopez Jr. (who render the title into English as “On the Linguistic Rules of the Tibetan Language”) is available in Gendun Chopel 2014: 209-220.

\(^{60}\) Seng rdor 2014; Sgo yon 2011.

\(^{61}\) For insightful discussions of Sangdhor’s poetry and the influence of Tibetan literary and oral traditions on it see Hor gtsang ’jigs med (Hortsang Jigme) 2018 and Dge ’dun rab gsal (Gedun Rabsal) 2018.

\(^{62}\) Seng rdor 2014.
Thus, the very text of “The Anniversary and the Melody” is also forged by a long and diverse Tibetan literary history which in turn augments its overall resistance against state-enforced oblivion.

Although Sangdhor is considered a radical poet because of his well-publicised anticlerical attitude, his “new verse” reveals that his originality lies in his respect for the old as much as his ability to communicate the new. In an essay called “On Being Modern-Minded” Bertrand Russell finds a specific type of mind shaped by the fashion of the present and desire for the new. According to Russell, such a mind has no propensity to think differently or independently other than to follow current opinions that reject the old and embrace the new. Individuality is drowned in the uniformity of the fashionable. This tendency has also influenced the minds of many contemporary Tibetan writers. As a result, they do not value much the earlier and more traditional forms of Tibetan literature. Sangdhor does not appear to escape the fetishism for the new in terms of some of his views on Tibetan Buddhism, but with regards to his poetic style he prefers the everlasting of the old to the ephemeral of the new. It seems he achieves originality through the observation of literary conventions deemed old-fashioned in the contemporary Tibetan literary climate. In his essay “Johnson as Critic and Poet” T. S Eliot notes that Samuel Johnson’s “originality” results from his rigorous upholding of the standards of a common style in English poetry. As a result, Eliot concludes: “To be original within definite limits of propriety may require greater talent and labour, than when every man may write as he pleases, and when the first thing expected of him is to be different.” Indeed, through the adherence to common standards and rules of both written and oral compositions whilst not being in thrall to the fleeting new, Sangdhor produces original poetry capable of communicating the contemporary Tibetan national experience. The CCP has implanted ideological words, phrases and images deep within the Tibetan language. However, as shown by “The Anniversary and the Melody” Sangdhor’s poetry erodes such implants through the reinvigoration of Tibetan verse poetry, reemploying older or enduring Tibetan terminology, cadence and meter, and injecting them with fresh

---

63 Ibid. Ḍāṇḍīn’s highly influential treatment of kāvyā (snan ngag me long ma) or Mirror of Poetics is a highly influential treatment of kāvyā by Dāṇḍīn (7th–8th c.) which had dominated classical Tibetan literary production till the late 20th century.


65 See Sangdhor’s controversial book Audacity (rtul phod) in which he attacks the transmission and some central beliefs of Tibetan Buddhism (Seng rdor 2008). One particular poem entitled “Eighty-Four Thousand Heaps of Lies” (shob kyi phung po brgyad khri bzhi stong) dismisses the complete teachings of Lord Buddha as the product of centuries old imaginative fabrication and intellectual mendacity (Ibid: 11-16). See also Lama Jabb 2015: 15-16.

66 Eliot, T. S. 1957: 188.
Remembering the Tibetan March 10th Uprising

senses and blending them with common speech. This decontamination process is assisted by the technology of the internet and social media that has spread Sangdhor’s poem far and wide.

The Paperless Sky: Popular Reception of the Poem

Data saturation brought on by a chaotic diversity of internet-based electronic modes of communication affects Tibetans as much as it impacts other peoples. However, this chaotic scene is conducive to the generation of a multiplicity of literary voices. The production, distribution and exchange of user-generated content via social media challenges the traditional notion of the literary canon—understood as a body of works deemed the highest quality by established scholars, writers, critics and anthologists. The mind-boggling plethora of internet-enabled communicative modes offers a certain degree of freedom to the contemporary Tibetan poet whose theme and style can no longer be totally controlled by the dictums of the powerful, be they literary or political. Dhatsenpo, a former leading member of the Third Generation of Tibetan Poets, is among the first to celebrate this newly acquired sense of freedom. In his provocatively entitled poem “Even If You Don’t Like It, So What? I Write Like This” Dhatsenpo writes poetry onto a “paperless sky” (shog bu med pa’i nam mkha’):

This is perhaps the noon
In terms of both age and sequence

I long ago erased
A rusted line of words

What remained was a paperless sky
Onto which I’ve written a poem
That is the light of semen dripping from the penis
And the supple softness of the unfolded vagina
In no way is it the twinned ancient sun and moon

The person who illumines the blade of intellect
Always dies without the time to wash the filth of certitude

With characteristic defiance and provocation, Dhatsenpo is defending graphic erotic poetry and attacking the authority of Tibetan critics’

whose literary tastes have been shaped by the classical kāvya poetics derived from India. Alongside the promotion of strict metrical rules, poetic diction, aesthetic principles and Indian mythology, kāvya imposes set themes such as the eulogy of the sun and the moon. What Dhatsenpo also emphasises is the “paperless sky”—the internet that provides the Tibetan poet with an infinite space of relative freedom. This space is not bound by the finiteness of the book in terms of its materiality and cannot be policed by the established literary authorities. To a noticeable degree it enables one to avoid financial pressures and socio-political restrictions associated with the production of literary books and journals printed on paper. Dhatsenpo’s erotic poetry forced itself onto the Tibetan literary scene in the mid 2000s due partly to his and the Tibetan reader’s use of the Web. His is a literary voice not drowned out by conservative critics nor the sheer volume of internet-generated literary data.

Sangdhor’s “The Anniversary and the Melody” is an even more audacious poem etched on to the “paperless sky”. It takes advantage of this expansive and relatively freer space to broach a politically forbidden theme and to broaden its reach beyond the limited circulation of the printed word. As observed already, Sangdhor composed the poem on 10 March 2010 coinciding with the 51st Anniversary of the Tibetan National Uprising Day of the 1959. He first published it online on his own website on 29 March 2010 to a rapturous reception. By 13 December 2011 Sangdhor’s writings featuring this poem received 106,557 hits on his website alone. It has appeared on many websites, blogs, public forums, in private chat-rooms and on other discursive platforms facilitated by online social networking services. It has been trending on Tibetan social media for some time now and is usually shared frantically during the month of March. Although the poem is mostly circulated via the internet it also appears in surreptitious publications such as privately produced pamphlets, journals and books both inside and outside Tibet. It is worth mentioning here that Sangdhor’s books, including those featuring “The Anniversary and the Melody”, go through several reprints and sell in their tens of thousands. In fact, this state of affairs has made him a bestselling Tibetan language writer who is almost singular in his capacity to make a living out of the profits

---

68 For an analysis of contemporary Tibetan erotic poetry including the cited Dhatsenpo’s poem see Lama Jabb 2015: 183-230.

69 This number only represents those who viewed it on Sangdhor’s private website as noted by Arik Gethong in 2011. It does not take into account others who would have come across the poem via online and printed publications.
accrued from the sales of his books.70 “The Anniversary and the Melody” constitutes only a tiny – be it a powerful - fragment of Sangdhor’s bestselling oeuvre. It first came out in print in 2011 in an acclaimed collection of some of Sangdhor’s contentious poems and prose that had initially appeared online.

Taking advantage of his own website and its editorial board Sangdhor published this volume himself and it is aptly entitled Wild Writings Dragging a Lasso (Rtsom rgod thag drud ma).71 The internet facilitates self-publication through enabling personal production and management of online content as well as making it possible to use this content and the information gleaned from it for producing printed material. Therefore, even before the actual publication of the volume, the popular and lucrative response to it was a fait accompli as it had been predetermined by the existing rapturous online reception of the items to be included in it. The title of the book appropriates the Tibetan pastoralist term thag drud, which translates as “the one dragging a lasso”. It is a reference to unruly horses and yaks that are released with a long rope around their necks so that they could be easily caught whenever and wherever necessary. This word is also a slang for prisoners released on parole who need to be constantly vigilant against the authorities. Therefore, a less literal translation of the title might be Wild Writings on Parole. The volume was published without official Chinese state permission with a print run of 5,000 copies. It run out of print as soon as it came out but the author has never reprinted it inside Tibet due to the risks and challenges entailed.72 In 2012, Virginia-based Tashi Choeuling Buddhist Centre published this volume in downloadable digital book format and made it widely available.73 “The Anniversary and the Melody” also features in another self-published book called The Depths of the Tibetan Language: The Best Poems of Sangdhor (bod skad kyi dting/sengs rdor gyi snyan ngag rtse gra phyogs bsdus). It is quietly buried deep within this volume which contains some of Sangdhor’s most representative “new verse poems” and finest prose pieces. This highly sought-after book was first published in 2013 with an initial print run

70 In a conversation about the popular reception of his poetry Sangdhor (15 December 2017) intimated unprompted that the main source of his income is accrued from the sale of his books. He categorically affirmed that this income not only enables him to make a living but also covers all expenses when he dines out, the purchase of electronic equipment including computer and phone and travel expenses for both business and pleasure.

71 Seng rdor: 2011.

72 This does not take into account many unauthorized reprints of the book available on the Tibetan book market.

73 This particular digitised form can be downloaded at http://www.rigzod.org/index.php?option=com_content&view=article&id=112%3A2011-12-22-17-40-41&catid=1%3A2011-09-01-18-24-37&Itemid=108&limitstart=3
of 4,500 (6,000) copies. Affirming the existing popularity of Sangdhor’s work, once again the book sold out as soon as it appeared on the market. In an effort to meet the unprecedented rising demands for the book it has been reprinted 12 times totalling over 40,000 copies.\footnote{This number only reflects conservative estimations offered by the author himself and some of the distributors of the book. It does not include many copies produced by private booksellers without the author’s permission or knowledge.}

The rise of social media technology has given further saliency to the existing online and printed presence of “The Anniversary and the Melody”. Many Tibetans repost and repeatedly share this poem via internet-facilitated instant-messaging applications such as Facebook, WhatsApp, WeChat and Weibo. It is impossible to ascertain how many people have read and re-read the poem and how many times it has been disseminated via multi-purpose social media apps. However, my own many encounters with this poem through a diversity of print and digital media over the last eight years tells me that it is indeed one of the most reproduced contemporary Tibetan poems. To cite just a single year as an example, Sangdhor republished it for only a brief period in January and again in March 2015 on his online literary forum and social media sites to a virtual community formed of nearly 10,000 individuals and groups. For reasons of directness and online searchability he revised the title of the poem to “March 10th and the Melody”. Before he was pressured to remove the poem from his microblogging sites it had received over 30,000 views. Many of the individuals who follow Sangdhor’s every post displayed the poem on their private blogging sites or on collective forums and distributed it amongst their online contacts. Around the same time (March 2015) many online social networking groups both inside and outside Tibet started sharing the poem while showering it with praises. These include two particularly popularly Tibetan language social media forums inside Tibet with a combined following of over 100,000 individuals where Sangdhor’s poem was viewed and shared more than most items.\footnote{The names of and links to these microblogging sites and virtual communities are kept anonymous so as to avoid unwelcome attention.}

By 2015, a digitised volume of a selection of Sangdhor’s poems featuring “The Anniversary and the Melody” (that had first come out in 2013 inside Tibet) became one of the most downloaded contemporary Tibetan literature e-books.\footnote{This digital book of Sangdhor’s selected poems was the most downloaded work out of several poetry books released as part of a Tibetan poetry e-book series still available online. The publisher and online links are left unidentified for fear of unwelcome attention.} In online discussions many readers have lauded the poem and some have even suggested that it along with another poem by Sangdhor that eulogises the current Dalai Lama should be used as
anthems for opening Tibetan public ceremonies and functions. This rapturous reception shows that the popular reach of Sangdhor’s poem is due to the fine quality of the poem itself, its daring subject matter and the technology of the internet.

The endless electronic reproduction of “The Anniversary and the Melody” reveals that our need to repeat things in order to remember persists in the age of social media and data saturation. Although online technology facilitates repeated communication, ironically it also bears an inherent ability to send any work, artistic or otherwise, into oblivion. There is no solid physical presence of the favourite book that can be manually browsed, visibly shelved and frequently revisited. This poem could have been buried deep under a mountain of invisible electronic data thus consigning it to forgetfulness like numerous other poems. However, the tendency to republish it over and over in mostly digitised format rescues it from this forgetfulness and makes people read it repeatedly. The constant rereading of a text is not only a feature of fine literature but is also an effective form of remembrance. In the case of Sangdhor’s poem re-reading entails the aesthetic appreciation of the poem itself as well as recalling its commemorative subject matter which remembers the silenced tragic history of modern Tibet. In short, countless reproductions mean deliverance from the oblivion of data saturation and also from the state imposed historical amnesia. The creative and subversive potential of the infinite “paperless sky”, generates a double-edged centrifugal force. It is a force that counters the totalitarian propensity to monopolise meaning-making and to control the means of representation. It also pulls away from individual or collective authoritarian tendencies to define literature within a narrow theoretical framework. The “paperless sky” creates the communicative technological condition for the existence of a multiplicity of literary voices. Of these Sangdhor’s is a single limpid poetic voice—a voice informed by the Tibetan literary tradition, oral poetry and a serious concern with Tibet’s current situation. In the Tibetan poetic struggle against forgetting in the age of social media two communicative tech-

77 This brilliant and unconventional praise verse called “The Yellow Cloth” (ras ser po) was first published on Sangdhor’s website in 2008 before its appearance in print (Seng r dor 2011: 115-17, 2013: 10-11). It is subtitled “Praising a Person” (mi zhig la bsnags pa).

78 The poem has a solid physical as well as a virtual presence. However, significantly it reaches to a wider audience thanks to the flexible digital reproducibility of it in a wide virtual world.

79 Many literary critics view the need to reread a particular book for many generations as a mark of fine writing. For instance, echoing this opinion Jonathan Bate (2010: 2) states: “The books that are read again and again become literature”. 
nologies stand out. The technology of the internet and that of the written word. As evident in the case of “The Anniversary and the Melody” the immortalisng power of the written word—so often celebrated by Shakespeare—^is still essential for inscribing poetry onto the “paperless sky”.

**Conclusion: A Poem Brimful of Suffering**

“The Anniversary and the Melody” monumentalizes an already immortal date of Tibetan history. The poem brims with profound sadness as it remembers and reflects upon 10 March 1959, a date that has come to symbolise all the irreversible changes brought on by CCP rule. By recalling the tragic loss of lives, sacrifices made, environmental degradation and waves of colonial repression over the years, the poem taps into the unifying force of shared suffering. As it gives utterance to the ongoing Tibetan plight, it also underscores the galvanising quality of human suffering resulting from an unbroken line of state repression. Tibetan defiance and political agency are captured by the intimations of the 2008 protests and the acts of self-immolation and the detection of a revolutionary awakening and impulse. In fact, “The Anniversary and the Melody” detects in the 2008 protests something not very dissimilar to W. B. Yeats’ celebrated interpretation of the 1916 Easter Rising: “All changed, changed utterly:/ A terrible beauty is born”.\(^1\) However, while Yeats displays ambivalence and uncertainty about that history defining Irish rebellion in his poem “Easter 1916”, Sangdhor is unambiguous in his celebration of the 2008 Tibetan uprising as a transformative moment. He makes out and celebrates its revolutionary energy with absolute certitude whilst not forgetting that it is also an active commemoration of 10 March 1959.

While Sangdhor’s poem explicitly commemorates the historic date and utters the ensuing Tibetan colonial experience with such poetic force, its very textual body, composed as it is in the style of “the new verse”, mirrors Tibet by recalling the diverse Tibetan literary and oral traditions with nuance and brio. What T. S. Eliot calls “the historical sense” or “the consciousness of the past” in his famous essay “Tradition and the Individual Talent”\(^2\) (the deep engagement with past literary luminaries that has shaped great European poetry) also informs contemporary Tibetan poetry. As shown by “The Anniversary and the

\(^{80}\) For instance, see Shakespeare’s sonnets 15, 17, 18 and 55 (Jones. ed. 1997: 141, 145, 147, 221).

\(^{81}\) Yeats, W. B. 2001: 85-87. For a postcolonial reading of Yeats’ “Easter 1916” touching on his uncertainties about the Easter Rising see Marjorie Howe: 216-17.

Melody”, in the case of Tibet, the historical sense involves more than a serious appreciation of its literary tradition. It also entails deep immersion in Tibet’s long history, mountainous territory, religious traditions and oral literature. Extending its reach through the infinite space of “the paperless sky” Sangdhor’s poem employs all these elements and beseeches the Tibetan people to let their hearts and minds beat to a new music.

Most of all, “The Anniversary and the Melody” is an extraordinarily eloquent poem of remembrance teeming with vivid and powerful imagery. Just like the short verse “Feelings on the Day of the March 10th” penned by the now incarcerated monk Hortsang Tamdrin, Sangdhor’s poem audaciously recalls a historically significant date evocative of immense loss, suffering and grievance:

Today is the anniversary date of the March Tenth;  
I remember the disease lodged within the heart,  
Remember the wounds lacerated across the flesh,  
Remember the grief for the siblings that died,  
Remember the sound of the red wind that blew,  
And remember the feud that’s festered for years.83

Appendix One

83 de ring gsum bcu’i dus tshigs yin//snying la zug pa’i nad cig dran//sha la gshar ba’i rma zhig dran//spun rdza shi ba’i sdug cig dran//rlung dmar spur ba’i sgra zhig dran//lo la bsinjal ba’i gyod cig dran/>. This poem and a brief account of Hortsang Tamdrin can be found in a news report posted by A rig ’gyur med AND Tshang dbyangs rgya mtsho on 22 November 2013. Hortsang Tamdrin was arrested on 24 April 2013 and later sentenced to four years and six months in prison for allegedly “instigating separatism” and “propagating the idea of Tibetan Independence”.
Remembering the Tibetan March 10th Uprising

བོད་ལྡན་ལེན་གྱི་བྱང་ཆུབ་ཐོབ་|།
དབང་བཅུ་བྱུང་བུ་དགེ་བར་བོད་བཞིན་|།
ཐ་ཤིང་བདེ་དག་ལྡན་ཐོབ་མཛད་པར་|།
མི་དྲི་བཀོད་ཐ་ཤིང་ཐོབ་མཛད་པར་|།

དྲོ་བོ་ཐོབ་མཛད་པར་|།
ཐ་ཤིང་བདེ་དག་ལྡན་ཐོབ་མཛད་པར་|།
མི་དྲི་བཀོད་ཐ་ཤིང་ཐོབ་མཛད་པར་|།

དེ་ནི་ང་ཚན་གཅིག་ན་དེ་མི་སེམས།།
དེ་ནི་ང་ཚན་འདི་བ་དང་སོད་ོབ་འཁོར་བ་རེ་ཆད་རེད།།
ཅུ་རི་ཆོས་ཚན་གཅིག་ན་དེ་མི་སེམས།།
ར་ི་དེ་ནི་ཐག་དིར་འཐེན་པ་ཕམ་ཉེས་རེད།།

g་ཤེད་ཅིག་ནས་N་ཞིག་བགས་_ིས་མཆེད། །

g་ལེ་ག་ལེར་uན་ཁང་གཞིག་པར་,ེད། །

དེ་ནི་ང་ཚན་མཐོང་བའི་
དེ་ནི་ང་ཚན་འདི་བ་

ཆོས་ཤིག་སིག་སིག་དགོད།།

འGང་བ་>ན་Aེས་གདངས་ཤིག་སིག་སིག་དགོད།།

P་kས་Eོགས་པོ་འ`མ་rི་གཏིང་མཐིལ་ན།།

gyག་མ་Pད་oབ་ད,ངས་ཤིག་འuམས་འuམས་^༌། །

དེ་ནི་ང་ཚན་མཐོང་བའི་
དེ་ནི་ང་ཚན་འདི་བ་

རི་Pེའི་~ོ་གཤོག་གཡོབ་པའི་ལོ་2་k།།

།ལ་དང་,ེ་མ་བ{ར་བའི་ངང་aལ་ཡིན།།

ང་པགས་uམ་པོ་wོང་གི་མར་ཞབས་ན།།

འGང་བ་>ན་Aེས་གདངས་ཤིག་སིག་སིག་དགོད།།

སོ་kས་Eོགས་པོ་འ`མ་rི་གཏིང་མཐིལ་ན།།

གyག་མ་Pད་oབ་ད,ངས་ཤིག་འuམས་འuམས་^༌། །

མ་པ་PB་wོང་གི་མར་ཞབས་ན།།

འGང་བ་>ན་Aེས་གདངས་ཤིག་སིག་སིག་དགོད།།

སོ་kས་Eོགས་པོ་འ`མ་rི་གཏིང་མཐིལ་ན།།

གyག་མ་Pད་oབ་ད,ངས་ཤིག་འuམས་འuམས་^༌། །

O་ཡི་lམ་པར་བvབས་ཏེ་wོན་པར་{།།

ད,ངས་_ི་ངོ་བོར་བ|ར་ཏེ་ལེན་པར་{།།

ད,ངས་དེ་,ེ་མ་བ{ར་བའི་ངང་aལ་ཡིན།།

།ལ་དང་,ེ་མ་བ{ར་བའི་ངང་aལ་ཡིན།།

རི་Pེའི་~ོ་གཤོག་གཡོབ་པའི་ལོ་2་k།།

།ལ་དང་,ེ་མ་ཤག་ཤག་བ{ར་བ་བཀའ་བL་ཡིན།།

Remembering the Tibetan March 10th Uprising 87
དདེ་ནི་དང་དེ་ག་རོ་དཔའི་པོགས་ཆ་ཡིན།
དིང་དང་ག་རོ་དཔའི་པོགས་ཆ་ཡིན།
རི་པིའི་ག་མོ་འབར་བའི་ལོ་2་ལ།
ག་རོ་ཚབ་aབ་རོ་དཔའི་ལོ་2་ལ།
དེ་ནི་དང་Lོ་བ་གཅོག་པའི་fག་O་ཡིན།
འrིག་དང་Lོ་བ་གཅོག་པའི་fག་O་ཡིན།
རི་Pེའི་“ོག་མ་གཟེངས་པའི་ལོ་2་ལ།
Lོ་བ་fག་fག་གཅོག་པ་ཐེ་iས་ཡིན།
དེ་ནི་དང་_ི་་…ོད་ནས་ཉམས་ལེན་,ེད།
དེ་ནི་Lི་འjགས་…ོད་“་~ོ་ˆོང་བrི།
ད,ངས་_ི་ལེན་འjགས་…ོད་“་~ོ་ˆོང་བrི།
དབང་བོའི་འཕར་ཆས་རེ་རེ་Pལ་rིས་བLེབ།
ཤེས་པའི་ག:ས་Vོ་སོ་སོ་wོབས་_ིས་བEོར།
ད་ནི་ད,ངས་_ི་…ོད་“་ɾས་པ་འSི།
བསམ་~ོ་ར་ར་གཏོང་བའི་རས་པ་འSི།
རས་པ་རེ་རེ་ཚ་འ%ི་”ང་Žར་ཡིན།
Kོག་གི་མ་ལག་ཆ་ཚང་དག་པར་བŒ །
Kོག་གི་མ་ལག་ཆ་ཚང་དག་པར་བŒ །
ད་ནི་ད,ངས་_ི་…ོད་“་ɾས་པ་འSི།

Bibliography

English Language Sources


**Tibetan Language Sources**


མོ་བོ་པོ་ལ་མཚན། 1998. *Gangtsa Ralpa of the Snowland*, རོ་འེ་མོ་ི་རིག་དཔེ་¡ན་ཁང་།


The Eastern Snow Mountain, རོ་འེ་དེབ་གམ་ཐེ་བཞི་ེས་ན་ 2008. རོ་འེ་པོད་།
People of every ethnic group and every profession of the Tibetan Autonomous Region have together celebrated the 58th Anniversary of One Million Serfs’ Emancipation Day. 

http://tibet.people.com.cn/15653450.html

2004a. 穆朗《布和拉杰·赛利玛吉》 Critical Essays: A Rosary of Jewels for Dispelling Darkness, 青海 省民族出版社

----. 2004b. 穆朗《哈斯·赛利玛吉》 Entrance Door to Literature: A Concise Knowledge of Poetics with Expositions and Exemplifications, 青海民族出版社

2008. 穆朗《布和拉杰·赛利玛吉》 Even If You Don’t Like It, So What? I Write Like This, 青海民族出版社

2009. 穆朗《布和拉杰·赛利玛吉》 Separating the Sky and the Earth: On the Peaceful Revolution of the Earth-Mouse Year,
Remembering the Tibetan March 10th Uprising


Aren’t These Footprints of Sangdhor Big?

The Disciplinarian Monk of the Zamthang Jonang Monastery Is Sentenced,
An outline of the sound structure of Lhagang Choyu: A newly recognised highly endangered language in Khams Minyag

Hiroyuki SUZUKI & Sonam Wangmo

(IKOS, Universitetet i Oslo)

1. Introduction

This article provides a preliminary phonological sketch of Lhagang Choyu—a Tibeto-Burman language variety that has not undergone previous linguistic analysis. The analysis is based on only around 700 words, which the present authors were able to collect during two fieldwork trips conducted in 2015 and 2016. This paper also attempts to compare the phonology of Lhagang Choyu with its closest related language, i.e. Choyu (a.k.a. Queyu; ISO 639-3 code: qvy). This comparison is based on previous studies of Choyu (e.g., Wang 1991; Nishida 2008; Lu 1985; Nagano & Prins 2013).

Lhagang Choyu has not gained much interest from researchers despite the fact that there are many publications focusing on the region (traditionally called Minyag or Minyag Rabgang of Khams). Several general reference works concerning the region where Lhagang Choyu is spoken have been published, e.g., Yang (1994), Kangding Xianzhi (1995), Ikeda (2003), and Rig-'dzin bsTan-srung (2015); yet none of these mention Lhagang Choyu. Anthropological works, e.g., Schneider (2013), (2016), and Tan (2013a; 2013b), also do not mention Lhagang Choyu. There are also several linguistic descriptions on the nearby non-Tibetic language of Minyag (or Darmdo Minyag) that do not mention Lhagang Choyu, e.g., Sun (1983), Huang (1991; 2009), Song (2006), and Dawa Drolma & Suzuki (2016). The first report regarding the sociolinguistic situation of the Lhagang Choyu language was published in Suzuki & Sonam Wangmo (2016a), and it is listed as a language in Roche & Suzuki (2017). Unfortunately, by the time the

---

1 We conducted a third fieldwork trip in 2017; however, we were not able to collect more words.

2 Toponyms that have originated from Tibetan are first given in Chinese pinyin, followed by a Tibetan romanised transliteration (based on de Nebesky-Wojkowitz 1956: xv) and finally by a transliteration style used henceforth in the article.

authors of this present paper became aware of Lhagang Choyu’s existence, Lhagang Choyu had already become moribund. It is likely that there are no longer speakers that acquired Lhagang Choyu as a mother tongue; with less than 100 people who have acquired it as a second language. It has been spoken in only one hamlet called Tage [Thabs-mkhas; Thamkhas] of Tagong [lHa-sgang; Lhagang] Town, Kangding [Dar-mdo] Municipality, Ganzi [dKar-mdzes] Tibetan Autonomous Prefecture, Sichuan Province, China (Fig. 1 & 2).

The language data was collected from speakers living in Lhagang Village—the cultural and administrative centre of Lhagang Town. Most Lhagang Choyu speakers are now speakers of Khams Tibetan (ISO 639-3 code: khg), of which their spoken variety is the Thamkhas dialect of the Minyag Rabgang dialect group. Those who are able to speak Lhagang Choyu usually do not use Lhagang Choyu anymore and instead speak Khams Tibetan. They use Khams Tibetan even within their family in which all the members are from Thamkhas Hamlet. Hence, the second author, native of Lhagang Village, has recently discovered that most middle-aged and younger villagers living in Lhagang Village do not even know the existence of the

---

3 There is another spelling for this hamlet: Thal-skas (Rig-’dzin bsTan-srung 2015: 55).
4 The figures in the article were designed by Arc GIS online: https://www.arcgis.com/home/webmap/viewer.html
5 Khams Tibetan should be considered as a language complex rather than a single language. See Tournadre (2014) and Suzuki (2015b; 2016). The Thamkhas dialect of the Minyag Rabgang dialect group is closely related to the Zhonglu subdialect mentioned by sKal-bzang 'Gyur-med (1985). For a detailed description based on sound changes (or shared innovations) corresponding to Literary Tibetan, see Suzuki (2016). For descriptions of dialects belonging to this group, see Suzuki (2007) and Suzuki & Sonam Wangmo (2015; 2017).
Lhagang Choyu language.

As the language name suggests, Lhagang Choyu is considered as a language closely related to the Choyu language, particularly to the dialect of Choyu spoken to the west of Thamkhas Hamlet (Suzuki & Sonam Wangmo 2016a). According to a traditional oral story, ancestors of Tibetans who are now living in Thamkhas Hamlet migrated more than 200 years ago from the present Choyu-speaking area of Xinlong [Nyag-rong] County. Thus, we can hypothesise an existence of a historical relationship between Lhagang Choyu and Choyu. In addition, a few Lhagang Choyu speakers remember being able to communicate with some Tibetans from the Choyu-speaking area of Nyagrong (nyag rong logs skad ‘Nyagrong’s local speech’) by using Lhagang Choyu (or skad logs ‘impure language’). The reported intelligibility between the variety of Choyu spoken in Nyagrong and

---

6 The person that we interviewed clearly mentions that her ancestors came from a place called /tɕʰo ji/; however, none of the Tibetans from Thamkhas Village who live in Lhagang Village know the exact place of /tɕʰo ji/, and they just say “somewhere in Nyagrong.” The first author conducted several interviews in Litang [Li-thang] County where he was told by a Choyu-speaking lama that “Choyu” just denoted today’s Zituoxi [rTse-thog-gshis] Township of Xinlong County; there are no locations called Choyu within the territory of Litang County. In other interviews, the first author has confirmed that no Choyu speakers living in Litang County consider the toponym “Choyu” as designating an area within Litang.

7 The first author has also confirmed that Tibetans (Kham speakers) in Litang County often call the Choyu language skad logs in contrast with mi nyag skad ‘the Minyag language(s)’ (which includes Darmdo Minyag and Nyagrong Minyag). The term skad logs is difficult to translate well, but the morpheme logs definitely carries a pejorative sense that, when used in skad logs, can also mean ‘biased’, ‘slanting’, ‘leaning’, and ‘non-authentic’.
Lhagang Choyu certainly suggests a close linguistic relationship between the two varieties within the highly variegated language situation of this area (Roche & Suzuki 2017; 2018). However, there have been no systematic studies of intelligibility between these languages.

Several dialects of Choyu have undergone analysis by linguists; e.g., the dialect in Youlaxi [gYang-la-gshis] Township of Xinlong County (Wang 1991), the dialect in Rongba [Rong-pa] Township of Litang [Li-thang] County (Nishida 2008), the dialect in Tuanjie Township (Lu 1985) and the dialect in Gala/Xiala Township (Nagano & Prins 2013) of Yajiang [Nyag-chu-kha] County. Figure 3 shows the geographical distribution of these Choyu dialects and the location of Thamkhas Hamlet. In addition, Figure 3 shows how Thamkhas is located in a different valley from all the other Choyu dialects. The Choyu dialects are principally spoken along the Nyagchu River Valley.

In Table 1, we can observe a comparison of eleven lexemes in Lhagang Choyu and five Choyu dialects (Tuanjie, Gala, Phubarong, Rongpa, and gYanglagshis).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Lhagang</th>
<th>Tuanjie</th>
<th>Gala</th>
<th>Phubarong</th>
<th>Rongpa</th>
<th>gYanglagshis</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Lhagang Choyu</td>
<td>Choyu</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>meaning</td>
<td>Lhagang</td>
<td>Tuanjie</td>
<td>Gala</td>
<td>Phubarong</td>
<td>Rongpa</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

8 Lu (1985) names the language in Tuanjie Township “Zhaba;” however, it is rather a dialect of Choyu (Wang 1991). Xiala is locally pronounced as [kala] in Sichuanese (Southwestern Mandarin), as shown in Nagano & Prins (2013), and thus henceforth, we will refer to this dialect as ‘Gala’.

9 Sources: Lhagang Choyu: the present authors’ field note; Tuanjie: Lu (1985) and Sun (1991); Gala: Nagano & Prins (2013); Phubarong: the first author’s field notes; Rongpa: Nishida (2008); gYanglagshis: Wang (1991).
An outline of the sound system of Lhagang Choyu

There are three lexemes of interest in Table 1 worth commenting on. Firstly, no Tibeto-Burman language, at least from the data that is available, has forms for the lexeme ‘sun’ similar to the forms in Lhagang Choyu and the Phubarong dialect of Choyu, i.e. /‘mi tsi/ and /‘mo‘-tsa/ respectively (e.g., see Shirai et al. 2016). Secondly, the word for ‘tooth’ with a /k-/ initial is attested only in Lhagang Choyu and Choyu among the languages of western Sichuan (see Suzuki and Sonam Wangmo 2016a). Thirdly, the word for ‘person’ with a voiceless nasal is also unique to Lhagang Choyu and Choyu among the languages spoken in the vicinity (see Huang 1992). These three unique lexical commonalities suggest a close relationship between Lhagang Choyu and Choyu.

From the data provided by previous works on Choyu, the Choyu language can be divided into two dialect groups based on the number of consonant clusters a dialect has. gYanglagshis and Rongpa have many, whereas Tuanjie and Gala have fewer than gYanglagshis and Rongpa. This typologically superficial feature reflects a historical divergence within Choyu and may be a clue for understanding whether or not Lhagang Choyu is related to the Choyu dialects in Nyagrong, as the oral migration history given by Thamkhas Tibetans suggests. For this purpose, we should first clarify the phonology of Lhagang Choyu, then seek shared innovations attested in etyma.

The primary purpose of this article is to provide a phonological sketch of Lhagang Choyu using the limited lexical data that is available. Since the language is already moribund, it has been difficult to access and obtain language data. Many word forms have been forgotten and replaced by Khams Tibetan. Making a long sentence using only Lhagang Choyu is basically impossible for the remaining speakers in Thamkhas Hamlet. Therefore, we provide an analysis based only on about 700 words as well as some fragments of morphological data. Thus, this article cannot provide a complete phonological analysis, but rather will attempt to make some preliminary claims about the phonology of Lhagang Choyu based on the data that is available. In addition, our phonological analysis follows a more “broad phonetic” approach to analysis (Timberlake 2004: 28). There are several reasons we take this approach. First, our data is limited, and thus making
strong claims about the phonology seems unwise. Second, there are sounds in Lhagang Choyu that need “extensive discussion about the actual properties of the sounds, rendering binary decisions about what is or is not phonemic uninformative” (Timberlake 2004: 28). For example, Lhagang Choyu has two labio-dental continuants (the approximate ʋ and the fricative v), both of which we represent in the consonant inventory. The approximate ʋ and the fricative v might indeed be a single phoneme, but the present data suggest that at these sound are at least partially contrastive. Thirdly, our approach is more conducive to doing dialectology, which is an urgent research need from an areal perspective. An approach that is overly focused on phonological economy does not always reflect how a native speaker may perceive dialect variation and may even hide some of the contrasts that are primarily motivated by dialect variation. Following the phonological analysis, we provide a preliminary comparative analysis of the phonology and lexicon of Lhagang Choyu with a number of Choyu dialects. Our conclusion is that Lhagang Choyu is related most closely to the Choyu dialects of Nyagrong.

2. A preliminary phonological sketch

A preliminary phonological sketch of Lhagang Choyu is described below, divided into four parts: consonants, vowels, suprasegmentals, and phonotactics. Typically it is indispensable in phonological analysis to find minimal pairs. Unfortunately, only a small number of minimal pairs can be found in our Lhagang Choyu database of 700 words. However, we do have enough data to provide a rough and preliminary phonological sketch based on minimal and near-minimal pairs as well as complementary distribution.

-Consonant inventory

From our data, we propose 54 consonants in Lhagang Choyu, as is shown in the following table:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Consonant Inventory of Lhagang Choyu</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>plosive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>p</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>affricate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>dz</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Due to limited accessibility to Lhagang Choyu, the authors cannot provide an exhaustive linguistic comparison, as is provided in Huang (2001).
* /ɸ/ appears only as a preinitial and never as a main initial. See discussion in 3.2.2.

N.B.1. /d/ and /dz/ do not appear as simple initials. Since other voiced obstruents exist just as simple initials, we can propose the existence of the two consonants.

N.B.2. /ʔ/: Glottal stops could be interpreted as an allophone of a zero-initial. However, we prefer to analyze glottal stops as a consonant phoneme because it provides a simpler explanation of syllable structure as requiring a consonant onset. See Phonotactics for further explanation.

Complex initials are attested and include the following preinitials: /p-, b-, ɸ-, v-, w-, m-, x-, ŋ-/.

-Vowels
There are eleven vowels in Lhagang Choyu, as seen in Table 3.

Table 3 — Vowels of Lhagang Choyu

| i | e | ɛ | a | ɑ | ɔ | o | u | ɯ | ʉ | ə |

Three secondary articulations (nasalisation, velarisation, and labialisation) are attested, as discussed with examples in Section 3.3.2.

-Suprasegmentals
Lhagang Choyu has a word-tone system, distinguishing two types of tone: ‘high’ and ‘low’. We represent the high tone with the symbol ˇ and the low tone with the acute accent symbol ´, both of which we place before the word. Pitch height can be identified phonetically for the first two syllables of a word, but the third syllable of trisyllabic words is always atonal. Stress is also contrastive and is represented with ’, which denotes that the preceding syllable has stress. In multisyllabic words, stress causes the following syllable to become atonal. See Section 4 for further explanation.
-Phonotactics

Lhagang Choyu’s basic syllable template is CV, and its maximum is CCV, of which the first two elements (C) are preinitials. We do not have any examples in our data of a syllable without an initial consonant. Preinitials are either nasals (prenasalisation and heterorganic /m/), glottal fricatives (preaspiration), or oral sounds such as /n, ɸ, ɭ, ɣ, w/. Syllables are always open.

3. Segmental sound structure

When doing phonology, it is typical to conduct analysis on native words and loanwords separately. However, due to the small amount of data, this methodology is not feasible. Lhagang Choyu has many Tibetan loanwords, several of which are not so similar to any other dialect in the surrounding area. We suppose that these Tibetan loanwords are quite old and have adapted to the sound structure of Lhagang Choyu. Therefore, we include Tibetan loanwords as necessary data for phonological analysis.

3.1 Combining initials and vowels

The following table (Table 4) contains all the possible combinations of initials with vowels found in our data. Attested combinations are marked with an X. We are not making a claim that these are all the possible combinations of simple initial consonants with vowels as the data we have is very limited. Initials here can occur with or without a preinitial. Vowels can be with or without secondary articulation (e.g., nasalisation, velarisation, and labialisation).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>i</th>
<th>e</th>
<th>ɛ</th>
<th>a</th>
<th>ɑ</th>
<th>ɔ</th>
<th>o</th>
<th>u</th>
<th>u</th>
<th>ɯ</th>
<th>ʊ</th>
<th>ə</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>p</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>p</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>t</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>t</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>t</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>k</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

Table. 4 — Combinations of initials and vowels

---

11 Based on the authors’ field notes. Lexical data regarding any variety of Khams Tibetan distributed around the Lhagang Choyu-spoken area has not been published in a systematic way except for Suzuki and Sonam Wangmo (2015, 2016b), who describe the Lhagang dialect of Khams Tibetan and the Shingnyag dialect of Amdo Tibetan respectively.
3.2 Consonants

Examples of consonants are provided in this section organised according to manner of articulation. Simple consonants initials are discussed in 3.2.1 and consonant clusters are discussed in 3.2.2.

3.2.1 Simple consonant initials
- obstruents
  - labial plosives
    /p/ /pʰ/ ‘pig year’
/p/  /̃pɔ/ 'tʃa/ 'insect'; /̃ʔa pa/ 'father (address term)'
/b/  /̃tʃə/ 'tʃa/ 'like this'

alveolar-retroflex plosives
/t/  /̃tʃə/ 'tʃa/ 'far'
/tʃ/ /̃tʃə/ 'like this'
/tʃh/ /̃tʃə/ 'tʃa/ 'insect'

velar-uvular-glottal plosives
/k/  /̃kə/ 'snlaw'; /̃kʰ/ 'smoke'
/kʰ/ /̃kʰa/ 'snlaw'
/g/  /̃ga pu/ 'big'; /̃gu za/ 'noodle'
/q/  /̃qa pi/ 'story'; /̃qʰ/ 'head'
/qʰ/ /̃qʰa zi/ 'pony'; /̃qo zo/ 'tall'
ʔ/  /̃ʔa ma/ 'mother'; /̃ʔo di/ 'throat'

alveolar-postalveolar-prepalatal fricatives
/ts/  /̃tʃa/ 'tsampa (roasted barley)'
/tsʰ/ /̃tʃʰa/ 'tsampa (roasted barley)'
/dz/ No simple initial examples; see prenasalisation and preaspiration in 3.2.2.
/tʃʰ/ /̃tʃʰu/ 'dog'
/tʃ/ /̃tʃə/ 'tʃa/ 'insect'
/tʃʰ/ /̃tʃʰa/ 'tsampa (roasted barley)'
/tʃʰ/ /̃tʃʰa/ 'tsampa (roasted barley)'

-l-continuants
labial-labiodental fricatives and approximants
/v/  /̃və/ 'tsampa (roasted barley)'
/w/  /̃və/ 'mdzo (hybrid of yak and cow)'
/v/  /̃və/ 'tsampa (roasted barley)'

These three are likely to be contrastive as simple initials.

alveolar-postalveolar-prepalatal fricatives
/s/  /̃se/ 'wood'
An outline of the sound system of Lhagang Choyu

/z/ /ˈze/ ‘liver’
/s/ /ˈʃə/ ‘bone’
/z/ /ˈʃə/ ‘water’
/ʃ/ /ˈʃə/ ‘tear up’
/ɛ/ /ˈɛ/ ‘who’
/z/ /ˈze/ ‘house’

velar-uvular-glottal fricatives
/ʃ/ /ˈʃə/ ‘calf’; /ˈʃə xu/ ‘earthen jar’
/ɣ/ /ˈɣa/ ‘fox’; /ˈɣu pa/ ‘owl’
/ɾ/ /ˈɾe/ ‘neck’
/ɾ/ /ˈɾa tsə/ ‘chili’
/ɦ/ /ˈɦə qə le/ ‘wear a ring’; /ˈku fiu/ ‘exchange’

Full contrast between these sounds is not attested.

labial, alveolar, postalveolar, and prepalatal nasals
/m/ /ˈma/ ‘butter’
/ untrue/ /ˈme/ ‘hair’
/n̥/ /ˈni/ ‘ear’
/ŋ/ /ˈŋi/ ‘nose’
/ŋ/ /ˈŋo ŋo/ ‘bitter’; cf. /ˈŋo ðu/ ‘jewel’
/ŋ/ /ˈŋi ŋi/ ‘black’
/ŋ/ /ˈŋi/ ‘knee’

velar-uvular nasals
/ŋ/ /ˈŋə ŋə/ ‘we’
/ŋ/ /ˈŋə ŋə/ ‘blue’
/ŋ/ /ˈŋə na/ ‘bright’
/ŋ̊/ /ˈŋ̊ə ŋə/ ‘yellow’

liquids and approximants
/l/ /ˈlu/ ‘stone’
/l̥/ /ˈla/ ‘wind’
/r/ /ˈɾa/ ‘female yak’
/ɾ̊/ /ˈɾi/ ‘rabbit year’

3.2.2 Complex consonants
There is a rich inventory of complex consonant cluster initials attested in Lhagang Choyu, which also appear in the majority of the dialects of Choyu. Prenasalisation /C/ and preaspiration /C, ʰC/
make up the majority of consonant clusters; however, labial plosive and continuant preinitials /pC, ʰC, ʰʰC, ʰC, ʰC/, and velar continuant preinitials /xC, ɣC/ are also attested. Due to insufficient data, we cannot confirm the entire system of complex initials; however, we can give a preliminary sketch. Regarding our phonetic representations, even though preinitial sounds are neutralised (especially in voicing), we still represent each cluster in its pre-neutralised state, following previous works on Choyu dialects.  

-Prenasalisation

Homorganic prenasalisation appears before a main initial with voiced or aspirated obstruents. E.g.,

- Prenasalisation

Homorganic prenasalisation appears before a main initial with voiced or aspirated obstruents. E.g.,

- Preaspiration

Preaspiration appears before unaspirated or voiced obstruent and continuant main initials. Voicing of the preinitial depends on the voicing of the main initial, and is thus neutralised. Therefore, we could unify the description with one phonetic symbol (choosing either /hC/ or /ʰC/); however, we represent both the voiced and voiceless forms in order to stay consistent with our broad phonetic approach. Some examples have a variant of preaspiration as a specific oral consonant. E.g.,

12 Taking Sun (1991) and Huang (1992) into consideration, we find that this style is commonly accepted among descriptions of relevant Tibeto-Burman languages. Although there is a criticism against this method from a phonological approach, we still follow the convention of Sun (1991) and Huang (1992).
Labial preinitials

Labial preinitials include various obstruents and nasals (e.g., /C, C, PhC, -C, -C/). The only labiodental preinitial is the voiced fricative /v/, and in some cases, it can alter with a labial approximant counterpart /w/. Nasal labial preinitials must be considered as heterorganic labial prenasalisation; hence, /b/ and /p/ are excluded in the forms below (see Prenasalisation above). Within our limited data, labial preinitials seem to be in complimentary distribution in terms of manner of articulation as well as voicing. In particular, /v/ sometimes appears as a prefix for verbal morphology and can precede any voiceless initials, including fricatives. We thus keep /v/ and /Ph/ in contrast at this present stage of research regardless of the lack of minimal pairs.

Only a few combinations are attested. The lack of systematicity might be due to insufficient data. E.g.,

/ʈ/ /ˈʈʰə/ ‘directional prefix’
/tʂ/ /ˈʈʂə/ ‘thread’; cf. /ˈʈʂə/ ‘3rd person pronoun’
/tʃ/ /ˈʈʃə/ ‘iron’; cf. /ˈʈʃə/ ‘tea’
/s/ /ˈsə/ ‘gold’; cf. /ˈsə/ ‘blood’
/l/ /ˈ/li/ ‘tongue’; cf. /ˈli/ ‘stairs’
/b/ /ˈɓə ɓa/ ‘frog’
/d/ /ˈɗə/ ‘seven’
/g/ /ˈɡu za/ ‘lunch’; cf. /ˈɡu za/ ‘noodle’
/dz/ /ˈɗə dzu/ ‘trousers’
/z/ /ˈɗə zo/ ‘girl, daughter’; cf. /ˈɗə/ ‘fry’
/z/ /ˈʒə/ ‘sickle’; cf. /ˈʒə/ ‘wooden bowl’
/z/ /ˈɓə zi/ ‘wait’; cf. /ˈɓə/ ‘peaceful’
/k/ /ˈɓə ɠa/ ‘power’; cf. /ˈɓə/ ‘help’
/m/ /ˈɓə mi/ ‘wound’; cf. /ˈɓə tsi/ ‘sun’
/n/ /ˈɓə na me/ ‘daughter-in-law’; cf. /ˈɓə na/ ‘bean flour’
/ŋ/ /ˈɓə ɓe/ ‘old’; cf. /ˈɓə/ ‘name’
/ŋ/ /ˈɓə ɓu/ ‘sweet’; cf. /ˈɓə/ ‘I’
/l/ /ˈɓə la/ ‘thigh’; cf. /ˈɓə la me/ ‘dream’
/r/ /ˈɓə ri/ ‘skin’; cf. /ˈɓə ri/ ‘road’
/w/ /ˈɓə wa/ ‘yak hair tent’; cf. /ˈɓə wa/ ‘under’
/j/ /ˈɓə ju/ ‘turquoise’

- Labial preinitials

An outline of the sound system of Lhagang Choyu

/ʔk/ /ˈʔkə/ ‘voice, language’; cf. /ˈkə/ ‘directional prefix’
/ʔts/ /ˈʔtsə/ ‘thread’; cf. /ˈʔtsə/ ‘3rd person pronoun’
/ʔtʃ/ /ˈʔtʃə/ ‘iron’; cf. /ˈʔtʃə/ ‘tea’
/ʔs/ /ˈʔsə/ ‘gold’; cf. /ˈʔsə/ ‘blood’
/l/ /ˈʔli/ ‘tongue’; cf. /ˈʔli/ ‘stairs’
/b/ /ˈʔɓə ɓa/ ‘frog’
/d/ /ˈʔɗə/ ‘seven’
/g/ /ˈʔɡu za/ ‘lunch’; cf. /ˈʔɡu za/ ‘noodle’
/dz/ /ˈʔɗə dzu/ ‘trousers’
/z/ /ˈʔɗə zo/ ‘girl, daughter’; cf. /ˈʔɗə/ ‘fry’
/z/ /ˈʔʒə/ ‘sickle’; cf. /ˈʔʒə/ ‘wooden bowl’
/z/ /ˈʔɓə zi/ ‘wait’; cf. /ˈʔɓə/ ‘peaceful’
/k/ /ˈʔɓə ɠa/ ‘power’; cf. /ˈʔɓə/ ‘help’
/m/ /ˈʔɓə mi/ ‘wound’; cf. /ˈʔɓə tsi/ ‘sun’
/n/ /ˈʔɓə na me/ ‘daughter-in-law’; cf. /ˈʔɓə na/ ‘bean flour’
/ŋ/ /ˈʔɓə ɓe/ ‘old’; cf. /ˈʔɓə/ ‘name’
/ŋ/ /ˈʔɓə ɓu/ ‘sweet’; cf. /ˈʔɓə/ ‘I’
/l/ /ˈʔɓə la/ ‘thigh’; cf. /ˈʔɓə la me/ ‘dream’
/r/ /ˈʔɓə ri/ ‘skin’; cf. /ˈʔɓə ri/ ‘road’
/w/ /ˈʔɓə wa/ ‘yak hair tent’; cf. /ˈʔɓə wa/ ‘under’
/j/ /ˈʔɓə ju/ ‘turquoise’
Velar preinitials

Velar preinitials include only fricatives, which seem to be neutralised in voicing based on the main initial. There is a clear pronunciation difference between velar preinitials and preaspiration. Although there are no minimal pairs, there are still some words that are in contrast with non-velar preinitials.

Only a few combinations are attested. E.g.,

\[ /\text{ŋ}/ \quad \text{‘chew’} \]
\[ /\text{ŋ}/ \quad \text{‘chew’} \]
\[ /\text{ŋ}/ \quad \text{‘chew’} \]
\[ /\text{ŋ}/ \quad \text{‘chew’} \]
\[ /\text{ŋ}/ \quad \text{‘chew’} \]
\[ /\text{ŋ}/ \quad \text{‘chew’} \]
\[ /\text{ŋ}/ \quad \text{‘chew’} \]
\[ /\text{ŋ}/ \quad \text{‘chew’} \]
\[ /\text{ŋ}/ \quad \text{‘chew’} \]
\[ /\text{ŋ}/ \quad \text{‘chew’} \]
\[ /\text{ŋ}/ \quad \text{‘chew’} \]
\[ /\text{ŋ}/ \quad \text{‘chew’} \]

The word ‘beads’ is considered to be a Tibetan loan originating from phreng ba. In the Rangakha dialect of Khams Tibetan (spoken in the vicinity of the Lhagang Choyu-speaking area), there is also the
prenasalised form \( /\text{-}\text{ŋt}\text{e wa}/ \) ‘beads’ (Suzuki 2007:153). The Lhagang Choyu form suggests a sound change: */p\text{-}r\text{e} wa/ \rightarrow */\text{-}\text{ŋt}\text{e wa}/.

3.3 Vowels

3.3.1 Simple vowels

The following contrasts can be made in the vowels of Lhagang Choyu:

- /i/-/e/-/a/
- /i/ \( /\text{-}\text{mi tsi}/ \) ‘sun’; /\text{-}\text{vi du}/ ‘pig food’
- /e/ \( /\text{-}\text{me}/ \) ‘hair’; /\text{-}\text{ve}/ ‘pig’; /\text{-}\text{se}/ ‘log’
- /ɛ/ \( /\text{-}\text{m̥ɛ}/ \) ‘medicine’; /\text{-}\text{ke sa}/ ‘cushion’; /\text{-}\text{se ma}/ ‘bean’
- /a/ \( /\text{-}\text{ma}/ \) ‘butter’; /\text{-}\text{ka wa}/ ‘steamed bun’

- /u/-/o/-/ɔ/-/ɑ/ /
- /u/ \( /\text{mu}/ \) ‘sky’; /\text{lu}/ ‘stone’
- /o/ \( /\text{mo zá}/ \) ‘cat’; /\text{lo ma}/ ‘leaf’; /\text{-}\text{tɛ u tsɔ}/ ‘time’
- /ɔ/ \( /\text{-}\text{no na}/ \) ‘inside’; /\text{-}\text{tɔɔ tsɔ}/ ‘short’
- /ɑ/ \( /\text{-}\text{ma mi}/ \) ‘soldier’

- /u/-/ɔ/-/u/ /
- /u/ \( /\text{tu tu ˈla}/ \) ‘quarrel’; /\text{-}\text{tɛ u}/ ‘sūtra’
- /ɔ/ \( /\text{ma}/ \) ‘fire’; /\text{-}\text{tɔ}/ ‘dog year’
- /u/ \( /\text{mu}/ \) ‘person’; /\text{-}\text{tɛ u mi}/ ‘water spring’

- /a/-/a/ /
- /a/ \( /\text{tɔ ˈla}/ \) ‘loose’; /\text{-}\text{tɔa}/ ‘elder sister’
- /a/ \( /\text{ji ˈla}/ \) ‘twist’; /\text{-}\text{ɛi tɛa}/ ‘broom’

- /u/-/u/ /
- /u/ \( /\text{-}\text{vu}/ \) ‘belly’
- /u/ \( /\text{-}\text{vu ɛu}/ \) ‘navel’

- /u/-/u/ /
- /u/ \( /\text{ho tɛ u}/ \) ‘uncover’
- /u/ \( /\text{-}\text{tɛ u}/ \) ‘sūtra’

Note that there are no minimal or near-minimal pairs to show contrast between the vowels /ɔ/ and /a/. However, nasalised forms, as seen in 3.3.2, reveal the possibility of contrast between /ɔ/ and /a/.
3.3.2 Vowels with secondary articulation

There are three types of secondary articulation that occur with vowels: nasalisation, velarisation, and labialisation. More than one type of secondary articulation cannot co-occur within the same syllable, according to the present data.

-Nasalised vowels

Nasalised vowels can be found in independent words and in words that have undergone alternations due to verb agreement morphology. For example, some verbs index the first person agent/actor with vowel nasalisation. We have not conducted a systematic analysis; however, we were able to record verb agreement indexed by nasalisation in a few elicited verbs. Verb agreement through nasalisation is evidence that Lhagang Choyu has a set of nasalised vowels.

Many nasalised vowels which appear in word-medial position occur before prenasalisation. In this case, the nasalisation of the vowel could be due to the phonetic effect of anticipating the following nasal. However, there are examples where the vowel is not nasalised before a nasal consonant; and examples where a vowel is nasalised even before a non-nasal consonant. Compare the following examples:

\[ tsʰ-\hat{o} /\text{merchant} /\text{(nasalised vowel + prenasalised initial)} \]
\[ \hat{\text{w}}\hat{\text{a}} /\text{ˈdə}/ /\text{ˈsow} /\text{ (non-nasalised vowel + prenasalised initial)} \]
\[ \hat{s}\hat{e} /\text{ˈgi}/ /\text{ˈlion} /\text{(nasalised vowel + non-prenasalised initial)} \]

Due to the small number of examples, we represent nasalisation in ever instance that it occurs, even though it may not be entirely phonological in every instance. Our data contains the following nasalised vowels: /\text{i̯}, \text{ɨ̃}, \text{ã}, \text{ɔ̃}, \text{ɑ̃}/. The existence of near minimal pairs also suggests that nasalisation is a distinctive feature.

Examples of nasalised vowels in word-final position, which rarely appear, are as follows:

\[ /\text{i̯}/ /\hat{\text{t}}\hat{\text{i}} / /\text{ˈcloud}/; \text{cf.} /\hat{\text{ti}} / /\text{ˈmule} /\]
\[ /\hat{\text{e}} / /\text{ˈkə zə}/ /\text{ˈI sleep} /\]
\[ /\text{ā}/ /\hat{\text{tsə}} / /\text{ˈI milk} /\]
\[ /\hat{\text{o}} / /\hat{\text{ra}} /\text{γə}/ /\text{ˈrabbit}; \text{cf.} /\hat{\text{γə}} / /\text{ˈ(inanimate things) exist (on an upper side)} /\]
\[ /\hat{\text{a}} / /\hat{\text{zə}} / /\text{ˈcopper} /\]
\[ /\hat{\text{ā}} / /\hat{\text{lə}} / /\text{ˈox}; \text{cf.} /\hat{\text{lə}} / /\text{ˈvulture} /\]

Examples of nasalised vowels in word-medial position (‘nasalised vowel + non-prenasalised initial’ type) are as follows:

\[ /\text{ẽ}/ /\hat{\text{se}} /\text{ɡi}/ /\text{ˈlion} /\]
\[ /\hat{\text{ə}} / /\hat{\text{lo}} /\text{kə}/ /\text{ˈwind} /\]
\[ /\hat{\text{a}} / /\hat{\text{dzə}} /\text{kə}/ /\text{ˈgreen} /\]
An outline of the sound system of Lhagang Choyu

/ä/ /ˈjä ji/ ‘potato’

-Velarised vowels
Some vowels have a velarised counterpart, which is pronounced as either a velarised vowel [Vɣ], a vowel followed by a velar approximant [Vɰ], or a vowel followed by a palatal approximant [Vj]. These three features are always free variants. Hence they can phonologically be described as /Vɣ/. The velarised vowels do not always form a contrast with their plain counterparts.

Our data contains the following velarised vowels: /ɛɣ, aɣ, ɑɣ, ɔɣ, oɣ, uɣ, ɔ̃ɣ/. The existence of minimal and near-minimal pairs suggests that velarisation is a distinctive feature.

/ɛɣ/ /ˈnɛɣ/ ‘milk’
/aɣ/ /ˈnaɣ/ ‘bean flour’
/ɑɣ/ /ˈtɑɣ/ ‘tiger’; cf. /ˈtɑ po/ ‘spoon’
/ɔɣ/ /ˈtɔɣ/ ‘yak’
/oɣ/ /ˈloɣ/ ‘skin’; cf. /ˈlɔ/ ‘flea’
/uɣ/ /ˈluɣ/ ‘seed’; cf. /ˈlu/ ‘song’
/ɔ̃ɣ/ /ˈsɔɣ/ ‘blood’; cf. /ˈsɔ/ ‘comb’

As presented above, velarised vowels are contrastive with their corresponding simple vowel counterparts.

-Labialised vowels
[u] is not in the consonant inventory nor does it occur as an allophone of /w/. However, some vowels have a labialised counterpart, which is pronounced as [−V] or [ʷV]. This secondary feature is most properly referred to as labio-velarisation; however, we will simply refer to it as labialisation in this article. In Lhagang Choyu, labialisation always precedes a vowel. In preparation for the articulation of an initial consonant, it does not influence the manner of articulation; for example, /ˈhɪ/ ‘rain’ is not pronounced as [wɪ] or [ɸɪ], but as [hʊɪ] ([hʊɪ] is also acceptable).

Within the data available at present, labialised vowels are: /ɨ, ɛ, ɑ, ə, o, ɔ/. The existence of minimal pairs suggests that labialisation is a distinctive feature.

/ɨ/ /ˈhɨ/ ‘rain’
/ɛ/ /ˈsɛ/ ‘father (reference term)’; cf. /ˈsɛ/ ‘wood’
/ɑ/ /ˈnɑ/ ‘five’; cf. /ˈnɑ/ ‘I’
/ə/ /ˈʃɑ/ ‘sugar’
/o/ /ˈkɑ/ ‘price’; cf. /ˈko nɑ/ ‘inside’
As presented above, labialized vowels with their corresponding simple vowel counterparts.

An exceptional case is attested as follows. There is an alternation between a prelabialised vowel and a prelabialised initial, which is not a common phenomenon, e.g., the word ‘shoe’ has two forms: /z-i/ and /-zi/.

4. Suprasegmentals

Lhagang Choyu has a word-tone system with two contrastive pitch patterns: HIGH (’) and LOW (´). Only the first two syllables of a word can have a distinct pitch pattern; after which low pitch patterns follow. Hence, no more than the first two syllables of a word are considered as the tone-bearing unit (TBU). This is similar to the tonal system of Lhasa Tibetan analyzed by Kitamura (1977), Hoshi (1991) and Hoshi (2003).

Pitch height is clear at the word-initial position for most words, and speakers generally do not accept an alternation of the pitch height. There are, however, a few exceptions, e.g., words which allow either of the two heights to appear such as /mA, mA/ ‘fire’. No additional phonation is contrastive (e.g., creaky voice, breathy voice, etc.; see Zhu 2010; Suzuki 2015a). Falling pitch never functions as a phonological feature. At the end of an utterance, the pitch pattern is generally falling. For instance, the word for ‘sun’ /mi tsi/ is pronounced as [mi55tsi] in citation form. However, when pronounced three times continuously in citation form it will be [mi55tsi mi55tsi mi55tsi]—a falling pitch appears only in the last utterance. This happens in phrases as well. For example, a sequence of two monosyllabic words /h-i/ ‘rain’ and /tu/ ‘fall’ is transcribed as /h-i ˇtu/ ‘it rains’. However, the pitch of the first word always stays high and level, e.g., [h-i], whereas the pitch of the second word tends to fall, e.g., [tu]a.

We place the diacritic for marking tone in the word-initial position. This transcription convention follows Kitamura (1977). Some monosyllabic examples of tonal contrast are as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>HIGH</th>
<th>LOW</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>/ca/</td>
<td>/ca/</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>‘east’</td>
<td>‘earth’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>/nA/</td>
<td>/nA/</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>‘you’</td>
<td>‘tail’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>/nA/</td>
<td>/nA/</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>‘read’</td>
<td>‘fish’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>/lu/</td>
<td>/lu/</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>‘stone’</td>
<td>‘sheep’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>/jo/</td>
<td>/jo/</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>‘left’</td>
<td>‘rabbit year’</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
An outline of the sound system of Lhagang Choyu

Some examples of contrast found between monosyllabic and disyllabic forms yet not in a derivational relationship, are as follows (an apostrophe within a word marks stress; see the explanation below):

HIGH
- /̃ze/ ze
- /̃ya/ ya
- /̃ni/
‘fragrant’
‘difficult’
‘name’

LOW
- /ˈze/
- /ˈya/
- /ˈni ni/
‘peaceful’
‘extend’
‘little’

Examples of polysyllabic words are given below. However, minimal pairs of polysyllabic words demonstrating tonal contrast have not been attested so far.

HIGH
- /̶t̶зо ma/
- /t̶ea t̶a ga/
- /jo qo /
- /t̶a la t̶a la/
‘milk cow’
‘ginger’
‘long ago’

LOW
- /ˈzo zi/
- /ˈt̶ea t̶a/
- /ˈre qa /
- /ˈma ro pe /
‘cowshed’
‘rough’
‘stable’
‘pitiful’

Although the TBU is no more than the first two syllables of a word, several polysyllabic examples demonstrate that the second syllable may be pronounced with a low pitch pattern, which makes the second syllable appear to be atonal. This is similar to what has been reported in Lhasa Tibetan: tones for disyllabic words with specific suffixes display have two different realisations (Kitamura 1977; Hoshi 1991). One realisation is a tone pattern that fully covers both the syllables and forms a single TBU; and the other realisation is the tone is primarily on the first syllable and the second syllable just has a “light tone.” This difference in Lhasa Tibetan is morphophonological.

Caplow (2016:182) describes the existence of stress in some Tibetic languages. Stress is used in some Tibetic languages to distinguish minimal pairs across lexical categories. Her definition of stress is, “the relative prominence of a syllable with respect to neighbouring syllables” (2016:182).

The phenomenon attested in Lhagang Choyu is quite similar to that of Lhasa Tibetan described by Kitamura (1977). Disyllabic words possessing an atonal second syllable are primarily reduplicated word forms, especially adjectives as well as words with a suffix. We analyze this feature as stress falling on the first syllable. Even though the first syllable itself has no prominence, it is highlighted by an atonalised second syllable. For our transcription convention, we propose an apostrophe (’) after the first syllable rather than a stress diacritic.

Stress in Lhagang Choyu is related not only to the phonology but also to morphology. For example, the diminutive /ʑi/ which makes a derivation of a ‘young animal’ from nouns denoting animals is atonal;
however, when this syllable is not a diminutive, it can bear a tone. Compare:

Stressed /¨xe‘ zi/ ‘calf’, /¨ts‘a z i/ ‘kid’, /¨pə z i/ ‘piglet’

Plain /¨mo zi/ ‘cat (not for kitten)’

In some cases of verbs with a prefix, stress can appear on the prefix and not on the root. Examples are:

Stressed /¨la‘-za/ ‘DIR"drop’, /¨ta‘-pə/ ‘DIR-rot’, /¨la‘-tso/ ‘DIR-sit’

Plain /¨la-la/ ‘DIR-do’, /¨ta-p,o/ ‘DIR-put, cover’

We have no minimal pairs in our data that display a contrast of stress vs. no stress. However, whether the second syllable is atonalised or not is a crucial feature for speakers. There might be minimal pairs that we have not recorded. Therefore, we maintain a representation of stress in the present description for further research.

To sum up, Lhagang Choyu has both word-tone and stress. This suprasegmental system, except for the restriction of the TBU, is similar to that of the Keihan dialect of Japanese (Ôno and Sibata eds. 1977).

5. Comparison of the sound structure and shared etyma

The present article presents the hypothesis that Lhagang Choyu and Choyu are genetically related based on sociolinguistic evidence as well as on a comparison of peculiar words found in the data of this present paper with the same words found in Suzuki & Sonam Wangmo (2016a). In this section, we attempt to demonstrate this more rigorously; and further to show that Lhagang Choyu is typologically closer to the Choyu variety in Nyagrong than the Choyu variety in Nyagchu even though the Nyagchu variety is closer to Lhagang Choyu than the Nyagrong variety in terms of geographical distance. Even though we have only been able to provide a preliminary sketch of the sound structure of Lhagang Choyu, a brief comparison of cognates shared between Lhagang Choyu and Choyu dialects is worth attempting. The discussion here is just a preparatory work for further research on Lhagang Choyu as well as other Choyu varieties.

The following discussion consists of two parts: the sound structure of three Choyu dialects (gYanglagshis, Rongpa, and Tuanjie), and lexical comparison of etyma which show how shared innovations exist. All the data from Choyu dialects are limited to descriptions

DIR: directional prefix. Due to a lack of data, we cannot provide an exact meaning of each prefix.
provided in the previous works: Wang (1991) for the gYanglagshis dialect, Nishida (2008) for the Rongpa dialect, and Lu (1985) for the Tuanjie dialect. The ordering of the presentation of these dialect descriptions will be based on each dialect’s relative geographical position, from west to east. Thus the order will be gYanglagshis, Rongpa, and Tuanjie, respectively. Due to the limitation of data, the lexical comparison is conducted with only three varieties: Lhagang Choyu, gYanglagshis Choyu (Huang 1992), and Tuanjie Choyu (Sun 1991).

We use the same transcription conventions as the original sources except for the retroflex affricate /tʂ/ and /tʂʰ/ which we write as /ʈʂ/ and /ʈʂʰ/, respectively.

5.1 Sound structure of three Choyu dialects
5.1.1 Consonant inventories

The consonant inventory of the gYanglagshis dialect is displayed in Table 5 followed by a comment regarding complex initials.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>pʰ</th>
<th>tʰ</th>
<th>kʰ</th>
<th>qʰ</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>p</td>
<td>t</td>
<td>k</td>
<td>q</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b</td>
<td>d</td>
<td>g</td>
<td>G</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>tsʰ</td>
<td>tʃʰ</td>
<td>tʃʰ</td>
<td>tɕʰ</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ts</td>
<td>tʃ</td>
<td>tʃ</td>
<td>tɕ</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>dz</td>
<td>dʒ</td>
<td>dʒ</td>
<td>dz</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>s l</td>
<td>f</td>
<td>s</td>
<td>c</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>v</td>
<td>z j</td>
<td>ʒ</td>
<td>ז</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>m n</td>
<td>m h</td>
<td>η</td>
<td>η</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>m ̥</td>
<td>n ̥</td>
<td>n ̥</td>
<td>ɨ</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>l</td>
<td>r</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>w</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Complex initials are 144 in total, in which preinitials include: homorganic prenasalised consonants and /m-, p-, b-, s-, z-, l-, l̥, ʃ-, r-, ḥ-, ʒ-, ʐ-, ʑ-, /.

The consonant inventory of the Rongpa dialect is displayed in Table 6 followed by a comment regarding the complex initials.

14 Adapted from Wang (1991). We have changed the symbols tʃ and tʃʰ to ʈʂ and ʈʂʰ, respectively.
Complex initials are 116 in total, in which preinitials include preaspirated consonants, homorganic prenasalised consonants, and /m-, p-, b-, s-, z-, l-, l̥-, ŋ-/. The consonant inventory of the Tuanjie dialect is displayed in Table 7 followed by a comment regarding the complex initials.

Table 6 — Consonant system of the Rongpa dialect

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>pʰ</th>
<th>tʰ</th>
<th>kʰ</th>
<th>qʰ</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>p</td>
<td>t</td>
<td>k</td>
<td>q</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b</td>
<td>d</td>
<td>g</td>
<td>G</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>tsʰ</td>
<td>tˢʰ</td>
<td>tɕʰ</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ts</td>
<td>tˢ</td>
<td>tɕ</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>dz</td>
<td>dʑ</td>
<td>dz</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>f</td>
<td>s</td>
<td>ž</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>v</td>
<td>z</td>
<td>ž</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>m</td>
<td>n</td>
<td>ɭ</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>m̥</td>
<td>n̥</td>
<td>ĭ</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>l</td>
<td>ɭ</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>w</td>
<td>r</td>
<td>ɭ</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Complex initials are limited to homorganic prenasalised voiced plosives and affricates, and labial plosives plus /z/.

Table 7 — Consonant system of the Tuanjie dialect

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>pʰ</th>
<th>tʰ</th>
<th>kʰ</th>
<th>qʰ</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>p</td>
<td>t</td>
<td>k</td>
<td>q</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b</td>
<td>d</td>
<td>ɭ</td>
<td>ɭ</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>tsʰ</td>
<td>tˢʰ</td>
<td>tɕʰ</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ts</td>
<td>tˢ</td>
<td>tɕ</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>dz</td>
<td>dʑ</td>
<td>dz</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>s</td>
<td>ž</td>
<td>c</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>v</td>
<td>z</td>
<td>ž</td>
<td>ɣ</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>m</td>
<td>n</td>
<td>ɭ</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>m̥</td>
<td>n̥</td>
<td>ĭ</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>l</td>
<td>ɭ</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>w</td>
<td>r</td>
<td>ɭ</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Complex initials are limited to homorganic prenasalised voiced plosives and affricates, and labial plosives plus /z/.

---

15 Adapted from Nishida (2008). Some phonetic symbols were changed.
16 Adapted from Lu (1985), who does not state each articulatory position and manner. Some phonetic symbols were changed.
Based on the description above, we list following outstanding typological differences in Lhagang Choyu and Choyu:

A. Existence of postalveolar initials
B. Existence of uvular nasals
C. Number of complex initials
D. Existence of preaspiration
E. Existence of labial nasal preinitials
F. Existence of prepalatal fricative preinitials
G. Existence of velar plosive preinitials

Table 8 contrasts the features above.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>A</th>
<th>B</th>
<th>C</th>
<th>D</th>
<th>E</th>
<th>F</th>
<th>G</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Lhagang Choyu</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>gYanglagshis</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>144</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rongpa</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>116</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tuanjie</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

5.1.2 Vowels and rhymes

Regarding vowels, it is better to examine not only the simple vowels but also the structure of rhymes (vowel+final).

Number and quality of distinctive vowels in the gYanglagshis dialect below:

- Tongue position contrast: /i, e, a, ə, u, y, u, o, ɔ/
- No simple vowel/nasalised vowel contrast is attested.
- Complex vowels: /ie, iɛ, io, ue, uɛ, ua, uə, ye, yə, ei/.
- /-r/, /-n/, and /-ŋ/ can appear as finals.

Number and quality of distinctive vowels in the Rongpa dialect below:

- Tongue position contrast: /i, e, a, ə, u, i, ə, u, o, ɔ/
- Simple vowel/nasalised vowel contrast is attested in /i, e, a, u, i, u, o/.
- Complex vowels: /ie, io, ue, ua, ui, ei/.
- Rhotic vowels: /ir, ur, er, ar, or, ur/.

Number and quality of distinctive vowels in the Tuanjie dialect below:

- Tongue position contrast: /i, ɪ, y, e, ə, ɛ, ə, v, a, ɔ, u, u, ɪ/.
- Simple vowel/nasalised vowel contrast is attested except for /ɪ, v, ʊ, i/.
- Complex vowels: /ei, ɛi, ai, əu, au/, /ui, ue, uɛ, uɛ, ua, ye/, /uei, iau/
Based on the description above, Lhagang Choyu and Choyu have following typological differences:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>nasalised vowels</th>
<th>nasal finals</th>
<th>/r/- final</th>
<th>rhotic vowels</th>
<th>velarised vowels</th>
<th>labialised vowels</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Lhagang Choyu</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>gYanglagshis</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rongpa</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tuanjie</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

5.1.3 Suprasegmentals

A simple comparison of suprasegmentals across language varieties is difficult unless the methodology of analysis is the same in each variety. Various methods have been used to describe suprasegmentals in Choyu varieties. A comparison of the number of tones and the superficial description (broad phonetic pitch patterns) in Lhagang Choyu and dialects of Choyu can be seen in Table 10.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>number of distinct tones</th>
<th>superficial description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Lhagang Choyu</td>
<td>2 + 1 (stress)</td>
<td>H (˘), L (˘), ˘</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>gYanglagshis</td>
<td>3 + 1 (atonal)</td>
<td>55, 13, 31 + atonal 33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rongpa</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>H, L</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tuanjie</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>55, 53, 35, 33</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Based on a superficial description of tones, Lhagang Choyu has a similar system to the Rongpa dialect in number of distinctive tones. However, the description of Lhagang Choyu applies to a word-tone system whereas the descriptions of Choyu dialects apply a syllable-tone system. Lhagang Choyu needs a stress marker in addition to tone markers. The existence of an ‘atonal’ category is attested in the gYanglagshis dialect, which could be similar to Lhagang Choyu’s system of stress.

In any case, it is not possible to compare these suprasegmental systems because each variety has been analyzed with a different framework. Thus, in the next subsection, we will compare the lexicon across these varieties, but we will have to ignore suprasegmentals until there is more data for each of these varieties.

5.2 Lexical comparison

To begin this subsection, we will briefly confirm that Lhagang Choyu has word forms shared with Choyu varieties. Due to a limitation of data, we will only take examples from gYanglagshis Choyu (Huang 1992) and Tuanjie Choyu (Sun 1991), keeping the original description style and symbols.
Firstly, we display peculiar words from Lhagang Choyu. There are several words which are attested in neither of the two Choyu dialects nor in Tibetic languages.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Meaning</th>
<th>gYanglagshis</th>
<th>Tuanjie</th>
<th>Lhagang Choyu</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>sun</td>
<td>pu³</td>
<td>nɿ₆m₅u₄ (TL)</td>
<td>mi tsi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>book</td>
<td>χ₅e³ tʃ₆a² (TL)</td>
<td>dzui³ dzui³</td>
<td>ɣ₉g₉</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>big</td>
<td>qo³ rʃi³</td>
<td>kɐ₅kɐ₅</td>
<td>ɡ₉p₉</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>butterfly</td>
<td>kɐ³ pu³ le³ ble³</td>
<td>pɔ₃ lɐ³</td>
<td>ʃ₅u</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

All the Lhagang Choyu forms in Table 11 are not of Tibetic origin. They should be considered as native words. A similar form to / ɣ₉mi tsi/ ‘sun’ is found in Phubarong Choyu (/ ɣ₉m₇ts₉/; see Table 1). A cognate of / ɣ₉g₉/ ‘book’ is found in a Choyu dialect spoken in Lithang (Suzuki & Sonam Wangmo 2018x); and is recorded as dgod in the Tibetan script in Litang Xianzhi (1996:474). It is highly possible for more cognates to be found after more research has been done on Choyu dialects.

Internal comparison is based on cognates tied to regular sound correspondences. We will present some phonological correspondences among these varieties, though this is difficult due to the insufficient quantity of data on the one hand, and because of the abundance of Tibetan loans in Lhagang Choyu on the other hand. Hence, here we just seek whether or not Lhagang Choyu has any forms which potentially correspond to any Choyu varieties.

Based on the differences pointed out in 5.1, we will give a comparison of a limited amount of lexical data. Taking examples from three varieties, gYanglagshis Choyu, Tuanjie Choyu, and Lhagang Choyu, we discuss the following phenomena: (1) postalveolar and uvular initials as well as a postalveolar nasal;¹⁸ (2) preaspiration; (3) nasal preinitials; (4) oral preinitials; (5) velarised rhymes; and (6) labialised rhymes.

Examples of postalveolar and uvular initials are as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Meaning</th>
<th>gYanglagshis</th>
<th>Tuanjie</th>
<th>Lhagang Choyu</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>dog</td>
<td>jʈʃⁱ³</td>
<td>tʃu³</td>
<td>ʃ₅u</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>insect</td>
<td>pu³ tʃᵃ³</td>
<td>bu³ tʃᵃ³</td>
<td>ʃ₉tʃᵃ</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>horn</td>
<td>tʃʰⁱ³ mba³</td>
<td>zᵃ³ tʃo³ (TL)</td>
<td>ʃ₉tʃᵃ</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>bone</td>
<td>ʃᵃ³ rə³</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>ʃ₉r₉</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

¹⁷ (TL) denotes a Tibetic loan.
¹⁸ As far as the authors know, among Choyu varieties, the postalveolar nasal simple initial only exists as a phoneme in Lhagang Choyu. See 3.2.1.
Based on the data in Table 12, we can find sound correspondences among the three varieties. Lhagang Choyu and gYanglagshis Choyu maintain the same articulatory positions for consonant initials except for Lhagang Choyu’s uvular nasals in \( \tilde{\text{n}} \tilde{\text{u}} \) ‘yellow’ and \( \tilde{\text{n}} \tilde{\text{u}} \) ‘sweet’ and prenasalisation + postalveolar in \( \tilde{\text{t}} \tilde{\text{f}} \tilde{\text{u}} \) ‘horn’. Tuanjie Choyu differs from both Lhagang Choyu and gYanglagshis: postalveolars instead of prepalatals, and uvulars instead of velars (cf. Table 7). Tuanjie Choyu also has uvular plosives in its consonant inventory, as seen in Table 7. We have not found cognates with uvular nasals among the varieties. The word \( \tilde{\text{n}} \tilde{\text{u}} \) ‘yellow’ in Lhagang Choyu might correspond to ‘gold’ in the two Choyu dialects (in gYanglagshis pronounced \( \tilde{\text{h}} \tilde{\text{a}} \tilde{\text{g}} \tilde{\text{l}} \tilde{\text{h}} \tilde{\text{i}} \tilde{\text{s}} \tilde{\text{h}} \tilde{\text{i}} \tilde{\text{s}} \) and Tuanjie pronounced \( \tilde{\text{h}} \tilde{\text{e}} \tilde{\text{x}} \tilde{\text{e}} \)). The word \( \tilde{\text{n}} \tilde{\text{u}} \) ‘sweet’ in Lhagang Choyu is similar to the Tuanjie Choyu pronunciation of the same word \( \tilde{\text{h}} \tilde{\text{a}} \tilde{\text{a}} \) ; however, it is possible that the Tuanjie form is a Tibetic loan. Note that Lhagang Choyu has two forms for ‘sweet’; a native word \( \tilde{\text{n}} \tilde{\text{u}} \) and a Tibetic loan \( \tilde{\text{h}} \tilde{\text{a}} \tilde{\text{b}} \). As for the word \( \tilde{\text{n}} \tilde{\text{o}} \) ‘bitter’, the postalveolar nasal can correspond to either a complex denti-alveolar nasal in gYanglagshis (\( \tilde{\text{r}} \tilde{\text{n}} \tilde{\text{u}} \tilde{\text{a}} \tilde{\text{a}} \) or a simple denti-alveolar nasal (\( \tilde{\text{n}} \tilde{\text{a}} \tilde{\text{a}} \)) in Tuanjie.

Examples of prespiration are as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Meaning</th>
<th>gYanglagshis</th>
<th>Tuanjie</th>
<th>Lhagang Choyu</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>excrement</td>
<td>( \text{ctye}^{\text{a}} )</td>
<td>( \text{qhe}^{\text{a}} )</td>
<td>( \tilde{\text{h}} \tilde{\text{t}} )</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>tongue</td>
<td>( \text{li}^{\text{a}} )</td>
<td>( \tilde{\text{l}} \tilde{\text{i}} )</td>
<td>( \tilde{\text{h}} \tilde{\text{l}} )</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>daughter</td>
<td>( \text{zo}^{\text{a}} \tilde{\text{p}} \tilde{\text{c}} )</td>
<td>( \text{zõ}^{\text{a}} )</td>
<td>( \tilde{\text{h}} \tilde{\text{z}} \tilde{\text{o}} )</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>skin</td>
<td>( \text{ri}^{\text{a}} \tilde{\text{r}} \tilde{\text{e}} )</td>
<td>( \tilde{\text{h}} \tilde{\text{r}} \tilde{\text{i}} )</td>
<td>( \tilde{\text{h}} \tilde{\text{r}} \tilde{\text{i}} )</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>belly</td>
<td>( \text{lvu}^{\text{a}} / \tilde{\text{r}} \tilde{\text{v}} \tilde{\text{u}} )</td>
<td>( \text{bu}^{\text{a}} )</td>
<td>( \tilde{\text{v}} \tilde{\text{u}} )</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>tail</td>
<td>( \text{rn}^{\text{a}} )</td>
<td>( \tilde{\text{n}} \tilde{\text{a}} \tilde{\text{m}} \tilde{\text{a}} )</td>
<td>( \tilde{\text{n}} \tilde{\text{a}} )</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
As Table 13 displays, preaspiration in Lhagang Choyu either corresponds to an oral preinitial in gYanglagshis (/ɕtye55/ ‘excrement’ and /ɬli55/ ‘tongue’) or zero (/zo13 pɕe55/ ‘daughter’ and /ri13 rɛ33/ ‘skin’) in gYanglagshis. Since Tuanjie has neither preaspiration nor oral preinitials, we can find no sound correspondences for this feature. In addition, a simple initial in Lhagang Choyu corresponds to a complex initial in gYanglagshis. This means that an existence of preaspiration does not always have a corresponding preinitial in gYanglagshis. Preaspiration in Lhagang Choyu also appears in Tibetic loans, many of which are not shared with gYanglagshis.

Examples of nasal preinitials (including prenasalisation) are as follows:

Table. 14 — Correspondence of nasal preinitials in Lhagang Choyu

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Meaning</th>
<th>gYanglagshis</th>
<th>Tuanjie</th>
<th>Lhagang Choyu</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>food</td>
<td>mdẙ</td>
<td>dŭ</td>
<td>-du</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>meat</td>
<td>tho̊</td>
<td>thō̊</td>
<td>-t̥o</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>salt</td>
<td>tchi̊</td>
<td>tshi̊</td>
<td>-t̥c̥i</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>goat</td>
<td>tshe̊</td>
<td>tshe̊</td>
<td>-ts̥a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>horn</td>
<td>tši̊mb̊e̊</td>
<td>z̥å t̥o̊ (TL)</td>
<td>-t̥f̥a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>rice</td>
<td>mdzi̊ (TL)</td>
<td>ndzi̊ (TL)</td>
<td>-d̥a (TL)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>listen</td>
<td>yůln̊ (TL)</td>
<td>k̥ån̊ů</td>
<td>ōne</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Most examples with a nasal preinitial do not have any common sound correspondences among the three varieties. However, looking at the form of the main initial, each example is probably in a cognate relationship except for /z̥å t̥o̊/ ‘horn’ in Tuanjie, which is of a Tibetic origin, as well as /k̥ån̊ů/ ‘listen’ in Tuanjie. Prenasalisation does exist in Choyu varieties; however, as far as the data shows, most examples are Tibetic loans. Native forms with prenasalisation, unfortunately, lack Lhagang Choyu counterparts.

Examples of oral preinitials are as follows:

Table. 15 — Correspondence of oral preinitials in Lhagang Choyu

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Meaning</th>
<th>gYanglagshis</th>
<th>Tuanjie</th>
<th>Lhagang Choyu</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>white</td>
<td>ptʃho̊</td>
<td>tʃhə̊</td>
<td>-t̥o̊v̊'t̥o̊v̊</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>full</td>
<td>ps̆e̊</td>
<td>lo̊så</td>
<td>'t̥o̊sů</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>thin</td>
<td>pe̊i̊</td>
<td>ʃẙ ʃẙ</td>
<td>ŋ̥fi̊ ŋ̥fi̊</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>hungry</td>
<td>t̥ə̊ bze̊</td>
<td>zẙ ə̊</td>
<td>ŋ̥zi̊</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>horse</td>
<td>bre̊</td>
<td>gi̊</td>
<td>ŋ̥re̊</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

For oral preinitials, we have only found sound correspondences among labials. Since Tuanjie lacks this series of preinitials, we can confirm an existence of sound correspondence of Lhagang Choyu.
forms with gYanglagshis. The data of gYanglagshis suggest that various preinitials of Lhagang Choyu can be analysed as a single neutralised preinitial; however, it should be confirmed after a clarification of verbal morphology in Lhagang Choyu which might have a /¬-/ prefix pronounced [¬] as in the word /’tsɔ-su/ ‘full’.

Examples of velarised rhymes are as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Meaning</th>
<th>gYanglagshis</th>
<th>Tuanjie</th>
<th>Lhagang Choyu</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>milk</td>
<td>ŋi-neⁿ</td>
<td>νu-tɛhiⁿ</td>
<td>¬neⁿ</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>long</td>
<td>qa² ʂsiⁿ</td>
<td>seⁿ  seⁿ</td>
<td>¬seⁿ  seⁿ</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>wet</td>
<td>tsnuⁿ  tsuⁿ</td>
<td>tseⁿ  tseⁿ</td>
<td>¬tsaⁿ  tsaⁿ</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>nail (finger)</td>
<td>ʂtseⁿ  čiⁿ</td>
<td>leⁿ  tʃaⁿ</td>
<td>¬tʃaⁿ</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>seed</td>
<td>rluⁿ</td>
<td>leⁿ</td>
<td>¬ռluⁿ</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>blood</td>
<td>siⁿ</td>
<td>saiⁿ</td>
<td>¬səⁿ</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

There seems to be no regularity regarding how a velarised rhyme corresponds to the same words in Choyu varieties. It remains to be discussed whether velarisation in Lhagang Choyu is an independent innovation or a retention. However, looking at Tibetic loans in Lhagang Choyu, we can find that the language has velarised vowels as a sound correspondence of LT final consonants. This fact suggests that velarisation is a reflex of finals from archaic loan words.

Examples of labialised rhymes are as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Meaning</th>
<th>gYanglagshis</th>
<th>Tuanjie</th>
<th>Lhagang Choyu</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>rain</td>
<td>xiⁿ</td>
<td>xuⁿ</td>
<td>h-i</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>father</td>
<td>pseⁿ</td>
<td>aⁿ phaⁿ</td>
<td>s-e</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>five</td>
<td>ŋuaⁿ</td>
<td>ŋuaⁿ tɛaⁿ</td>
<td>ŋ-а</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>silver</td>
<td>ŋeⁿ</td>
<td>ŋuiⁿ</td>
<td>¬ŋ-а</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Based on the examples in Table 17, labialised vowels correspond to a rounded vowel (/xuⁿ/ ‘rain’ in Tuanjie, /ŋuaⁿ tɛaⁿ/ ‘five’ in Tuanjie, /ŋuaⁿ/ ‘five’ in gYanglagshis and /ŋuiⁿ/ ‘silver’ in Tuanjie) and a labial preinitial (/pseⁿ/ ‘father’ in gYanglagshis). In Lhagang Choyu, /¬ŋ-a/ ‘five’ and /¬ŋ-а/ ‘silver’ form a minimal pair with or without preaspiration; however, ‘five’ and ‘silver’ do not form minimal pairs in gYanglagshis and Tuanjie. It is beyond the scope of this paper to investigate this feature.

19 The first author’s research in Litang County has revealed that a simplification of preinitials is also attested in Rongpa Choyu and Lhayul Choyu among the younger generation.
Finally, we will make some observations regarding Tibetic loans. Examples of Tibetic loans are as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Meaning</th>
<th>gYanglagshis</th>
<th>Tuanjie</th>
<th>Lhagang Choyu</th>
<th>Literary Tibetan</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>fox</td>
<td>pu-a</td>
<td>wa (TL)</td>
<td>'ya (TL)</td>
<td>wa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>gold</td>
<td>ŋa</td>
<td>ŋe</td>
<td>sava (TL)</td>
<td>gser</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>tiger</td>
<td>sta (TL)</td>
<td>ta (TL)</td>
<td>'ta (TL)</td>
<td>stag</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>chicken</td>
<td>rdza-bza (TL)</td>
<td>za (TL)</td>
<td>ka (TL)</td>
<td>bya</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>rabbit</td>
<td>li</td>
<td>zi ko (TL)</td>
<td>ro yo (TL)</td>
<td>ri bong</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>old [thing]</td>
<td>nu pe</td>
<td>ne pi (TL)</td>
<td>'n-ri-be (TL)</td>
<td>rnying ba</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>rice</td>
<td>mdje (TL)</td>
<td>ndze (TL)</td>
<td>'d-a (TL)</td>
<td>'bras</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tibetan</td>
<td>pe ri (TL)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>po pe (TL)</td>
<td>bod rigs/ bod pa</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Many Tibetic loans are not shared within the three varieties. For the examples /ptʃa/ ‘fox’ in gYanglagshis, ‘gold’ (/ŋ̊e/ in gYanglagshis and /ŋ̊o/ in Tuanjie) and /li/ ‘rabbit’ in gYanglagshis we can only find a Choyu word. The example ‘Tibetan’ has different lexical correspondences: /pe 55 ri55/ in gYanglagshis comes from LT bod rigs ‘Tibetan nationality’; and /’po pe/ in Lhagang Choyu comes from LT bod pa ‘Tibetan people’. We can claim that the variation of loan forms displayed in Table 18 reflects the historical process of lexical borrowing. Interestingly, the forms for ‘fox’ reveal different paths from which the forms descend. Lhagang Choyu borrowed /’ya/ ‘fox’ from Minyag Rabgang Khams, whereas Tuanjie borrowed /wa/ ‘fox’ from Nyagchu Khams; both based on the pronunciation of neighboring varieties of Khams. The example ‘chicken’ might reflect a temporal difference in borrowing. The gYanglagshis form /rdza-bza/ appears to be the most archaic, and Lhagang Choyu form /’ka/ appears the most recent. Evidence for this comes from the surrounding Tibetic varieties (such as Nyagrong, Lithang, Nyagchu, Lhagang, etc.) that have quite similar forms, e.g., /’ka/ (Khams) and /’ka/ (Amdo). The examples /’sava/ ‘gold’ and /’ta/ ‘tiger’ in Lhagang Choyu seem to maintain the consonant final of the Tibetic forms as a velarised vowel. The example /’d-a/ ‘rice’ in Lhagang Choyu is a relatively old loan, maintaining the labial preinitial for LT ‘br’ as well as a LT rhyme –as. The loan in Lhagang Choyu /’n-ri-be/ ‘old’ is also old, in which one can find a regular sound change LT a > /e/ or /i/, as in the second

---

21 The velarised feature and ‘rhotic’ feature may also be connected due to the similarity of an acoustic feature that F3 can fall down as suggested by several research results (Ladefoged 2006; Suzuki 2011, 2013).
syllable of /ˊpo pe/ ‘Tibetan’.

5.3 Recapitulation and remarks

Typological remarks regarding the phonology will be recapitulated as follows. From a quantitative viewpoint, the number of complex initials in Lhagang Choyu is different from any dialect of Choyu: less than gYanglagshis and more than Tuanjie. From a qualitative viewpoint, Lhagang Choyu and Rongpa are relatively close to each other, although differences exist. For example, in Lhagang Choyu the retroflex obstruent series are plosives, but in Choyu dialects they are affricates. In Lhagang Choyu and Tuanjie glottal sounds are phonemic, but they are not phonemic in gYanglashis and Rongpa. The existence of uvular nasals is a characteristic feature of Lhagang Choyu, which certainly forms a contrast with velar nasals, as displayed in 3.2.1. The word forms in 3.2.1 are not considered as loans. Hence, uvular nasals may be a native feature of Lhagang Choyu. In addition, it is noteworthy that all the varieties of Lhagang Choyu and Choyu do not have an aspiration contrast in fricatives despite its general existence in Khams Tibetan varieties overlapping with the Lhagang Choyu and the Choyu-linguistic area (see sKal-bzang ʻGyur-med 1985 for mBathang, Häsl 1999 for Derge, and Suzuki and Sonam Wangmo 2015 for Lhagang Village). As for the complex initial series, the emergence of preaspiration in Lhagang Choyu implies a simplification of complex initials. However, the Tuanjie dialect is different from other Choyu varieties in its lack of complex initials. Across the Choyu dialects (including Lhagang Choyu) simple vowels have less variation than consonants. It is reasonable to postulate that Lhagang Choyu’s various secondary articulations for vowels correspond to the final consonants and diphthongs in Choyu dialects.

A preliminary lexical comparison between Lhagang Choyu, gYanglagshis and Tuanjie revealed the following features:

1. the existence of sound correspondences of postalveolars and uvulars between Lhagang Choyu and Choyu;
2. the relationship between preaspiration in Lhagang Choyu and oral preinitials in gYanglagshis;
3. an unclear relationship between prenasalisation of Lhagang Choyu and Choyu;
4. a clear relationship between labial preinitials in Lhagang Choyu and gYanglagshis; and
5. a clear sound correspondence of labialised vowels in Lhagang

---

22 One can also compare the cases of Minyag (Huang 1991) and Chengzhang Tibetan (Ye-shes 'Od-gsal A-tshogs 2008) as neighboring languages as well as a general discussion regarding uvulars in Tibeto-Burman (Huang 2012).
Choyu with a high rounded vowel /u/ in gYanglagshis and Tuanjie and with a labial preinitial /p/ in gYanglagshis.

The three varieties have Tibetic loans; however, their word forms suggest that their respective borrowing pathways might be different.

In sum, we can reasonably postulate that Tuanjie Choyu has a typologically independent position among Lhagang Choyu and Choyu varieties in terms of sound structure, which is simpler than gYanglagshis Choyu and Lhagang Choyu. Lhagang Choyu is more similar to gYanglagshis Choyu in terms of consonants correspondences. For lexical forms, Lhagang Choyu shares a number of cognates with Choyu; among the present data, we can find more examples which show sound correspondences between Lhagang Choyu and gYanglagshis than between Lhagang Choyu and Tuanjie. However, since lexical variation within Choyu has been unclear so far, we need data from more varieties of Choyu before firm conclusions can be made.

6. Conclusion

This article attempts to provide a rough sketch of the phonology of Lhagang Choyu based merely on about 700 words that the authors collected. An analysis of the phonology has revealed the following phenomena worth noting: the existence of uvular articulation, no aspiration contrast with fricatives, the existence of velarised and labialised vowels, and a word-tone system consisting of two tones (high and low), and stress as a distinctive feature.

A preliminary comparative analysis between Lhagang Choyu and Choyu dialects reveals that Lhagang Choyu is more similar to varieties spoken in Nyagrong and Lithang. Despite the geographical vicinity, it has quite a number of different features from the Tuanjie dialect. The Tuanjie dialect, spoken in the nearest area to the place where Lhagang Choyu is spoken, is typologically different from Lhagang Choyu, and even from other Choyu dialects.

The number of collected words is insufficient to describe in detail the sound structure of Lhagang Choyu due to its relatively complicated sound structure, which is similar to Choyu dialects described in Wang (1991) and Nishida (2008). In order to investigate the history and relationship between Lhagang Choyu and Choyu in more detail, it is necessary for more lexical items and texts from Lhagang Choyu and other Choyu dialects to be collected and analysed.
Acknowledgements

Our thanks go to Lhagang Choyu speakers living in Tagong Village, especially to nChimed Lhamo ['Chi-med lHa-mo], who drew out her knowledge of Lhagang Choyu from her memory to teach it to us. We are also grateful to Tshekho [Tshe-kho], the second author’s mother, Yongzong Lhamo [gYang-'dzom lHa-mo], and Gelag [dGe-lags], who helped us look for speakers of Lhagang Choyu living in Tagong Village. We are grateful to Jesse Gates for his great endeavour for improving the article and editing the English. However, the authors take full responsibility for any shortcomings in this article.

Appendix

Lhagang Choyu word list in an alphabetical order of the English entry

N.B. Following abbreviations are used as necessary: (pl): plural; (sg): singular; (v): verb. We do not include grammatical information about the verbs (e.g., person indexation, TAM, egophoric evidentiality, etc.), due to insufficient data for giving us a clear understanding of the verbal system. Some supplementary words are added in square brackets to specify a given meaning. Most verbs appear with a directional prefix. Literary Tibetan (LT) cognates are shown in italics within square brackets after likely loanwords from Tibetic languages. See Suzuki and Sonam Wangmo (2015, 2016b, 2017) for the word forms of modern dialects spoken around the Lhagang Choyu-spoken area.

- abbot ː kʰa’-bu [LT mkhan po]
- accomplish ː kʰa’ wu
- afternoon ː ɕə tʰa tʰa sə
- agate ː ʰa₂ [LT gzi]
- age ː ʰa
- alcoholic drink ː ʰo; ʰo
- all ː ʰe tʰa tʰa
- alveolum ː ʰo [LT spos shel]
- ant ː ʰo ro / ʰe tʰa pə ro
- arrive ː ʰa [LT mda’]
- ask ː ʰe kʰo ʰa na no
- autumn ː ʰo tʰa tʰa
- axe ː ʰe ri [LT sta re]
- back [body] ː ʰa ʰa te
- back [position] ː ʰa ʰa te
- bad ː ʰa ʰa; ʰa ʰa; ʰo ʰa ʰa; ʰo ʰa ʰa
An outline of the sound system of Lhagang Choyu

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>English</th>
<th>Lhagang Choyu</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>bark</td>
<td>`ʁa·tuw</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>barley</td>
<td>`k·a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>be [copulative]</td>
<td><code>tsa; </code>tsə</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>be afraid</td>
<td>`ʁə·təə</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>be boiled</td>
<td>`kə tʃə; tʃə ʃə to</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>be broken</td>
<td>`tə ce</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>be cooked</td>
<td>`ji to</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>be deaf</td>
<td>`ni pu to ji ma-nə tə</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>be drunk</td>
<td>`tə zə</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>be enough</td>
<td>`tə tʃə</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>be full</td>
<td><code>kə tʃi na </code>tə tʃe; <code>və</code> tə <code>ʔə</code> te te</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>be hot</td>
<td>`ŋə zo tə</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>be hungry</td>
<td>`zi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>be ill</td>
<td><code>ŋə</code> tə</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>be ripe</td>
<td>`mə ji tə</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>be shy</td>
<td><code>k·a k·a; </code>k·a ma ŋə nə</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>be sleepy</td>
<td><code>mo</code> la tu tə; `ʔə mo ma so</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>be thirsty</td>
<td>`ʔə ce tə</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>be tired</td>
<td>`la yə</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>beads</td>
<td>`ʔə tə ve [LT phreng ba]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>bean</td>
<td>`ʔə sa ma [LT sran ma]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>bean flour</td>
<td>`nə</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>bear</td>
<td><code>tə mu [LT dred mong]; </code>wə ra</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>beautiful</td>
<td><code>ʔə tə; </code>ʔə tə bə ʔə</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>bed</td>
<td><code>za</code> tə</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>belly</td>
<td>`və</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>bent</td>
<td>`ɡu gu [LT sgur sgur]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>big; large</td>
<td>`ga pu</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>bitter</td>
<td><code>ʔə</code> nə</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>black</td>
<td><code>nə</code> nə</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>blood</td>
<td>`sə</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>bloom</td>
<td>`tə pe</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>blow [the trumpet]</td>
<td>`pə ta nu</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>blue</td>
<td><code>ʔə</code> ʔə</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>boar</td>
<td>`pə pə [LT pho phag]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>body hair</td>
<td><code>nə; </code>ʔə ra</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>bone</td>
<td>`ʃə rə</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>book</td>
<td>`nə gə</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>boot</td>
<td>`ko tə ʔə zə</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>borrow</td>
<td>`tə ʃe</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>bottle</td>
<td><code>ji to </code>tə`bi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>bottom</td>
<td>`ma la təsə</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>bow (v); worship</td>
<td><code>ʔə la·zo; </code>la·zo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>bowl</td>
<td><code>tə</code>bi</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| box        | `nə bəgə  ```
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Spanish</th>
<th>Tibetan</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>boy</td>
<td>गेि (zi)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>bracelet</td>
<td>¹la ṭɪ (LT klad pa)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>brain</td>
<td>²ni pa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>break [a bowl]</td>
<td>ʰta ce</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>breakfast</td>
<td>ʰq a ts a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>breast</td>
<td>ʰtu; ʰtu te</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>bridge</td>
<td>ʰza ʰbe (LT zam pa)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>bright</td>
<td>¹na nə</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>broom</td>
<td>כיל tea</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>bucket</td>
<td>ʰte ʰu [LT chu zo]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>bullet</td>
<td>ʰde wu (LT mde u)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>butter</td>
<td>ʰma (LT mar)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>butterfly</td>
<td>ʰjuu</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>button</td>
<td>ʰdũ ku (LT sgro)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>buttocks</td>
<td>ʰsũ ʰgu; ʰp o (LT ʰphongs)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>buy</td>
<td>ʰku ku</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>calf</td>
<td>ʰxe ʰzi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>carnivore</td>
<td>ʰte ʰo dze (LT gcan gzan)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>carry on the back</td>
<td>ʰta ku</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>cat</td>
<td>ʰmo zi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>catch cold</td>
<td>ʰte a sə ʰq o zə sə</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>caterpillar fungus</td>
<td>ʰp o ʰt a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>cattle dung</td>
<td>ʰp a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>celebrate the New Year</td>
<td>ʰlo sə ʰca</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>chat</td>
<td>ʰk o ʰda ʰla bi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>cheap</td>
<td>ʰk o ʰga bu</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>cheese</td>
<td>ʰta ra (LT dar ba)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>chew</td>
<td>ʰta ʰjo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>chicken</td>
<td>ʰk ai (LT bya)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>child</td>
<td>ʰɕo ʰe</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>chili</td>
<td>ʰhu ts a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>chin</td>
<td>ʰma ʰk i</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>claw</td>
<td>ʰw a rə</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>clean</td>
<td>ʰtsə me (LT gtsang ma)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>clear</td>
<td>ʰt s mu (LT dwang mo)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>climb a mountain</td>
<td>ʰr o ko ʰrə ʰeə ʰנ o ʰn dze</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>close [the mouth]</td>
<td>ʰp o ʰla ju; ʰp o ʰn dze</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>close [the door]</td>
<td>ʰr o ʰa; ʰrə ʰt a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>cloth</td>
<td>ʰr a (LT ras); ʰra ʰk u (LT ras skud)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>clothing</td>
<td>ʰkə mə; ʰkə mə</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>cloud</td>
<td>ʰt i (LT sprin)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>cock</td>
<td>ʰkai (LT bya)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>cock year</td>
<td>ʰkai (LT bya)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>cold [weather]</td>
<td>ʰə tə p i p i; ʰp o ʰp o</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>collar</td>
<td>ʰkə mə ʰt a ʰv gi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>English</td>
<td>Tibetan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------</td>
<td>---------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>collect [woods]</td>
<td>ˈta sə</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>comb</td>
<td>ˈsə</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>comb (v)</td>
<td>ˈla tə</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>come</td>
<td>ʔə lo; ˈji tu pə</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>cooking stove</td>
<td>ˈtə k-e [LT thab ka]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>copper</td>
<td>ˈzə [LT zangs]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>coral</td>
<td>ˈcu ru; ˈcu ru [LT byu ru]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>corner</td>
<td>ˈzo ɨo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>correct</td>
<td>ˈze tə</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>caught</td>
<td>ˈtsə jo tə</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>cowshed</td>
<td>ˈzo zi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>cross[a bridge]</td>
<td>ˈkə əə</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>crow</td>
<td>ˈke ni ni</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>cushion</td>
<td>ˈkə sa; ɨk de ɨdzə</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>cut off</td>
<td>ˈta qə</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>cut up [vegetable]</td>
<td>ˈla tʃə</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>cut[meat]</td>
<td>ˈta qo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>cypress</td>
<td>ˈcu pa [LT shug pa]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>cypress incense</td>
<td>ˈso [LT bsang]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>dance</td>
<td>ˈlu</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>dance (v)</td>
<td>ˈlu tə; ɨlu-ɨlu</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dartsendo</td>
<td>ˈdu [LT mdo]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>daughter</td>
<td>ˈnəzo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>daughter-in-law</td>
<td>ˈnə ma [LT mna’ ma]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>day after tomorrow</td>
<td>ˈqo se</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>day before yesterday</td>
<td>ˈgə’ la</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>day breaks</td>
<td>ɨmu ʔə so</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>daytime</td>
<td>ˈnə-ɨbe [LT nyin pa]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>deity</td>
<td>ˈje [LT lha]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>dew</td>
<td>ˈzi pa [LT zil pa]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>die</td>
<td>ɨtə si</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>difficult</td>
<td>ɨya’ ya</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>dinner</td>
<td>ˈtee’ wu təa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>dirty</td>
<td>ɨtsə’ ɭtsə’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>dish</td>
<td>ɨdə́ [LT sdir]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>do</td>
<td>ˈla la</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>do not have</td>
<td>ˈma tə tu</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>doctor</td>
<td>ˈmə’-ba [LT sman pa]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>dog</td>
<td>ɭtʃw</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>dog year</td>
<td>ˈteə [LT khyi]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>domestic animal</td>
<td>ɭə́ ɭtə [LT sems can]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>donkey</td>
<td>ˈkə rə</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>door</td>
<td>ʔə</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>downwards</td>
<td>ˈla zu</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>dragon</td>
<td>ˈnə qu [LT ’brug]</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
dragon year ˈnju [LT 'brug]
draw [a picture] ˈkə ʒə
dream ˈla ə me
dream (v) ˈla ə me sə; ə ə ə ə de
drink ˈfiə tə
drop (v) ˈla zə
dry ˈro ə; ə ə ə ro
dry [clothes] ˈla po
eagle ʰə ə ə [LT bya rgod]
ear ə ə; ə ə pu to
earrings ˈlə tu
earth;ground ˈca
earthen jar ˈtə xu
earthquake ˈca ə mu
east ˈca [LT shar]
eat ˈka təə
egg ˈnəgə ŋə [LT sgo nga]; ə ə ə ə go
eight ə ə ə ə [LT brgyad]
elbow ˈtu u ədzo [LT gru mjug]
elder brother ʔə ko; ə zu ə mu ə tu
elder sister ʔə də; ʔə ə ə
easy ə ə ə ə ə [LT sθong pa]
evening ə ə ə ə ə zi
exchange ˈku fiu
excrement ə ə ə ə ə
excuse ə ə ə ə ə
exist [person] ˈyo
exist [thing on a place] ˈko ə ə ə ə ə
expensive ˈkə ə ə ə ə ə
extend ə ə ə ə
eye ə ə ə
eyebrow ə ə ə ə ə
eyelash ə ə ə ə ə
face ə ə ə ə ə ə /
fall asleep ə ə ə ə ə
false ə ə ə ə ə
far ə ə ə ə ə [LT thag ring]
farmer ə ə ə ə ə ə [LT rong pa]
fasten ə ə ə ə ə
fat ə ə ə ə ə ə; ə ə ə ə ə ə
fat oil ə ə ə ə ə
father [address] ʔə pa
father [reference] ə ə ə
female deity ə ə ə ə ə [LT lha]
female mdzo ə ə ə ə ə ə ə [LT mdzo]
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Word</th>
<th>Transcription</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>female yak</td>
<td>ʰɾa; ʰɾَا</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>fetch</td>
<td>ʰkə ku</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>few; little</td>
<td>ʰnɨ nɨ</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>fight</td>
<td>ʰtu tu la ʰvi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>fill</td>
<td>ʰlə ta</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>finger</td>
<td>ʰle nɨ</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>finish; be over</td>
<td>ʰla wu</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>fire</td>
<td>ʰmə; ʰmə</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>fish</td>
<td>ʰnə [LT nya]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>five</td>
<td>ʰnə-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>five [things]</td>
<td>ʰnə- ʰtəo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>flat</td>
<td>ʰtə ʰta</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>flea</td>
<td>ʰlə</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>flour</td>
<td>ʰnɨluɣ ʰə</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>flower</td>
<td>ʰmə to [LT me tog]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>fly (v)</td>
<td>ʰtə ʰde</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>food</td>
<td>ʰdʊ</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>foot</td>
<td>ʰkə; ʰku</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>forehead</td>
<td>ʰtə pe [LT thod pa]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>forget</td>
<td>ʰtə-ʰə</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>fortune</td>
<td>ʰnɨ ʰta [LT rlung rta]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>four</td>
<td>ʰzə; ʰnzə</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>four [things]</td>
<td>ʰzə- ʰtəo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>fox</td>
<td>ʰə</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>fragrant</td>
<td>ʰzə ʰze</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>free (time)</td>
<td>ʰtso ʰtə</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>friend</td>
<td>ʰtə ʰə</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>frog</td>
<td>ʰnɨbe ba [LT shal ba]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>front</td>
<td>ʰnɨ- ʰnɨ ʰqə pu [LT sngon]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>front gate</td>
<td>ʰpə ʰqə pu</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>frost</td>
<td>ʰpə mo [LT ba mo]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>fry</td>
<td>ʰzʊ</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>full</td>
<td>ʰtə-ʰsu</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>garlic</td>
<td>ʰçʊ</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>gate</td>
<td>ʰkə</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>get old</td>
<td>ʰkə ʰtə ʰə</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>get up</td>
<td>ʰə ʰsə; ʰə ʰkə</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ghost; demon</td>
<td>ʰlə ʰdɨ</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ginger</td>
<td>ʰtə ʰgə [LT skya sga]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>girl</td>
<td>ʰnɨ ʰzʊ</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>give</td>
<td>ʰtə ʰtə; ʰtə ʰtə ʰvə</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>give birth</td>
<td>ʰtə</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>glass</td>
<td>ʰç [LT shel]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>glasses</td>
<td>ʰmɨ rə [LT mig rə]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>go out</td>
<td>ʰnə ʰnə ʰlə ʰə</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
go upstairs ʔʰə tə lə; ʔə ɕə
go; leave ɬa ɕə
goat ʔtəə [LT gser]
gold ʔqə ʰəi
granddaughter ʔtəə mu [LT tsha mo]
grandfather ʔə wu
grandmother ʔma ma
grandson ʔtəə wu [LT tsha bo]
grape ɬu
green ʰədzə kəu [LT ljong khu]
grey ʔteə' pə pə
gun ʔʃə da
hair ʔme; ʔqə 个月内
hammer ɬu ʰə tə
Han Chinese ʰə dza [LT rgya]
hand ɬə
handle ɬu
hang [on the wall] ʔə tə lu; ʔə xa lə
happy ʰə'be ʔqə ʰəi; ʰə ɡə [LT dga']
hard; solid ʔqə ʔə
hat ʔa [LT zhwa]
have a fever ʔtəə pə ʰə tə
have a headache ʔqə ʰəo
have; exist ɬəo; ɬəi
he; she; it ʔtəə; ɬi; ʰə dzə
head ʔqə
heart ʔəə mi
heat up [cold rice] ʔko jə
heavy ɬə ʰəə
help ʔko
herbivore ʔə tə
dead ʔtəə ke
hide ʔtə ʰba
high; tall ʔqə əjə; ʔə ʰə bu
highland barley ʔjəi
hit[a person] ɬe ɬu; ɬə tə tu
hold; grasp ʔqə ɬə
horn ʔʧə
horse ʔre
horse food ʔri də
horse year ʔtə; ʔre
hot ʰə dza' ʰə dzə; ʰə ɬu jə
hot pepper ɬu təə
An outline of the sound system of Lhagang Choyu

hot water ˊʒə tʃə
house ˊze; ˊze
how ˊde' pe ro
how many ˊde ta
I ʹŋa; ʹŋa nɔ
ice ʹtə a ro ˇsa
in the past ˇtə ə
incense ˇpu
incorrect ʿma ze tə
inn; hotel ʿra wa
insect; worm ʿpa tʃə
insert; plant ʹpʰa j pʰa j ˇdzu ma
inside ʹnə na; ʹko na; ˇtu gu
intestine ˇdzu ma [LT rgyu ma]
iron ˇteu [LT lcags]
jewel ʹno ʰbu [LT nor bu]
kettle ʿtə xu
key ˇde mi [LT lde mig]
khatak ˇkə te [LT kha btags]
kid ˇtsə a zi
kidney ˇki ma [LT mkhal ma]
kill ˇtə sa
knee ˉŋi
kneel ˉŋi ˇkə su
knife ˇtə zi
knot ʹdəu pa [LT mdud pa]
knot (v) ʹdəu pa ˇkə ra
know ˇtə ˈla ku
know [how to write] ˇtə nə; ˇtə nji
lake ˇtsu [LT mtsho]
lama ˇla me [LT bla ma]
language ˇkə [LT skad]
last night ˇpuu ço
last year ʹji zi; ʹji zi
laugh; smile ˇru ˇru tu tə
lax; loose ˇtə ˇlə
leaf ˇlo ma [LT lo ma]
lean meat ˇtə ˇqa zı
learn ˇkə ze
leave ʾtə pə
left ʾjo [LT g.ʃon]; ʾjo qo ma; ʾpo le
Lhagang ˇla ʰgo [LT lhag sgang]
lick; lap ˇpə ʰdzi
light [weight] ˇjə wu
light (a fire) ʾbə [LT ˈbar]
like this
lion
listen
little
liver
lock
lock [the door]
log
long
long time ago
look
look after
lose [thing]
lotus
louse
love;like
low;short
lower [the head]
lower half-body
lunatic person
lunch
lung
mani stone pile
many; much
matter
mdzo
meal;food
meat
medicine
melt
merchant
middle
milk
milk (v)
milk cow
mirror
mole
monastery
money
monk
monkey
monkey year
month
moon
morning

.texture: contains a collection of English words with their corresponding Chinese (Tibetan) translations.

Lexicon:
- like this: ˇtẽa’ be tẽ
- lion: ˇsẽ gi [LT seng ge]
- listen: ˇne
- little: ˇni ˇni
- liver: ˇze
- lock: ˇtẽa lo
- log: ˇsẽ i ˇkə ru
- long: ˇsẽ i ˇsẽ i
- long time ago: ˇta la · t’a la
- look: ˇkə sə re
- look after: ˇta’ ze
- lose [thing]: ˇma’ ta’ tco
- lotus: ˇpẽ ma · ma to
- louse: ˇcə [LT shig]
- love; like: ˇa ga [LT dga’]
- low; short: ˇa me ˇme [LT dma’ dma’]
- lower [the head]: ˇk-a me [LT khog smad]
- lower half-body: ˇa’ mu
- lunatic person: ˇa gu za [LT dgon zan]
- lunch: ˇa lo wa [LT glo ba]
- mani stone pile: ˇa ts’a
- many; much: ˇqa’ zi
- matter: ˇko’ la ˇla la
- mdzo: ˇwə’ zi
- meal; food: ˇdu
- meat: ˇt’o
- medicine: ˇme
- melt: ˇla · ˇʒu
- merchant: ˇts’o’ba [LT tshong pa]
- middle: ˇtsεi k’u
- milk: ˇne’i
- milk (v): ˇla · tso; ˇtsa’n
- milk cow: ˇh zo’ ma [LT bzhon ma]
- mirror: ˇcə ˇgu [LT shel sgo]
- mole: ˇme wa [LT sme ba]
- monastery: ˇa go’ be [LT dgon pa]
- money: ˇme zi
- monk: ˇa’ pe [LT grwa pa]
- monkey: ˇte [LT spre’u]
- monkey year: ˇti [LT spre’]
- month: ˇli
- moon: ˇda [LT zla ba]
- morning: ˇnĩ’ be [LT nyin pa]
An outline of the sound system of Lhagang Choyu

morning [before the noon]
mother [address]
mother [reference]
mother’s uncle
mountain
mouse
mouse year
moustache
mouth
move [house]
mow
mule
mushroom
mute person
myself
nail
name
narrate
narrow
nasal mucus
navel
near
neck
necklace
need
needle
new
New Year
next year
nine
nine [things]
noodles
north
nose
now
nun
oat
offspring of a bull and a female yak
oil
old [thing]
old [person]
old man
old woman
on [the table] ˉte [LT steng]
one ˉto
one [thing] ˉto’ təo
onion ˉtsə [LT tsong]
open [a cover] ˉho təo; ˇko ’təo
open [a door] ˇka le ’tə tə
outside ˇa əo; ˇka te
over there ˇpə ra
owl ˇyu pa [LT ’ug pa]
ox ˇlə [LT glang]
ox year ˇlə [LT glang]; ’sə ˇtəe [LT sens can]
paper ˇco ku [LT shog bu]
parents ˇs-e mi
paste ˇk-a’ wa ˇqə jo; ˇkə əa la
paternal uncle ˇəa ku [LT a ku]
paternal uncle’s wife ˇa ne [LT a ne]
pea; bean ˇsə ma [LT sran ma]
peaceful ˇzə
peach ˇk-a ’bu [LT kham bu]
peacock ˇma ca [LT rma bya]
peel ˇta k-a
pen ˇæe pi
person ˇmu
pick up ˇtə ˘bu ˘la de
picture ˇrə mu [LT ri mo]
pig ˇve
pig food ˇvə du
pig year ˇpə [LT phag]
piglet ˇpə’ zi
pigsty ˇve ˇtsə
pillar ˇdəzə
pillow ˇq-a’ ko
pitiful ˇma ə pə pe
place ˇca
plairie ˇru
plank ˇæe dəzə
play ˇtei tci ˘la ˘zo
plough ˇle
pony ˇqa zi
poor ˇtəo’ ma
porridge ˇntə tə [LT ’bras thug]
potato ˇja jə
power ˇrə [LT dbang]
press; push down ˇtə tə
price ˇk-o [LT gong]
promise ˊkʰ ˊta le
pull ˋta ·tu ·tʰ o
pull up ˊqʰ a
push ˋta te u
put [soil] on ˋtu pʰ o
quarrel ˋtu tu ˊla
quick; fast ˇh tʰ o’ ˇh tʰ o
rabbit ˊr a y o [LT ri bong]
rabbit year ˊjo [LT yos]
rain ˊh i
rain falls ˊh i ˊtʰ u; ˇm u ˇtʰ
rainbow ˇn dza [LT ‘ja’]
raise [pigs] ˊk o zu
raise [the tail] ˊfi a tse; ˊk o tsʰ
read ˇn a
red ˇñe’ ˇñe; ˇñi’ ˇñi
reincarnated lama ˇt u ku [LT sprul sku]
remember ˇs a’be ˇs o tʰ
resemble ˇn da ˇd a [LT ‘dra ’dra]
return [home] ˇa’ gu ˇeo’ tsʰ
rice ˇd a [LT ’bras]
rich ˇt ee t ee
ride ˊt a ’te a pe
right [hand] ˇt o’ le; ˇñi pa
ring ˇa’ lo; ˇl a tʰ u
ring in a cow’s nose ˇpi t o tʰ u
river ˇʒ a
road ˇri; ˇn dza la [LT rgya lam]
rock ˇl u
roof ˇʔ o ·d e
root ˇr u
rough ˇte a’ te a
round ˇn wʰ a ˇwʰ
run ˇt o jo
saddle ˇt a ˇg a [LT rta sga]
saliva ˇqʰ a ʒ a
salt ˇn tʰ i
salty ˇn tʰ i’ ɲ o tʰ
sand ˇt e a ma [LT bye ma]
saw ˇs o te i
scarf ˇp a re
school ˇe o’ t a
scoop up [water] ˇʔ o te
script ˇn g o’
see ˇɾ u
seed ˉ³lɯŋ
sell ˉ²tei
seven ˉ⁶de [LT bdun]
sew ˇso tee
sew (v) ˇso tee ˇta te
shadow ˇτə na [LT grib nag]
shake [head] ˇτa hu; ˇhu hu
sheath ˇτə zi ˇku ta
sheep ˇlu [LT lug]
sheep year ˇlu [LT lug]
sheepfold ˇlu qa ta
shit ˇqə ˇsa
shoe ˇzi; ˇzi
shoot ˇtəo da ˇkə ra
short ˇtsə tsə; ˇtsə tso
shoulder ˇτa pe [LT phrag pa]
show ˇkə sa re
Sichuan pepper ˉ⁶ja ma [LT g.yer ma]
sickle ˉ⁶ʃə
silver ˉ⁶ʃə
silverweed ˇə
sit; stay ˇta tu; ˇla tso
six ˇtu [LT drug]
six [things] ˇtu təo
skin ˇri; ˇlo
sky ˇmu
sleep ˇkə za; ˇkə zê
sleeve ˇpɯ le
slim ˉtə ˇma ˇrə tə; ˉtə ˇma ˇrə təi
slow ˇta ta
small ˇza za
smell ˇta nu; ˇka ra ˇlo no
smoke ˇkə
smoke (v) ˇkə ˇji te
smooth ˇpa ˇna
snake ˇpə re
snake year ˉ⁶du [LT sbrul]
nap ˇta po ˇta ce
snore ˉ⁷ni xo ˇkə ra
snow ˉkə [LT kha ba]
sniff ˇna te
soft ˇvə ˇso
soil ˇsa
soldier ˉ⁷ma mi [LT dmag mi]
son ˇzi
An outline of the sound system of Lhagang Choyu

son-in-law ːpə to
song ːla jo; ːŋlu [LT glu]
south ːJo [LT lho]
sour ːte-a’ ʔtə-
sow ːwa’ ʔqə
speech ːteə ’ka ʔtə-
spicy; hot ːza’ ʔza; ːno ʔzo ʔtə
spit ːtə ʔla ʔtə-
spleen ːtsə ’pa [LT mtshər pa]
spoon ːta’ po
spring ːci’ ta ʔa
sputum ːtə
square ʔʒə ʔtə-
stable ʔre qa ʔa
stairs ʔji’ ki
stand up ʔə ko
star ʔka ma [LT skar ma]
statue of Buddha ʔsa’ ku [LT sangs sku]
steal ʔta ku kə
steam (v) ʔqə qa
steamed bun ʔka’ wa
steelyard ʔnə dza me [LT rgya ma]
stomach ʔvu
stone ʔlu
stool ʔtsu’ ʔa
story ʔqə ’pi [LT kha dpe]
straight ʔto mu [LT drang mo]
street ʔnə dza la [LT rgya lam]
stūpa ʔnə te’a te [LT mchod rtə]
sugar ʔjə
suckle ʔnu nu ʔtə-
summer ʔnə ja’ ta ʔa
sun ʔmi tsi
surroundings ʔkə ra ’la vi
sūtra ʔtə [LT chos]
swear; vow ʔtə ʔnu
sweat ʔnə ʔə
sweep ʔə’ gu la ’kə la le
sweet ʔnə ʔbə [LT mngar po]; ʔnu’ nu
table ʔteo’ tse [LT cog tse]
tail ʔnə
talk ʔkə’də ’la bi
take ʔə tə ’wo ’ta’ ko
take with ʔə ’həo
taste ʔə ze la ʔzo
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>English Word</th>
<th>Tibetan Pronunciation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>tea</td>
<td>'te a [LT ja]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>teach</td>
<td>'ko ze</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>teacher</td>
<td>'a ge [LT dge rga]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>tear</td>
<td>'ne' ʒa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>tear up</td>
<td>'ta ʂa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>tell</td>
<td>'nao</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ten</td>
<td>'teu [LT bcu]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ten [things]</td>
<td>'teu' ʰo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>tent</td>
<td>'ra ko [LT ras gur]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>that</td>
<td>'tu ku</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>that [over yonder]</td>
<td>'p a ɾa; ʔa ʋa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>there</td>
<td>'tu ku</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>these</td>
<td>'ʔa teo re</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>they</td>
<td>'ze ʰdza; 'dza ʰtsa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>thick</td>
<td>'Je' ʃe</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>thief</td>
<td>'nku ma [LT rku ma]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>thigh</td>
<td>'nla [LT brla]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>thin</td>
<td>'tʃa ʰta, 'ʃi ʰʃi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>thin [in diametre]</td>
<td>'tʃa' ʰtʃa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>thing</td>
<td>'te a ka</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>think</td>
<td>'tse' ʃə</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>this</td>
<td>'ʔa teo; ʔa tei</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>this year</td>
<td>'puu ʒi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>thorn</td>
<td>'tʃa [LT tʃer ma]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>thread</td>
<td>'tʃa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>three</td>
<td>'ʃo; 'ʃo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>three [things]</td>
<td>'ʃo' ʰʃo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>three days later</td>
<td>'qo ti</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>three days ago</td>
<td>'g a la ʰg a la</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>throat</td>
<td>'ʔo ɾi [LT o mdud]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>thumb</td>
<td>'t e mo ʰdza ʰbu [LT mthe mo rgyal po]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>thunder</td>
<td>'qu [LT 'brug]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>thunder (v)</td>
<td>'qu 'tə' ʃo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tibetan</td>
<td>'po pe [LT bod pa]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>tiger</td>
<td>'tə [LT stag]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>tiger year</td>
<td>'tə [LT stag]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>tight</td>
<td>'tə'bu [LT dam po]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>time</td>
<td>'teu ɾi ʃo [LT chu tshod]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>tip</td>
<td>'qo' ʃa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>tobacco</td>
<td>'k u</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>today</td>
<td>'pu ɾa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>together</td>
<td>'nə ʰbu ɾa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>toilets</td>
<td>'ʃo kɔ [LT chab khang]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>tomorrow</td>
<td>'ʔa se</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>tomorrow night</td>
<td>'ʃa' ʃe</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
tongue
tonight
tooth
touch
tread
tree
trousers
true
tsampa
turn over
turn over [thing]
turquoise
twelve animal years
twenty
twig fence	wins
twist
two
two [things]
two of them
two of us
two of you
ugly
uncover
under [the table]
understand
unseam [clothing]
upper half-body
upwards
urine
village
voice
vomit
vulture
waist
wait
wake up
wall
walnut
warm oneself [by a fire]
wash [clothes]
water
water spring
we
wear [clothes] ˉta ke; ˉta ke
wear [ring] ʰa qə le
weave [basket] ˉnə u ʰə
dep
weave [hair] ʰa ʰə
weep ʰə tə
weigh [food] ʰə kə
west ʰə [LT nub]
wet ʰə tə ʰə tə
what ʰə de; ʰə da
wheat ʰə lu
when ʰə de tə
where ʰə la ka
whip ʰə tə
white ʰə tə vi ʰə vi
who ʰə
wind ʰə lo ʰə ka
window ʰə lu
winter ʰə ge ʰə ta ʰə a
wipe ʰə ta ʰə a
wolf ʰə go ʰə ra; ʰə go ʰə tə
wood ʰə
wooden bowl ʰə a ʰə; ʰə a ʰə
wool ʰə zu
work ʰə la [LT las ka]
work (v) ʰə la ʰə la; ʰə la lo
wound ʰə mi
woven hair ʰə tə ʰə dzə
write ʰə ʰə ʰə
yak ʰə ʰə
yak hair tent ʰə wa [LT sbrə]
yawn ʰə ha la ʰə tu tə
year ʰə a; ʰə ʰə
year before last ʰə ti ʰə zi
year after next ʰə ʰə se
yellow ʰə ʰə
yesterday ʰə ji ʰə; ʰə ji ʰə
yoghurt ʰə [LT zho]
you (sg) ʰə
you (pl) ʰə tə re; ʰə tə
young ʰə ʰə ʰə za za
younger brother ʰə me ʰə bu; ʰə ma ʰə tə
younger sister ʰə se ʰə [LT sring mo]
Bibliography

Caplow, Nancy J.

Dai, Qingxia, Bufan Huang, Ailan Fu, Rig-'dzin dBang-mo, and Juhuang Liu

Dawa Drolma and Hiroyuki Suzuki

Häslér, Katrin Louise
*A grammar of the Tibetan Dege (Sde dge) dialect*, München, Selbstverlag, 1999.

Hoshi, Izumi
*Gendai Tibettogo Doosi Ziten (Lhasa hoogen)*, Fuchu, Research Institute for the Languages and Cultures of Asia and Africa, 2003.

Hoshi, Michiyo

Huang, Bufan

Huang, Bufan (ed)

Ikeda, Takumi
“Seinan Tyuugoku Sensei minzoku sooroo tiiki no gengo bunpu:

sKal bzang’Gyur med

Kitamura, Hajime
Tibetan (Lhasa dialect), Tokyo, Research Institute for Languages and Cultures of Asia and Africa, 1977.

Ladefoged, Peter

Litang Xianzhi Bianzuan Weiyuanhui
Litang Xianzhi, Chengdu, Sichuan Renmin Chubanshe, 1996.

Lu, Shaozun

de Nebesky-Wojkowitz, René

Nishida, Fuminobu

Ōno, Susumu, and Takesi Sibata (eds.)

Nagano, Yasuhiko and Marielle Prins (eds.)

Rig ’dzin bsTan srung
Mi ngag gi lo rgyus deb ther ljung gu, Lan gru, Kan su’u rig gnas dpe skrun khang, 2015.

Roche, Gerald and Hiroyuki Suzuki
An outline of the sound system of Lhagang Choyu


Schneider, Nicola

Shirai, Satoko, Keita Kurabe, Kazue Iwasa, Hiroyuki Suzuki, and Shihoko Ebihara

Sichuansheng Kangding Xianzhi Bianzuan Weiyuanhui ed.
Kangding Xianzhi, Chengdu, Sichuan Cishu Chubanshe, 1995.

Song, Lingli

Sun, Hongkai

Sun, Hongkai ed.

Suzuki, Hiroyuki
— “Kamutibettogo Kangding-Xinduqiao [Rangakha] hoogen no onsei bunseki”, Asian and African Languages and Linguistics


— Dongfang Zangqu Zhuyuyan Yanjiu, Chengdu, Sichuan Minzu Chubanshe, 2015.


Suzuki, Hiroyuki and Sonam Wangmo


— “Geolinguistic approach to the route of Tibetic loanwords in Lhagang Choyu”, Hiroyuki Suzuki and Mitsuaki Endo eds. Papers from the Fourth International Conference of Asian Geolinguistics, Fuchu, Research Institute for Languages and Cultures of Asia and Africa, 2018 (in press)
An outline of the sound system of Lhagang Choyu

Tan, Gillian G.

Timberlake, Alan

Tournadre, Nicolas

Wang, Tianxi.
“Queyuyu”, In Dai et al., pp. 46-63.

Yang, Jiaming

Ye-shes ’Od-gsal A-tshogs

Zhang, Jichuan

Zhu, Xiaonong
Yuyinxue, Beijing, Shangwu Yinshuguan, 2010.
**Tibetan Studies and the Art of Dialogue**

Sarah H. Jacoby  
(Northwestern University)

What follows is the author’s keynote address spoken on June 19, 2016 to the International Association of Tibetan Studies Meeting in Bergen, Norway. The address begins with general reflections on dialogue, moves into an analysis of dialogue in the specific Tibetan context of the writings of the early twentieth Tibetan visionary Sera Khandro Dewé Dorjé (Se ra mkhā’ ’gro bde ba’i rdo rje), and concludes with a set of questions for reflecting on the value of dialogue for Tibetologists gathering at conferences such as the International Association of Tibetan Studies.

1. On Dialogue

“Dialogue” is an old word in English, in use by the thirteenth century to mean a conversation carried on between two or more people, or a literary work in which such conversation takes place.\(^1\) It derives from even older words in Latin (*dialogus*) and Greek (*διάλογος*), with broad resonances and applications ranging from ancient literary genres for philosophical exploration to modern strategies for peace building and business success. Perhaps the most famous author of dialogue in the Western world was Plato, who was, in the words of his ancient Greek biographer Diogenes Laertius “the writer of dialogues.”\(^2\) Millennia after this, the early moderns also sometimes used dialogue as a literary genre for presenting scientific explorations, such as Galileo Galilei’s seventeenth-century *Dialogue Concerning the*  

---

\(^*\) I would like to thank the program committee for the 14th International Association of Tibetan Studies Meeting held in Bergen, Norway, and in particular Dr. Hanna Havnevik of the University of Oslo for inviting me to present this keynote, which was a great honor. Thanks also to Karma Ngodup of the University of Chicago, with whom I had productive dialogues about the Tibetan translations included here.


---

Two Chief World Systems, in which he defended the Copernican theory that the earth revolved around the sun.3

Beyond the many European works written in dialogue genres, in the past century there has also been an explosion of analysis about dialogue, particularly in the context of literary studies. One cannot think very long about dialogue without encountering the Russian philosopher and literary theorist Mikhail Bakhtin (1895-1975). Bakhtin’s central interest was in the novel, a prose form he heralded for its “dialogic” nature. A great novelist, exemplified for Bakhtin by Fyodor Dostoevsky (1821-1881), is one who interweaves his narration with the languages of his protagonists, producing a polyphonic or multivoiced text. Bakhtin contrasted this to other literary forms such as lyrical poetry, which he presented as “monologic,” or tending toward a single, authoritative voice. By “dialogic” Bakhtin did not refer only to actual instances of dialogue in the novel, but to a quality of the word itself, which according to him is “entangled, shot through with shared thoughts, points of view, alien value judgments and accents.”4 Slavic literary scholar Michael Holquist explains that for Bakhtin “a dialogue is composed of an utterance, a reply, and a relation between the two. It is the relation that is most important of the three, for without it the other two would have no meaning.”5 This relation of an utterance and its reply is what situates language and its individual users in a broader social field. The language that we use does not belong to us as individuals, but comes to our tongues already flavored with the tastes ascribed to it by previous users. As such, according to Bakhtin:

The word in language is half someone else’s. It becomes “one’s own” only when the speaker populates it with his own intention, his own accent, when he appropriates the word, adapting it to his own semantic and expressive intention.6

Hence, for Bakhtin, the self is inconceivable as an independent entity, but rather only comes into being as an active participant in social dialogue.

---

3 Of course, this didn’t work out as well for Galileo as dialogue had for Plato, given that he was tried by the Inquisition, convicted of heresy, and forced to spend the rest of his life under house arrest.


5 Michael Holquist, Dialogism: Bakhtin and his world (New York: Routledge, 1990), 38.

Bakhtin’s writings on the dialogic nature of language demonstrate considerable influence from another prominent twentieth-century thinker, the Austrian-born Israeli philosopher Martin Buber (1878-1965). In his most influential work *I and Thou* (1923), Buber contrasts the direct, mutual, present, open, and dialogical relationship between oneself and another, the “I and Thou,” with the indirect, nonmutual, instrumental, and monological relationship between “I and It,” or subject and object. For Buber, human life finds its meaningfulness in relation to others; we understand ourselves “in the making present of another self and in the knowledge that one is made present in his own self by the other.” Dialogue is crucial to the encounter between “I” and “Thou,” but not all that passes for dialogue is genuine dialogue. In his 1929 essay on “Dialogue” Buber distinguishes between three kinds of dialogue: the first is “genuine dialogue” in which “each of the participants really has in mind the other or others in their present and particular being and turns to them with the intention of establishing a living mutual relation between himself and them.” The second is “technical dialogue,” a feature of “modern existence” according to Buber that is “prompted solely by the need of objective understanding.” The third type of dialogue is monologue disguised as dialogue. There are many varieties of this specter of dialogue—debate intended to strike another sharply without, in Buber’s words, “the men that are spoken to being regarded in any way present as persons;” or conversations “characterized by the need neither to communicate something, nor to learn something, nor to influence someone, nor to come into connection with someone, but solely by the desire to have one’s own self-reliance confirmed...” Dialogue for Buber isn’t just an open-hearted conversation between two people; by dialogue he refers to a broader relationality between persons and phenomena in the world, extending the “Thou” of the “I and Thou” relationship beyond the human. My favorite quotation from Buber expresses this beautifully:

To all unprejudiced reflection it is clear that all art is from its origin essentially of the nature of dialogue. All music calls to an ear not the musician’s own, all sculpture to an eye not the sculptor’s, architecture in addition calls to the step as it walks in the building.9

---

In the 21st century, dialogue appears pervasively as a panacea for the ills of the world. Some of these instances are quite profound. For example, the Pakistani activist Malala Yousafzai has said: “The best way to solve problems and to fight against war is through dialogue.”\(^{10}\) The context for these words is finding a peaceful resolution to conflicts with the Taliban, spoken in 2013 during her first major interview since she was attacked for championing girls’ rights to education in Pakistan.

In a considerably less profound vein, dialogue is also popular corporate-speak, at least in the United States now.\(^{11}\) Many people seem to be making a lot of money by positioning themselves as experts in training corporate managers and employees in effective dialogue techniques, therefore operationalizing dialogue as a tool for business management.\(^{12}\) And in this era of the corporatization of mindfulness, we should not be surprised to find Buddhist-derived mindfulness practices for sale along with dialogue.\(^{13}\)

### 2. Dialogue in Tibetan and in the writings of Sera Khandro

Moving on to thinking about the Tibetan cultural world, dialogue has roots as old as those in Europe not only as a textual genre but also as a literary device and as a feature of oral language arts. In the early

---


\(^{12}\) For one of many examples, see the website of Dialogos, a management consulting and leadership development firm, that describes its principle as follows: “Our principals originated many of the central techniques commonly found in successful business and consulting practices, including organizational learning, dialogue, and dialogic process consultation.” ([https://dialogos.com/about/our-heritage/](https://dialogos.com/about/our-heritage/)), accessed Sept. 24, 2018.

Indian Buddhist world as in classical Greece, dialogue was an important literary genre and oral technique for philosophical analysis. This is evident in the dialogic form of Buddhist sūtras; the Buddha’s wisdom is not abstracted but rather spoken to another in a particular time and place. In Tibet the dialogic nature of philosophical inquiry is clearly demonstrated in the form of debate found most often in Geluk (Dge lugs) monasteries. Beyond philosophy, dialogue is a Tibetan literary genre in the form of the large body of Tibetan religious works categorized as dris lan (replies to questions), alternatively called zhus lan. And, of course dialogue is not only a Tibetan textual category, but also has rich oral resonances in Tibetan ranging from various types of call and response songs to comedy.

Fig. 1 Sera Khandro statue on shrine at Getsé Tralek Monastery (Dge rtse bkra legs) in Kandzé (Dkar mdzes) Tibetan Autonomous Prefecture, Photograph by Sarah Jacoby, 2007.

14 Dris lan as a genre remains understudied in comparison to other Tibetan genres of writing; this has been noted by Jim Rheingans, “Introduction. Typologies in Tibetan Literature: Genre or Text Type? Reflections on Previous Approaches and Future Perspectives,” in Tibetan Literary Genres, Texts, and Text Types: From Genre Classification to Transformation (Leiden: Brill, 2015), 3.
Surely there are many other oral and written Tibetan dialogical genres beyond those I’ve just mentioned, but now I would like to say more about dialogue in a Tibetan autobiography, that of the early twentieth-century Tibetan visionary Sera Khandro (1892-1940). Out of all the features that render Sera Khandro’s writing exceptional, the quality I find most compelling is its dialogic nature, or to use another of Bakhtin’s terms, the polyphonic nature of her writing. Bakhtin describes polyphonic prose as that in which “the ‘depicting’ authorial language now lies on the same plane as the ‘depicted’ language of the hero, and may enter into dialogic relations and hybrid combinations with it.” In other words, multiple speakers hold court, at times talking louder than the narrator’s own voice, serving not as mimes for her singular authorial intentions but actively intercepting the narrative flow, pushing and pulling the story of her life in their own directions. Sera Khandro’s autobiography is polyphonic in the sense that it is comprised of many different voices ranging from bodhisattvas, dakinis, local deities, demonic forces, animals, religious teachers, relatives, and neighbors. These voices are not entirely separate from Sera Khandro, who after all is inciting them to speak as the author of her text, nor are they identical to her—for as Bakhtin wrote, language “lies on the borderline between oneself and the other.” But of course we don’t have to invoke Bakhtin to think about the ways in which Sera Khandro frames a thoroughly intersubjective account of herself, in particular one that is shot through with invectives and succor from

---

15 By Sera Khandro’s autobiography, I am referring in this essay to the long autobiography she completed circa 1934. Titled Dbus mo bde ba’i rdo rje’i rnam par thar pa nges ’byung ’dren pa’i shing rta skal ldan dam pa’i mchod sdong, this 400-plus folio work remained in unpublished manuscript form until it was first published by the same title in 2009. All quotations in this essay are drawn from this edition. It is noteworthy that Sera Khandro’s long autobiography is experiencing a renaissance of popular interest in Tibet today. Since its initial 2009 publication in Tibetan, it has been published twice more in collections of Tibetan-language women’s writings, including Si khron bod yig dpe skrun bsdu sgrig bhang (eds), Gangs can skyes ma’i dpe tshogs (Chengdu: Si khron mi rigs dpe skrun khang, 2015) vol. 9, and again in the new 53-volume compilation of Buddhist women’s writings published by nuns from Larung Gar, Bla rung ’daya tare’i dpe tshogs rtsom sgrig bhang (eds), Mika’ ‘gro’i chos mchod chen mo (Lhasa: Bod ljongs bod yig dpe skrun khang, 2017), vol. 31. I am currently completing a full English translation of Sera Khandro’s long autobiography. For a translation of her much shorter verse autobiography, see Sarah Jacoby, “The Excellent Path of Devotion: An Annotated Translation of Sera Khandro’s Short Autobiography,” in Himalayan Passages: Tibetan and Newar Studies in Honor of Hubert Decler, eds. Benjamin Bogin and Andrew Quintman (Boston: Wisdom, 2014).


 dakiniṣ, for she draws this from her own tradition as a Tibetan Buddhist Treasure revealer (gter ston).

From the title of my book, *Love and Liberation*, one might have the idea that Sera Khandro’s life was full of love and spiritual liberation, a happy story all around.¹⁸ This is reinforced by the book colors chosen by the publisher for the first hard cover printing (without consulting the author)—under the purple, blue, and pink dust jacket the book cover is pale pink with shiny purple writing on the spine—hardly the typical color palate for a scholarly book! This pastel-toned happy story is partially accurate; there is liberation in the sense that Sera Khandro narrates her life story according to the teleological progression generic to Tibetan biography, *rnam thar*, which charts a religious devotee’s journey from suffering to sanctity. And there is love as well, in the shape of what I argue is an unusually prominent narrative of love between herself and her guru and consort Drimé Özer (Dri med ’od zer, 1881-1924), one of the eight sons of Dudjom Lingpa (Bdud ’joms gling pa, 1835-1904). Since I develop this argument about love in greater detail in the fifth chapter of *Love and Liberation*, I won’t elaborate here. Instead today I thought we could listen to a few examples of some considerably darker dialogues through which Sera Khandro wrote the story of her life. There are many examples to choose from. Interactions with dakiniṣ permeate her visionary life—they threaten her when she avoids accomplishing her religious destiny to be a Treasure revealer, they prophesy about who should be her consort, and they encourage her about the virtues of the female body when all she can find in it is fault. Prominent male lamas take their part in these sorts of conversations as well, though at times their prognostications about who should be her consort clash with her own. Land deities have important speaking roles as well, demanding obeisance from Sera Khandro and in return granting her rights to reveal Treasures on their territory. Sera Khandro’s fellow religious community members taunt her for her intensive commitment to the Dharma and joke about her developing intimacy with Drimé Özer. But to his consort Akyongza (A skyong bza’), this was no laughing matter. Dialogues between Sera Khandro and Akyongza, as well as several other female consorts with whom she competed, were fierce. Reading all this one is left with the impression that the cacophony of conversation in Sera Khandro’s autobiography is as acrimonious as it is inspirational.

---

The first dialogue I want to share with you occurred in 1921 when she was 29, according to her autobiography.\textsuperscript{19} At this time, her decade-long relationship with her spouse (tshe grogs) Gara Gyelsé (Mgar ra rgyal sras), son of Gara Terchen Pema Dündül Wangchuk Lingpa (Mgar ra gter chen pad+ma bdud ’dul dbang phyug gling pa, 1857-1910) of Benak Monastery, Golok (Ban nag, Mgo log), was deteriorating, and she would soon leave him to go live with her guru Drimé Özer in Dartsang, Serta (Gdar tshang, Gser rta):

When we were returning home, we arrived at a place called Rizap (Ri zab). That night, in my dream again the terrifying spontaneously born woman arrived and said,

Why are you going toward those with deteriorated commitment vows? It is as if you have mistaken brass for gold, water for wine. You cast away your destined bodhisattva as worthless. You turn away from upholding your profound Treasure. You are distracted, grasping onto \textls{saṃsāra}. From the time you were young until now, I have given you honest advice. I have given you your paternal inheritance of profound Dharma Treasures. Although I have reared you like a mother loves her adorable child, repelling negative conditions, outer and inner obstacles, and so forth, still you are unable to be independent and you need only to be under others’ power. What is the meaning of this?

I explained,

It is not that I had too many thoughts and mistook who was or was not my consort. I didn’t have the power to break the commands of gods and lamas, so I turned away from my own purpose and wondered if I could uphold [Gara Terchen] Dündül Wangchuk Lingpa’s profound Treasures. Since I directed my intentions toward this, until now I have not accomplished my purpose. In particular, all my consorts and Dharma holders have fallen under others’ sway. Because I am one with an inferior female body, I did not have a way to meet them. Now, too, I am powerless not to go [back to Gyelsé]. That is my response.

She stated,

\textsuperscript{19} Sera Khandro recorded her age according to the Tibetan system of tabulating age from conception, which I have modified to accord with the international convention of tabulating age from birth. Hence, when Sera Khandro writes that she was 30 in 1921, I give the age as 29.
Thinking that since you were of bad ancestry, you needed to do all kinds of work without retribution, until now you have remained with the Gara family. From this year forward, you belong to us. The time for you to live with the Gara family is finished. Even so, if you are encouraged by a person with perverse aspirations, I don’t know what will happen to your life, Dharma, and disciples. Like wind is to butter lamps, fire is to water, and iron is to rock, you need to be extremely careful.

As she said this, I awoke from sleep. Then we went on. The encampment base of [Gyelsé’s] residence had merged into the Gar [kinsmen’s] circle. I told Tupzang (Thub bzang), “There aren’t any good prophecies about the encampment base joining the Gar circle this year; it isn’t a good omen.”

Tupzang said, “Yes, before when Gyelsé had no wealth or food, I never saw those who say they are ‘the Gar kinsmen circle.’ These days, when there is growing property and wealth thanks to your kindness, their identity as Gara family members is awakened and they say they need to take care of Gyelsé.”

I replied, “It is not acceptable for you to speak as if you are a young person with a child’s intellect who doesn’t know anything. If they hear you, they will say bad things.”

From this dialogue with both human and celestial interlocutors, Sera Khandro effectively communicates the difficulty of extricating herself from Gyelsé. But she does so carefully, using language in a way that resonates with what Bakhtin aptly called “the word with a sideward glance,” or words that anticipate a particular response and attempt to mitigate it in advance. She expresses her sense that she should be with Drimé Özer and not Gyelsé through her conversation with the ḍākinī, all the while voicing this viewpoint through the ḍākinī’s words and refuting it with her own. Through quoting her close disciple Tupzang, Sera Khandro conveys the resentment that presumably she also felt toward Gyelsé and his relatives’ newfound interest in him. She skillfully claims through Tupzang’s statement that she played an unacknowledged role in enlarging his stature, but then scolds him for saying this in her own voice.

All this resentment and discord eventually erupts into what becomes the climax of her life narrative: she becomes deathly ill, so

---

20 Dbus mo bde ba'i rdo rje'i rnam par thar pa, 347-49.
21 Mikhail Bakhtin, Problems of Dostoevsky’s Poetics (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1984), 196.
Gyelsé sends her off to live with Drimé Özer rather than have her blood on his hands because Drimé Özer was prophesied to be able to cure her. Not only does he nurture her back to health, but “the two, method and insight, actually merged as one taste,” and they “entered the feast assembly of the ḍākinīs,” where “there was an inconceivable celebration feast for completing the greatly secret quick path.”

But I promised to elaborate on the dark side, and mutual enlightenment sounds pretty great to me, at least as Sera Khandro describes it. So, moving forward just three years later in 1924 when Sera Khandro had been living together with Drimé Özer in Dartsang, Serta, Gyelsé and his entourage returned to press a lawsuit over child custody. Since this translation is not included in Love and Liberation, and also since there are not many examples of such legal proceedings from early-twentieth-century Golok, I will quote this passage, also from Sera Khandro’s autobiography, in full:

Then, when I was thirty-two, the Yeru (G.yas ru) religious encampment members had a discussion and Dorla Tenzin (Rdor bla bstan ‘dzin), Alo (A lo), Öchö (‘Od chos), and Jikchö (‘Jigs chos) came to my place. They said that if we, mother and children, went to live at the Yeru religious encampment it would be a way to end the dispute with the Gara family.

The Master [Drimé Özer] considered their mutual commitment vows and said, “It is okay if she does this for a while.”

Gara [Gyelsé] replied to him, “It would displease me if she does this. This needs to be adjudicated by both the religious court of Lama Pelyul and the legal court of Akyong Kangen.”

It was done this way. After the proceedings, I was found to be not guilty from both viewpoints, so I was to give my share of twelve...
dotsé.\textsuperscript{26} Also, even though my little son was not Gara’s, for him to temporarily be considered his, the settlement (gzu 'phang) called for fourteen dotsé.

At that time I said, “I won’t accept a false settlement like this.”

Even so, the Master didn’t give me permission and there was nothing I could do. His disciples, mainly Sotrül,\textsuperscript{27} agreed to support me in accordance with their means with provisions such as horses and livestock and so forth, and with that the lawsuit was settled (gyod 'grigs).\textsuperscript{28}

Through dialogues and narration such as this, Sera Khandro’s story of love and liberation is considerably less rosy, as powerful men in her community decided her fate and that of her son, Gyurmé Dorjé (’Gyur med rdo rje), then only five years old.\textsuperscript{29} Tragically, the young boy succumbed to illness and died shortly after this, followed after a few days by Drimé Özer himself.

Passages like these are fascinating for the data they provide about life on the eastern Tibetan grasslands in early twentieth-century Tibet, in some cases providing information unavailable elsewhere about social customs, Tibetan dialects, famous personages, trade relations, political organization, religious life, and in this case divorce and child custody proceedings. But even more than what these passages of Sera Khandro’s writing convey about Tibetan history and culture, they communicate something about what it means to be human—they are poignant, infused with emotion, and mired in the complexities, confusions, and sorrows of ordinary life.

This brings me to my final point about the dialogic nature of Sera Khandro’s writing. If meaning is generated through the relation of an utterance and its reply, or in Bakhtin’s terms if all rhetorical forms “are oriented toward the listener and his answer,”\textsuperscript{30} then the dialogic nature of Sera Khandro’s writing does not just come into being through the interactions she choreographs between the many speak-

\textsuperscript{26} One dotsé (rdo tshad) of silver is a Tibetan measure equal to fifty sang (srang) of silver according to the Bod rgya tshig mdzod chen mo vol. 2, ed. Krang dbyi sun (Beijing: The Nationalities Publishing House, 1993), 1445.
\textsuperscript{27} Sotrül is Bsod sprul sna tshogs rang grol (1869-1935), one of Drimé Özer’s heart disciples. He was a member of the ruling Washül (Wa shul) family in Serta, eastern Tibet, as well as an incarnate lama at Sera Tekchen Chönkhor Ling (Se ra theg chen chos’ khor gling) Monastery in Serta.
\textsuperscript{28} Dbus mo bde ba’i rdo rje’i rnam par thar pa, 389-390.
\textsuperscript{29} Gyelsé and Sera Khandro also had a daughter Yangchen Drönma (Dbyangs can sgron ma, b. 1913) who would have been eleven years old at this time, but she is not mentioned in this lawsuit.
ing subjects in her narrative; it comes to life in relation to the reader. Reading is an active process of meaning making; we are not neutral word processors or invisible witnesses listening to the dialogues Sera Khandro unfolds. Like Buber’s assertion that “music calls to an ear not the musician’s own,” or “sculpture to an eye not the sculptor’s,” literature calls to its readers and draws us into dialogue with it. Listening carefully to Sera Khandro’s words involves us in an intersubjective relation; her writings sound inside our heads and are made audible by our voices, pushing them forward in time to be heard by new generations. In Bakhtin’s words:

The contexts of dialogue are without limit. They extend into the deepest past and the most distant future. Even meanings born in dialogues of the remotest past will never be finally grasped once and for all, for they will always be renewed in later dialogue.\(^{32}\)

To transpose this into terms closer to Sera Khandro’s worldview, the auspicious connections (rten 'brel) that came together (or didn’t) to make things possible (or not) within the bookends of Sera Khandro’s auto/biographical volumes are not contained there; they reach out to us too. It is then our call to pay greater or lesser attention, understand with greater or lesser skill, and choose how to respond.

### 3. The art of dialogue at the International Association of Tibetan Studies Meeting

Now that we’ve carried the theme of dialogue toward ourselves as listeners and speakers, I’d like to turn our attention to thinking about what we are doing here at the International Association of Tibetan Studies Meeting. I want to raise a series of questions about dialogue both how it relates to what we do within our international community of Tibetan Studies scholars and outside of it.\(^{33}\)

---

33 Many thanks to Karma Ngodup, lecturer at the University of Chicago’s South Asian Languages and Civilizations Department, for translating these questions into Tibetan.
a. Dialogue within the IATS community

1. Do we come to meetings like this to talk at each other, to engage in what Buber describes as “monologue disguised as dialogue,” or to genuinely dialogue with each other though we may differ in terms of native language, research methodology, or interpretation of socio-political histories?

2. What would it take to push the typical “monologue disguised as dialogue” into genuine dialogue?

3. How often do we attend a meeting like IATS in order to talk with the few other people in the world who do exactly what we do, skipping sessions on other topics?

4. Do we come to dialogue with the people we already know, or exchange with people we would never have a chance to meet outside of these meetings (that is what makes it worth flying across the world to do this)?
5. How often do we avoid attending conference talks that are not in languages in which we are most comfortable, requiring us to listen attentively and struggle to comprehend? (some of you have to do this all the time, but the rest of us should also…)

6. How do we make our English-language conference presentations accessible to scholars who are not native speakers of European languages, and in particular to scholars coming from Tibet?

7. To what degree do we make use of meetings such as this to seek out opportunities for collaborative research across national borders, political divides, or language barriers?

8. And importantly, in what ways should we take note of the voices within Tibetan studies with whom we cannot reasonably or safely dialogue, and the topics about which we cannot safely dialogue?
b. Dialogue with others outside of the Tibetan Studies scholarly community raises a number of other important questions

1. In this era when some of our colleagues are “being made redundant” to use British English (Americans are more direct and call it getting fired), how do we convincingly present the importance of Tibetan Studies scholarship for those outside our field, both within other academic disciplines and in public discourse more broadly?

a. Some would say that it is not our responsibility to convince others in the academies and public spheres of our respective countries of the relevance of Tibetan Studies, (because this is either self-evident or not our problem), but as our colleagues continue to face “redundancy” I would suggest that it is necessary for all of us to engage in productive dialogue about Tibetan Studies with others outside of our field and outside of academia.
2. With this in mind, to what degree do we make our scholarship accessible to non-Tibetan Studies scholars (transliteration systems, etc.)?

3. How can we foster broader intellectual exchange about Tibet across the humanities and social sciences such that it is not only Tibetologists who cite Russian literary theorists, for example, but Russian literary theorists who cite Tibetologists?

4. In other words, how can we best write for an audience of people not only defined by a mutual interest in Tibet as a unique civilization, but for an audience interested in great literature, arts, and sciences that happen to be Tibetan?

5. And finally, to what degree and in what forums do we dialogue with the broader public about issues relating to Tibet, ranging from meditation to mining?

So I have raised lots of questions and provided far fewer answers. At this conference and those in the future, I hope we can engage in many genuine dialogues about these questions and more!
Bibliography


Si khron bod yig dpe rnying bsdu sgrig khang (eds), *Gangs can skyes ma’i dpe tshogs*. Chengdu: Si khron mi rigs dpe skrun khang, 2015.

Pilgrimage Guide of the Tibetan Buddhist Holy Mountain Brag dkar sprel rdzong

Nakza Drolma (Zhuoma)

(Qinghai Normal University, Xining, 810008)

I. Introduction

A pilgrimage guide (gnas yig) is a guidebook to a sacred place. It gives directions and information about specific routes of Buddhist holy sites. The guides are often written by great religious specialists like yogis and masters. The texts are usually composed for pilgrims so that they could locate the sites. There are important written descriptions about the sacred places. Pilgrimage guides are considered to be a special literature genre (e.g. Wylie 1965, Dowman 1988, Cobezon 1996). A number of scholars in the West have studied pilgrimage guides to Tibetan Buddhist holy places (e.g. Filibeck 1988, Buffetrille 1997, Huber 1997, Macdonald 1997).

Brag dkar sprel rdzong Mountain, also known as Sprel rdzong Mountain, is considered a Buddhist holy mountain (gnas ri). It is one of the three holy places in Qinghai; the other two are Kokonor Lake to the north and A myes rma chen Mountain to the south. These three holy places are said to be the embodiment of the three holy places: Tse Mountain, Ma pham g.yu mtsho Lake and Tsa ri Mountain in Tibet. Thus, these three holy places in Qinghai follow the pilgrimage tradition of those in Tibet, according to which Brag dkar sprel rdzong is said to be the second Tsa ri Mountain. The degrees of blessings received in these three places are considered to be equal to those of the three holy places in Tibet. The most auspicious and benevolent year for Sprel rdzong Mountain, like Tsa ri, falls in the Year of the Monkey, according to the lunar calendar. The Year of the Monkey is known as the ‘Great Pilgrimage’ (gnas 'dus). Such auspicious years attract a large number of pilgrims to the mountain.

The object of the present research is a Tibetan text belonging to the literary genre of the gnas yig. It is the guide to the holy place of Brag dkar sprel rdzong Mountain, the mountain hermitage of Zhabs dkar tshogs drug rang drol(1781–1851). The author of this text is 'Bri gung dbe smyon chos kyi grags pa. The manuscript was found in Bragdgon pa stan pa rab rgyas’s (1801–?) religious history book of A
Pilgrimage Guide of Brag dkar sprel rdzong

mdo Mdo smad chos 'byung, and was completed in 1865. The current text is from Mdo smad chos 'byung (1982: 317-321). The dimensions of the folios are 210 mm x 285 mm. The text is versified. Except the information provided by the name of the author, there is no other indication of his background in terms of lineage and tradition. The first part of his name bears 'Bri gung, which is the name of 'Bri gung lineage of the Bka' rgyud pa School of Tibetan Buddhism. In her guidebook translation, Two Guidebooks to Ti se and La phyi, Filibeck writes, “the 'Bri gung pas, follow the practice of meditating in the hermitages in the mountains since Phag mo gru pa” (1110-1170) (Filibeck 1988: 7). The author also mentions 'Bri gung 'jig rten mgon po (1143-1217), the founder of 'Bri gung pa Sect. He writes in the pilgrimage guide the master’s image is naturally formed at the site. It could be assumed that the author of this gnas yig to Brag dkar sprel rdzong Mountain had some associations with the 'Bri gung lineage in Central Tibet. In his translation work The Life of Shabkar, Ricard mentions the birth and death dates of the author 1597-1659 (Ricard 2001:204). According to his research, the pilgrimage guide was written in the early 17th century.

In the author’s time, 'Bri gung pas still played active roles in the veneration of holy mountains. That lineage held the tradition of sending hermits to the mountains. It was a very common practice for the hermits to make their sacred journeys to various holy places across Tibetan cultural geography. Thus, it is possible the author of the pilgrimage guide to Brag dkar sprel rdzong made his journey from central Tibet to Amdo, and composed the text.

Unlike the pilgrimage guides of the three holy places Ti se, La phyi and Tsa ri, which are widely known to scholars, the pilgrimage guide to Brag dkar sprel rdzong is little known. Mathew Ricard only translated its first two verses in his introduction to Brag dkar sprel rdzong Mountain, where Zhabs dkar tshogs drug rang grol meditated before his sacred journey to Central Tibet.

II. A Brief Analysis of the Pilgrimage Guide

1. Forms and Purposes of the Text

Pilgrimage guides are a special Tibetan Buddhist literature genre. Such texts often have their own forms and purposes, particularly pilgrimage guides to holy mountains. The more detailed pilgrimage guides contain the origins of the gnas (places), the characteristics of the gnas, the process of opening the gnas sgo (door of a place) which leads to the pilgrimage routes for circumambulation around the holy mountains, de-
scriptions of specific pilgrimage routes, and the benefits of circumambulating the *gnas*. The content of the texts often reflects the author’s background and the school he follows. The purposes of the writing transcend mere guides for the pilgrims and serve the purposes of elevation and propagation of a religious school.

The pilgrimage guide to Brag dkar sprel rdzong follows the aforementioned forms. The first verses deal with the origin of the *gnas*, in which the narrative traces to the enlightened master Padmasambhava, the Guru Rinpoche, who “comes” to the holy mountain to subdue the local gods and spirits. Gods, *nagas, gnyan, btsan*, semi-gods and *srin po* are common motifs in pilgrimage guides. These “non-Buddhist” gods and spirits play major roles in local human affairs. Tibetans worship territorial gods and beseech them for various worldly needs and wishes. The rituals practiced for such mountain gods belong to the *yul lha zhi bdag* category of popular religion, which differs from the *gnas ri* type of mountain as the former is merely concerned with worldly affairs and remaining in the cycle of *samsāra*, while the latter seeks eternal liberation. The narration from this text shows spiritual beings as opponents to the master Padmasambhava, who is the emanation of the white dharma (*dkar po chos*), Buddhism. The subjugation of local gods and *srinpo* by Padmasambhava includes the mountain god Gnyan sprel zla ba chen po, and some other adjacent territorial gods.

In terms of the characteristics of the *gnas*, the narrative points out that Brag dkar sprel rdzong Mountain is the second Tsa ri Mountain. Tsari is considered to be one of the three most important holy places of ‘Bri gung pa, one of the twenty-four prominent Buddhist holy locations, and the palace of ‘Khor lo sdom pa’. The narrative says its blessings are equal to that of Tsa ri Mountain. Next, the guide to Brag dkar sprel rdzong shows that the mountain plays an important role among the bordering regions.

Regarding the process of opening the *gnas sgo*, the text is mainly concerned with the confrontation of the master Padmasambhava with those outer unruly autochthonous forces and empowerment of the place. The master subdues them through his magical power; he converts the mountain god Gnyan sprel zla ba chen po into dharma protec-

---

1 See Slob dpon bso nams bzang po, 1982; D. R. Filibeck, Elena, 1988.
2 He is the master from Oḍḍiyāna who, along with Śāntarakṣita and King Khri srong lde btsan, formally established Buddhism in Tibet during the 8th century. In particular, he is renowned for his suppression and conversion of malevolent spirits and hostile non-Buddhist forces, as well as for introducing Tibet many oral transmissions and the texts of Mahāyoga and Atiyoga. To practitioners of the Rnying ma School and all those who follow the practices of Mahāyoga and Atiyoga, he is revered as a ‘second Buddha’.
tor, along with other mountain gods like his consort Brang dmar ma, and the adjacent territorial god A myes rma chen. As a superior hero, this tantric master then bestows his blessings over the landscape by praying, hiding treasures and leaving imprints of his feet on the rocks. Finally, he takes control of the mountain, and its access is open to the Buddhist devotees for ritual practice.

The next parts of the pilgrimage guides deal with the descriptions of specific pilgrimage routes on the mountain, which are the main objective of the text. Objects on these routes include naturally formed Buddhist deities, holy icons and materials like stones, earth and water. It is believed that these objects and materials are sacred; one gets blessings when seeing or touching them.

The last verses of the text focus on the circumambulation of the holy mountain. According to the text, there are three circumambulation paths around the mountain: the outer path, known as phyi skor, the middle and inner circumambulation paths (respectively, bar skor and nang skor). The narrative describes the length of these paths, as well as the four directions, the four lakes, and the four corners of the mountain gods. Then the author concludes the gnas yig by pointing out that he dares not describe the benefits of circumambulation because he is afraid he might not be able to explain them clearly and the words he would need to use might be too complicated.

2. Types of Pilgrimage Routes

The narrative shows several types of pilgrimage routes based on the characteristics of each gnas sgo. One way of categorizing pilgrimage routes is determined by their origins, explained in the myth of the great tantric master Padmasambhava’s empowering over the mountain, and subduing the unruly autochthonous forces. This type of gnas sgo is described in the first verses of the pilgrimage guide. It is the most important pilgrimage route of the holy mountain.

The other categorization of pilgrimage routes is based on one’s cognitive ranking. Most people who visit the sacred mountain Brag dkar sprel rdzong as pilgrims are described as falling into two classes, which are “excellent persons” or “saints” (skyes bu rab), and “ordinary persons” (skyes bu phal ba). This classification of the pilgrims is derived from Buddhist conceptions of a person’s karma, cause and effect. One’s capability of seeing some of the special pilgrimage places is based on the merits one accumulated in both his previous lives and the present one. The karma ascribes a pilgrim ranking as “pure” (dag pa) or “impure beings” (ma dag pa). These two cognitive rankings determine two types

---

4 See Nebesky, 1975.
of pilgrimage routes. The first one includes the physical obvious pilgrimage routes that everyone is able to see and venerate. This type of pilgrimage routes includes Padmasambhava’s Cave and the Holy Water. The other routes involve *tantric* visionary interpretation, which can only be envisioned by the “excellent persons” through their pure vision. The narrative shows a number of such pilgrimage routes where one can envision the presence of celestial realms, meditational deities, and other divine beings and sacred objects. For example, the text goes:

“On the right side of that (referring to the previous pilgrimage route), on the wall of the cave, hold the torchlight above the footprint, look up from below the *maṇḍala*, [in] the marvellous Dharmadhātu Palace of Akaniṣṭha, the Five Buddha Families dwell at the centre and in the four directions. The Five Families of the Most Supreme dwell at the centre and in the intermediate directions. There are different perceptions of them……” “Then walk out and at the path of the doorway, entering the narrow Bardo5 Passage on the right, will calm the fears in the intermediate state later. There are numerous entrances to holy sites here and there on the rocks. And there are many treasures at those [sites], the fortune to be able to see [them] depends on one’s karma.”

Another way of viewing the pilgrimage routes is to classify them according to the three levels of the universe. The notion of the “three levels” (*sa gsum*) traces to Buddhist *tantric* interpretations, in which Buddhist holy mountains are considered to be the abode of a high-class deity. Those mountains often have twenty-four pilgrimage routes matching the twenty-four *rtsa* of the deity’s body. The twenty-four sites are divided into three sets of eight, which form a “three levels” (*sa gsum*) organization of space: upper (sky), middle (earth) and lower (underground) spaces. Each set of eight sites is respectively known as “the eight *gnas* of celestial action” (*mkha’ la sbyod pa’i gnas brgyad*), “the eight *gnas* of action on earth” (*sa la sbyod pa’i gnas brgyad*), and “the eight *gnas* of action underground” (*sa ‘og na sbyod pa’i gnas brgyad*).

The narrative of the pilgrimage guide to Brag dkar sprel rdzong does not clarify the eight sets. However, there are quite a number of pilgrimage routes that reflects these three levels. One is those routes of celestial realms and meditational deities belonging to the category of the eight *gnas* of celestial action. There are several pilgrimage routes that show such type of *gnas sgo*. The other type is the ones on earth including great masters and holy waters. The last type of the pilgrimage routes are the ones underground. Such examples include the routes to the *Bar-do* Passage, the Lord of Death, and the Three Lower Realms. Although it

5 *Bardo* indicates an interval or intermediate period of experience between death and rebirth.
is uncertain whether every pilgrimage route matches to one of the set of eight sites, from those examples above we can see the narrative at least follows the tradition of the “three levels” in composing the text.

In conclusion, this text plays an important role in the making of that mountain into an acknowledged holy place as it explains the blessings found on that holy mountain. The text is one of the earliest written sources about that holy mountain and a central guide on pilgrimage practice. This pilgrimage guide represents unique Tibetan Buddhist literary tradition that opens for both the intellectuals and lay people. As a traditional written text, the manuscript has a significant position in local history and literary contribution.

III. Translation of the Pilgrimage with subtitles

In the following translation, I divide the verses into 51 sections and put 18 subtitles based on the completeness of their meaning.

1. Opening of the site and taming of the srin spirits

1. In this degeneration age, Guru Padmasambhava himself, will go to Lake Khri gshog rgyal mo. In the middle of the G.yer mo thang, at the shore, [he] subdue the nine vow-breaking siblings. There [he] hide many treasures of sādhanā and Dharma, [and] opened gates to sacred places and the Dharma.

2. Then at dusk and dawn, a srin po with a long mane of blood, [and] a srin mo with nasty fangs, [and] their seven children, escaped and stayed at Sprel rdzong brag.

3. When] meditating in the cave, while the Master will remain in a state of samādhi, of blazing enchantment and destruction, the Rakshasis will block the top entrance of the cave with a rock. [Padmasambhava] descended from above brandishing [his] vajra. Even though remaining in a state of samādhi, on the left side of the ’Dus mo rdzong, on the upper part of the rock, appeared as if a blasting fire, there is a dimming rocky shelter, [the demon] retreated to the border. [Padmasambhava] struck with the thunderbolt too, [and] destroyed [him] like the dust of dew. There are traces of such liberation, the faces of male and female demons and so on; vivid evidence can be found today.

4. The srin po gave up evil wishes. Because of that reason, in the future, some people will be reborn by the srin po, [and] preach the Dharma and spells, immoralities harmful to the Doctrine, all kinds of unpleasant things [they] will commit,
the red-handed butchers will occupy some countries. As an antidote for controlling such incidents, the master stayed at Yang rdzong Cave, of Sprel rdzong brag dkar.

[2. Binding the mountain god under oath]

5. In the palace of Rdo rje klo dkar, during his meditation, a being, who has a human body, and a monkey’s head appeared, and said ‘I am the guardian of this place’. [Padmasambhava] bound under oath the guardian of this place. Thereby, making [him] the protector of the Doctrine. [He] gave empowerment, bound [him] in an oath and gave [him] a name G.nyan sprel zla ba chen po.

[3. Hiding treasures and leaving imprints of Padmasambhava’s feet on the rocks]

6. Then Padmasambhava prayed and wished, that future harm will not come from the demon. [He] hid many treasures and other things. When [Padmasambhava] made the offering cake, [he] performed the dance and so on, the imprints of his feet emerged on the rocks in great number, [and he] left his footprints on the rocks in four directions.

7. This Sprel rdzong brag dkar, where three valleys meet, was the place where [Padmasambhava] conquered the demon in the past; [therefore it is] the holiest among the border-taming regions.6

[4. Guide to the holy place of Rdo rje klo dkar gsal ba and other deities]

8. In the supreme holy place of Rdo rje klo dkar gsal ba, Five Families and the seed in the manner of avadhūti, rasanā and lalanā, three bodies [and] six syllables that block the door of rebirth, the self-manifested Gurusiddhi rise in relief. Inside, at the upper half, is the shrine room of the enlightened ones. When entering it, take off ornaments and wear light clothes, go inside holding a butter lamp and torch. And look above to the open space, [there one can see] Cakrasaṃvara, Guhyasamājā, Hevajra and Yamāntaka and others. And the maṇḍalas of the four classes of tantras are presented in relief.

6 Here the bordering region refers to Amdo, the area where the mountain of Brag dkar sprel rdzong is located, is the bordering region between Inner Mongolia and the north-eastern part of Tibet.
[5. Guide to the pure crystal cave]

9. Coming out from there and going to the left, there is the crystal cave of the Pure Glory. Go in there with a lighted butter lamp and a torch. In the pure paradise of Khecara and the magnificent Čāritra, open miraculously formed divine palace, that naturally emerged in relief. There are four big ravines and four lakes, all self-manifested, and an assembly of two thousand and eight hundred divine beings in relief. At the summit, four animal-headed dākinī and so forth are clearly visible, the gates of lower rebirths are blocked merely by seeing them.

[6. Guide to the cave of Garuḍa and other holy places surrounding it]

10. Then come out, like before, with a butter lamp, light a torch at the end of a long cane of a wood, and go up to the third floor, there’s the Garuḍa, the emanation of the mind of the Enlightened One, raising its head and hovering in the sky, small horns are adorned with a wish-fulfilling jewel, on seeing the jewel, the sufferings of poverty will be dispelled. Wings are stretched out to the right and left, and the feet, tail feathers and so on are clearly visible. By merely seeing them, one will recover from various, malevolent diseases caused by nāgas and the lord of the earth.

11. To the right side of the Garuḍa are one thousand statues of the Buddha; to the left is the Bri gung 'jig rten gsum mgon.

12. On the right side of that, on the wall of the cave, hold the torchlight above the footprint, look up from below the maṇḍala, in the marvellous Dharmadhātu Palace of Akaniṣṭha, the Five Buddha Families dwell at the centre and in the four directions. The Five Families of the Most Supreme dwell at the centre and in the intermediate directions. There are different perceptions of them.

13. On the rock face outside the cave, Padmasambhava from Oḍḍiyāna resides clearly.

---

7 A mythological bird normally depicted with an owl-like sharp beak, often holding a snake, and with large and powerful wings. In tantric Buddhism, the Garuḍa is associated with Vajrapāṇi and certain wrathful forms of Padmasambhava, and may symbolize the trans-mutative power which purifies certain malevolent influences.

8 Oḍḍiyāna is the name of an ancient kingdom, probably in the remote north-west of the Indian subcontinent, where a large corpus of tantric literature is said to
14. On the left side are eight teachings with the appearance like a box, adorned with the dharma wheel, umbrella and top. A hundred families of peaceful and wrathful supreme deities dwell clearly.
15. To the left are ten wrathful deities and so on dwell clearly.
16. To its left, Shri Devi dwells vividly.
17. In the innermost corner of the cave is a *sādhana* spring of Oddiyāṇa; drinking from and bathing in it will purify diseases, evil spirits, sins and defilements. In this cave, the doors to the three holy sites are located.

[7. Guide to the *manḍala* of the eighty spheres of *stag sgrol*]

18. Next go out and reach the gate, and on the right and left. On the outer walls on the sides of the gate are the Four Great Kings. To one side, in the valley on the left, there is a cave with an entrance facing to the southeast, looking up above it, there is the *manḍala* of the eighty spheres of *stag sgrol*.
19. To the right side of the door is a precious elephant. Above the entrance is the eleven-faced Avalokiteśvara, [and] Padmasambhava [in his manifestation] as the Twisted Nectar and, the venerable Acalā and others are clearly manifested. On the corner are Amitāyus, Vajravārahī and so forth clearly manifested.
20. At the corner of the entrance, knock on the door with a stone in a careful manner, the sound reaches all the heavenly realms; it is the same as visiting. Looking to the upper steps from the corner [of the entrance], Avalokiteśvara and Supreme Attribute are clearly visible, [and] Supreme Rāhula and others are manifested clearly [as well]. The entrances to the holy place will be opened one time.
21. On the platform attached to the entrance, Marba, the translator, the enlightened sages and others are clearly visible.
22. On the middle of the doorway, there is a stone, with Padmasambhava’s footprint, please venerate it!

[8. Guide to the shady side of Brag dkar sprel rdzong Mountain]

23. Then on the shady side [of the mountain] there is a cave, with the entrance facing the north; go there carrying a torch-light and butter lamp. There is the alms bowl of Guru Pad-
masambhava, on which self-manifested Sanskrit syllables are visible. At the beginning of the eon (bskal ba), the opening was [turned] up, after that, in the middle of the eon, it was lying [with the opening to the side]. At the present eon of degeneration, it is turned upside down. Signs of time and the world ages and so on are visible on it.

24. If one goes further, one can see a pond in the plain. When ascending from down there, one can see a feast and offerings bestowed by dākinis. In front of this, appears like a throne of Oḍḍiyāna, illuminate it with a torch underneath, on a treasure chest, treasure letters are visible.

25. Then walk on to the wall to the left side, there is a crystal rock with a turquoise colour, above the centre of it is the Medicine Buddha’s, lapis lazuli (vaidurya) alms bowl with four sides, filled with various jewels and medicine, and gold and silver are stuffed inside the chest. It has been sealed with seven layers. One will be liberated from hunger and diseases by touching and seeing [them].

26. On the left side above there are self-manifested [images] clearly visible in relief. There are the Eight Medicine Buddhas. The Medicine Buddha, the supreme healer of the three poisons and diseases, liberating [one] from the four hundred and four diseases.

27. After that, go up to the summit of the cave, enter the small cave located there, in all directions self-manifested [images of] assembly of divinities dwell, those who have accumulated pure karma will be able to see them, while they are difficult to perceive for the ordinary ones.

28. Then come out and on the left side, there is a cave entrance facing southeast. Bring a bright torch there. On the right side of the path, on the surface of the rock, Vajrakīla and Sixteen phur ba Protectors are manifested.

29. Then when gradually going upwards, if someone familiar [with the place] observes the surface on the left, there are temples and celestial palaces, archways, porches, four pillars and so on clearly visible.

30. In the centre of the visible wheels, there are umbrellas and victory banners, and the Sixteen Arhats are spontaneously present. The Four Great Guardian Kings stay at the gate.

31. Along the path to the cave is the bosom of the wishing cow, for the fortunate ones milk is really available; when consumed by whomever, all desired wishes for this life time will be granted.

32. Walking to the end, at the distance of three arm-spans, water
flows in summer and the path cannot be crossed. It is only possible to cross in autumn and winter. There are some treasures and entrances to the holy sites.


33. Then walk out and at the path of the doorway, entering the narrow Bardo Passage on the right, will calm the fears in the intermediate state later. There are numerous entrances to holy sites here and there on the rocks. And there are many treasures at those [sites], the fortune to be able to see [them] depends on one’s karma.


34. When arriving at the door of this sacred place in the east, there are rocky hills on either side of the entrance, resembling white silk curtains stretched and between [them]. To the right side, the sky is merely visible. There is a valley in the south that leads towards the north, go there where there is a cliff resembling a hoisted flag. There is a cave facing towards the south. Lighten the torch and go inside, there stand the Buddha Maitreya and the Eight Bodhisattvas.

[11. Guide to the site of the ladder to liberation and the Buddha of Avalokiteśvara]

35. Then come out and go to the southern side, and if one takes the path that is merely recognisable, one will see a white rock looking like a hoisted flag in the west. To its side there is a cave facing towards the east. Lighten a butter lamp and look around, and the landscape of Sukhāvatī is clearly visible. On its surface are many self-manifested [images].

36. Come out and go along the circumambulation route to the right, [one will see] a ladder with forty-nine rungs to heaven and liberation. Every step will leave the cyclic saṃsāra behind.

37. When arriving there, on the left side of the rock, “Thee, noble son, go to Sukhāvatī,” pray for Avalokiteśvara’s prophecy with devotion.

---

9 This term refers to the Pure land of the Buddha Amitābha.
10 Yama means the lord of death.
[12. Guide to the cave of the victorious Vairocana]

38. On the back side, between the meadow and rock entrance, there is a cave entrance, lighten the butter lamp, [one will see] Victorious Vairocana with eight bodhisattvas disciples stand.

[13. Guide to the holy site of Padmasambhava’s footprints]

39. When one returns to the path, one will see a fearsome black rock, on which, the footprint of Padmasambhava from Oḍḍiyāna is actually visible. If one goes upward from the rock, on the foot of the rock, which upper part resembles a blazing fire, there are destroyed faces of male and female yamas, and traces of eliminated demons and so forth.

[14. Guide to the cave of the three lower realms]

40. There are three caves at the end of the circumambulation path, entering there one will be liberated from [rebirth in] the three lower realms.

[15. Guide to the meditation caves]

41. And then if one climbs to the upper peak, there are numerous extraordinary places for meditation. Padmasambhava resides in the middle of the cave. There are remnants of an altar, a drum and other things.

42. [In the] red rock, the precious crystal palace, the Five Families, Three Families and Supreme Hundred Families reside. In the self-appeared immense palace, seven hundred and twenty divinities of the eight sādhanā teachings reside.

43. In other caves the divine abodes of the Five Families are present, countless manifestations of the assembly of deities reside [there], and the eight manifestations of the Guru [Padmasambhava] reside [there] clearly.

44. Outside there is the essence of the Lords of the Three Families and so on, [and] the self-manifested syllables and so on clearly show. In the complete maṇḍala of the eight sādhanā teachings, [and] there are many treasure and holy places ful-
ly encircled by chests. If those familiar with it look, they can take [from the chests]. The white and red bodhicitta, the so-called sindhurā, [can be taken] as one’s wishes and needs. The story can be found in the explanation of “The Explanatory Tantra”.


45. Between the north and the west is the ladder to liberation. If one could walk on three paths, one’s three obscurations would be removed. Right below are the Lord of Death and, hot and cold hells [with] the roaring sounds of demons. [These can be] clearly found if an intelligent person examines.

[17. Guide to the Holy Waters]

46. In the time of going on the pass should not change the departure. Beneath the mountain corner at the left side of the entrance to the holy site, beneficial medicinal springs with six tastes flow. Either drinking or bathing [there] will give seventeen good qualities, without doubts [they] will wash away diseases and evil spirits.

[18. Guide to the corner of Brag dkar sprel rdzong ]

47. Then at the corner of the mountain [there are] handprints and so on, and self-manifested syllables can be seen.  
48. To the right there is [a mountain] called Chu bzang brag dkar, a male mountain and the abode of heroes.  
49. In a valley is Rma chen spom ra, and, footprints are visible; [the deity] liberates human beings and livestock from epidemics.  
50. To the left lies Spel mo brag, a female mountain and the abode of heroines.  
51. In the front is Zhing skyong ral ba can, to its left is his consort Brang dmar ma. Both the Father and Mother, are Dharma and Field Protectors.

References

[1] 'Bri gung dbu smyon chos kyi grag pa. ‘Brag dkar sprel rdzong gi


Material culture as proxy for language: the Himalayan evidence

Maheshwar P. Joshi
(Doon Library and Research Centre, Dehradun, Uttarakhand, India)

Words in a language are of course symbols, but material things also serve in symbolic roles. Humans, it is said, live in a forest of symbols, and to understand what makes humans tick, it is necessary to consider how those symbols work. That leads us on to a relatively new field in the study of prehistory — cognitive archaeology — that is still in early development (Renfrew 2008: 67).

1. Introduction

Studying material culture as proxy for language involves cognitive archaeology a relatively young discipline. There are several competing theories of language cognition, among which the modular and non-modular ones have gained wide currency. The modular theory posits language as a genetically endowed, biological system, i.e., the faculty of language is innate (see, Chomsky 2006). According to the non-modular theory it is behavioural therefore learned (see, Lieberman 2013: in passim; 2016; Bickerton 2009). There is no doubt that language is a very complex behaviour that involves the interweaving of many components. Since archaeological evidence is behavioural in nature, it can be invoked in studying language origin and evolution (see, Leroi-Gourhan 1993 [1964]; Isaac 1976).

Stone tools fashioned by our remote ancestors are the earliest surviving components of material culture; therefore, our enquiry begins with the Lower Palaeolithic. The evolutionary typology in archaeological record is defined in simplistic terms as Mode system of lithic technology (Clark 1977: 23-38, in passim, table 5). This process of evolution passed through four major successive transitions, namely, the Lower Palaeolithic Transition, the Lower-to-Middle Paleolithic Tran-
sition, the Middle-to-Upper Paleolithic Transition, and the Paleolithic-Mesolithic Transition (see papers in Camps and Chauhan 2009). Accordingly, Mode 1 technology represents the Lower Palaeolithic, advent of Mode 2 marks the Lower Palaeolithic Transition, of Mode 3 the Lower-to-Middle Palaeolithic Transition, of Mode 4 the Middle-to-Upper Palaeolithic Transition, and of Mode 5 the Palaeolithic-Mesolithic Transition.

Leroi-Gourhan’s pioneering studies leading to formulation of the chaîne opératoire or operational sequences (1993 [1964]: Chs. 7-8) is a ‘key theoretical and methodological concept’ that can be applied universally in all applications including language cognition (see, White 1993). According to Leroi-Gourhan (1993 [1964]: 234), human operational behaviour ‘involves several highly complex processes’ bearing on operational sequences at two levels: Operational Memory and Mechanical Operational Sequences. There are three succeeding stages of operational sequences, 1- an automatic form of behaviour directly connected with our biological nature termed as ‘automatic’, 2- mechanical behaviour taking place in a state of dimmed consciousness, termed as ‘mechanical’, and 3- ‘lucid’ or ‘fully conscious’ behaviour (Ibid: 230-31).

Leroi-Gourhan (Ibid: 133) notes that we have to ‘rely exclusively on the stone industry’ to unfold ‘technical evolution stretching back from Homo sapiens to the Australanthropians’. Showing critical importance of bipedalism and the anatomical changes that accompanied, he discusses at great length as to how in sync with these changes our remote ancestors progressively advanced in lithic technology from simple ‘choppers’ (Mode 1) of the ‘pebble culture’ to the ‘micro-liths’ (Mode 5) (Ibid: Chs. 3-4). Thus, his study demonstrates that ‘the process of extraction of a cutting edge from a lump of flint varied in time proportionally with the ratio between the length of cutting edge obtained and the volume of flint required to obtain it’, which he explains in ‘figure 64’ of his work (Ibid: 134-37). Leroi-Gourhan further shows remarkable similarity in the ‘increase in brain volume and technical evolution’, which, when translated into a diagram (Ibid: 137-38, figure 65), runs as two almost flat parallel lines up to the Acheulian (Mode 2 technology), and thereafter ‘rise steeply during the Moustero-Levalloisian period’ (Mode 3 technology), ‘while those representing brain volume flatten out and remain flat until the present day’. Significantly, Leroi-Gourhan observes that occurrence of flattening of brain volume was ‘a radical biological crisis’ that ‘was resolved with the disappearance of the prefrontal bar... a radical turning point in our biological evolution as a zoological species governed by the normal laws of species behavior.’ He synthesises technical evolution with the capacity of language as follows:
There is probably no reason, in the case of the earliest anthropoids, to separate the level of language from that of toolmaking: Throughout history up to the present time, technical progress has gone hand in hand with progress in the development of technical language symbols. It is possible, in the abstract, to conceive of a purely gestural technical education; in practice, even completely silent instruction will actuate a reflective symbolism in both teacher and pupil. The organic link appears to be strong enough to justify crediting the Australopithecinae [authors of Mode 1 technology] and the Archaanthropians [authors of Mode 2 technology] with language at a level corresponding to that of their tools...

Techniques involve both gestures and tools, sequentially organized by means of a "syntax" that imparts both fixity and flexibility to the series of operations involved. This operating syntax is suggested by the memory and comes into being as a product of the brain and the physical environment. If we pursue the parallel with language, we find a similar process taking place...

The early Palaeoanthropians [authors of Mode 3 technology] were the direct inheritors of this situation, but their possibilities became gradually extended. The exteriorization of non-concrete symbols took place with the Neanderthals, and technical concepts were thenceforth overtaken by concepts of which we have only manual operating evidence – burial, dyes, curious objects. This evidence, however, is sufficient to establish with certainty that thought was being applied to areas beyond that of purely vital technical motor function...

If language really sprang from the same source as technics, we are entitled to visualize language too in the form of operating sequences limited to the expression of concrete situations, at first concurrently with them and later involving the deliberate preservation and reproduction of verbal sequences going beyond immediate situations (Ibid: 114-16).

The above citation from Leroi-Gourhan is a prelude to his postulation of 'The Birth of Graphism' (Ibid: 187-216) in which he discusses at length the relationship between ‘palaeolithic art’ and ‘verbal language’:

Parallel with the extraordinary acceleration of the development of material techniques following the emergence of Homo sapiens, the abstract thought we find reflected in paleolithic art implies that language too had reached a similar level. Graphic or plastic figurative representation should therefore be seen as the means of expression of symbolic thinking of the myth-making type, its medium being graphic representation related to verbal language but independent from phonetic notation. Although no fossil records of late Paleolithic languages have come down to us, evidence fashioned by the hands
Material culture as proxy for language

I strongly feel that Leroi-Gourhan’s monumental work anticipates nearly all subsequent developments in the field of sensory-based internal systems and material culture vis-à-vis language, for subsequent researches in language cognition seem to strengthen his postulates with new data, though his intellectual debt is barely remembered (cf. White 1993). In this connection I will cite two major contributions: that of Isaac (1976) and of Wynn (1991) that develop two opposite lines of argument.

Thus, in his pioneering persuasive attempts to trace ‘archaeological indicators of the development of language capabilities’, Isaac (1976) addresses this issue in two parts: I- evolutionary implication of the material culture, and II- archaeological reconstruction of the behaviour of early hominids. In the first part he builds:

on the large-scale features of the archaeological record on the assumption that hominid capacity for conceiving and executing increasingly elaborate material culture designs has been connected with rising capacity for manipulating symbols, naming, and speaking’ (Isaac 1976: 276).

He works out four steps of these developments (Ibid: 282-83). Accordingly, the first step ‘(2½-1½ Million Years ago)’ characterises ‘simple tools’, step two ‘(1½-2 Million Years Ago)’, advent of ‘the handaxe’, step three’(2-.04 Million Years Ago)’, ‘Late Acheulian, Mousterian, Middle Stone Age, etc.’, and the fourth step ‘(.04 Million Years Ago, Upwards)’ is marked by tools with ‘maximum level of design complexity and of differentiation... Explicit traces of representational and abstract art’ and ‘ritual and overt symbolism became more and more frequent’. Thus,

Step 4 material culture has long given archaeologists a feel of being organized on much more elaborate principles than Step 3, and there is still heated debate over whether the change from 3 to 4 in-
volved the spread of genes determining superior capabilities. Alternative hypotheses more recently advanced suggest the spread of cultural and/or linguistic innovations that put behavior across a crucial organizational threshold, perhaps a cognitive and communications equivalent of the agricultural revolution.

In the second part, he briefly points out certain behavioural traits, namely, ‘Bipedal Locomotion; Tool-Making; Meat Eating; Gathering (?); Home Bases; and Food Sharing’, and divides them into three phases beginning with Phase I marked by ‘establishment of the first protohuman adaptive complex (bipedalism, transport, tool-making, food sharing).’ It put selection pressure on the enhancement of communication and information exchange systems, ‘which went on to mature during Phase II.’ In this Phase ‘a host of indicators imply a basically human grade of organization’ among ‘which capabilities for language were first important’. Archaeological record of Phase III assigned to between ‘about 50,000 and 100,000 years ago’ shows ‘a quickening of the tempo of change’, and by ‘about 30,000-40,000 years ago, the record gives the appearance that a threshold was crossed with the emergence of much more complex and more style-ridden systems of material culture. From this same period, as we have seen, come the first surviving manifestations of art and of bodily adornment.’ Isaac suggests ‘that crucial developments in language may provide the best explanation of the Upper Paleolithic cultural spurt. This remains an untested, but, in my view, very plausible hypothesis’ (Ibid: 286).

In sum, Isaac posits that material culture unfolds that from ‘step 1’ (the ape grade adaptive behaviour in the Lower Palaeolithic) to ‘step 4’ (the anatomically modern human like behaviour in the Upper Palaeolithic) human cognitive faculty shows a progressive development, and ‘capabilities for language’ played critical role throughout the course of this evolution (see, Ibid: 277-81, and Figures 1-4, showing diagrammatic representations and time-tables; compare it with figures 64-65, and pp. 134-37 of Leroi-Gourhan 1993 [1964]). Isaac’s paper reinforces Leroi-Gourhan’s formulation of succeeding complexity in material culture as an expression of human behavioural change due to biological cum technological evolution as noted above.

Wynn (1991) examines language issue from cognitive perspective and uses grammar as one of the important indicators to examine presence of language in the earliest stone tools represented, in chronological order, by the Oldowan and the Acheulian biface respectively. He notes that language ‘employs complex domain-specific features in grammatical constructions’, such is not the case with ‘tool behaviour’. Thus, stone tools representing Oldowan clearly show an ad hoc tech-
nology aimed at obtaining a sharp-edged artefact closely tied to an immediate task, which was abandoned after its use, and possibly reused at a later episode. However, ‘notion’ of a tool is implied in fashioning a biface, even if it was based on ‘traditional knowledge’. Wynn accounts for this development in ‘constellations of knowledge’ in which ‘sequence construction’ is central. Though ‘tool sequences are organized like strings of beads’, which, superficially, may appear similar to the process of ‘string-of-beads’ in language acquisition, they do not follow any rules of grammar, rather they are ‘learned by observation and memorization’. Independent of language, ‘apprenticeship is essential to the learning of tool-use and tool-making’ (Ibid: 193-4). In sum, compared to the Oldowan tool-use, ‘making and using a biface was in this sense more cognitively complex’ because its technology appears to be ‘hierarchically more complex’. It was not meant for obtaining a sharp edge to address an immediate task, it exhibits ‘symmetry imposed on some of these early bifaces’ (Ibid: 203-04). In his subsequent study, Wynn (2000) discusses at length development of ‘hominid-imposed symmetry’ over time from two-dimensional symmetries to true congruent symmetry to three-dimensional symmetries, as noticed in stone tools, bone tools, and cave paintings dating back from the Lower Palaeolithic through the Upper Palaeolithic. Wynn contends that it ‘reflects the evolution of hominid spatial perception-cognition... and developments in skill’ associated with ‘an aspect of the neural processing’ (Ibid: 131). He concludes: ‘It did not, however, require language’ (Ibid: 139). Interestingly, in his 1991-paper, Wynn is non-committal about the presence of language among the authors of the Oldowan and biface tools. However, in his 2000-paper, citing his own 1991-paper, he says: ‘It is clear, for example, that people learn tool use largely by observation, replication and repetition (apprenticeship), and that language plays only a minor role’ (Ibid: 119, italics mine).

According to Marwick (2003), the African evidence suggests use of ‘arbitrary bi-directional symbols and expression of displacement communication system’ after ‘1.9 million years ago’ when ‘the first Homo habilis fossils appear’. This inference is drawn from gradual increase in the distance of raw material transfer from 3 to 13 kms ‘during the period 1.9–1.6 million years ago’, 4 to 15 kms during ‘1.6 to 1.2’, and ‘15 km to 100 km’ after ‘1.2 million years ago’. Accordingly, this accounts for human ‘ability to pool information collected by individuals through face-to-face negotiation and the use of a proto-language’ (Ibid: 71), which also facilitated human colonization outside Africa. Experimental archaeology also supports that: ‘Linguistic communication plays a key role in this system of apprenticeship by
facilitating joint action and the cultural construction of identity’ (see for details and further references, Stout 2010).

It is clear then that howsoever primitive, hominids were equipped with verbal communication during the Lower Palaeolithic. On the basis of ‘independent studies’ over the past four decades, discussed by celebrated cognitive scientist Philip Lieberman (2013; 2016), it is clear that ‘the neural mechanisms implicated in speech production were present in earlier hominins’, that ‘the intonation of speech involves neural structures that have a deep evolutionary history (Lieberman 2013: Ch. 3, and in passim) ‘which can be ‘traced back to therapsids, mammal-like reptiles’ of the Triassic, Jurassic, and early Cretaceous eras’ (Lieberman 2016: 138). He concludes:

A full appraisal of the biological bases of human language remains in the distant future. However, some of the neural circuits that confer the ability to master and execute the complex motor commands that underlie speech and other aspects of behavior are becoming evident. These neural circuits involve structures that also play a part in “mental” aspects of language such as associating words with their meanings and syntax. Similar neural circuits involving the same cortical and subcortical structures are implicated in a range of “higher” cognitive acts. Though many of these neural structures are “recycled” – being present in archaic species far removed from humans, they have taken on new functions and have been modified by Natural Selection acting on genetic and epigenetic events, some occurring in the last 200,000 years or so and specific to humans (Ibid:142).

It draws our attention to Bickerton’s studies. He suggests that social pressure triggered the episodic memory of our remote ancestors to categorise objects (predators, gender, food, etc.,) and activities (grooming, food sharing, etc.), which account for the evolution of language (Bickerton 2000). He has elaborately discussed this issue in his later study (Bickerton 2009). He explicitly says that initially humans exchanged messages in the same way as chimps by using ACS (animal communication system). In course of evolution, their biological structure and foraging needs forced them to organize socially to meet the challenges from other competing species and predators for survival. It required better information flow than the ‘indexical units’ of the ACSs, which are mainly manipulative, hence bound to the condition of ‘the here and now’. To free humans from this limitation of ‘the here and now’, primarily informative rather than manipulative means of messaging was required. This was achieved by substituting ‘symbolic units’ of language for ‘indexical units’ of the ACSs, for the symbols ‘can refer to things outside of the here and now. This capacity is something linguists generally refer to as “displacement”’ (Ibid:
48-50). Initially it was a modified ACS. It enabled our ancestors to free themselves from the condition of ‘the here and now’, which bear on the emergence of ‘protowords’, followed by ‘words’. It was a great leap – perhaps the greatest – in human cognition initiated by a ‘Stone Age Einstein’ owing to ‘some particular, highly specific set of circumstances that forced words to emerge’ (Ibid: 72; cf., Tomasello 2003). In this process human activities were concentrated primarily on survival strategies for which humans created a ‘niche’ within a particular geographical area leading to the birth of a protolanguage. Termed as ‘niche construction theory’ (Bickerton 2009: 150-53), it accounts for a series of speciations in the six-stage evolutionary model that Bickerton has suggested for the development of language (Bickerton 2009: 189).

According to Bickerton, ‘the modified ACS remained, just like an ant ACS, mired in the business—a vital one, you have to admit—for which it had been originally developed’ (Ibid: 142). Our ancestors continued to live in the protolanguage niche for a considerably long time ‘at the bee/ant level or only a little beyond it’ to signal warnings against predators/sudden natural calamities or give recruitment calls for exploiting bigmammal-scavenging (Ibid: Ch. 7-8). Then, shortly after ‘the bigmammal-scavenging phase’ they started producing a ‘teardrop- or pear-shaped’ object called Acheulian hand axe which remained unchanged for more than a million years (Ibid: 142-43). The other tools, ‘the so-called borers and scrapers were basically variations on this tool’ (Ibid: 213). Whatever was their function, the ‘basic form’ common to all was that ‘they were all single, stand-alone pieces’. During this very stage they developed protolanguage to invoke group co-operation to exploit food and to secure safety against predators/natural calamities. Obviously, since in the beginning the role of language was ‘fully functional’, it required few words sufficient to serve the limited functions of social organization aimed at surviving strategies (Ibid: Ch. 8). ‘If the first one or three or five protolanguage signs didn’t have a substantial payoff, no one would have bothered to invent any more’ (Ibid: 165). Bickerton holds that like the modern pidgin languages these words were combined like ‘beads-on-a-string’ to deliver messages (Ibid: Ch. 9).

The next evolutionary phase started some ninety thousand years ago with the appearance of the ‘Aterian point’ in North Africa. It heralds the stage of the concepts substituting for categories (Ibid: Ch. 10). Though the Aterian point looks like a miniature Acheulian tool, it cannot be used as a stand-alone piece, it requires hafting. It needed stone for the point, wood for the shaft, mastic (a sticky resin) to bond and gut or vine to bind. The point was provided with a tang and two transverse flaring barbed-flanges terminating towards top into a
point. Unlike the Acheulian tool type which could be fashioned by trial and error, it was a carefully conceived tool employing a tang to fit into the shaft, mastic for gluing together the tang and the shaft, and gut for their added security. The idea was aimed at fashioning a ‘barbed-weapon’ that would penetrate skin of the prey animal and hold there even if the animal tried to let loose the weapon by shaking its body.

Bickerton adds that the ACSs are complete by themselves therefore there is no question of their combinability. A word by itself cannot convey the required message therefore needs to be combined with another word to give the required call. Thus, in the evolution of language the process started with an increase in phonological complexity leading to modification of the ACS, the modified ACSs emerged into words, the words combined to signal messages in the manner of beads-on-a-string like the modern pidgin languages (Ibid: Ch. 11). According to Bickerton ‘the earliest protolanguage words... would have been indivisible chunks of sound, sharing no features with other words’, and in its later evolutionary stages protolanguage acquired syntax-like features. Interestingly, Bickerton constructs a modern pidgin version of ‘the barbed-weapon scenario’ to explain the structure of any given language in its evolutionary stage, and by analogy, suggests that ‘there would probably have been a statistical preponderance of what, in a true language, you’d have to call “subject-first” sentences’ (Ibid: 231).

Bickerton points out that due to absence of syntax long and complex sentences in the beads-on-a-string chaining would become ambiguous, besides it takes long time to deliver them as they are not supported by ‘any brain-internal processing’. The barbed-weapon scenario again provides a clue to the brain-internal processing through which concepts recognised ‘two most crucial kinds of words’, namely, nouns and verbs, accordingly, ‘the two templates (roughly, phrases and clauses) were headed, respectively, by nouns and verbs’ (Ibid: 235-37). Eventually, our ancestors reached the stage of fully syntactical language with Merge as its core (Ibid: Ch. 12). Thus, Bickerton traces three stages in the evolution of human language from the ACS to protolanguage to fully syntactical language which he developed with his colleague Calvin (see, Calvin and Bickerton 2000).¹

Bickerton’s studies are appealing, for he situates his formulations in the evolutionary context coupled with verifiable ant/bee and pri-

¹ Due to my absolute lack of French language, I have not been able to use this book. However, its introductory chapters do suggest commonality with those of the Leroi-Gourhan.
mate behaviour. The Aterian point cited by him is crucial to our understanding of the cognitive evolution. Its appearance is almost contemporaneous with those of the Blombos Cave artefacts. However, it is an open issue whether humans associated with material remains from the Blombos Cave, dated to about 75,000 BP, were equipped with ‘syntactic’ or ‘fully syntactic’ language as some scholars strongly contend (Henshilwood et al. 2002; Henshilwood and Marean 2003; Henshilwood and Dubreuil 2009; d’Errico et al. 2003; d’Errico and Vanhaeren 2009; d’Errico and Vanhaeren 2012). It may be noted that ‘syntax evolved gradually in terms of steps or stages’ (Botha 2009: 96), i.e., as a ‘historical process’ (Tomasello 2003), and in syntactic theory ‘the grammatical structure of language is the mediator between signal and meaning’ (Kinsella 2009: 6, and in passim), thus suggesting a long process and complex cognitive ability, as Bickerton has vividly described.

Botha compellingly argues that to infer existence of syntactic or fully syntactic language from material remains from the Blombos Cave fails to withstand the test of ‘Pertinence Condition’ because material ‘things’ related to putative ‘syntactic’ language are ‘not actually language’, it cannot be accepted a ‘right process’. Therefore, Botha suggests that inferences about language need to be ‘underpinned by a principled linguistic ontology’ (Botha 2009: 101, 107-08; see also, Balari et al. 2011; Malafouris 2013: Ch. 5 in passim) grounded in an appropriate bridge theory.

Significantly, to resolve this issue we can invoke Barnard’s (2010) work in which he deals with ‘working-memory’ vis-à-vis ‘system-level’ properties. Based on his earlier studies spanning over past two decades, he explores how the ‘working memory’ progressively evolves from ‘a four-subsystem architecture’ of ‘a prototypical mammal’ like a zebra to ‘nine-subsystem human architecture’. Mammalian minds were augmented by successive interacting ‘additions of one new subsystem’ ultimately leading to enhanced working-memory capacities in modern humans. He proposes nine-subsystem human architecture in somatic and visceral response mechanism to evaluate ‘evidence concerning relationships between cognition and emotion in both normal healthy individuals and those with various psychopathologies’. Accordingly, six-subsystem architecture matches the capability of great apes and by inference of the last common ancestor shared with modern humans. The remaining three subsystems represent the three successive evolutionary steps to attain H. Sapiens sapiens architecture (see, Ibid: fig. 3 on page 45). Applying this ‘system-level’ approach to the archaeological record, he shows ‘increasing differentiation limited to the articulatory domain’ of Homo erectus. He conceives presence of properties of entities that would ‘fit to as-
sign the emergence of a seven-subsystem architecture to *Homo erectus*’ (using Acheulian biface technology, i.e., Mode 2). He adds that the Levallois flakes ‘provide good evidence’ of eight-subsystem human architecture. Finally, use of intricately prepared compound adhesives in hafting found at Sibudu in southern Africa from 70 kya illustrates the ‘nine-subsystem human architecture’ as contrasted to the single adhesive use of noncompound materials such as bitumen in Neanderthal hafting. Furthermore, the nine-subsystem architecture also includes ‘appearance of art and personal ornamentation and the use of mineral pigments’, which are ‘all traditionally associated with the emergence of symbolic representation’ (*Ibid*: 51-52; see also Barnard et al 2017). He notes:

The emphasis here on a sequence of well-specified architectures brings into focus the idea that evolution enabled minds with more advanced architectures to do more things at the same time. By the very nature of the sequence, our proposals inherently provide tight couplings between the evolution of cognitive processes, language, meaning, and more refined emotions. The system-level account directs our attention away from evidence pinpointing the emergence of particular capabilities such as the use of iconic, indexical, and symbolic representations and more toward asking questions about the “whole package” of theoretically derived capabilities that come with a mind organized in a particular way (Barnard 2010: S50-S51).

The above summary suggests that oral signalling was central to the social behaviour of our species from *Homo erectus* to Anatomically Modern Humans and that evolution of stone technology and language run as two parallel rising trajectories over time. It also suggests that material culture can be studied as proxy for language.

2. Material culture of Himalaya

It is important to note that, barring a few sites, most of the Palaeolithic find-spots in Himalayan region are surface finds (cf. Chauhan 2007). Furthermore, whereas the western Himalayan region has been subjected to extensive investigation, we have meagre information about the prehistory of the remaining vast stretch of Himalaya to the east of Himachal Pradesh, the only exception being the Siwalik region of southern- Central- and Western Nepal which was subjected to intensive and extensive explorations by Corvinus. Her extensive studies extending over two decades from 1980s onwards unfold that geoarchaeologically Central and it’s adjoining Western Nepal has proved to be the most promising area of Stone Age Culture studies in the
Himalayan region, and it serves as an index to the prehistory of Himalaya. Her exhaustive report on the prehistoric archaeology of Nepal was published posthumously (Corvinus 2007). This monumental work not only deals with ‘mostly stratigraphically controlled’ and ‘more or less securely established’ artefact-bearing sites in ‘a chronological order’ dating back from the Lower Palaeolithic through the Neolithic, but also situates them in appropriate South Asian, East Asian, and Southeast Asian archaeological context. Corvinus’ work leads us to better our understanding of the early human activities in Himalaya. To this may be added site-specific detailed analysis of tool types of certain sites carried out by different scholars. These studies suggest site-specific homogenous character of artefacts and associated technology and by implication presence of related named stages of techno-cultural complexes, i.e., Mode 1 to Mode 5, albeit with a caveat that such artefacts are time-transgressive. However, this classification based on techno-cultural traits shows existence of various hominin stone knapping techniques in the Himalayan region without situating them in chronological framework. Hopefully, this exercise liberates a non-specialist of my tribe from the bounds of specialists’ culture specific classificatory terminology. In sum, synthesis of these studies leads to suggest that the Himalayan region was one of the cradles of our remote ancestors. It will be clear from the following table.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Site/region</th>
<th>Techno-facie</th>
<th>Stratigraphy</th>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Reference</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Potwar &amp; Jammu-Kashmir</td>
<td>Soan’ (Mode 1 to Mode 4 type?)</td>
<td>Geological context (Now outdated)</td>
<td>Pleistocene Different glacial sequences (Now outdated)</td>
<td>de Terra and Paterson 1939</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Riwat</td>
<td>Pre Acheulian* (Mode 1)</td>
<td>Geological context</td>
<td>-2 mya/ 2.6 mya</td>
<td>Dennell et al 1988/ Dennell 2009</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dina &amp; Jalalpur, North Pakistan</td>
<td>Acheulian* (Mode 2)</td>
<td>Geological context</td>
<td>7 mya &amp; .4 mya</td>
<td>Rendell and Dennell 1985</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Uttarbaini, Jammu &amp; Kashmir</td>
<td>Pre Acheulian* (Mode 1)</td>
<td>Geological context</td>
<td>2.8 ± 0.56 mya</td>
<td>Verma 1991</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nalagarh, Himachal Pradesh</td>
<td>Acheulian* (Mode 2)</td>
<td>Geological context</td>
<td>Pinjor: Lower Pleistocene</td>
<td>Verma 1975</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Site/Region</td>
<td>Cultural Characteristics</td>
<td>Artefact Homogeneity</td>
<td>Site Context</td>
<td>Stratigraphical Context</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>--------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Toka, Himachal Pradesh</td>
<td>Post-Acheulian* ‘Mode 1 and Mode 3’</td>
<td>Homogeneity of artefacts and site context</td>
<td>Mid-Late Pleistocene</td>
<td>Chauhan 2007</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Atbarapur, Punjab</td>
<td>Acheulian* (Mode 2)</td>
<td>Homogeneity of artefacts and site context</td>
<td>Upper Siwalik sediments, &gt; 0.6 mya</td>
<td>Gaillard et al 2008</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dzama Thang, Spiti Valley, Himachal Pradesh.</td>
<td>Prepared core technology &amp; blade elements* (Mode 3 &amp; Mode 4)</td>
<td>Homogeneity of artefacts and site context</td>
<td>Late Pleistocene 50-30 ka</td>
<td>Chauhan et al 2017 / Joshi 2017</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kalsi, Uttarakhand</td>
<td>Unifacial &amp; bifacial artefacts (Mode 1 type)</td>
<td>Surface finds</td>
<td>No date</td>
<td>Verma et al 2012</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Narayan Ganga Valley, Uttarakhand</td>
<td>Flakes &amp; scrapers Levalloissian technique (Mode 3?)</td>
<td>Surface finds</td>
<td>No date</td>
<td>IAR 1977-78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Suwal Valley, Uttarakhand</td>
<td>Microliths (Mode 5 type)</td>
<td>Surface finds</td>
<td>No date</td>
<td>Joshi 1981; 2008</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gadari</td>
<td>Acheulian*</td>
<td>Stratigraphical context</td>
<td>≥early Mid-Pleistocene</td>
<td>Corvinus 2007</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Satpati Hill</td>
<td>Acheulian* (Mode 2)</td>
<td>Stratigraphical context</td>
<td>Early Pleistocene to early Middle Pleistocene</td>
<td>Corvinus 2007</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brakhuti W. Southern-Central &amp; Central-western Nepal</td>
<td>Large flake core industry (Mode 1 type, time-transgressive)</td>
<td>Stratigraphical context</td>
<td>≥early Mid-Pleistocene</td>
<td>Corvinus 2007</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arjun complex, Central-western Nepal</td>
<td>Prepared core/Levallois &amp; blade elements* (Mode 3)</td>
<td>Stratigraphical context</td>
<td>Eemian age 100 ka-70 ka (Middle Palaeolithic)</td>
<td>Corvinus 2007</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ammapur, Lamahi, &amp; Bhatarkund</td>
<td>Microlithic* (Mode 5)</td>
<td>Stratigraphical context</td>
<td>Late Pleistocene</td>
<td>Corvinus 2007</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chabeni, Central Nepal; Patu,</td>
<td>Mesolithic</td>
<td>Stratigraphical context</td>
<td>Before 7,000 BP</td>
<td>Corvinus 2007</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Material culture as proxy for language

Table 1: Outline of different techno-facies discovered in Himalaya

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>State/Region</th>
<th>Idiom</th>
<th>Theme</th>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Reference</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Eastern Himalaya</td>
<td>Petroglyphs</td>
<td>Depressions/Zoomorphs/Anthropomorphs/Floral/Geometric motifs</td>
<td>Uncertain Neolithic(?)</td>
<td>Bezbaruah 2014</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Central Himalaya</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nepal</td>
<td>Petroglyphs</td>
<td>Depressions/Zoomorphs/Anthropomorphs/</td>
<td>'older than the Neolithic'</td>
<td>Pohle 2003</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* sensu Clark 1977.

Rock drawings: In addition to the above-mentioned lithic artefacts, the Himalaya is also dotted with petroglyphs and pictographs. [Problem with table alignment in the Word file - but corrected in the PDF file]

2 If these dates are accepted, the artefacts found in Potwar and Siwalik sites are the earliest in Asia, next to the ‘Pre-Oldowan’ stone tools from Lomekwi 3 in West Turkana, Kenya, dated to 3.3. mya and christened ‘Lomekwan’ (Harmand et al 2015).
Table 2: Profile of petroglyphs and pictographs of Himalaya

The above table (No. 1) clearly shows that stratigraphically controlled archaeological studies in Nepal unfold existence of discrete named stages of techno-cultural complexes, i.e., Mode 1 to Mode 5, and that in the Old World the Himalaya witnessed the earliest hominin activities next to Africa. What is central to the present study is the presence of the Middle Palaeolithic (Mode 3) techno-cultural complex that marks quantum leap forward in human cognition and matching language acquisition skills as evident from Wadley’s study of Middle Stone Age industry (corresponding to the Middle Palaeolithic) called the Howiesons Poort. It may be noted that stone tools exemplified by segments ‘have been found in the earliest Central African MSA, with an age of about 300,000 years. In southern Africa, between about 70,000 and 55,000 years ago, segments and other backed tools were
the most common stone tools in an MSA industry called the Howiesons Poort’ (Wadley 2010: S112). Wadley’s (2010) experimental study clearly shows that in this industry segments as multipurpose artefacts could be used both as tools and weapons, and their hafting was an intricate process. She summarizes:

Mental rotation, a capacity implying advanced working-memory capacity, was required to place the segments in various positions to create novel weapons and tools. The compound glues used to fix the segments to shafts are made from disparate ingredients, using an irreversible process. The steps required for compound-adhesive manufacture demonstrate multitasking and the use of abstraction and recursion. As is the case in recursive language, the artisan needed to hold in mind what was previously done in order to carry out what was still needed. Cognitive fluidity enabled people to do and think several things at the same time, for example, mix glue from disparate ingredients, mentally rotate segments, talk, and maintain fire temperature. Thus, there is a case for attributing advanced mental abilities to people who lived 70,000 years ago in Africa without necessarily invoking symbolic behaviour (Ibid: S111).

Interestingly, Bar-Yosef (2008) draws our attention to the intricacy of the Levalloisian technology and states that it involves oral communication to impart this knowledge. He posits that, like Out-of-Africa scenario, the Levalloisian technology was invented in ‘a specific region of the Old World and only later spread all over to be shared by many other groups, enriched in due course by a series of additional technical improvements’ (Ibid: 376-77; see also, Lieberman 2013: Ch. 5). It may be inferred then that the inhabitants of Himalaya were exchanging information through oral communication long before the emergence of the named languages.

3. Material culture and language: the Himalayan evidence

Recent archaeological investigations in Europe, Africa and Near East suggest two models of language evolution, namely, ‘Human Revolution scenario’, and ‘Out-of-Africa scenario’, the former credits Europe for this evolution and the latter Africa (see for details and further references, Botha and Knight (eds.) 2009; see also, Possehl 2007; Dennell and Pettaglia 2012). However, these studies become redundant in the light of Lieberman’s recent studies (2013; 2016) cited above. Be it as it may, genetic studies indicate dispersal of anatomically modern humans representing ‘three Y chromosome founder lineages, accompanying mtDNA haplogroups M and N’ from Africa to South
Asia ‘approximately 70–50 thousand years ago’ via ‘the southern [coastal] route’ and ‘the coalescence times of mtDNA haplogroups M, N and R are remarkably similar and ancient, ~65,000 years’ (Chaubey et al. 2006; Endicott et al. 2007: 235; see also, Mellars 2006; Mellars et al. 2013; Atkinson et al. 2008; Zegura 2008; Petraglia et al. 2010; Li and Durbin 2011; Hen et al. 2012; see for recent studies in human colonization of Asia in the Late Pleistocene, *Current Anthropology*, Volume 58, Supplement 17, December 2017).

In this connection it is also to be noted that genetic and paleoanthropological evidences suggest a late Pleistocene ‘great demic (demographic and geographic) expansion’ of modern humans that began ‘approximately 45,000 to 60,000 y ago in Africa and rapidly resulted in human occupation of almost all of the Earth’s habitable regions’ (Henn et al. 2012). In case of Southern Asia, ‘the history of the genetic lineages now inhabiting the region’ suggests a ‘5-fold increase in population size’ by ~ 52 kya, and that these ‘estimates of effective population size through time show that Southern Asia was not only a key waypoint in the human expansion from Africa but also a major chapter in human prehistory’ (Chaubey et al. 2006; Atkinson et al. 2008: 471-72). Genetic signatures also disclose that the new geographical environment of South Asia was instrumental in generating genetic differences during this time (see, Chaubey et al. 2006; Sankhyan 2013).

Significantly, Kivisild et al. (2003: 216) observe:

> The Indian haplogroup M lineages differ substantially from those found in eastern and central Asian populations and most likely represent *in situ* diversification in the sub-continent since the Palaeolithic...

> Thus, what we see as specific to Indian subcontinent is the presence of diverse sub-clusters of haplogroups M, R, and U that are virtually absent elsewhere. All these sub-clusters show coalescent times at around 50,000 BP. Given their high overall frequency in India this suggests a very limited gene flow – at least as far as maternal lineages are concerned – beyond the subcontinent over a long time span, likely since its initial colonization.

Hard archaeological evidence from different sites in South Asia (Mellars 2006; Mellars et al. 2013; Corvinus 2007: Ch. VIII; James 2007; Petraglia et al. 2009; Petraglia et al. 2010) also supports human expansion. Significantly, Dunbar (2003) postulates that time invested in social grooming is crucial to social bonding and therefore determines its group size. Maintenance of larger social group size requires matching investment in time for social grooming within the limited time budget, which constraint was overcome by vocal grooming and ultimately language. On the basis of material culture bearing on symbol-
ic cognition, particularly from the Blombos Cave near Still Bay in South Africa, it has been suggested that ‘anatomically modern humans’ were already language users at the time of their dispersal from Africa (Renfrew 1994; McBrearty and Brooks 2000; Henshilwood et al 2002; Henshilwood and Dubreuil 2009; Mellars 2004; Zilhão 2007; Knight 2009; Watts 2009). Therefore, there is no reason to believe that they arrived in South Asia without language.

Scholars engaged in linguistic and genetic studies have observed ‘a remarkable similarity between the linguistic tree and the genetic tree’ (Henn et al 2012: 17761). These studies also suggest dispersal of language using humans from Africa to different parts of the Old World (Nichols 1999 [1992]; Cavalli-Sforza 2001; Creanza et al 2015). The tree of origin of human languages originally drawn by Merritt Ruhlen and modified by Cavalli-Sforza (2001: 169) shows Africa as the root of the language of *Homo sapiens sapiens* (100-70 kya), whence it branched off into three sub-families, namely, Khoisian, Congo-Saharan, and Asian, the last one is assigned to ‘70-50 kya’. She also adds (*Ibid*: 155) that possibly the ancestors of the speakers of Khoisan languages ‘were responsible for the first expansion from Africa to Asia’, although ‘linguistic methods have not yet generated a complete tree growing from a single source’ (*Ibid*: 139-40; cf., Zegura 2008; Gell-Mann and Ruhlen 2011).

In terms of language dispersal, Himalaya is a ‘residual’ zone (Nichols 1999 [1992]: 21), and together with the Caucasus, offers considerable language diversity owing to climatic, geographical, and political factors, which ‘make it possible for a relatively small community to survive autonomously’ (*Ibid*: 44, 234). The linguistic profile of the Himalayan region is interesting:

The greater Himalayan region is the principal meeting point for the two largest language families of the world, Indo-European and Tibeto-Burman. The same massifs have also been home to two smaller language families (Austroasiatic and Dravidian), and to two language isolates (Burushaski and Kusunda). Despite their physical prominence, the Himalayas constitute not so much an insurmountable barrier but rather a region of interaction between these various language families (Turin and Zeisler 2011: 1).

It may be noted here that whereas Burushaski is spoken ‘in the central Hunza Valley of northern Pakistan’, Kusunda is spoken by a precariously small group of former foragers commonly known as the ‘Ban Raja’ (Watters 2006: 9; Blench 2008). Various addressed as Raute, Raji, Banraka or Banraji, the people inhabiting Far West Nepal and eastern Kumaon in Uttarakhand, India, are different from the
Kusunda-speaking ‘Ban Raja’ of Nepal.\(^3\) The language of the former is called Raute or Raji (see for further references, Bandhu 2017; Rastogi 2017), and its origin remains disputed (Krishnan cited in Zoller 2016: 3). Interestingly, not only in terms of language isolates, Himalaya is equally important from the perspective of history of Indo-European language phylum as it has at least two regions, namely, Lahaul and Spiti sub-division of Himachal Pradesh in Western Himalaya (Sharma 1983) and Bangan in Garhwal division of Uttarakhand in Central Himalaya (Zoller 1988; 1989; 2007; 2008; see also, Abbi 1997; Drocco 2016), where traces of ‘Old Indo-Aryan’ have survived, whereas they have disappeared in most other places since long.

Arguably, in terms of time depth there are deep-rooted connections between the forebears of the speakers of the above-mentioned languages and the authors of material culture of the Himalaya. To the best of my knowledge, this issue has not attracted scholars working on the prehistory of Himalaya and its linguistic prehistory. Surprisingly, despite ‘Munda and related Austro-Asiatic languages’ that existed in South Asia for ‘several millennia’ and pre-date Old Indo-Aryan (Southworth 2005: Ch.3; van Driem 2012), in the archaeological context studies in the dispersal of language using humans in South Asia is generally dominated by the Indo-European speakers vis-à-vis agriculture (see, for example, Renfrew 1987: Ch. 8; 1992; 1994; Erdosy 1997 [1995]; Southworth 1997 [1995]; 2005; Witzel 1997 [1995]; van Driem 2001; Blench and Spriggs (eds.) 2004 [1998]; Blench 2008; Bellwood 2001; Bellwood and Oxenham 2008; Fuller 2003; 2007; Fuller et al 2011; Gray et al 2011; Tewari et al (eds.) 2007-2008).\(^{13}\) This is despite availability of adequate material culture bearing on symbolic cognition (James 2007), implying use of spoken language long before the Neolithic.

Thus, according to these linguistic hypotheses, the ancestors of close to 100 per cent of the indigenous languages spoken in India today came to India during the Holocene... consequently, all the preceding pre-Neolithic languages were totally replaced. If this is indeed so, how extensive was the genetic replacement caused by these events? (Kivisild et al 2003: 216).

---

\(^3\) Variously known as Raute, Raji or Banraj in Far WestNepal the ‘population of Rautes and their cultural and linguistic relatives who live in the Nepal/India border region [i.e., estern Kumaun, India, and its adjoining Far Western Nepal] is estimated to be about 700 Rautes, 2,500 Rajis, and 2–3,000 Banrajis’ (Fortier 2009: 4). The Raute, Raji or Banraj are different from Kusunda-speaking folks who call themselves ‘mihaq Ban Raja’ (Watters 2006: 14). I am thankful to Prof. Dr. Chudamani Bandhu (Tribhuwan University, Kathmandu, Nepal) and Prof. Dr. Kavita Rastogi (Lucknow University, Lucknow, India) for this information.
While studying the rock paintings of Central Himalaya (Uttarakhand), a preliminary attempt at reading signatures of language was made by me a few years ago (Joshi 2014: in press). In the meantime, I got the opportunity to work with a team of archaeologists of Himachal Pradesh Government headed by Dr. Hari Chauhan. Their (Chauhan et al. 2017) recent discovery of the Palaeolithic tools with prepared core technology in the lower Spiti Valley (Himachal Pradesh) has added new dimensions to Indian archaeology. Though these tools have been found on the surface, circumstantial and inferred archaeological evidence (e.g., prepared core technology, Levallois-like flakes, predominance of blade elements and absence of microliths; find-spot situated along a palaeolake dated to ‘50–30 ka’ by Phartiyal et al. 2009; and discovery of almost similar tools dated to ‘minimum’ 30 kya in adjoining Western Tibet by Aldenderfer et al. 2008) suggest that they represent local transitional phase from the Middle Palaeolithic to the Upper Palaeolithic (Joshi 2017).

What is central to the present study is that, as we already have noticed, the Levallois-like technology implies adequate oral communication. It draws our attention to Burushaski, a language isolate, considered to be one of the branches of Basque (Cavalli-Sforza 2001: 142, 149). van Driem (2008) affiliates Burushaski with ‘Greater Yenisseian’. According to Bengtson (2009, and further references therein) Kusunda, Burushaski and Basque form part of a larger language family, called ‘Dene-Caucasian’. However, in a recent paper Gerber (2017) has thoroughly examined the possibility of parcelling these languages into one larger language family linguistically, but he found no ‘genealogical relationship’ between these languages. He concludes:

all languages involved in this paper are typologically similar to each other and exhibit similarly complex verbal morphology [but do] not provide evidence for genealogical relationship...

Especially in the case of the comparison of Burushaski, Kusunda, Yenisseian and Athabaskan-Eyak-Tlingit, the assumed time depth makes it unlikely that these languages, even if they were in fact related to each other, would still preserve enough of the original positions and categories to resemble each other in the way that they actually do nowadays.

All these considerations lead to the conclusion that a genealogical relationship between Burushaski, Kusunda, Yenisseian and Athabaskan-Eyak-Tlingit cannot be demonstrated at the present stage. This finding corroborates my personal conjecture that the time depth of a putative Dene-Kusunda family is just too great to enable us to detect convincing vestiges of a common origin. Convincing statements concerning language relatedness beyond a certain time
depth are not possible, and the Dene-Kusunda hypothesis lies well beyond this horizon (Ibid: 191-192).

It is obvious then that great time depth makes it difficult to identify the forebears of speakers of modern language isolates based on linguistics. However, as noted above, there is ‘a remarkable similarity between the linguistic tree and the genetic tree’ and therefore, in the absence of any other convincing hypothesis, we can follow the suggestion that genetic studies indicate that Basque is ‘related to the language spoken by Cro-Magnons, the first modern humans in Europe’ (Cavalli-Sforza 2001: 112, 121, 141-42, 149, 158; see also, Piazza and Cavalli-Sforza 2006). If it is so in Eurasia, what about the forebears of Burushaski-speaking folks and, in the same vein, of Kusunda- and Raute/Raji-speaking folks in the Himalaya? Let us examine the Himalayan archaeological record.

To the best of my knowledge, van Driem is the only scholar who has cited archaeological evidence in his linguistic studies of the Himalaya, but it is restricted to the Neolithic (van Driem 2001; 2008). He cites Corvinus’ (2007) study of material culture of pre-Neolithic Nepal but, to the best of my understanding, he does not articulate it with any Himalayan language (van Driem 2012: 211-12). However, his studies point out that the first language using occupants of Himalaya were ‘the Austroasiatic speaking populations’ (van Driem 2001: 414; 2011; 2012). They were followed by the Kusunda speakers ‘whom the Tibeto-Burmans must have encountered when they first entered the Himalayan region millennia ago’ (van Driem 2001: 333). In a more recent study, van Driem suggests that ‘Kusunda might be the remnant of the same ancient Greater Yenissean migration into the Himalayas’ as Burushaski (van Driem 2013: 164), but neither he gives any chronology of such an event nor he refers to any material culture of Himalaya bearing on such a migration. Arguably, if Burushaski and Kusunda belong to ‘Greater Yenissean’, and together with Basque form part of yet greater language family termed ‘Proto-Yeniseian’ (see for details and further references, Vajda 2012: 15-16), we should look for their roots in the Upper Palaeolithic. Admittedly, it refers to the geographical area of Eurasia and North-West South Asia. A recent study of human activities in Gissar Range, Pamir, Hindu Kush and Kashmir during prehistoric times by Malassé and Gaillard (2010) shows close interaction of peoples in this area. They sum up:

The data suggest that the hunting territory in high plateaus was a biotope exploited during summer, since the Late Pleistocene, by Central Asian hunters and that a huge territory opened from the second half of the Holocene, including lower valleys not only such
Material culture as proxy for language

as Gissar and Afghani Badakhshan, but also Chitral, Swat, Indus and may be other regions awaiting further investigations in Himalayas and Western China. Without those movements which allowed interbreeding between the tribes, the genetic variability would have declined (Ibid: 8).

Since discovery of the ‘Acheulian, Middle Acheulian, proto-Levalloisian, early Levalloisian, distinctly Levalloisian, and the late Levalloisian of Europe’ have been reported from Potwar and Kashmir by Paterson (1939: 303, 307-68, 310), it presupposes existence of speakers of syntactic language. Therefore, it is not unlikely that some of the folks using the Levallois technology in the area under reference were the forebears of Burushaski, which, following Cavalli-Sforza (2001: 158, and figure showing tree of language on page 169), belonged to ‘Dene-Caucasion’ superfamily of language that included two major families, namely, ‘Sino-Tibetan and Na-Dene’. This suggestion may also lend support to van Driem’s ‘Greater Yenisseian’ hypothesis provided we assign it to the Upper Palaeolithic.

The above account gives us general information about presence of language using folks on the basis of stone artefacts. However, these are the rock drawings which make our understanding of linguistic prehistory of Himalaya somewhat explicit. I have discussed this issue in some detail elsewhere (Joshi 2014: in press; 2017: in press; see also, Joshi et al 2015; Joshi et al 2017; Chauhan and Joshi 2017; Joshi: forthcoming). In sum, we have two idioms of rock drawings in Himalaya, namely, petroglyphs and pictographs (see above, table 2). Petroglyphs are ubiquitous in Himalaya but pictographs are restricted to Central Himalaya (Uttarakhand) and Western Himalaya. Furthermore, on circumstantial and stylistic grounds, the Central Himalayan rock paintings form a class by themselves and may be assigned to the Upper Palaeolithic-Epipalaeolithic (see for details, Joshi 2014: in press). Since, as already stated above, the Neolithic has been subjected to extensive studies in the context of language and agriculture dispersal, in the discussion that follows I will address the rock drawings of the Pre-Neolithic Central Himalaya vis-à-vis language.

Stylistically, Central Himalayan rock paintings have two distinct categories, the one showing anthropomorphic, zoomorphic, and aniconic signs. This category may further be divided into two subgroups: the first shows human figures arranged linearly with horizontal orientation, for example, Lakhud-udyar (Pl. 1), Lwethap (Pl. 2), and Phalsima (Pl. 3), all situated in District Almora (Kumaon, Uttarakhand). The second sub-group shows human figures jumbled up in conglomeration. Significantly, so far the latter sub-group is noticed only in two sites, namely, Gvarkhyavadyar (near Village Chhinka. Pl.
and Ghatgarh rock shelter (near Adi Badri, Pl. 5), both in District Chamoli (Garhwal). The second category is unique in that it shows a perpendicular row of hieroglyph-like motifs having creeper-like shoots painted in steel-grey colour as found at Hudoli, District Uttarkashi (Pl. 6). In terms of symbolic cognition the first category compares well with the earliest rock paintings of Bhimbetka in that it shows overwhelmingly large number of barehanded anthropomorphic figures, few wild zoomorphic figures, simple iconicity, and small variety of aniconic motifs. Furthermore, except stick-like object, that too occurring rarely, these paintings do not show any such object as indicates any advanced tool technology. The abstract depictions in the rock paintings under reference include vulvas, dots, varied alignments of short lines and a long wavering line as may be seen at Phalsima (Pl. 7), and Lakhu-Udyar (Pls. 8-10). Whereas Leroi-Gourhan (1968: 199-200) associates such signs with femininity, according to Lewis-Williams (2012 [2002]: 127-33, 151-54) such depictions in the Upper Palaeolithic drawings are produced due to ‘entopic phenomena’ experienced by the shamans. These characteristics tend to suggest that these paintings belong to the pre-Neolithic phase of material culture of Central Himalaya (see for details, Joshi 2014: in press).

There is a general consensus among scholars that Munda is one of the ‘primary’ branches of Austroasiatic (see, Blust 2013: Ch. 11, see also Kumar and Reddy 2003; Sidwell 2015; cf. Majumdar 2010). Significantly, Sharma (2003) has shown that Munda is the sub-stratum of ‘Tibeto-Himalayan languages’. Thus, we have three major candidates whose forebears may have left their signatures in the Pre-Neolithic material culture of Himalaya, namely, the Munda-, the Burushaski-, and the Kusunda-speaking folks. We already have noticed that the forebears of the Burushaski-speaking folks may represent some or the other groups using the Levalloisian technology. Interestingly, the Levalloisian flakes have also been found in close proximity of Ghatgarh rock-shelter (Indian Archaeology 1977-78 – A Review: 83). If the Ghatgarh rock paintings are accepted as the Upper Palaeolithic, association of the Levalloisian flakes with them is plausible. In that case, it is an open issue whether the authors of Ghatgarh rock paintings as well as the other ones found in Central Himalaya, represent the forebears of the Munda-speaking folks. In any case, they were using adequate language to communicate through these paintings.

There is a solitary example of perpendicular arrangement of motifs located at Hudoli. Perpendicular arrangement of symbols is found on ‘Oracle bones’ representing ‘the earliest undisputed’ Chinese texts in ‘late Shang dynasty (c. 1300–1200 bc) inscriptions’ from the area of ‘the last Shang capital, Yinxu, near Anyang (Henan)’ (Demattè 2010).
However, Chinese characters start appearing from ‘the Late Neolithic (c. 3000–2000 BC)’. Interestingly, inscription on the Dinggong pot-sherd shows horizontal arrangements of character (Ibid: 214 and Fig. 2c), hence, the source of perpendicular arrangement of Chinese characters needs to be searched somewhere else. According to van Driem (2008: 44), ‘most Tibeto-Burman language communities and even most branches of the language family are exclusively represented outside of China’. Therefore, can it be suggested that the authors of Hudoli paintings were the forebears of the Kusunda-speaking folks? For, it has been suggested that the Tibeto-Burman speakers ‘must have encountered’ Kusunda speakers ‘when they first entered the Himalayan region millennia ago’ (van Driem 2001: 333). In that case, it is not unlikely that the Hudoli paintings served as a prototype that inspired development of pictographic script and perpendicular alignment of characters. The Tibeto-Burman speakers learned it from the authors of Hudoli paintings and passed on the system to their counterparts in China. Alternatively, the Tibeto-Burman speakers themselves invented the characters and perpendicular alignment of motifs after settling in Hudoli area whence the idea spread northwards into China. It is difficult to surmise otherwise, for there is no resemblance between the Hudoli motifs and early Chinese characters (see for early Chinese characters, Huisheng 1995; Demattè 2010). If it is so, the Hudoli paintings might date back to the Early Neolithic phase of South Asian Northern Neolithic (circa 7000 BC). I reserve it for a future study. In this connection it is also to be noted that recent linguistic and genome studies have complicated the identity of the Kusunda-speaking people because of Kusunda’s closeness to ‘Indo-Pacific family of languages’ (Whitehouse et al 2004; Rasmussen et al 2011; cf. van Driem 2011).

It seems that prehistoric community resorted to depictive symbolism, what Leroi-Gourhan’s pioneering study terms as ‘The Birth of Graphism’ (Leroi-Gourhan 1993 [1964]: 187-216), to give expression to its perception of mundane as well as metaphysical world effectively due to their deficiency in spoken language. This practice was abandoned in course of time when humankind developed an adequate vocabulary and syntactic language to narrate the same. Interestingly, in Africa, the San continued the tradition until their last paintings in the nineteenth century, because the Bushman still use click mode of communication.
4. Concluding observation: why material culture is proxy for language

In the preceding section of this essay an attempt was made to identify forebears of speakers of three putatively most ancient language families of Himalaya, namely, Munda, Burushaski, and Kusunda with the authors of material culture of the Himalaya. As regards techno-facies of the stone artefacts, their approximate dates cannot be disputed. Therefore, it is obvious that humans with adequate language skills were roaming in the Himalaya at least some 70,000 years ago. However, such is not the case with rock paintings. Despite several scientific attempts at dating prehistoric rock paintings ‘a reliable scientific method to establish their absolute antiquities’ is yet to come into view (Watchman 1997: 21). Therefore, scholars take into account circumstantial, inferred archaeological, comparative, and stylistic grounds to work their chronology. No doubt, it is speculative and subject to sudden death the moment a compelling scientific method is developed in the light of which these paintings declared Neolithic or much later. If so, what about the explanations given here of the rock paintings, their authors vis-à-vis different languages spoken in antiquity in the Himalaya? Its answer lies in the semiotic study of these paintings. In the discussion that follows I will summarily point out few representative examples.

Thus, there is a highly symbolic representation located at Pethsal (Pl. 11). It represents a conically roofed pyramidal motif showing three upward receding tiers of arched niche-like panels in red with a human figure in black within each panel. The topmost tier consists of a single conical niche-like panel. The motif is superimposed on three human figures in red depicted outside the niche-like panels, below on the right. Moving towards right, three conical patterns of varying sizes in black are depicted in vertical order, and on the extreme right, there is a vertically arranged serpentine motif. There is no doubt that the colour combination of red and black pigments in the motif under reference is indicative of cognitive complexity. Does it suggest association of red with life and black with death? In that case, the human figures in black may represent deceased ancestors, the arched panel-like niches in red (symbolising life) as ochre-furnished graves to bring life to the deceased, and the three conical patterns in black on the right as the graves emptied by them during the ancestor worship (śrāddha ceremony in Brahmanical religion). Significantly, these conical patterns are devoid of any base or ground, as if floating in the sky, suggestive of their locations in the three worlds of departed ancestors in the sky. The three human figures in red below on which this three-
 tiered motif is superimposed might denote the resurrected immediate ancestors referred to above.

It may be noted that association of the deceased ancestors (pitri-s) with the three worlds is explicitly mentioned in several Brahmanical texts (see, Kane 1953: 458; 503). Interestingly, it has been suggested that some sort of belief system in the three worlds finds expression widely in the prehistoric rock drawings (see, Lewis-Williams 2012 [2002]: 144, 149, 165, 209; Boyd 2012; Hays-Gilpin 2012; McNiven and Brady 2012; Rozwadowski 2012; see also Bloch 2008; Layton 2012: 442). It is likely that such beliefs continued echoing in the subsequent phases of human history and resurfaced in the form of pitri-pūjā of the Indo-Aryan culture as evidenced in the Rigveda. Interestingly, according to Staal (1963: 268) Vedic rituals related to deceased members of one’s family known as preta-karma, which also include pitri-pūjā, are non-sanskritic in origin (see also Joshi 2011: Adhya 4-5). Singh (1997) draws our attention to copious references in the Rigveda which clearly show that their authors had not lost memory of the Pre-Neolithic phase of human culture in South Asia. Accordingly, depiction of the three tiers in the motif under reference may refer to the three worlds of the pitri-s.

Another noteworthy example of symbolism is found at Lwethap (upper rock shelter). It shows a long frieze of human figures together with other motifs in different hues of red, some of which are superimposed (Pl. 2). In this frieze we come across few curious figures, each looking like a slightly slanted vertical line surmounted by ‘X’-like (in one case ‘star-like’) sign in solid red, and, if it is not due to the impact of bleeding of calciferous rock, encased in deft thin white lines. The composition seems to depict a procession of anthropomorphic figures including some differentiated human figures wearing peaked headdresses or masks (?); the figurative representation of coalition ritual activity is beyond doubt. It reminds us of the Katyūr jāgar ritual (a group spirit possession séance) still in vogue in Central Himalaya in which possessed spirits are differentiated on the basis of their socio-political antecedents and seated in a specific order accordingly. It plays vital role in bringing about group solidarity, and in perpetuating shared beliefs through time (cf., DeMarrais 2011). A spectacular show of such activities takes place in the annual fair at Ranibagh near Kathgodam (District Nainital), where the jāgar rituals start with processions lead by possessed mediums (see for details and photographs, Joshi 2014).

Significantly, Central Himalayan rock paintings clearly show that when used in association with black, red pigment tends to superimpose on the black. It may explain the contents of a section of rock paintings at Phalsima depicting medley of black and red figures (Pls.
3, 12). Following shamanistic interpretation, it may be suggested that the black figures may denote evil spirits being subdued/vanquished by the superimposed life-giving red ones representing benevolent spirits, or else a struggle between the evil and the benevolent spirits, a common belief system enacted in spirit possession in Central Himalaya. Two singularly drawn headless human figures in black at Phalsima (Pl. 3) clearly support association of death/evil spirits with black colour (cf., Petru 2008: 226). In this case they might represent vanquished, beheaded evil spirits.

In the same vein, another example of colour symbolism is noticed on the large rock shelter near the Forest Checkpoint at Lakhu-udyar (Pl. 9). It shows a large number of variously shaped alternating white and red coloured motifs, somewhat resembling 'l' 'c', 's', 'y', of the Roman letters, and reverse 'da' of the Devanagari script, besides different combinations of straight/semi-curved lines, all arranged in a horizontal row. It may be explained as a structural representation of 'nothingness that is before birth, the world in the ice age' (cf. Kandinsky 1977) represented by white strokes and birth/life represented by red ones. Indeed, plants stemming through snow/ice cover in the spring season is still a common experience for the residents of higher altitudes of the Himalaya.

Yet another interesting example of symbolic use of red colour is noticed in the same painted rock. Here a considerably long irregular thin red line is drawn on the side face of the rock, which at random would appear as meaningless (Pl. 10). Interestingly, in African rock drawings such irregularly drawn long thin red lines, albeit in association with human and animal figures, have been interpreted as 'lines of potency', which could be both malevolent and benevolent (Lewis-Williams 1981; Power 2004). In Central Himalayan rock paintings also red lines are clearly associated with human figures as may be noticed at Lwethap (Pl. 13, lower painted rock) and Lakhu-Udyar below Forest Checkpoint (Pl. 14).

Cognitive archaeology has shown that ‘the symbolic capacities needed for art are also needed for language, and are interpreted by some as indicative of the presence of language’ (Johansson 2006; cf. Davidson and Noble 1989). Deacon’s (1997) studies show the centrality of symbols in the spread of language communication, and Rappaport (1999: Ch. 3; cf., Renfrew 2001) has persuasively shown that certain indexical signs ‘would be impossible to conceive or denote in the absence of language’. In the same vein, motifs in Himalayan rock drawings were used as symbols which needed adequate means of communication for explaining their contents to the viewers of the society who used them. If symbolism is separated from the above-mentioned examples of Central Himalayan rock paintings what else
could be the intent of these paintings? So long as we do not find an answer to this poser, it would not be an overstatement to say that the examples cited by us represent proxy for language in the material culture of Himalaya. It needs further research to associate these paintings with the forebears of different named language-speaking groups, i.e., Munda-, Burushaski-, Kusunda-, Raute/Raï-speaking folks of Himalaya.

Bibliography


Bloch, Maurice. 2008. Why religion is nothing special but is central. In: Colin Renfrew, Chris Frith and Lambros Malafouris (eds.), The


IAR 1977-78: Indian Archaeology 1977-78 – A Review.


____. Forthcoming. *Cognition and Archaeology: Global Perspective on Himalaya Before the Neolithic (With a Special Reference to Petroglyphs and Rock Paintings)*.


Stout, Dietrich. 2010. Possible relations between language and technology in human evolution. *In: April Nowell and Iain Davidson ___*


Pl. 1: Lakhu-udyar, horizontal orientation of human figures.

Pl. 2: Lwethap, horizontal orientation of human figures.
Material culture as proxy for language

Pl. 3: Phalsima, horizontal orientation of human figures.

Pl. 4: Gvarkhyavadyar, human figures jumbled up in conglomeration.
Pl. 5. Ghatgarh rock shelter, human figures jumbled up in conglomeration.

Pl. 6. Hudoli, perpendicular row of hieroglyph-like motifs.
Pl. 7: Phalsima, alignments of short lines.

Pl. 8: Lakhu-Udyar above Forest Checkpoint, vulvas.
Pl. 9. LakhvUdyar, imposing rock shelter above Forest Checkpoint, alignments of short lines.

Pl. 10: LakhvUdyar, imposing rock shelter above Forest Checkpoint, long wavering red line.
Pl. 11: Pethsal, conically roofed pyramidal motif.

Pl. 12: Phalsima, beheaded human figures in black.
Pl. 13. Lwethap, lower rock shelter, red lines associated with human figures.

Pl. 14: LakhuUdyar, red lines associated with human figures.
Les études sino-tibétologiques ont depuis quelques années bénéficié de travaux extrêmement importants, en particulier dans le domaine du Bouddhisme, et plus précisément dans celui de l’influence exercée par le Bouddhisme Tibétain sur la société chinoise contemporaine. Le présent volume s’inscrit parfaitement dans cette perspective, en présentant un ensemble de travaux pertinents qui contribuent à l’approfondissement de notre compréhension de ce sujet en pleine évolution. Le thème n’est certes pas nouveau, mais son traitement sous la direction de F. Jagou (EFEO) permet d’aborder des thématiques particulières qui montrent que, en comparaison des études précédentes qui abordaient ce sujet d’une manière somme toute plus générale et plus synthétique à la fois, on est maintenant passé à une étape d’analyses plus détaillées sur des thèmes manifestement plus ciblés.

L’ouvrage s’ouvre sur une savante introduction de F. Jagou (p. 11-21) qui retrace la genèse du projet, à commencer par un intéressant rappel des contributions taiwanaises à l’histoire de la diffusion du Bouddhisme Tibétain à Taiwan même.

Le volume lui-même est divisé en deux parties principales (non mentionnées comme telles cependant) consacrées à l’influence et à la présence du Bouddhisme Tibétain 1. à Taiwan proprement dit, et 2. en Chine continentale, respectivement à proportion d’un tiers et de deux tiers de l’ensemble.

Le premier article (Cécile Campergue, p. 21-40) rappelle un certain nombre de fondamentaux relatifs à la nature à la fois laïque et religieuse de la société taiwanaise, et présente une série d’analyses de l’impact du Bouddhisme Tibétain sur le pays : impact religieux, mais également politique et économique. D’autres problématiques sont abordées dans le deuxième article (l’architecture et la distribution géographique des temples tibétains à Taiwan, Sarah E. Fraser, p. 41-65), ainsi que dans le troisième (Fabienne Jagou, p. 67-89), consacré à
la tradition des reliques. Les deux exemples discutés par Jagou sont celui de Changkya Qutuytu (un important hiérarque dge lugs pa), et celui de Gongga Laoren dont il est également question dans l’article de Fraser (p. 53-54), ainsi que dans le quatrième (Cody R. Bahir [p. 91-108], p. 94-95, etc.) portant sur une forme syncrétique de Bouddhisme qui semble de toute évidence surfer sur une “mode” tibétaine n’ayant de tantrique d’un pâle vernis opportun.

Le cinquième article (E. Bianchi, p. 109–131) est consacré au système du Dayuanman (大圓滿) ou rDzogs chen en tibétain, tel qu’il a été enseigné par mKhan po ‘Jigs phun (‘Jigs med phun tshogs, 1933–2004), l’incarnation principale de Las rab gling pa (gTer ston bSod rgyal, 1856–1926). L’influence de ce maître sur tout le mouvement du Dayuanman dans le monde chinois contemporain n’est pas sans rappeler celle de Gangs dkar rin po che (1893–1957) dans la première partie du 20e siècle, même si le rôle joué par ce dernier est incontestablement sans commune mesure avec celui du mKhan po.


L’ouvrage bénéficie d’une seule bibliographie pour toutes les contributions, ainsi qu’un index thématique fort utile.

L’ensemble du volume est remarquablement équilibré et agrémenté d’illustrations en couleur de grande qualité. On ne peut que féliciter F. Jagou pour le professionnalisme de son travail d’éditrice qui est véritablement un modèle du genre. Aussi les remarques conclusives du présent compte-rendu ne doivent-elles pas apparaître comme dépréciatives relativement au volume lui-même, mais plutôt comme le pinaillage obligé d’un spécialiste du Bön et du Dzogchen.

En premier lieu, p. 28 n. 24, Fraser présente Lopön Tenzin Namdak comme le fondateur (lit. “le maître fondateur”) de l’école du Yungdrung Bön. Ce n’est évidemment pas le cas. Les adeptes du Yungdrung Bön font remonter l’origine de leur tradition à des millénaires avant le Buddha Śākyamuni (ca. 5e s. BC). Cette affirmation n’engage évidemment qu’eux-mêmes. En revanche, Lopön Tenzin Namdak est effectivement le fondateur du monastère de Menri en Inde, ainsi que celui de Triten Norbutsé au Népal.
En second lieu, Bahir (p. 97) fait un parallèle intéressant entre les rêves visionnaires du maître Chesheng et le système des *gter ma* qui est dans sa présentation essentiellement limité aux écoles Nyingma et Kagyü. C'est oublier un peu rapidement que 99% de la littérature Bönpo est constituée de *gter ma* (alors que ce n'est ni le cas des Nyingmapas et encore moins celui des Kagyüpas) dont la révélation s'étale entre la fin du 10e et le début du 21e siècle. Certes, c'est un détail de présentation qui n'est probablement guère pertinent dans le contexte de ce livre, mais il aurait été judicieux de citer *inter alia* les travaux de A-M. Blondeau ou de J. Gyatso qui sont des sources incontournables pour le système des *gter ma* (“trésors”) et qui, surtout, en donnent une image plus conforme à la réalité. Là où la présentation des *gter ma* s'avère erronée dans l’article de Bahir, c'est lorsque l'auteur les présente comme des textes prophétiques : “These texts are presented as prophecies that were hidden away...”. Les textes prophétiques sont véritablement une minorité dans les collections de *gter ma*. Il y a certes des *lung bstan* (prophéties) qui sont associés à certains cycles, mais il y a des révélations entières (les plus fréquentes) dans lesquelles ne figure aucun texte prophétique *per se*, au mieux des *kha byang* ou “index” qui fournissent des éléments de localisation de *gter ma* (avec un éventuel rappel historique des conditions qui ont motivé la cache du “trésor”) ou encore le contenu thématique, voire littéralement un “listing” des textes inclus dans la collection. Ce type de *listing* est très utile pour repérer les ajouts tardifs qui ne relèvent pas directement du *gter ma* original lui-même. La présentation des *gter ma* comme étant des textes prophétiques cadre mal avec le fait — mentionné par l'auteur malgré la contradiction évidente — que certains de ces “trésors” sont des objets, des substances, etc., pas uniquement des textes. À un niveau doctrinal beaucoup plus subtil, la révélation de *gter ma* “au sein de la conscience” dans la phrase indiquant que ces trésors peuvent être “…revealed to the predestined individual in their consciousness” ne correspond pas à la réalité du phénomène. Il est évident que l’auteur fait référence au système des *dgongs gter* souvent présentés comme des “trésors de l’esprit” dans la littérature secondaire, sous la plume d’auteurs peu au fait de la précision des termes employés dans les textes originaux. En effet, dans le Bouddhisme, la conscience (*rnam shes*) et l’esprit (*sems*) sont conçus comme conditionnés par les passions (*nyon mongs*) et affligés par l’ignorance (*ma rig pa*). Ce n’est bien évidemment au cœur de tels états intérieurs que des *gter ma* peuvent être découverts. Au contraire, ils sont révélés au sein de la Contemplation (*dgongs pa*), en fonction de certaines conditions. Ici, l’auteur aurait pu renvoyer au livre de T. Thondup, *Hidden Teachings of Tibet* pour plus de précisions et pour cerner le sujet de manière
plus avisée. Dans la même section de l’article, l’auteur dit : “The whereabouts of these texts are oftentimes delivered to the recipient in a dream or in a pre-existent text.” Si un certain nombre de gter ma s’appuient en effet sur un texte antérieur, souvent appelé kha byang ou encore yang byang et autres variantes composées avec byang, ce n’est pas le cas de manière systématique. Par ailleurs, les transmissions par le biais des rêves ne sont pas considérées comme des gter ma — même si certaines en adoptent la ponctuation avec les gter shad — mais comme des mnal chos, c’est-à-dire des “enseignements” (chos) reçus en “rêve” (mnal). Les enseignements de ce type ne sont pas — comme le sont les gter ma eux-mêmes — nécessairement rattachés à une figure du 8e siècle (Padmasambhava, Vimalamitra, Vairocana, Dran pa nam mkha’, etc.) et ne forment pas forcément un cycle cohérent s’appuyant éventuellement sur un kha byang. Le rattachement des gter ma par l’auteur à “un” ādhibuddha est par ailleurs un raccourci malvenu puisque l’ādhibuddha (il n’y en a qu’un, à savoir le Buddha primordial Samantabhadra) n’a jamais rien caché comme gter ma selon les conceptions trans-historiques des écoles s’appuyant sur le système de la littérature révélée. De ce fait, la mise en parallèle des rêves du maître Chesheng avec le système des gter ma est une intuition fondée sur une relative méconnaissance de la nature de la littérature tibétaine révélée.

Enfin, pour conclure ces remarques, Bianchi (p. 111) présente le curriculum en usage à Larung Gar comme s’appuyant essentiellement sur le Dzogchen, et plus précisément sur le système des sNying thig. La note 8 qui accompagne la fin de ce paragraphe, en référence au composé sNying thig, semble limiter ce dernier au seul Klong chen snying thig. C’est une erreur. Il y a toutes sortes de sNying thig qui ne sont pas rattachés au Klong chen snying thig, lequel date du 18e siècle, alors que le premier corpus explicitement qualifié de snying thig est à n’en pas douter le Bi ma snying thig (ca. fin du 10e siècle) qui n’a aucun lien direct avec le Klong chen snying thig.

J’insiste ici encore sur le fait que ces remarques n’enlèvent strictement rien à la qualité de ce volume ni au travail minutieux de l’éditrice de ce collectif. L’ouvrage lui-même foisonne d’informations souvent inédites qui méritent l’attention des chercheurs.